REFUTATION TO THE ARTICLE TITLED " *The Doctrine of Tawassul In the Light of Qur'an & Sunnah* " . THE ARTICLE HASN'T BEEN COMPLETELY EDITED/ FORMATTED AND WHEN IT IS DONE THIS STATEMENT WILL BE DELETED.

THOSE WHO ARE NOT WELL VERSED WITH SCIENCE OF HADEETH MAY REFRAIN FROM PROCEEDING FURTHER.

Summary : proving that waseela from the dead is not proven from the shari'ah

Article Compiled by brother Asim ul Haq
Modified and edited by Mohammed Omar Shah

May Allah bless Asim for his excellent effort in both the worlds.

Introduction:

This article is response to the so called “ahlus-sunna” website. They are trying to claim that we (Ahlus sunnah wal jamah) do not believe in tawassul. But the truth is that we believe in all the permissible types of Tawassul. It is because of these deviants, Christians are accusing us to prove their shirk by saying (like Sam shamoun in his article "**Praying through Muhammad's Mediation") said "Not only are Muslims addressing Muhammad directly during their daily prayers there is also the Islamic practice of invoking Allah through Muhammad."**
Throughout this article , the claims/clause/statements of ahlus-sunnah.com will be framed in a box for a cleaner presentation.

Sh Muhammad bin Abdul Wahab (Rahimullah) said:

فكون بعض يرخص بالتوسل بالصالحين , وبعض يخصه بالنبي صلى الله عليه وسلم، واكثر العلماء ينهى عن ذلك ويكرهه فهده المسأله من مسائل الفقه، وان كان الصواب عندنا قول الجمهور من انه مكروه , فلا ننكر على من فعله , ولا انكار في مسائل الاجتهاد، ولكن انكارنا على من دعا لمخلوق أعظم مما يدعو الله تعالى ويقصد القبر يتضرع عند ضريح الشيخ عبد القادر او غيره يطلب فيه تفريج الكربات واغاثه اللهفات

وإعطاء الرغبات . فأين هذا ممن يدعو الله مخلصا له الدين لايدعو مع الله أحدا، ولكن يقول في دعائه: اسألك بنبيك أو بالمرسين أو بعبادك الصالحين , أو يقصد قبرا معروفا أو غيره يدعو عنده لكن لا يدعو الا الله مخلصا له الدين، فأين هذا مما نحن فيه

For some scholars to allow tawassul through the righteous, or for some to restrict it to the Prophet – SallAllahu 'alaihi wa-sallam, while majority of the scholars forbidding and disliking it; (All) these issues are from fiqhi issues.
Even though the correct opinion in our view is the majority opinion that it is disliked (Makrooh but), we still do not censure (criticize) one who practices it (this kind of tawassul), for there is no censuring in issues of ijtihad. However, our censure (criticism) of one who calls upon the creation (for help/waseela - such as "Oh so and so help me or Oh so and so ask Allah to help me") , is greater than the criticism of one who calls upon Allah Ta'ala (alone by saying " Oh lord have mercy on me for the sake of your love for your messenger and etc).
(The reason our harshness towards the one who seeks help from the creation is more is) because he travels to the grave beseeching, next to (for e.g) al-Sheikh 'Abd al-Qadir (Jilaani may allah have mercy on him) or others, seeking the alleviation (removal) of calamities, aiding the grief-stricken, attaining the desirable (dua'a);
Where is this all from one who calls upon Allah, purifying His religion for Him, not calling upon anyone besides Allah, except that he says in his supplication: I ask you by Your Prophet, messengers, or the righteous servants, or travels to Ma'ruf's (famous personalities) grave or others' to supplicate there, yet only supplicates to Allah, purifying the religion for Him, how is this relevant to what concerns us here?

فتاوي الشيخ محمد بن عبد الوهاب في مجموعه المؤلفات القسم الثالث ص
translated by Abu az-Zubair, modified by Mohammed Omar Shah

BLOCK 1

فَاسْتَغْفَرُواْ اللَّهَ **جَآءُوكَ** وَمَآ أَرْسَلْنَا مِن رَّسُولٍ إِلاَّ لِيُطَاعَ بِإِذْنِ اللَّهِ وَلَوْ أَنَّهُمْ إِذ ظَّلَمُواْ أَنفُسَهُمْ
لَوَجَدُواْ اللّهَ تَوَّاباً رَّحِيماً **وَاسْتَغْفَرَ لَهُمُ الرَّسُولُ**

Translation: We sent not an apostle, but to be obeyed, in accordance with the

will of Allah. If they had only, when they were unjust to themselves, **come to the Messenger and asked Allah's forgiveness,** ***and the Messenger had asked forgiveness for them,*** they would have found Allah indeed Oft-returning, Most Merciful.(4:64)

This is a direct divine order to seek intercession through Prophet Muhammad (Peace be upon him) and this verse is Mutlaq (not restricted to any time) and none of the classical commentators of Qur'an said that it only applied to the Dhahiri Hayaat of Prophet (Peace be upon him) as falsely asserted by people of Bidah (Salafis/Wahabis/Ghayr Muqalideen/Quranites/Ikhwanees/Najdis/Khawarij/Takfiri etc...). Before citing many commentaries of Qur'an we would like to present a logical rhetoric question and then provide an answer:

Question: When Allah is Qarib (close) then why does He not say: Ask me in your houses and I will answer you, why does He put the condition of going to Prophet (Peace be upon him)?

Answer: If the Munafiqeen and those who deny Tawassul understand this point then Insha'Allah this article shall be a source of guidance to them and their generations. This verse proves from the Nass of Qur'an that Tawassul in sight of Allah is an approved approach towards Him. We as Ahlus Sunnah consider both the ways to be right i.e. Asking Allah without an intermediary and also asking Allah through an intermediary. Both these procedures are ordained for us, so rejecting any of the two concepts can result in rejection of glorious verses of Qur'an and can even lead to Kufr (disbelief). Without Tawassul of Prophets we would not have had Qur'an, nor Salaat, nor fasting nor hajj rather not even a single good deed on this earth. Had Tawassul been shirk or Bidah then it would have been Shirk and Bidah in all forms whether through an alive person or dead.

Our Response :

This understanding is against the understandings of Sahaba and Tabiyeen, for example the very Next verse says [004:065] "But no! by your Lord! they do not believe (in reality) **until they make you a judge of that which has become a matter of disagreement** among them, and then do not find any straightness in their hearts as to what you have decided and submit with entire submission."

How many times these people take their disputes to the grave of Prophet (peace be upon him) and have made him (s.a.w) a judge? And how many times did our beloved and honored Prophet (peace be upon him) decide who is right and who is wrong? So, when it comes to asking help from dead they use the Quranic verse no. 64 but when it comes to making him judge i.e the very next verse 65. They do interpretation of the verse.

Tafsir Jalalayn says

"O you who believe, obey God, and obey the Messenger and those in authority among you, that is, rulers, when they command you to obey God and His Messenger. If you should quarrel, disagree, about anything, **refer it to God, that is, to His Book, and the Messenger, while he lives, and thereafter [refer] to his Sunna: in other words examine these [disputes] with reference to these two [sources],** if you believe in God and the Last Day; that, reference to the two [sources], is better, for you than quarrelling or [adhering to] personal opinions, and more excellent in interpretation, in the end."[In his tafsir under 4:59]

Meaning after the blessed death of Prophet peace be upon him, we don't have to take disputes at his grave rather we have to refer Quran and his sunnah. Same goes to verse 64. After his blessed death we don't have to go to the grave and ask him directly.

Imam Ibn Abdul Hadi(704 h-744h) said

من فهم هذا من سلف الأمة وأئمة الإسلام، فاذكر لنا عن رجل واحد من الصحابة أو التابعين أو تابعي التابعين أو الأئمة الأربعة أو غيرهم من الأئمة وأهل الحديث والتفسير أنه فهم العموم بالمعنى الذي ذكرته أو عمل به وأرشد إليه. فدعواك على العلماء بطريق العموم وهذا الفهم دعوى باطلة

Who from the Salaf of this ummah and scholars of Islam understood this meaning? Show us the meaning of generality you have taken from this verse from only one sahaba, tabiyeen, Taba Tabiyeen or four Imams (Abu Hanifa, Maalik, Shafiee, Ahmad) or others from the people of hadith or Tafseer? or he practiced on it (as you mentioned), or guided towards it (like the way you explained). Your claim that all the scholars took its generality is a false claim[as-Sarim al-Munki fe Radd al-Subki page 321]

The claim of Imam Ibn Abdul Hadi is supported by Imam Mujahid (Tabiyee) and earliest scholars like Imam Al Tabri and others.

Below is the response to Tahir ul Qadri by Br. Bassam Zawadi, taken from Multaqa

BLOCK -2

We sent not an apostle, but to be obeyed, in accordance with the will of Allah. If they had only, when they were unjust to themselves, **come to the Messenger and asked Allah's forgiveness,** ***and the Messenger had asked forgiveness for them,*** they would have found Allah indeed Oft returning, Most Merciful.(4:64)

First of all, the verse kind of makes it clear that it is talking about a certain group of them when it says "And if they had come to you"

Secondly, the Quranic commentators made it clear that it was referring to the hypocrites...

Tabari

يَعْنِي بِذَلِكَ جَلَّ ثَنَاؤُهُ : وَلَوْ أَنَّ هَؤُلَاءِ الْمُنَافِقِينَ الَّذِينَ وَصَفَ صِفَتَهمْ فِي هَاتَيْنِ الْآيَتَيْنِ

and another opinion (which is that of Mujahid) was that it was referring to a specific Jew or Muslim...

وَقَالَ مُجَاهِد : عُنِيَ بِذَلِكَ : الْيَهُودِيّ وَالْمُسْلِم اللَّذَانِ تَحَاكَمَا إِلَى كَعْب بْن الْأَشْرَف

Zamakshari

Says it (the verse was referring to) the hypocrites...

وَلَوْ أَنَّهُمْ إِذ ظَّلَمُواْ أَنفُسَهُمْ } بالتحاكم إلى الطاغوت { جاؤك } تائبين من النفاق متنصلين عما ارتكبوا {

and Imam Razi says the same thing.

So this shows that the verse is not general if one looks at the asbaab al nuzool (reasons for the revelation of the verse and its historical context).(end quote of br bassam)

BLOCK - 3

They quoted

1. Imam Ibn Kathir (rah) endorsing Tawassul in tafsir of above verse:

وقد ذكر جماعة منهم الشيخ أبو منصور الصباغ في كتابه الشامل الحكاية المشهورة عن العتبي قال : كنت جالسا عند قبر النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فجاء أعرابي فقال : السلام عليك يا رسول الله سمعت الله يقول " ولو أنهم إذ ظلموا أنفسهم جاءوك فاستغفروا الله واستغفر لهم الرسول لوجدوا الله توابا رحيما " وقد جئتك مستغفرا لذنبي مستشفعا بك إلى ربي ثم أنشأ يقول : يا خير من دفنت بالقاع أعظمه فطاب من طيبهن القاع والأكم نفسي الفداء لقبر أنت ساكنه فيه العفاف وفيه الجود والكرم ثم انصرف الأعرابي فغلبتني عيني فرأيت النبي صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم في النوم فقال : يا عتبي الحق الأعرابي فبشره أن الله قد غفر له " .

Translation: *Jama'at (Many scholars)* have stated this tradition. One of them is Abu Mansur al-Sabbagh who writes in his book Al-Shamil Al-Hikayat-ul-mashhurah that, according to 'Utbi, **once he was sitting beside the Prophet's grave when a bedouin came and he said, "Peace be on you, O Allah's Messenger. I have heard that Allah says: '**(O beloved!) And if they had come to you, when they had wronged their souls, and asked forgiveness of Allah, and the Messenger also had asked forgiveness for them, they (on the basis of this means and intercession) would have surely found Allah the Granter of repentance, extremely Merciful.' **I have come to you, asking forgiveness for my sins and I make you as my intermediary before my Lord and I have come to you for this purpose." Then he recited these verses: "O, the most exalted among the buried people who improved the worth of the plains and the hillocks! May I sacrifice my life for this grave which is made radiant by you, (the Prophet,) the one who is (an embodiment) of mercy and forgiveness."** Then the bedouin went away and I fell asleep. In my dream I saw the Holy Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him). He said to me: O 'Utbi, the bedouin is right, go and give him the good news that Allah has forgiven his sins. [Ibn Kathir, Tafsir-ul-Qur'an al-azim Volume 004, Page No. 140, Under the Verse 4:64]

Click here for Scanned Page (1)

Important Note: This report is only shown to reveal the beautiful Aqida of Imam Ibn Kathir (rah) and he has declared it to be narrated by "JAMAAH (GROUP OF SCHOLARS)" and considered it Hikayat al "MASHUR (AS HE DID NOT GIVE ANY JARH)" Please note that Imam Ibn Kathir (rah) nowhere calls it shirk rather uses it as proof in his magnificent Tafsir. Another reason why this report is shown is to reveal the deceit of Salafis who have deliberately removed this report from the English version of Tafsir Ibn Kathir.

The Proof on Tawassul for us comes from many Quranic verses and "ABSOLUTELY SAHIH AHADITH" which shall be mentioned later in this article. Also note that Many scholars have cited the above report in "Manasik of Hajj and visiting the grave of Prophet (Peace be upon him)" While doing Istadlal from it none of the classical A'ima (scholars) called this incident as Shirk or Bidah, which proves beyond any shadow of doubt that great scholars of Ahlus Sunnah cited it as Proof and believed in Tawassul

Our Response

- **Ibn e kathir said**

وقد ذكر جماعة منهم الشيخ أبو نصر بن الصباغ في كتابه " الشامل " الحكاية المشهورة عن العتبي،

It was mentioned by a group like Shaikh Abu Nasr alsabbagh in his book alshamel the incident that **Al-U'tbi (who narrated it) is mash-hoor(famouse)…..(end of statement)**

This is weak according to Ibn Kathir. The students of hadeeth know that if the muhaddith mentioned the narration with the seegha tamreedh, then it means it is weak according to him. Secondly Aqeedah is not based from the Hikayaah according to Ahlus sunnah, **The Claim "why Ibne Kathir and others mentioned this story in their books? It shows that they agree with this athar of Utbi"**

Reply to this is that no where Ibne Kathir Authenticated this athar, but he said it is Mashur Hikayah. And we say Hikayah can be weak and Fabricated, Now This is the Stance of Ibne Katheer.

Creed of Ibne Kathir

Allah says: And ask those of Our messengers whom We sent before thee: Did We ever appoint gods to be worshipped beside the Beneficent? (43:45)

- **Commentary of Ibn e kathir says**

قال مجاهد في قراءة عبد الله بن مسعود رضي الله عنه: (واسأل الذين أرسلنا إليهم قبلك رسلنا). وهكذا حكاه قتادة والضحاك والسدي عن ابن مسعود رضي الله عنه، وهذا كأنه تفسير لا تلاوة، والله أعلم. وقال عبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم: واسألهم ليلة الإسراء؛ فإن الأنبياء عليهم الصلاة والسلام جمعوا له، واختار ابن جرير الأول، والله أعلم.

Mujahid said that `Abdullahbin Mas`ud recited it: ((مِنْ) وَاسْأَلِ الَّذِينَ أَرْسَلْنَا إِلَيْهِمْ قَبْلَكَ رُسُلِنَا) (And ask those whom We sent before you of Our Messengers.)

This was narrated by Qatadah, Ad Dahak and as-Suddi from Ibn Mas`ud, may Allah be pleased with him. Yet this appears to be an explanation rather than an alternate version of recitation. so meaning is that ask to those people to whom these messengers were sent, abdul rehman said ask to the anbiya, meaning in the night of meraj and ibn e jareer hold the first one

- **Comment:**

It is Clearly Refuting the stance that we can ask anbiya in this world because Ibne Kathir and ibn e jareer knew, that it is impossible for Prophet peace be upon him to ask anbiya in this world (other than a miracle) so they preferred first opinion.

Ibne Katheer said under the Biography of Sayyiyadah Nafeesah in Al Bidaya wal Nihaya

والذي ينبغي أن يعتقد فيها ما يليق بمثلها من النساء الصالحات، وأصل عبادة الأصنام من المغالاة في وأصحابها، وقد أمر النبي بتسويه القبور وطمسها، والمغالاة في البشر حرام القبور ومن زعم أنها تفك من الخشب (هكذا) أو أنها تنفع أو تضر بغير مشيئة الله فهو مشرك.رحمها الله وأكرمها.)

The AITEQAAD(creed) regarding her is not applicable for righteous women like her, The Origin of Idol worship is Exaggeration for graves and people of graves (the person who are in the grave), That is why Prophet peace be upon him ordered to level and Obliterate the graves, and Exaggerating for any Man is Prohibited, It is alleged.. (whoever thinks that) they can benefit or harm without the will of Allah is Mushrik

-

Comment

So the own sayings of Ibne Kthir is different (i.e contradictory to grave worshiping or seeking tawassul through the dead) and thus quoting something in book never means the author agree with it

- It is mentioned in Maghazi

حدثنا أحمد قال : نا يونس بن بكير عن أبي خلدة بن دينار قال : نا أبو العالية قال لما فتخنا تستر وجدنا في بيت مال الهرمزان سريراً عليه رجل ميت عند رأسه مصحف له فأخذنا المصحف فحملنا إلى عمر بن الخطاب فدعا له كعباً فنسخه بالعربية فأنا أول رل من العرب قرأته مثلما أقرأ القرآن هذا فقلت لأبي العالية: ما كان فيه ؟ فقال سيرتكم وأموركن ولحون كلامكم وما هو كائن بعد قلت : فما صنعتم بالرجل ؟. قال حفرنا بالنهار ثلاثة عشر قبراً متفرقة فلما كان الليل دفناه وسوينا القبور كلها لتعمية على الناس لا ينبشونه ، قلت وما يرجون منه ؟قال: كانت السماء إذا جست عليهم برزوا بسريره فيمطرون قلت من كنتم تظنون الرجل ؟ قال رجل يقال له دنيال فقلت ، منذ كم وجدتموه مات ؟ قال : منذ ثلاثمائة سنة قلت : ما كان تغير بشيء ؟ قال : لا إلا شعيرات من قفاه ، إن لحوم الأنبياء لاتبليها الأرض ولا تأكلها السباع

.

Abul Aalia said: "When Tastar was invaded, we found, in the treasure house of Al-Harmazan, a bed on which lay a dead man, with a holy script at his bedside. We took the scripture to Umar Ibn Al-Khattab. He called Ka'b and he translated it into Arabic, and I was the first Arab to read it. I read it as I read the Quran." Here, I (i.e. Khalid Ibn Dinar) said to Abul Aalia: "What was in it?" He said: "Life history, annals, songs, speech, and what is to come." I asked: "And what did you do with the man?" He said: "We dug in the river bank thirteen separate graves. At nightfall we buried him and leveled all the graves in order to mislead people for they would tamper with him." I asked: "And what did they want from him?" He said: "When the sky was cloudless for them, they went out with his bed, and it rained." I asked: "Who did you think the man was?" He said: "A man called Daniel." I asked: "And for how long had he been dead when you found him?" He said: 'Three hundred years." I asked: "Did not anything change on him?" He said: "No, except for the

hairs of his face (beard and mustache); the skin of the prophets is not harmed by the earth, nor devoured by hyenas."

[Narrated by Ibne Abi Duniya, Behaqi, Muhammad bin Ishaq in Maghazi, This is mentioned in Hadiya tul Mustafeed page 226 english translation, Mentioned by Ibne Kathir in his book Stories of the Prophets and Authenticated, Mentioned by Shaykh Al Bani in Fadail as Sham and Damishq page 18 and Authenticated, Ibn Abdul Hadi mentioned in as-Sarim al Munki and the Muhaqqiq of a-Sarim al Munki Aqeel Al Maqtaree said "The chain of this story is Hasan"as-Sarim al Munki page no: 170]

.

Ibne Katheer Authenticated and said

The chain of citation from Abul Aa'lia is good, but if the date of the dead man's death was really three hundred years, then he was not a prophet but a saintly Man, because there was no prophet between Isa (Jesus)(pbuh), and the Prophet Muhammad (pbuh), according to the hadith in Bukhari. The span between them (the dead man and Muhammad (pbuh)) was variously reported as four hundred, six hundred, and six hundred twenty years. It could be that he had died eight hundred years earlier, which would be near to Daniel's time, if his being Daniel is correct. However, he could still have been somebody else, either a prophet or a saint. Yet the truth is more likely he was Daniel, because he had been taken by the King of Persia and remained imprisoned as already mentioned. It was narrated with a correct citation that his nose as one span (nine inches) long. Anas Ibn Malik, with a good citation, said that his nose was an arm's stretch long (two feet), on which basis he is thought to be an ancient prophet from before this period. Almighty Allah knows best.[Stories of the Prophets under Prophet Daniel]

So, we can see the own sayings of Ibn Katheer are very different then what so called *"ahlus-sunna.com"* are conveying. See another saying

Ibn e Kathir said in al-Bidaya wal Nihaya under the Tarjuma of al-Khidr bin Nasr

وترجمه ابن خلكان في الوفيات ، وقال قبره يزار، وقد زرته غير مرة، ورأيت الناس ينتابون قبره ويتبركون به، وهذا الذي قاله ابن خلكان مما ينكره أهل العلم عليه وعلى أمثاله ممن يعظم القبور

Ibn Khilkaan mentioned his biography in al-Wafayāt and said: People visit his grave and i have visited his grave and i have seen people visiting his grave and seeking blessings from it. This is what Ibn Khilkaan said. **People of knowledge rejected the veneration on his grave and a like**[al-Bidaya wal-Nihaya 12/371]

We have mentioned the aqeedah of Imam Ibn Kathir from his tafsir of Quran, from his books on Prophets and his book al-Bidaya wal Nihaya. What more do these people want? They can just quote Hikayaat, if hikayaat are used for aqeedah then what about this hikayaah?

Ibne Kathir mentioned

وقال ابن عساكر: حدثنا أبو الفضل محمد بن محمد بن الفضل بن المظفر العبدي قاضي البحرين من لفظه وكتبه لي بخطه - قال: رأيت يزيد بن معاوية في النوم فقلت له: أنت قتلت الحسين؟
فقال: لا!
فقلت له: هل غفر الله لك؟
قال: نعم، وأدخلني الجنة.

Ibne Athakir said: Abul Fadhal Muhammad bin Fadhal bin al-Muzaffar al-Abdi who is judge in Behrain told me in the letter. He saw Yazeed bin Muawiyah in the dream. I asked him: Did you kill hussain? Yazeed said No. I asked Allah saved you? He said "Yes" Allah sent me in the paradise. [Al Bidaya wal Nihaya vol 16 page no: 299 under the Tarjuma of Yazeed bin Muawiyah]

Now what is the stance of Brailwism on Imam of Ahlus sunnah Ibn Kathir? If this is not enough for them than nothing can change them, May Allah guide them amen.

BLOCK - 4

They said

Had there been a hint of shirk in such practice then they would have never ignored to refute it let alone citing it in category of recommended deeds. Before we move forward to next proofs we consider it most important to mention the beautiful explanation of Imam an-Nawawi (rah) who was a great specialist over hadith in Shafi'i school and is ranked at top of Muhaditheen to the extent that his books over ahadith like Riyaadh us Saliheen are translated in variety of languages and approved by Muslim Ummah as a whole. He said and we quote:

2. Imam an-Nawawi (Rahimuhullah) while emphatically proving Tawassul said:

ويتوسل به في حق نفسه ثم يرجع إلى موقفه الاول قبالة وجه رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ما حكاه الماوردي والقاضي أبو سبحانه وتعالى ومن**أحسن ما يقول ويستشفع به إلى ربه** قال (كنت جالسا عند قبر رسول الله صلى الله عليه **وسائر أصحابنا عن العتبي مستحسنين له** الطيب وسلم فجاء أعرابي فقال السلام عليك يا رسول الله سمعت الله يقول (ولو أنهم إذ ظلموا أنفسهم جاءوك فاستغفروا الله واستغفر لهم الرسول لوجدوا الله توابا رحيما) وقد جئتك مستغفرا من ذنبي مستشفعا بك إلى ربي

Translation: (The pilgrim) should turn towards the face of the Messenger of Allah (صلى الله عليه وسلم) and make him a means (*tawassul*) for the sake of himself and also seek his intercession (shafa'at) towards reaching God. In this regard **"THE BEST OF SAYINGS"** is the Hikayat of Imam al-Marwadi (rah) and Qadhi Abu at-Tayb (rah) and **"ALL MY OTHER ASHAAB (I.E. SHAWAFI)" the narration of Utbi "AND THEY CONSIDERED IT HASAN/RECOMMENDED (**مستحسنين له**)"** i.e. Bedouin who visited the Prophet's grave and sat beside it said: Peace unto you O Messenger of Allah, I have heard Allah has said:
Had they, when they had wronged themselves, come to you and asked Allah's forgiveness and the Apostle had asked forgiveness for them, they would certainly have found Allah Most-Propitious, Most-Merciful. (Holy Qur'an 4: 64).
Therefore, I have come to you for forgiveness of my sins and seeking your intercession with Allah [*Imam an-Nawawi in Al-Majmu', Volume No. 8, Page No. 274*]

This beautiful explanation by Imam an-Nawawi (rh) proves without any shadow of doubt that great Muhaditheen (hadith masters) not only authenticated this very report but also considered the action as Mustahab (recommended).

We ask the Wahabis not to consider themselves superior to classical Hadith masters especially likes of Imam an-Nawawi (rah) who is unanimously agreed to be the best commentator of Sahih Muslim and a leading authority in Shafi'i school plus many other legendary scholars whom they themselves revere very highly for example Hafidh Ibn Kathir and others (whom we shall cite in this article later on). They have authenticated this report and used it as conclusive proof. We will not go in detail about Sanad of this report because

when Muhaditheen authenticated it then even if Wahabiyyah find some so called D'af (weakness) today it will stand as null and void according to us Ahlus Sunnah wal Jamm'ah because the Muhaditheen knew the so called Da'af better than us but still they authenticated it.If still wahabis are stubborn as we know they always are then they should continue reading this article as we have established from overwhelming absolutely sahih hadiths the permissibility rather fairness of Tawassul.

Our Response

First of all in this hikayah he is not asking help from Prophet rather he is asking directly from Allah and that is what Imam Nawawi is trying to convey, and no one ever authenticated this athar **Imam Nawawi himself said**

إذا كان الحديث ضعيفا لا يقال فيه قال رسول الله : فصل قال العلماء المحققون من أهل الحديث وغيرهم أو حكم وما أشبه ذلك من صيغ الجزم ، وكذا لا يقال فيه صلى الله عليه وسلم أو فعل أو أمر أو نهى ، أو قال ، أو ذكر ، أو أخبر ، أو حدث ، أو نقل ، أو أفتى ، وما أشبهه ، وكذا لا يقال ذلك أبو هريرة روى في التابعين ومن بعدهم فيما كان ضعيفا ، فلا يقال في شيء من ذلك بصيغة الجزم ، وإنما يقال في هذا كله حكي عنه أو جاء عنه أو بلغنا عنه ، أو يقال أو يذكر أو يحكى أو يروى أو يرفع روي عنه أو نقل عنه أو أو يعزى ، وما أشبه ذلك من صيغ التمريض ، وليست من صيغ الجزم ، قالوا : فصيغ الجزم موضوعة للصحيح أو الحسن ، وصيغ التمريض لما سواهما ، وذلك أن صيغة الجزم تقتضي صحته عن المضاف إليه فلا ينبغي أن يطلق إلا فيما صح ، وإلا فيكون الإنسان في معنى الكاذب عليه .

Scholars and researchers among people of hadeeth and others said that when the hadeeth is weak, so it will not be said that Prophet peace be upon him said that or he had done or he ordered or he stopped and there are other words like this which are used for the mode of affirmation, these modes can not be used. And it can not be said that Abu Huraira narrated or he said that or mentioned that or he told or explained or transferred or gave fatwa. And it can not be said for tabiyeen and people after them while the (narration attributed to them) is weak.
And we can not use the mode of affirmation in any other thing. **In all these situations these modes are used ruviya anhu or nuqila anhu or huqiya anhu or jaa anhu or balaghnaaa anhu or it is said (Yaqaal) or Yuzkaru or Yuhkay or Yurwa or or yurfaoo or yuazaroo and there are other modes which can be used here (in seegha at-Tameeedh)**. And we can not use the mode of affirmation (on these kind of narrations) because the mode of affirmation are entitled for authentic and Hasan Narrations, and the mode of tamreedh is used for other

narrations (like weak and fabricated etc). Because the mode of affirmation requires authentication of being established and it cannot be used for those which are not authentic. Else under such situations the man would be considered a liar if he say something"

http://www.islamweb.net/newlibrary/display_book.php?idfrom=97&idto=97&bk_no=14&ID=83

Comment: So its is clear that it is not authentic according to Muhadditheen because Ibn Qudamah mentioned it with the mode "Yurwa", Ibn Katheer with "Hikayat al Mashoora". Nawawi quoted with the mode "**ما حكاه**".Secondly this is not Quran and Sunnah, not even saying of Sahabee and Tabiyee, How can it be evidence? For the sake of argument even if it is sahih then its not fulfilling the criteria of the tawassul which soofis practice, i.e

First consider yourself to be a hypocrite (because 4:64) is about Hypocrites and then Go to the Grave of Prophet peace be upon him then make tawassul. But here we can see people ask help from Prophet peace be upon him in their Homes and in Masajid and everywhere, but this athar (which is actually not an evidence) is about only at the Grave of Prophet peace be upon him.

Imam Nawawi said

ومن خطر بباله أن المسح باليد ونحوه أبلغ في البركة فهو من جهالته وغفلته؛ لأن البركة إنما هي فيما وافق الشرع وأقوال العلماء، وكيف يبتغى الفضل في مخالفة الصواب؟!

Whoever thinks that wiping the grave (of the Prophet) with the hand attains barakah, then this is a result of the foolishness and ignorance, because barakah is attained by following shariyah and from the sayings of scholars. How can barakah can be attain by going against shariyah?[Al Eydaah fil Manaasik page 456]

- Imam Nawawi is not spreading the message like brailwis do, let me provide another great Imam to clear the stance of Imam Nawawi. **Ibn Qudama says the following:**

اللهم إنك قلت وقولك الحق : { ولو أنهم إذ ظلموا أنفسهم جاءوك فاستغفروا الله واستغفر لهم الرسول لوجدوا الله توابا رحيما } . وقد أتيتك مستغفرا من ذنوبي ، مستشفعا بك إلى ربي ، فأسألك يا رب أن توجب لي المغفرة ، كما أوجبتها لمن أتاه في حياته ، اللهم اجعله أول الشافعين

O ALLAH You spoke and your word is true"And if they had come to you, when they had wronged their souls, and asked forgiveness of Allah, and the Messenger also had asked forgiveness for them, they (on the basis of this means and intercession) would have found Allah the Granter of repentance, extremely

Merciful"(Surah an-Nisa verse 64) I came to you after I have had asked for forgiveness of my sins and seeking your intercession with your Lord. So I ask you, O Allah! To grant me your forgiveness, just as you granted it for those who came to him when he was alive. O Allah! Make him the first of all intercessors..."[alMughni Vol 3 Kitab al-Hajj]

It is clear that Ibn Qudama is making du'a to Allah directly, and there is absolutely nothing wrong with this, let alone it be bid'a or Shirk. For more information see this:**http://www.ahlalhdeeth.com/vbe/showthread.php?t=14758**

BLOCK 5

They said

Important Note: We have also noticed that Wahabi sect only revolves around Ibn Taymiyyah al-Mujasmi and his fanatic students like Ibn Abdul Hadi to refute the Ahlus Sunnah on this report (This proves that Wahabis do taqlid in Aqida whereas we rely on many many great scholars who proved this incident as recommended). Ibn Abdul Hadi actually revealed to the world that he along with his master used to **cuss and bad-mouth the scholars** frequently.

The very title of his book is pathetic and proves like bright sun that Imam as-Subki - Rahimuhullah - had destroyed Ibn Taymiyyah's ideology completely, Ibn Abdul Hadi named the book as Sarim al Munki fi radd ala Subki , he filled it with cusses and pseudo rebuttals just in fanatic love of Ibn Taymiyyah whereas on the other hand Ibn Abdul Hadi even tried to prove circulating around the grave of Ibn Taymiyyah as an act of Angels - Naudhobillah **!!!** (see: **Al-Uqud Ad-Durriyyah, 1/434)**, this proves that he loved his master more than Prophet Muhammad - صلى الله عليه وسلم - This is why Allah made Shifa us Siqaam by Imam as-Subki the best ever book written on topic of Tawasssul and Istighatha (seeking help) and there has been no match to it ever since

OUR RESPONSE

Now they are attacking the great Muhaddith and Imam Ibn Abdul Hadi, they themselves praised nd quoted Imam Ibn Kathir but they failed to quote Ibn Kathir Rahimullah regarding Imam Ibn Abdul Hadi.

Ibn e kathir RA said regarding him

الشيخ الإمام العالم العلامة الناقد البارع في فنون العلم، حصل من العلوم ما لا يبلغه الشيوخ الكبار، " وتفنن في الحديث والنحو والتصريف والفقه والتفسير والأصلين والتاريخ

The shaykh the Imam The scholar …..[Al Bidaya wal Nihayah 18/466]

Ibn e Nasir ud din damashqi said.

قال ابن ناصر الدين الدمشقي: الشيخ الإمام العلامة الحافظ الناقد ذو الفنون عمدة المحدثين متقن المحررين.

Al shaykh Al Imam Al Allamah Al Hafidh…[Al Radd Al Wafir vol 1 page 29]

We are not shocked after seeing the so called *"ahlus sunna"* website`s false accusation against Imam Ibn Abdul Hadi because it is their old habbit to defame great Imams. Why these people accused Imam Ibn Abdul Hadi? That is because he thrashed their arguments by saying

- Imam al Muhaddith Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Abdul-Haadee (705h to 744 h) said.

"الحكاية هذه التي ذكرها بعضهم :
1- إسناد بلا العتبي عن يرويها .
2- الهلالي حرب بن محمد عن يرويها وبعضهم.
3- الأعرابي عن الزعفراني الحسن أبي عن حرب بن محمد عن يرويها وبعضهم.
4-
أبو حدثني البصري، يزيد بن روح بن محمد عن مظلم بإسناد الإيمان شعب كتاب في البيهقي ذكرها وقد ثم فعقلها راحلته أناخ وسلم عليه الله صلى الله رسول بابمسجد إلى جاء فلما أعرابي حج :قال الهلالي حرب . تقدم ما نحو ذكر ثم ، القبر أتى حتى دخل

"This incident as some people have mentioned and have narrated it from Utbi without a chain, some narrate it from Muhammad bin Harb al-Hilaalee and some

from Muhammad bin Harb from Abul-Hasan Za'afaraanee and he from the bedouin arab. Biahaqee has transmitted in Shu'bal Eemaan with a defective chain from Muhammad bin Rooh bin Yazeed Basree who said mentioned to me Abu Harb al-Hilaahee and then he mentioned the narration as above.(as-Saarim al Munkee pg.246)

Whoever responded back academically brailwis and the followers of Nuh Keller started defaming and abusing them and declared them fanatics. This is their Manhaj, May Allah guide them amen.

BLOCK - 6

They said

Imam Jalaluddin Suyuti in "Dur al-Manthur":

(والسيوطي في الدر المنثور (١/٥٧٠-٢٣
وأخرج البيهقي عن أبي حرب الهلالي قال : حج أعرابي إلى باب مسجد رسول الله صلى الله عليه " وسلم أناخ راحلته فعقلها ثم دخل المسجد حتى أتى القبر ووقف بحذاء وجه رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فقال : بأبي أنت وأمي يا رسول الله جئتك مثقلا بالذنوب والخطايا مستشفعا بك على ربك لأنه قال في محكم تنزيله ولو إنهم إذ ظلموا أنفسهم جاؤوك فاستغفروا الله واستغفر لهم الرسول لوجدوا الله توابا رحيما

Imam al-Bayhaqi (rah) has narrated from Abi Harb al-Hilali who said:... (and then he mentioned the incident of Araabi) [Tafsir Dur al Manthur under 4:64)]

OUR RESPONSE

The response is given in the sayings of Ibn Abdul Hadee above, quoting something in the book is something different and own sayings are something different. Even though Imam Jalal ud din suyuti rahimullah was inclined towards Sufism but in this matter he is strongly against them as he said.

Jalal ud din Suyooti in his work :السيوطي- الأمر بالاتباع والنهي عن الابتداع

Under the Chapter تعظيم الأماكن التي لا تستحق التعظيم (Veneration of those places which are not applicable for veneration)

First he replied those who say that our prayers are accepted at these places or graves or shrines etc He replied by saying

وقد كان الكفار يدعون، فيستجاب لهم فيسقون وينصرون يعافون مع دعائهم عند أوثام وتوسلهم ا. وقد قال تعالى: (كُلاّ نمد هؤلاء وهؤلاء من عطاء ربك وما كان عطاء ربك محظوراً

Kuffar pray in front of Idols and with the Wasilah of Idols and their prayers are Accepted ,then Rain comes to them, Help comes to them , Afiyah comes to them as Allah says (in Bani Israeel:20) On each these as well as those We bestow from the bounties of your Lord. And the bounties of your Lord can never be forbidden [Page 124 with the tehqeeq of Shaykh Mashoor bin Hasan aal Salmaan publihed by دار ابن القيم للنشر والتوزيع ، الدمام ، ط 1 ، 1410 هـ / 1990 م]

Scan:http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/OwAAAM1L00qhpCh6h28aeikiwqa3McivDCTOox_SRTLLkuxKT1ozKlpNDh9NEsAz5i3BC1VG6alMINuVjrV4DOv3h8MAm1T1UB5xVJbKBdQwx18XNsO68b2f2GQH.jpg

- On page 139 he said

فإن قصد القبور للدعاء رجاء الإجابة فمنهي عنه، وهو إلى التحريم أقرب. والصحابة رضي الله عنهم - وقد أجدبوا مراتٍ - ودهمتهم نوائب بعد موته (، فهلا جاءوا فاستسقوا واستغاثوا عند قبر النبي (وهو أكرم الخلق على الله عز وجل، بل خرج فيهم سيدنا عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه .) بالعباس عم النبي (إلى المصلى فاستسقى به، ولم يستسقوا عند قبر النبي فاقتد أيها المسلم إن كنت عبد الله بسلفك الصالح، وتحقق التوحيد الخالص؛ فلا تعبد إلا الله، ولا تشرك بربك أحداً، كما أمر الله تعالى بقوله: (فإياي فاعبدون)، وقال تعالى: (فمن كان يرجو لقاء ربه فليعمل عملاً صالحاً ولا يشرك بعبادة ربه أحداً). فلا تعبد إلا إياه ولا تد ع إلا هو، ولا تستعن إلا به، فإنه لا مانع ولا معطي ولا مضار ولا نافع إلا هو سبحانه وتعالى، لا إله إلا هو عليه توكلت وإليه أنيب

For Verily visiting the graves with the intention that our prayers will be accepted is not allowed and it is closer to Haraam. Sahaaba faced so many difficulties after the death of Prophet (peace be upon him) (for example) drought came to them,..... so Why didn't they come to the grave of Prophet of Allah? Why didn't they request him (peace be upon him) for rain? Why they didn't call at his grave?

Prophet (SAW) is the highest of the creation in the sight of Allah

In fact at the time of drought OMAR (Ra) went to Eid GAH with Abbas RA and asked him to pray for rain (prayer of istesqa see Sahih bukhari for detailed athar).

They never prayed near grave of Prophet (peace be upon him). O Muslim If You are follower of Allah like your Salaf as Saleh were so follow them, do Research of Correct Tauheed, Do not Worship other then Allah, Do not Make Partners of Allah. As Allah Commanded (Therefore worship Me.) and Allah says (So whoever hopes for the meeting with his Lord, let him work righteousness and associate none as a partner in the worship of his Lord.") (end)

Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/OwAAAGELeRXxbwwbrWMO_RqurrqsR42dlhUuEDmYumyLYp7BA2l2D_U0q-bmeIXej8dP_SRNZ53zT59bz9gomuN1ACcAm1T1UCcBhTs5Lh0dGBoLJdv9wPeQN-Ky.jpg

- **Comment**:

This book is publish by مكتبة القرآن بولاق Qahirah with the Tahqeeq of Mustafa Ashoor Also دار الكتب العلمية للنشر with the Tahqeeq of Mustafa Abdul Qadir Ata, Shaykh Mashoor bin Hasan aal Salmaan also did tehqeeq of this book Published by دار ابن القيم للنشر والتوزيع ، الدمام ، ط 1 ، 1410 هـ / 1990 م Suyuti ra is clear in his stance some people may quote suyuti where He has related the tradition of Adam's intermediation in ad-Durr-ul-manthūr (1:58) and al-Khasā'is-ul-kubrā (1:6) and also he quoted the tawassul of jews in his book.but this is only he has narrated not that those were his own wrdings and 2ndly Hafiz As-Suyuti himself weakened the narration of jews in his "Dur ul Manthur. and weakened the narration of Adam peace be upon him in Sharah As shifa.

It is mentionned in Tafsir of Jalalayn under Surah al-Araf verse 188

Say: ‘I have no power to **bring** benefit, **to attract it to,** myself, or hurt, to repel it, except as God wills. Had I knowledge of the Unseen — **that which is hidden from me**, I would have acquired much good, and adversity, **in the way of impoverishment and otherwise**, would not touch me, **since I would take precautions against such [adversity] by avoiding what is harmful**. I am but a

warner, **to disbelievers, of the Fire**, and a bearer of good tidings**, of Paradise**, to a people who believe'.

Here Imam Jalal ud din Suyuti Rahimullah is advising the people (likes of brailwis). May Allah guide these people amen

BLOCK 7

They quoted

Imam Qurtubi (rah) on Tawassul:

روى أبو صادق عن علي قال : قدم علينا أعرابي بعدما دفنا رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم بثلاثة أيام , فرمى بنفسه على قبر رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وحثا على رأسه من ترابه ; فقال : قلت يا رسول الله فسمعنا قولك , ووعيت عن الله فوعينا عنك , وكان فيما أنزل الله عليك " ولو أنهم إذ ظلموا أنفسهم " الآية , وقد ظلمت نفسي وجئتك تستغفر لي . فنودي من القبر إنه قد غفر لك .

Its related from Abu Sadiq (ra) that Imam Ali (ra) said: "Three days after burying the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) arab did came and did throw himself on the grave of the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him), took the earth and throw it on his head. He said: "Ya Rasulallah! (Peace Be Upon Him) You did speak and we did hear, you learned from Allah and we did learn from you. Between those things which Allah did send you, is following: (4:64) I am the one, which is a sinner and now I did came to you, so that you may ask for me." After that a call from the grave did came: "Theres no doubt, you are forgiven!" [Tafsir al-Qurtubi, al-Jami li Ahkam al-Quran Volume 006, Page No. 439, Under the Verse, 4:64]

Click here for Scanned Page (3)

The incident of the Bedouin has also been recorded by the following:

1. Bayhaqi in Shu'ab-ul-Imaan (Volume no: 3, Page no:495-496, Hadith No#4178) **Click here for Scanned Page (130)**

2. Ibn Qudamah in al-Mughni- (Book : Kitab Al Hajj Chapter : Wa

Yustahabbu Ziyarat Qabr An NABI SAW Volume : 5 Page : 465) **Click here for Scanned Page (**131**)**

3. Ibn ‘Asakir in Tahdhīb tarikh Dimashq al-kabir popularly known as Tarikh/Tahdhib Ibn ‘Asakir as quoted by Imam as-Subki in Shifa’-us-siqam fī ziyaat khayr-il-anam **(pp. 46-7).**

4. Tafsir al-Bahr al-Muheet by Imam Abu Hayyan al-Andalusi (3/282, Dar al Fikr edition) or Book : Tafseer bahr Al Muheet Volume : 3 Page : 269 Under : Sorat An Nisa Ayat number 64 **Click here for Scanned Page (**132**)**

5. Imam al-Mutaqi al-Hindi in Kanz ul Amaal (1/714 #10422) or Book : Tafseer bahr Al Muheet Volume : 3 Page : 269 Under : Sorat An Nisa Ayat number 64 **Click here for Scanned Page (**133**)**

6. Imam al-Nawawi again in his al-Majmu' **(8/202-203)**

7. Ibn Hajar Haythami in al-Jawhar-ul-munazzam **(p. 51)**.
And many others, plus none of these Imams called it shirk or Bidah.

OUR REPONSE

- This is called ignorance, Imam Qurtubi only quoted a narration which is not authentic as **Imam Ibn Abdul Hadi said**

اه .عنه الله رضي طالب أبي بن علي إلى إسنادًا الكذابين بعض لها وضع وقد -

Some liars have even raised the chain to Alee bin Abee Taalib (as-Saarim al Munkee pg.246)

on page 247 he says

" وفي الجملة : ليست هذه الحكاية المنكورة عن الأعرابي مما يقوم به حجة وإسنادها مظلم"

This story mentioned from al Arabi is not evidence, its chain is Dark”(end)

Plus the text is also false because it is against the authentic teachings of Prophet peace be upon him and the practice of sahaba because Ibn Umar ra used to dislike kissing the grave, but here the man is taking the mud from grave and throwing on his head. How can this thing is acceptable for the grave of Prophet peace be upon him? As for Imam al-Qurtubi, let me quote his own saying

([035:014] If ye invoke them, they will not listen to your call, and if they were to listen, they cannot answer your (prayer). On the Day of Judgment they will reject your "Partnership". and none, (O man!) can tell thee (the Truth) like the One Who is acquainted with all things.)

Qurtubi's Commentry:

أي إن تستغيثوا بهم في النوائب لا يسمعوا دعاءكم؛ لأنها جمادات لا تبصر ولا تسمع

Meaning is If you Call them for help in hard situations then they can not hear you because they are Jamadaat, they can not see nor hear.

ثم يجوز أن يرجع هذا إلى المعبودين مما يعقل؛ كالملائكة والجن والأنبياء والشياطين؛ أي يجحدون أن يكون ما فعلتموه حقاً، وأنهم أمروكم بعبادتهم؛
كما أخبر عن عيسى بقوله:
{ مَا يَكُونُ لِيَ أَنْ أَقُولَ مَا لَيْسَ لِي بِحَقٍّ

This is Possible that this ayah is for Angels,Jinn, Prophets and Satan they will Reject What have you done and they (will reject that they) told them to worship them, Like EESA ALEH SALAM will say (It was not for me to say what I had no right (to say).

Scan: https://lh6.googleusercontent.com/-iOqfH_QsFLs/T_Xmk6DFAwI/AAAAAAAABv8/gFINPHPn64o/s400/Untitled.jpg

So for Imam Qurtubi if you invoke Prophets they will not listen and answer and on the day of judgment they will reject their false aqeedah. Allah says
(And your Lord said, "Invoke Me, I will respond (to your invocation). 40:60

- Imam-Qurtubi states in the commentary of this verse:

فدل هذا على أن الدعاء هو العبادة. وكذا قال أكثر المفسرين

'Your Lord said: Call upon Me, and I will respond to you!', this proves that invocation is the act of worship, and this is what most of the mufassirin are upon'.(end quote)

This again goes against the aqaid of brailvism and Keller clan they should not spread shirk in the land.

BLOCK 8

They said

Quran states:

وَلَمَّا جَآءَهُمْ كِتَـبٌ مِّنْ عِندِ اللَّهِ مُصَدِّقٌ لِّمَا مَعَهُمْ وَكَانُواْ مِن قَبْلُ يَسْتَفْتِحُونَ عَلَى الَّذِينَ كَفَرُواْ فَلَمَّا جَآءَهُم مَّا عَرَفُواْ كَفَرُواْ بِهِ فَلَعْنَةُ اللَّهِ عَلَى الْكَـفِرِينَ

Translation: And when there comes to them a Book from Allah, confirming what is with them,- **although from of old they had prayed for victory against those without Faith,- when there comes to them that which they (should) have recognised**, they refuse to believe in it but the curse of Allah is on those without Faith. (2:89)

Imam Qurtubi related the tradition through Ibn 'Abbas: The Jews of Khaybar were often at war with the Ghatafan (tribe). When they confronted each other (in battle) the Jews were defeated. They attacked again, offering this prayer, "(O Lord,) we beg You through the mediation of the Unlettered Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) about whom You have promised us that you will send him to us at the end of time. Please help us against them." Ibn 'Abbas adds: whenever they faced the enemy, they offered this prayer and defeated the Ghatafan (tribe). But when the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) was sent, they denied (him). So Allah the Exalted revealed the verse: "And before that they themselves had (prayed) for victory (through the mediation of the last Prophet Muhammad (Peace Be Upon Him) and the Book revealed to him) over the disbelievers," that is, through your mediation, O Muhammad.[Tafsir Qurtubi, al-Jami li Ahkam al-Quran, Volume 002, Page No. 89-90, Under the Verse 2:89]

Click here for Scanned Page (4)

If some people have problem with authenticity of these high ranking Tafaseer then they should move directly to the hadith section below where Tawassul has been proven from irrefutable proofs mentioned in Sahih ahadith.

OUR RESPONSE

Again Imam Qurtubi is quoting an athar and surprisingly the scan they have presented states in the footnotes that "Mentioned by alHakim 2/263, alWahidi in Asbaab al-Nuzool page 25-26 and in al-Waseet 1/173. The chain contains Abdul Malik bin Haroon, Reagding him adDahabee said in Talkhees alMustadrak Rejected haalik.

See their own scan http://www.ahlus-sunna.com/images/stories/imam%20qurtubi%20on%20waseela%20used%20by%20jews.jpg

Now below is the Reply which is taken from the Book "Hazihi Mafahimuna" by Shaykh Salih Al Shaykh **صالح بن عبد العزيز بن محمد آل الشيخ** in Refutation of the book of Muhammad ibn 'Alawi Al-Maliki "**مفاهيم يجب أن تصحح**"

Shaykh Salih replied

وقد أخرجه الحاكم في "المستدرك" (263/2)، والبيهقي في"دلائل النبوة" (2/ 76) من طريق عبد الملك بن هارون بن عنترة عن أبيه عن جده عن سعيد بن جبير عن ابن عباس من كلامه. وقال الحاكم بعد ذكره :الحديث: (أدت الضرورة إلى إخراجه في التفسير وهو غريب) اهـ، قال الذهبي في "تلخيصه": (قلت .لا ضرورة في ذلك، فعبد الملك متروك هالك) اهـ
وذكر السيوطي في "الدر المنثور" أن إسناده ضعيف

This was narrated by Al-Hakim in his "Mustadrak" v 2 p 263 and Al-Bayhaqi in his "Dalail un Nubuwwah" v 2 p 76 from the Route Abdul Malik Bin Haroon bin Antrah from his Father from His grand father from Saeed bin Jubair from Ibne Abbas... Al-Hakim said after narrating this Hadith:"There is a need of quoting it in (books of) Tafsir and it is Gharib." Hafidh Ad Dahabi said in his "Talkhis": "I say: There is no such need because (the narrator) AbdulMalik is Matruk Halik (abandoned destroyed)" and Hafidh As-Suyuti mentioned in "Dur ul Manthur" and weakened this narration‹**(end)**

(والحاكم قد ذكر عبد الملك في "المدخل"(170/1) وقال: (روى عن أبيه أحاديث موضوعة
وعبد الملك هذا كذبه ابن معين وابن حبان والجوزجاني وغيرهم،

Hakim mentioned Abdul Malik in Mudakhal (1/170) and Said: "He narrated Fabrications from his Father".and Abdul Malik is Liar Acoording to Ibn e Maiyeen and Ibne Hibban and Al Jozjani and Others (end)

Then Shaykh said

قال شيخ الإسلام في "التوسل والوسيلة"
(قوله تعالى: { وَكَانُوا مِنْ قَبْلُ يَسْتَفْتِحُونَ عَلَى الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا } [البقرة: 89] إنما نزلت باتفاق أهل التفسير والسير في اليهود المجاورين للمدينة أولا، كبني قينقاع وقريظة والنظير.

Shaykh Ul Islam Ibn Taymiyah said in his "Tawassul wal Waseelah"
Allah says **(although aforetime they had invoked Allah (for the coming of Muhammad) in order to gain victory over those who disbelieved,)[Al Baqarah:89]** there is agreement between scholars of Tafseer and history that this verse came for Jews of Madeenah like Banu Qaynuqah, Quraydhah and Nadhir,

فكيف يقال: نزلت في يهود خيبر وغطفان؟ ،

so how can someone say it came about Jews of Khaybar and Ghatfaan?(end quote from Shakh Salih)

Hazihi Mafahimuna page 28 and 29

Note: Most of the Translation is taken from: **http://www.umm-ul-qura.org/info/user_pages/page.asp?art_id=128**

Hafidh Jalal Ud Din Suyuti Said under the Commentary of Surah Al Baqarah ayah 89

وأخرج الحاكم والبيهقي في الدلائل بسند ضعيف عن ابن عباس
Narrated by Al-Hakim in his "Mustadrak" and Al Behaqay in "Dalail al nabuwwah" with Weak Chain from Ibn e Abbas (and then same story)
Source: http://www.al-eman.com/islamlib/viewchp.asp?BID=248&CID=20

What Did the Jews Exactly say?

From the Commentary of Ibne Kathir, it Says:

Before this Messenger came to them, they used to ask **Allah to aid them by his arrival,** against their polytheistic enemies in war. They used to say to the polytheists, **"A Prophet shall be sent just before the end of this world and we, along with him, shall exterminate you, just as the nations of `Ad and Iram were exterminated."** Also, Muhammad bin Ishaq narrated that Ibn `Abbas said, **"The Jews used to invoke Allah (for the coming of Muhammad) in order to gain victory over the Aws and Khazraj,**before the Prophet was sent. When Allah sent him to the Arabs, they rejected him and denied what they used to say about him. Hence, Mu`adh bin Jabal and Bishr bin Al-Bara' bin Ma`rur, from Bani Salamah, said to them, `O Jews! Fear Allah and embrace Islam. **You used to invoke Allah for the coming of Muhammad(peace be upon him)**when we were still disbelievers and you used to tell us that **he would come and describe him to us**,' Salam bin Mushkim from Bani An-Nadir replied, `He did not bring anything that we recognize. He is not the Prophet we told you about.' Allah then revealed this Ayah about their statement,

(وَلَمَّا جَآءَهُمْ كِتَـبٌ مِّنْ عِندِ اللَّهِ مُصَدِّقٌ لِّمَا مَعَهُمْ)

(And when there came to them (the Jews), a Book (this Qur'an) from Allah confirming what is with them (the Tawrah) and the Injil (Gospel)).'"
Abu Al-`Aliyah said, **"The Jews used to ask Allah to send Muhammad (Peace be upon him)**so that they would gain victory over the Arab disbelievers. They used to say, **`O Allah! Send the Prophet that we read about - in the Tawrah -** so that we can torment and kill the disbelievers alongside him.' When Allah sent Muhammad (Peace be upon him) and they saw that he was not one of them, they rejected him and envied the Arabs, even though they knew that he was the Messenger of Allah. Hence, Allah said,

(فَلَمَّا جَآءَهُم مَّا عَرَفُواْ كَفَرُواْ بِهِ فَلَعْنَةُ اللَّهِ عَلَى الْكَـفِرِينَ)

(Then when there came to them that which they had recognized, they disbelieved in it. So let the curse of Allah be on the disbelievers). "(end)

BLOCK 9

They said

Intercession By Different Means

1. Maryam (alaih salam)'s place of worship used as a means of approach by Zakriyyah (alaih salam)

Allah azza Wajjal Says:

And her supervision was given to Zakariyyā. Whenever Zakariyyā entered her place of worship, he found with her (the latest and freshest) items of food. He asked, "O Maryam, where do these things come to you from?" She said, "This (food) comes from Allah." Surely, Allah gives to whomsoever He wishes without measure. (3:37)

In the next verse Allah has mentioned Zakariyyā's prayer at this very spot:

At that very place Zakariyya prayed to his Lord. He requested, "My Master! Give me from Yourself pure offspring. Surely You are the Hearer of prayer."(3:38)

Qur'an itself has rectified the error and eliminated uncertainty by using the word "hunalika (there)" When we reflect on the words of the Qur'anic verse, we realize that it was Zakariyya's routine that he woke up in the later part of the night and prayed to his Lord. According to his routine, even on that day he woke up to offer his prayer, but instead of praying at his usual place of worship, he chose specifically the chamber in which Maryam lived. If he had offered his prayer only by accident and not by design, **the insertion of the word hunalika would have been superfluous and insignificant.** Such an interpretation is not only a misreading of the Qur'anic message but also a violation of its spirit, which discourages and condemns all forms of superfluity. Thus the choice of that particular spot is an act of intermediation and at the same time it is a confirmation of the fact that a sacred spot can also serve as a source of intermediation.

OUR RESPONSE

These are different translations

Sher Ali:
[003:038] Then and there did Zachariah pray to his Lord, saying, `My Lord grant me from Thyself pure offspring; surely thou art the Hearer of Prayer.'

Shakir:
[003:038] There did Zakariya pray to his Lord; he said: My Lord! grant me from Thee good offspring; surely Thou art the Hearer of prayer.

Pickthall:
[003:038] Then Zachariah prayed unto his Lord and said: My Lord! Bestow upon me of Thy bounty goodly offspring. Lo! Thou art the Hearer of Prayer.

Muhammad Al-Hilali & Muhsin Khan:
[003:038] At that time Zakariya (Zachariya) invoked his Lord, saying: "O my Lord! Grant me from You, a good offspring. You are indeed the All-Hearer of invocation."

Nowhere the verse states that he asked Allah through the tawassul of Mariam alaihis salam rather He (peace be upon) him asked directly Allah, same is what Mariam aleh salam said to him by saying

[003:037] So her Lord accepted her with a good acceptance and made her grow up a good growing, and gave her into the charge of Zakariya; whenever Zakariya entered the sanctuary to (see) her, he found with her food. He said: O Marium! whence comes this to you? **She said: It is from Allah. Surely Allah gives to whom He pleases without measure.**

Ibn Kathir commented under the verse 38 of ale Imran

When Zakariyya saw that Allah provided sustenance for Maryam by giving her the fruits of winter in summer and the fruits of summer in winter, he was eager to have a child of his own. By then, Zakariyya had become an old man, his bones feeble and his head full of gray hair. His wife was an old women who was barren. Yet, he still supplicated to Allah and called Him in secret, (O my Lord! Grant me from Ladunka,) from You, (A good offspring) meaning, a righteous offspring, (You are indeed the All-Hearer of invocation.) (end quote)

It is clear that he asked directly from Allah and brailwis must do the same.

BLOCK 10

They said

2. Quranic method of using a blessed shirt which had touched a blessed body as a means to cure.

Allah says in surah Yusuf:
(Yusuf said,) "Take my shirt and lay it on the face of my father (Ya'qub), **he will regain his sight**." (Qur'an Yūsuf 12:93)
The Qur'an has expressed the later development in these words:

When the bearer of glad tidings arrived, he laid the shirt on the face of Ya'qūb and his sight returned immediately (Qur'an Yusuf 12:96)

This Qur'anic verse clearly proves that intermediation through any object associated with the prophets and the saints does not negate the Islamic concept of divine unity. In this case the sender of the shirt is a prophet, the one who is benefiting from this act of intermediation is also a prophet and the one who is describing the act, are all parts of a sacred phenomenon authenticated by the Qur'an itself. Therefore, to express any doubts and reservations about its authenticity is to deny the sanctity of an act which is being sanctified by no less an authority than the Qur'an.
In relevance to this we would like to cite this beautiful hadith of Sahih Muslim which makes the Aqida of Sahaba clear as bright sun.

OUR RESPONSE :

It is unanimously agreed upon in Ahlus sunnah that Holy Relics of Prophet peace be upon him are cure if they are really attributed to Prophet peace be upon him, but there is difference of opinion regarding cure in the relics of Auliyah. Imam Abu

Ishaq shatabi and Ibn Rajab Hanbalee etc are on the opinion that it is not allowed whereas, Imam Nawawi etc allowed it. Below is the proof from ahadith regarding the first matter.

It is mentioned in Bayhaqi's Shoaib al Eman

عن عبد الرحمن بن أبي قراد أن النبي - صلى الله عليه وسلم - توضأ يوما ، فجعل أصحابه يتمسحون بوضوئه ، فقال لهم النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم : " ما يحملكم على هذا ؟ " قالوا : حب الله ورسوله . فقال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم : " من سره أن يحب الله ورسوله أو يحبه الله ورسوله فليصدق حديثه إذا حدث ، وليؤد أمانته إذا اوتمن ، وليحسن جوار من جاوره "

Once Prophet peace be upon him was performing ablution and his companions started rubbing their bodies with his ablution, Prophet peace be upon him said: Which thing makes you to do this? Sahaba said: Love of Allah and his Prophet, Prophet Peace be upon him replied: One who likes to love Allah and his Prophet and who likes that Allah and his Prophet Love him; he should speak the truth, should not take from the amanah(trust/faithfulness), be good to neighbors[Shatabi in Kitab al Qayim "Al Aitesam" 1/139 Musannif Abdul Razzaq no:19748 Shoaib al Eman of Imam Behaqi no:1533,Mirqaat al Mafateeh hadeeth no: 4990 Shaykh Al Albani said "This hadeeth is Hasan" see detail in Silsilah as Saheeha hadeeth no:2998]

Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAHFjtZrVPqiQZDlNQAydGLukubYSepjmkgK0cZ8eoRodovcU4o207-EvREuHX7QiBvr6Cen7dMQaIwaMJjdnZf8Am1T1UIOZTa6pKzhMFTyHhjRiGcQE_R0Z.jpg

Narrated by Umm Alqamah that Muawiyah bin Abi Sufiyan Came to Madeenah and asked for Blanket and hair of Prophet Peace be upon him from Aisha RA then He (Muawiyah) covered himself with the blanket, dipped the hair in water, drank and put on his body.[Tareekh Damishq 62/106 and chain is Hasan as Shaykh Zubair Ali Zai said in Majallah Al Hadith no: 29 page 60]

Note: this athar is proof that how much Muawiyah RA loved Prophet peace be upon him and it is also proof for Seeking Blessings through the Holy Relics of Prophet Peace be upon him if they are really from Prophet.

See this article also http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/aqeedah/296-tabarruk-through-the-holy-relics-of-prophet-peace-be-upon-him-and-auliyah

BLOCK 11

They quoted

Hadith # 1(A)

حَدَّثَنَا الْحَسَنُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْأَنْصَارِيُّ قَالَ حَدَّثَنِي أَبِي عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ الْمُثَنَّى عَنْ ثُمَامَةَ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ أَنَسٍ عَنْ أَنَسِ بْنِ مَالِكٍ أَنَّ عُمَرَ بْنَ الْخَطَّابِ " - ص 343 -" رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ كَانَ إِذَا قَحَطُوا اسْتَسْقَى بِالْعَبَّاسِ بْنِ عَبْدِ الْمُطَّلِبِ فَقَالَ اللَّهُمَّ إِنَّا كُنَّا نَتَوَسَّلُ إِلَيْكَ بِنَبِيِّنَا فَتَسْقِينَا وَإِنَّا نَتَوَسَّلُ إِلَيْكَ بِعَمِّ نَبِيِّنَا فَاسْقِنَا قَالَ فَيُسْقَوْنَ

Translation: It is related from Anas, "If there was a drought, 'Umar ibn al-Khattab would ask al-'Abbas ibn 'Abdu'l-Muttalib to do the rain prayer. He would say, 'O Allah, **we seek intercession with You by Your Prophet** and we ask You for rain. We seek intercession with You by the uncle **of our Prophet**, so give us rain!'" He added, "And they were given rain."

References:
1) Sahih Bukhari Book:Al istasqa Chapter: Suaal An Nas Al Imam Alistasqa iza Qahatu Page : 245 Hadith number :1010 **Click here for Scanned Page (**157**)**

2) Sahih Bukhari Book:Fadail e Ashaab An NABI SAW Chapter: Zikr Al Abbas Bin Abdul Muttalib R.A Page :914 Hadith number : 3710 **Click here for Scanned Page (**157**)**

3) Imam Ibn e Hibban, Sahi ibn e Hibban, Book : As Salah Chapter : Salat Al Istasqa Volume :7 Page :110-111 Hadith number: 2861 **Click here for Scanned Page (**158**)**

4) Imam Tabrani Book : Mu'jam Al Ausath Volume : 3 Page : 49 Hadith number : 2437 **Click here for Scanned Page (**159**)**

5) Ibn e Khuzimah , Sahih Ibn e Khuzimah, Book: As Salah Chapter: Istihbaab Al istasqa Bi Ba'd Qarabat An NABI (663) Volume: 2 page: 337-338 Hadith number : 1421 **Click here for Scanned Page (**160**)**

6) Imam Bayhaqi r.a, Sunan al Kubra, Volume : 3 Page : 491 Hadith number : 6427 **Click here for Scanned Page (**161**)**

OUR RESPONSE :

This is totally distorted translation, let me quote urdu translation from the book present in very same website in the books section, Books on Aqeda and the name of the book is "**Proofs from sahabas (ra) on tawassul (istignatha and intercession)**" **by** Mufti Faiz Ahmad Owaisi Qadri Ridwi page no: 8

تو ہمیں سیراب کرتا اور ہم **کیا کرتے تھے** اے اللہ ہم تیری طرف اپنے نبی صلی اللہ علیہ وسلم کا وسیلہ **ھیں** تیری طرف اپنے نبی کے چچا حضرت عباس کا وسیلہ کرتے

So, in the distorted transation of the website "used to" is missing because it is our evidence of permissible and recommended tawassul, Narrated Anas: Whenever drought threatened them, 'umar bin Al-Khattab, used to ask Al-abbas bin 'Abdul Muttalib to invoke Allah for rain. He used to say, **"O Allah! We used to ask our Prophet to invoke You for rain, and You would bless us with rain, and now we ask his uncle to invoke You for rain. O Allah ! Bless us with rain."** And so it would rain. (BukhariBook #17, Hadith #123)

Muhadditheen on the hadith of Umar ra

Saying of Imam Mahmood Alusi on the athar of Umar ra he said in Tafsir of the Ayat: "**Seek Wasilah to Him**" (Maidah : 35) **in his 'Ruh Al-Ma'ani"**
"And if we suppose it there is not but Iqsam (swearing) with alive and Tawassul (intermediation) with him, and making his (saw) state of life as his state of death in this topic needs a clear text and probably the text is opposed to that, as there is in "Sahih Al-Bukhari" from Anas that "Umar ibn Al-Khattab when they faced drought sought rain with Abbas and said: "O Allah we used to do Tawassul with Your Prophet (saw) and You gave us rain, and now we do Tawassul to You with the **uncle of our** Prophet, give us rain" and they were given rain. **And if there was Tawassul with him (saw) after his departure from this world, why did they turn to other than him? Rather they would have said: "O Allah we do Tawassul with Your Prophet, give us rain."**

And they are far away from turning away from the Tawassul of the Prophet (saw) to the Tawassul with his uncle ‘Abbas…while they were first forerunners (As-Sabiqun Al-Awalun), and they were more knowledgeable than us about Allah and His Prophet (saw), and the rights of Allah and His Prophet saw, what is legislated in invocation and what is not legislated, and they were in time of huge need, they were seeking relief from difficulties and easiness of difficult, and descent of rain with all ways, this is clear proof that the legislated is what they did without others…

As for the first information, the saying of Umar : “We used to do Tawassul with Your Prophet (saw)” and as for second his saying : “and now we do Tawassul with uncle of Your Prophet (saw)” because it is said : This Tawassul is not from chapter of Iqsam rather it is from categories of seeking intercession, and this is to seek invocation from an individual and his intercession, and seeking from Allah that he accepts his invocation and intercession. And this is supported by the fact that Abbas was invoking and they were trusting his invocation until rain came.”

Hafiz Suyuti on the athar of Umar ra

- **Imaam Suyooti in his work** :السيوطي- الأمر بالاتباع والنهي عن الابتداع Under the Chapter تعظيم الأماكن التي لا تستحق التعظيم (Veneration of those places which are not applicable for veneration) **On page 25 he said**

فإن قصد القبور للدعاء رجاء الإجابة فمنهي عنه، وهو إلى التحريم أقرب. والصحابة رضي الله عنهم - وقد أجدبوا مراتٍ - ودهمتهم نوائب بعد موته (، فهلا جاءوا فاستسقوا واستغاثوا عند قبر النبي (وهو أكرم الخلق على الله عز وجل، بل خرج فيهم سيدنا عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه بالعباس عم النبي (إلى المصلى فاستسقى به، ولم يستسقوا عند قبر النبي .)

فاقتد أيها المسلم إن كنت عبد الله بسلفك الصالح، وتحقق التوحيد الخالص؛ فلا تعبد إلا الله، ولا تشرك بربك أحداً، كما أمر الله تعالى بقوله: (فإياي فاعبدون)، وقال تعالى: (فمن كان يرجو لقاء ربه فليعمل عملاً صالحاً ولا يشرك بعبادة ربه أحداً). فلا تعبد إلا إياه ولا تد ع إلا هو، ولا تستعن إلا به، فإنه لا مانع ولا معطي ولا مضار ولا نافع إلا هو سبحانه وتعالى، لا إله إلا هو عليه توكلت وإليه أنيب

For Verily visiting the graves with the intention that our prayers **will be accepted is not allowed and it is closer to Haram**

Sahaba faced so many difficulties after the death of Prophet (peace be upon him) drought came to them,..... **so Why didn't they came to the grave of Prophet of Allah? Why they didn't requested him (peace be upon him) for rain? Why they didn't call at his grave?** Prophet (SAW) is the highest of the creation in the sight of Allah

In fact at the time of drought OMAR Ra went to Eid GAH with Abbas RA and asked him to pray for rain(prayer of istesqa see Sahih bukhari for detailed athar). **They never prayed near grave of Prophet (peace be upon him)**. O Muslim If You are follower of Allah like your Salaf as Saleh were so follow them, do Research of Correct Tauheed, Do not Worship other then Allah, Do not Make Partners of Allah. As Allah Commanded (Therefore worship Me.) and Allah says (So whoever hopes for the meeting with his Lord, let him work righteousness and associate none as a partner in the worship of his Lord.") (end)

Imam Ibn Abi al-Izz said same as Ahlus sunnah say[commentary of aqeeda tahawiya pages 237 and 238]

The sayings of these great Imams is also supported by another athar because ‘Umar ra was not alone in preferring tawassul by means of Abbas`s ra supplication to tawassul by means of his person, rather the same was done by Mu’aawiyah ibn Abee Sufyaan ra who also performed tawassul by means of the supplication of Yazeed ibn al-Aswad and not by means of the Prophet Peace be upon him, and a number of the Companions and greater tabi’een were present with him.[Tareekh Damishq 65/112, Ibn Hajar asqalani authenticated the chain alIsaba fe tameez alsahaba 6/697]

Alsi Zahhak bin qays ra did same with Yazeed ibn al-Aswad [Tareekh Abi Zura damishqi 1/602]

These Companions and Tabiyeen knew better than later people because they were the best of the best. Not only this was the practice of companions, it was also the practice of Prophet peace be upon him

.

Narrated **anas** bin Malik: Once in the lifetime of the Prophet (p.b.u.h) the people were afflicted with drought (famine). While the Prophet was delivering the Khutba on a Friday, a Bedouin stood up and said, "O, Allah's Apostle! Our possessions are being destroyed and the children are hungry; Please invoke Allah (for rain)". So the Prophet raised his hands. At that time there was not a trace of cloud in the sky. By Him in Whose Hands my soul is as soon as he lowered his hands, **clouds** gathered like mountains, and before he got down from the pulpit, I saw the rain falling on the beard of the Prophet. It rained that day, the next day, the third day, the fourth day till the next Friday. The same Bedouin or another man stood up and said, "O Allah's Apostle! The

houses have collapsed, our possessions and livestock have been drowned; Please invoke Allah (to protect us)". So the Prophet I raised both his hands and said, "O Allah! Round about us and not on us". So, in whatever direction he pointed with his hands, the **clouds** dispersed and cleared away, and Medina's (sky) became clear as a hole in between the **clouds**. The valley of Qanat remained flooded, for one month, none came from outside but talked about the abundant rain. (Bukhari Book #13, Hadith #55)

All the Sahaba followed Prophet peace be upon him in the best way.

BLOCK 12

They said

Sheikh ul Islam Imam Ibn Hajr al Asqalani (rah) explains the Tawassul hadith of Umar (RA) and Abbas (RA)[Above one] in his great Fath al Bari as:

اللهم إنه لم ينزل بلاء إلا بذنب , ولم يكشف إلا بتوبة , وقد توجه القوم بي إليك لمكاني من نبيك

Translation: "O Allah, truly no tribulation descends except because of sins, nor is lifted except upon repentance. The people have turned to you by means of me **BECAUSE OF MY POSITION IN RELATION TO YOUR PROPHET**

Our Response

This is not the sayings of Ibn Hajar asqalani ra rather he is quoting a narration (which is from Tareekh Damishq Ibn Asakir 26/358) in which there is a narrator Muhammad bin Saaib kalbi who is a liar even Ibn Hajar asqalani accused him that he was a shia and a liar [Taqreeb atTahdeeb no:5901]

Ibn Hajar asqalani also mentioned in Tahdeeb that Muhammad bin Saaib kalbi (shia dajjal) said

كان جبريل يوحي إلى النبي صلى الله عليه وسلّم فقام النبي لحاجته وجلس علي فأوحى إلي علي
Jibreel used to take wahyy to Prophet peace be upon him, once Prophet peace be upon him went for something and Ali was sitting there, Jibreel aleh salam took wahy to Ali.

This is a proof that whatever Ibn Hajar quoted in Fath ul Bari does not mean the narration is authentic. There is a big difference between quoting a narration and own verdicts. We will mention the own verdicts of Ibn Hajar asqalani.

BLOCK 13

They said :

Imam Ibn Hajr al Asqalani (rah) also explains in his great Fath al Bari:

إن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم كان يرى للعباس ما يرى الولد للوالد , فاقتدوا أيها الناس برسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم في عمه العباس واتخذوه وسيلة إلى الله

Translation: Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) used to take Al-Abbas(RA) like a son considers his father. O People You should also follow the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) incase of Al-Abbas(RA) and make him an Intercessor to Allah.

Our Response

These are not own sayings of Ibn Hajar rather he is quoting a narration here is the arabic.

عام عمر بن الخطاب استسقى : قال ابن عمر عن زيد بن أسلم عن عطاء عن داود وأخرج أيضا من طريق فذكر الحديث وفيه " فخطب الناس عمر فقال : إن رسول الله - صلى الله " بالعباس بن عبد المطلب الرمادة عليه وسلم - كان يرى للعباس ما يرى الولد للوالد ، فاقتدوا أيها الناس برسول الله - صلى الله عليه وسلم - في عمه العباس واتخذوه وسيلة إلى الله " وفيه " فما برحوا حتى سقاهم الله "

Even though this hadith is not authentic because of Dawood bin ata who is rejected and Munkar al-Hadith according to Abu Zur`a, Imam Bukhari, Darqutni, ad-Dahabee and even according to Imam Ibn Hajar asqalani he is weak. He is same Dawood bin Ata who cooked up the hadith where it states Allah will shake hands with Umar ra (Naudhubillah)[Sunan Ibn Maja hadith no: 104]

The fact that Al Abbas (r.a) was considered like a father to the Prophet (s.a.w) is right as proven by a hadeeth in Tirmidhi, under the chapter Virtues of Al Abbas. However, the meaning derived from this narration is wrong . I.e the statement " hence consider him as an intercession with Allah"

this is interpreted wrongly and secondly this is a fabricated saying as explained in the first paragraph above. Even if we assume this narration to be saheeh, then in accordance to the other ahadeeth (Hujjah) the apparent meaning is to seek Al Abbas (r.a)'s dua'a as a waseela and this (understanding) is proven by the hadeeth of Umar (r.a) and the sahabaas who sought the dua'a of Al Abbas (r.a) as a waseela during the time of famine.

Then Ibn Hajar asqalani mentioned his own verdicts which is according to the stance of ahlus sunnah and also quoted by ahlus-sunna website.

BLOCK 14

They said:

Imam Ibn Hajr al Asqalani (rah) explains in the same passage that:

ويستفاد من قصة العباس استحباب الاستشفاع بأهل الخير والصلاح وأهل بيت النبوة , وفيه فضل العباس وفضل عمر لتواضعه للعباس ومعرفته بحقه

Translation: "From the story of 'Abbas it follows that seeking intercession through the pious, the righteous and the Ahlul Bait (family of the Prophet) is praiseworthy

Reference: Fathul Bari Sharah Sahi Bukhari, Page : 577 Under Hadith number :1010 of Sahi bukhari **Click here for Scanned Page (**162**)**
Imam Subki r.a said under this hadith

From this incidence we infer that, it is permissible to take Tawasul of all Righteous people. Infact no muslim ever rejected this, only those people who where from different sect[Innovators in religion] rejected Tawasul.

Reference: As Shifa As Siqam Page : 377 **Click here for Scanned Page (**163**)**

Our Response:

There is no dispute in this type of tawassul as evident from the hadith and the sayings itself. We should ask pious people for the dua. For those who want more information then see this article The Creed of Ibn e Hajar Asqalani VS extreme Soofiyah http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/aqeedah/192-creed-of-ibn-e-hajar-asqalani-versus-ghali-soofiyah

BLOCK 15

They said

Direct and explicit order of Prophet(صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم)

Hadith #2

حدثنا أحمد بن منصور بن سيار حدثنا عثمان بن عمر حدثنا شعبة عن أبي جعفر المدني عن عمارة بن خزيمة بن ثابت عن عثمان بن حنيف
أن رجلا ضرير البصر أتى النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فقال ادع الله لي أن يعافيني فقال إن شئت أخرت لك وهو خير وإن شئت دعوت فقال ادعه فأمره أن يتوضأ فيحسن وضوءه ويصلي ركعتين ويدعو بهذا الدعاء اللهم إني أسألك وأتوجه إليك بمحمد نبي الرحمة يا محمد إني قد توجهت بك إلى ربي في حاجتي هذه لتقضى اللهم شفعه في

The Hadith states: It was narrated from 'Uthman bin Hunaif that a blind

man came to the Prophet (Peace be upon him) and said: "Pray to Allah to heal me." He said: "If you wish to store your reward for the Hereafter, that is better, or if you wish, I will supplicate for you." He said: "Supplicate." So he told him to perform ablution and do it well, to pray two Rak'ah, and to say this supplication: "Allahumma lnni as'aluka wa atawajjahu ilaika bimuhammadin nabiyyir-rahma. Ya Muhammadu inni qad tawajjahtu bika ila rabbi fi hajati hadhihi lituqda. Allahumma fashaffi'hu fiya (O Allah, I ask of You and I turn my face towards **You by virtue of the intercession of Muhammad the Prophet of mercy. O Muhammad, I have turned to my Lord by virtue of your intercession concerning this need of mine so that it may be met.** O Allah, accept his intercession concerning me)".

References

►Ibn Majah transmitted it in his Sunan, book of Iqamat al-salat wa al-sunnat (establishing prayer and its sunnahs)[Page 197, Hadith No#1385) **Click here for Scanned Page (87)**

In Sunnan Ibn Majah then it says:

قال أبو إسحق هذا حديث صحيح

Translation: Imam Abu Ishaaq (rah) said: **This hadith is "SAHIH"** [ibid]

►Tirmidhī in al-Jami-us-sahīh, book of da'awat (supplications) ch.119 (5:569#3578) where he declared it**"HASAN SAHIH GHARIB" Click here for Scanned Page (135)**
►Nasa'i, 'Amal-ul-yawm wal-laylah (p.417#658-659) **Click here for Scanned Page (136)**

►Ahmad bin Hambal in his Musnad (4:138 #17246-17247)
►Hākim, al-Mustadrak (1:313,519) where he declared it **"SAHIH"**
►Imam Bukhari, Book : Tareekh Ul Kabeer Volume : 6 page : 209 Biography number : 2192 **Click here for Scanned Page (144)**

►Abd Bin Humaid Book : Al Musnad Volume : 1 Page : 308 Hadith number : 379 **Click here for Scanned Page (145)**

►Ibn e Khuzimah, Book: Sahi Ibn e Khuzimah Chapter : Salat At Targheeb Wat Tarheeb (527) Volume : 2 Page : 225 Hadith number : 1219 **Click here for Scanned Page (**146**)**

►Imam Hakim, Mustadrak Sahiyan, Book : Salat At Tatawa' Volume : 1 Page : 449 Hadith number : 1181
Click here for Scanned Page (147**)**

►Imam Bayhaqi, Book : Dalail An Nubuwwah Volume : 6 Page : 166-167 **Click here for Scanned Page (**148**)**

► Qadi Ayyad, Book : As Shifa Chapter: Ibra Al Marda Wa Zil 'Ahaat Volume : 1 Page : 322 **Click here for Scanned Page (**149**)**

►Nawawī, al-Adhkār (p.83)

►Imam Mundhiri Book : Targheeb Wat Tarheeb Chapter : Salat Al Hajah Volume : 1 Page : 241 **Click here for Scanned Page (**137**)**

►Ibn Kathīr, al-Bidāyah wan-nihāyah (4:558)

►Ibn Hajar Haythamī, al-Jawhar-ul-munazzam (p.61)

►Ibn Mājah, Hākim and Dhahabī have declared it a sound (sahīh) tradition while Tirmidhī graded it hasan (fair) sahīh, gharīb (unfamiliar or rare)

Similarly, another tradition narrated by Imam Hākim is present in different words. In this tradition, 'Uthmān bin Hunayf says that he was present in the Prophet's company. A blind person called on the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) and complained about the loss of his eyesight. He added: 'O Messenger of Allah, there is no one to guide me and I am in great trouble.' On hearing his complaint, the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) said:

Bring an earthen pot for ablution, then perform the ablution and offer two cycles of optional prayer. Then say: "O Allah, I appeal to You, and submit to You through the mediation of Your merciful Prophet

Muhammad (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم). O Muhammad, through your mediation I submit myself to your Lord that He should give light to my eyes. O Allah, acknowledge his intercession in my favour and accept my supplication also in my favour." 'Uthmān bin Hunayf says: I swear by Allah that we had neither left the company nor had we carried on a long conversation that the man entered (with his sight fully restored) and it seemed as if he had never been blind.

References

►Nasā'ī, 'Amal-ul-yawm wal-laylah (p.418#660)

►Ahmad bin Hambal, Musnad (4:138)

►Ibn Kathīr, al-Bidāyah wan-nihāyah (4:559)

►Suyūtī, al-Khasā'is-ul-kubrā (2:201)

►Qastallānī, al-Mawāhib-ul-laduniyyah (4:594)

►Bayhaqī, Dalā'il-un-nubuwwah (6:166-7)

Our Response

It was tawassul by means of his supplication, not his person, as has preceded. it is a further proof for the tawassul through alive person who is in front of us which is lawful and prescribed tawassul. Infact there is another hadith mentioned by Imam bukhari in his tareekh al kabeer and this is what he mentioned with his chain.

O Allah, I ask of You and I turn my face towards You(end) http://ar.wikisource.org/wiki/التاريخ_الكبير/باب_عثمان

Another wordings are *اللهم فشفعني في وشفع نفسي، في نبيي في رد بصري "O Allah accept the intercession of Prophet and mine with regards to my vision"[Tareekh Ibn Abi*

Khaythama, Musnad al Imam Ahmad 4/138 mukhtasaran, Qaida al jaleela page 102]

***Now it** is clear that this hadith is regarding the dua with the living person which is not a disputed issue, it has nothing to do with innovative types of tawassul.*

BLOCK 16

They quoted
Qadhi Shawkani, the leading authority for Salafis, he while authenticating Tawassul said:

قوله ويتوسل إلى الله سبحانه بأنبيائه والصالحين أقول ومن التوسل بالأنبياء ما أخرجه الترمذي وقال حسن صحيح غريب والنسائي وابن ماجة وابن خزيمة في صحيحه والحاكم وقال صحيح على شرط البخاري ومسلم من حديث عثمان بن حنيف رضي الله عنه أن أعمى أتى النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فقال يا رسول الله ادع الله أن يكشف لي عن بصري قال أو أدعك فقال يا رسول الله أني قد شق علي ذهاب بصري قال فانطلق فتوضأ فصل ركعتين ثم قل اللهم أني أسألك وأتوجه إليك بمحمد نبي الرحمة الحديث وسيأتي هذا الحديث في هذا الكتاب عند ذكر صلاة الحاجة وأما التوسل بالصالحين فمنه ما ثبت في الصحيح أن الصحابة استسقوا بالعباس رضي الله عنه عم رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وقال عمر رضي الله عنه اللهم إنا نتوسل إليك بعم نبينا

Translation: Qadhi Shawkani explains the saying of Imam Ibn al-Jarzi i.e. One should ask Allah through the intermediary of Anbiya and Pious servants of Allah: I (Qadhi Shawkani) say that to seek Intercession with Allah through Prophets and Righteous (is proven) as is narrated by Tirmidhi who called it Hassan Sahih Gharib**,** also narrated by Nasai'i, Ibn Majah, Ibn Khuzayma in his "Sahih" Hakim who said: It is Sahih on the criteria of Bukhari and Muslim, the Hadith of Uthman bin HUNAIF (ra) that a blind man came to the Prophet (Allah bless him & give him peace) and said: "I've been afflicted in my eyesight, so pray to Allah for me". The Prophet (Allah bless him & give him peace) said: "Go perform ablution (Wudu), perform two rak'at Salat and then say: **"O Allah!I ask you and turn to you through my Prophet Muhammad.** This hadith is mentioned in the book (with chapter) of Salaat al Hajah. And regarding Tawassul through righteous people, It is proven from Sahih (Bukhari) that Sahaba used to seek rain through Abbas (ra) the uncle of Prophet (Peace be

upon him). Umar (ra) said: O Allah we turn to you through the means of Prophet's uncle [Tuhfa tul Dhakireen, Page No. 48]

He also said:

وفي الحديث دليل على جواز التوسل برسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم إلى الله عز وجل مع اعتقاد أن الفاعل هو الله سبحانه وتعالى وأنه المعطي المانع ما شاء كان وما يشأ لم يكن

Translation: And in this hadith is the Proof on permissibility of seeking intercession to Allah through Prophet (Peace be upon him) but with the belief that Allah Subhanahu wa Ta'la is the one who grants or takes , whatever he wills happens and whatever he does not will cannot happen. [Tuhfa tul Dhakireen, Page No. 138]

Click here for Scanned Page (2)

Our Response:

Here Qadhi Shawkani is talking about the tawassul which means Tawassul with Iman in him (peace be upon him), obedience to him(peace be upon him), love for him (peace be upon him), salam on him(peace be upon him), or with his du'a and his shafa'ah, which is from his actions or actions of worship ordered for his right, this is legislated by consensus', and this is from Wasilah ordered " And Seek Wasilah to Him"[see alInsaaf of Mardawi hanbalee]

Let me quote Qadhi Shawkani where he was trying to correct Muslims who are doing shirk

- Qadhi shawkani said in (شرح الصدور بتحريم رفع القبور)Page no: 10

،
صار تحت أطباق الثرى، لا يقدر على أن يجلب لنفسه نفعا ولا يدفع عنها ضرا، كما قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فيما أمره الله أن يقول:
(لا أملك لنفسي نفعا ولا ضرا). فانظر كيف قال سيد البشر وصفوةالله من خلقه بأمر ربه أنه لا يملك لنفسه ضرا ولا نفعا ، وكذلك قال فيما صح عنه " يا فاطمة بنت محمد لا أغني عنك من الله شيئا. "

They are under mud, They have no authority of good and Bad for their own self, nor they have power to prevent the pain of any other, like ALLAH told Prophet Peace be upon him to tell the people (al araf 188). Say : "I possess no power over benefit or harm to myself.

Same like He said to his beloved Daughter "O Faatimah bint Muhammad, I cannot help you before Allah in any way"?.(end)

Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAKv0cMQcnpU_AqNPT9Kr5rYMPLdTAnjtNrzYGoJoZiy86hcYZVoZ5VIJZuVhvFFTlIfnU-GXxjnfs2lndtD34BcAm1T1UJpXgR-9ty-XU-YtmM796t5CAnPh.jpg

- **12) Qadhi Shawkani went on and said**

فيا عجبًا! كيف يطمع من له أدنى نصيب من علم، أو أقل حفظ من عرفان أن ينفعه أو يضره فرد من أفراد أمة هذا النبي الذي يقول عن نفسه هذه المقالة ؟ والحال أنه فرد من التابعين له المقتدين بشرعه.
فهل سمعت أذنَاكَ- أرشدك الله- بضلال عقل أكبر من هذا الضلال الذي وقع فيه عباد أهل القبور؟!
(إنا لله وإنا إليه راجعون).
وقد أوضحنا هذا أبلغ إيضاح في رسالتنا التي سميناها " الدر النضيد في إخلاص كلمة التوحيد

How strange! people have creed for the person who have normal knowledge and small muarifat that he has authority over good and preventing the pains of people, he is in the Ummah of That Prophet who said (I possess no power over benefit or harm to myself)
And this man is in followers of Prophet, have you ever heard about a more big deviant talk?? Like what these worshipers of grave say? Inna Lillah wa inna iliyhe Rajioon
We have mentioned in detail on this issue in our Risalah Ad dur al nzeed fe ikhilaas kalmia tul tawheed (end)

Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAOzYErmlQ4tlhZW7Z4B0xcPHIOL9vQXKrHCLsTFstyTh-Zv4RUtSeZVNpd3iTZD7iv4aDcYwKMMW2ZSb1z6N3ycAm1T1UMywD1M7EHwbbtu81tPjdmoO5kgP.jpg

- This is the hadith Qadhi Shawkani is Talking About

It was narrated that Abu Hurayrah (may Allaah be pleased with him) said: When the words "And warn your tribe (O Muhammad) of near kindred" [al-Shu'ara' 26:214] were revealed to him, the Messenger of Allaah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: "O people of Quraysh (or words to that effect)! Ransom yourselves, I cannot avail you anything before Allaah. O Banu 'Abd Manaaf, I cannot avail you anything before Allaah. O 'Abbaas ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib, I cannot avail you anything before Allaah. O Safiyah, (paternal) aunt of the Messenger of Allaah, I cannot avail you anything before Allaah. O Faatimah, daughter of the Messenger of Allaah, ask me for whatever you want of my wealth, I cannot avail you anything before Allaah." Narrated by al-Bukhaari (2602) and Muslim (206).

And then Qadhi Shawkani went on and mentioned the bad things of domes on graves

- al-Shawkani says in الدر النضيد في إخلاص كلمة التوحيد page no: 150

If this is not kufr then there is no kufr on EARTH!(end)

BLOCK 17

They said

Hadith #3

Some people object to the above hadith and say that it only proves Tawassul through Prophet (Peace be upon him) during his life, although their self cooked up taweel is false which goes against the teaching of Prophet (Peace be upon him) but still we would like to present another "SAHIH" hadith to establish that Sahaaba took the waseela of Prophet (Peace be upon him) even after his passing away

وَهُوَ أَنَّ رَجُلاً كَانَ يَخْتَلِفُ إِلَى عُثْمَانَ بْنِ عَفَّانَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ فِي حَاجَةٍ لَهُ، وَكَانَ عُثْمَانُ لاَ يَلْتَفِتُ إِلَيْهِ، وَلاَ يَنْظُرُ فِي حَاجَتِهِ، فَلَقِيَ عُثْمَانَ بْنَ حُنَيْفٍ فَشَكَا ذلِكَ إِلَيْهِ، فَقَالَ لَهُ عُثْمَانُ بْنُ حُنَيْفٍ: ائْتِ الْمِيضَأَةَ فَتَوَضَّأْ، ثُمَّ ائْتِ الْمَسْجِدَ فَصَلِّ فِيهِ رَكْعَتَيْنِ، ثُمَّ قُلِ: اللَّهُمَّ إِنِّي أَسْأَلُكَ، وَأَتَوَجَّهُ إِلَيْكَ بِنَبِيِّنَا مُحَمَّدٍ نَبِيِّ الرَّحْمَةِ، يَا مُحَمَّدُ! إِنِّي أَتَوَجَّهُ بِكَ إِلَى رَبِّي فَيَقْضِي حَاجَتِي، وَتَذْكُرُ حَاجَتَكَ وَرُحْ إِلَيَّ حَتَّى أَرُوحَ مَعَكَ، فَانْطَلَقَ الرَّجُلُ فَصَنَعَ مَا قَالَ لَهُ، ثُمَّ أَتَى بَابَ عُثْمَانَ فَجَاءَ الْبَوَّابُ حَتَّى أَخَذَ بِيَدِهِ، فَأَدْخَلَهُ عَلَى عُثْمَانَ بْنِ عَفَّانَ فَأَجْلَسَهُ مَعَهُ عَلَى الطُّنْفَسَةِ، وَقَالَ: مَا حَاجَتُكَ؟ فَذَكَرَ حَاجَتُهُ فَقَضَاهَا لَهُ، ثُمَّ قَالَ: مَا ذَكَرْتُ حَاجَتَكَ حَتَّى كَانَتْ هذِهِ السَّاعَةُ، وَقَالَ: مَا كَانَتْ لَكَ مِنْ حَاجَةٍ فَائْتِنَا، ثُمَّ إِنَّ الرَّجُلَ خَرَجَ مِنْ

عِنْدِهِ فَلَقِيَ عُثْمَانَ بْنَ حُنَيْفٍ فَقَالَ لَهُ: جَزَاكَ اللَّهُ خَيْرًا، مَا كَانَ يَنْظُرُ فِي حَاجَتِي، وَلاَ يَلْتَفِتُ إِلَيَّ حَتَّى كَلَّمْتَهُ فِيَّ، فَقَالَ عُثْمَانُ بْنُ حُنَيْفٍ: وَاللَّهِ مَا كَلَّمْتُهُ، وَلَكِنْ شَهِدْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ، وَأَتَاهُ رَجُلٌ ضَرِيرٌ فَشَكَا إِلَيْهِ ذَهَابَ بَصَرِهِ، فَقَالَ لَهُ النَّبِيُّ: «أَوْ تَصْبِرُ»، فَقَالَ: يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ إِنَّهُ لَيْسَ لِي قَائِدٌ، وَقَدْ شَقَّ عَلَيَّ؟ فَقَالَ لَهُ النَّبِيُّ: «ائْتِ الْمِيضَأَةَ فَتَوَضَّ

Translation: Imam Tabrani has narrated an incident that a person repeatedly visited Uthman bin Affan (ra) concerning something he needed but Uthman paid no attention to him. The man went to Uthman bin Hunaif (ra) and complained to him about the matter- **[Note: this was after the death of the Prophet and after the caliphates of Abu Bakr and Umar]** so Uthman bin Hunaif said : "Go to the place of Wudu, then come to the Masjid, perform two Rak'ats and then say : "**O Allah!, I ask you and turn to you through our Prophet Muhammad, the Prophet of Mercy. O Muhammad! I turn through you to my lord, that He fulfil my need" and mention your need.** Then come so that I can go with you [to the caliph Uthman] So the man left and did as he had been told, then went to the door of Uthman ibn Affan (Allah be pleased with him), and the doorman came, took him by the hand, brought him to Uthman ibn Affan, and seated him next to him on a cushion. 'Uthman asked, "What do you need?" and the man mentioned what he wanted, and Uthman accomplished it for him ...(till the end of hadith)

References: Imam al-Mundhiri (rah) brought this under "SALAT AL HAJAH" and said: Imam Tabarani after narrating it said **"THIS HADITH IS SAHIH"** [At-Targheeb wa Tarheeb, Page No. 129 in the chapter of Salaat al Hajah] **Click here for Scanned Page (**140**)**

►Imam Tabrani Book : Ma'jam As Sagheer Volume : 1 Page : 306-307 Hadith number : 508 **Click here for Scanned Page (**138**)**
Note: Imam Tabrani, after narrating the hadith usually doesn't say anything but in this case he specifically says it is "Sahih"
►Imam Tabrani Book : Ma'jam Al Kabeer Volume : 9 page : 17-19 Hadith number : 8311 **Click here for Scanned Page (**139**)**

►Imam al-Haythami (rah) brought this under "SALAT AL HAJAH" also accepted the authentication of Imam Tabrani in his Majma az Zawaid Volume No. 2, Hadith # 3668 **Click here for Scanned Page (**141**)**

►Imam Bayhaqi Book : Dalail An nubuwwah Volume : 6 Page : 167-168 **Click here for Scanned Page (**142**)**

►Imam Taqi ud Din Subki brought this under the chapter: "AFTER PASSING AWAY OF PROPHET" and also quotes Imam Bayhaqi in the end, Book : Shia As Siqam Volume : 1 Page : 370-372 **Click here for Scanned Page (143)**

►Ibn Taymiyyah declared it "SAHIH" in his Qa'ida al Jaleela fit Tawassul wal Waseela (Page No. 156)

Imam Muhammad bin Yusuf al-Salihi (rah) has actually put the final nail in coffin of Munkareen by setting a whole chapter on this issue:

الباب الخامس في ذكر من توسل به - صلى الله عليه وسلم بعد موته

عن عثمان بن حنيف أن رجلا كان يختلف - والبيهقي - بإسناد متصل ورجاله ثقات روى الطبراني إلى عثمان بن عفان في حاجة

Translation: Chapter 5: Regarding Tawassul through the Prophet (Peace be upon him) **"AFTER HIS DEATH"**. It is narrated by At-Tabrani **and al-Bayhaqi "WITH CONTINEOUS CHAIN (بإسناد متصل) HAVING THIQA NARRATORS"** the hadith of Uthman bin Hunaif (ra) that a man came to Uthman bin Affan (ra) regarding his Hajah .. until the end of same hadith [Muhammad bin Yusuf al-Salihi in Sabl al Hadi, Volume No.12, Page No. 407]

Our Response:

Nu'maan Ibn Mahmood Al-Aloossi said in his book Jalaa' Al-'Aynayn Fi Muhaakamat Al-Ahmadayn commented on this narration:

"There is something wrong about the chain of narrators of this narration reported by 'Uthmaan Ibn Hunaif, at the time of the reign of the caliphate 'Uthmaan Ibn 'Affaan, may Allah be pleased with him. Some scholars even say that the signs of fabrication are apparent in it, so how can this narration be acted upon while it contradicts the Book of Allaah, the Sunnah of the Prophet and the actions of the companions ? Did you hear that any sahaba coming to the grave of the Prophet

and asked him about that which only Allaah is capable of, while they were very keen to have their needs fulfilled and to attain the highest rewards?'(end quote taken from Islamweb)

The Claim that Tabrani authenticated this hadith

Reply is that

This is what Hafidh Tabrani said after narrating hadeeth.

يروه عن روح بن القاسم إلا شبيب بن سعيد أبو سعيد المكي وهو ثقة وهو الذي يحدث عن بن أحمد بن شبيب عن أبيه عن يونس بن يزيد الأبلي وقد روى هذا الحديث شعبة عن أبي جعفر الخطمي واسمه عمير بن يزيد وهو ثقة تفرد به عثمان بن عمر بن فارس بن شعبة والحديث صحيح وروى هذا الحديث عون بن عمارة عن روح بن القاسم عن محمد بن النكدر عن جابر رضي الله عنه وهم فيه عون بن عمارة والصواب حديث شبيب بن سعيد

"No one reports it from Rawh ibn al-Qaasim except Shabeeb ibn Sa'eed, Aboo Sa'eed al-Makkee and he is reliable. He is also the one whom Ahmad ibn Shabeeb narrates from, narrating from his father, from Yoonus ibn Yazeed al-Aylee. **This hadeeth is also reported from Shu'bah from Aboo Ja'far al-Khatamee, whose name is 'Umayr ibn Yazeed, and he is reliable. It is reported from Shu'bah only by 'Uthmaan ibn 'Umar ibn Faaris, and the hadeeth is Saheeh**. and this hadeeth is narrated from OWN BIN AMARAH from Roah Bin al qasim from Muhammab bin Alinkdr from jabir radhi Allah anho wa hum feeh awn bin al amarah wal thawab hadith shabeb bin saeed. (end)

Comment

One can see here Tabrani is talking about 3 chains

1 From shabeeb bin saeed
2 From Shubah(after mentioning that he said hadeeth is sahih)
3 From Own bin amarah.

Hafidh Tabrani never said hadeeth is sahih after mentioning chain no: 1(**it is the chain of story of man in need after death of Prophet**) but he said after chain 2(**which is the chain of blind man in the life of Prophet**). Then Tabrani mentioned 3rd chain and he quoted his words on 3rd one

Shaykh Albani said in his book on Tawassul

At-Tabaraanee only declared the hadeeth (of uthman bin hunaif when Prophet was in front of blind man) authentic, not the story (of man in need after the death of Prophet) So this is a clear statement that what he was talking about was the same hadeeth as that reported by Shu'bah,and Shu'bah did not narrate the story, so there is no proof for them in his words.(end)

Imam at-Tabrani relates from Ubadah bin Sāmit that a hypocrite used to bother the companions of the Prophet (pbuh). One some of the companions said, "Let us go and beseech the Prophet's aide to help us against this hypocrite. Upon hearing this Prophet (pbuh) said, **"Indeed, no one beseeches me for help, but should only beseech Allah.**

Imam Haythamee said

رواه الطبراني ، ورجاله رجال الصحيح غير ابن لهيعة ، وهو حسن الحديث .

Narrated by at-Tabrani and its narrators are the narrators of Saheeh, except Ibn Lahiya who is good in hadith.

http://www.islamweb.net/newlibrary/display_book.php?bk_no=87&ID=3366&idfrom=17499&idto=17521&bookid=87&startno=21

Comment: Even though the authenticity of above hadith is disputed, but why don't they take authentications of Haythamee rahimullah in this case? Surely they will come up with their own interpretations and excuses. They evade by taking only those narrations which suit their agenda and purposely exclude or ignore the narrations such as tabraani quoted **"Indeed, no one beseeches me for help, but should only beseech Allah"** Why this double standard? If they say that " the authenticity of the narration **" Indeed no one beseeches...."** is dubious then we say the authenticity of the above narration (a man coming to the grave of the prophet) is weak, so why take this narration into consideration at all?

Regarding Text of this athar

It clearly says "a person repeatedly visited Uthman bin Affan (ra) concerning something he needed but Uthman paid no attention to him"

Shaykh Albani Said

This is a sentence in the story which if an intelligent and wise person who knows about the virtues of the Companions was to consider he would find it a further proof of the weakness and incorrectness of the story. It is the saying that the rightly-guided Caliph ‘Uthmaan, radiyallaahu ‘anhu, had not used to take any notice of that man's need and would ignore it! So how does this agree with what is authentically reported from the Prophet (peace be upon him) that the angels used to feel shy from ‘Uthmaan, and with what is well-known about him, radiyallaahu ‘anhu, that he used to treat the people with kindness, gentleness and goodness? All of this causes us to further doubt that this story took place, since it shows oppression which totally conflicts with his behaviour and manner, radiyallaahu ‘anhu.(end)

Soofi argue that maybe he was busy and after that he was the person who solved that man’s problem.The reply to this is that it is just an excuse and false interpretation i.e that means because of that dua Uthman Ra listened to him otherwise he was not listening his People.One more argument is can someone call his father by his name like if name of father is IBRAHEEM can he say? O IBRAHEEM, O IBRAHEEM

How can we call Prophet peace be upon him by taking His name?, who is more beloved to us then our parents and everything? Even if someone still say this story(after death of Prophet) is saheeh then

Manawi said in his explanation of hadith of the blind man when Prophet Muhammad Peace be upon him was alive in the world:

اللهم إني أسألك) أطلب منك (وأتوجه إليك بنبيك محمد) صرح باسمه مع ورود النهي عنه تواضعا) - لكونالتعليم من جهته

(and I turn to You by your Prophet Muhammad) he stated his name, **although it is forbidden**, out of humbleness because he is in state of teaching from his side. Fayd al Qadeer sharh al Jame' as Saghir (2/134))

The claim that Bayhaqi authenticated this hadith

Imam Bayhaqi himself went against this stance as he said:

Allah says: ( ) وقال عزوجل (وَقُلْ رَّبِّ أَعُوذُ بِكَ مِنْ هَمَزَاتِ الشَّيـطِينِ - وَأَعُوذُ بِكَ رَبِّ أَن يَحْضُرُونِ) فَاسْتَعِذْ بِاللَّهِ مِنَ الشَّيْطَـنِ الرَّجِيمِ) ولا يصح أن يستعيذبمخلوق من مخلوق ، فدل أنه استعاذ بصفة من صفات

ذاته ، وأمر أن يستعاذ بصفة من صفات ذاته ، وهي غير مخلوقة كما أمره الله تعالى أن يستعيذ بذاته ، وذاته غير مخلوق

[23:97] And say, "My Lord, I seek refuge in You from the incitements of the devils,[23:98] And I seek refuge in You, my Lord , lest they be present with me." and Allah says [16:98]seek refuge with Allah from Shaytan, the outcast.

And it is not correct that the creation would seek refuge from other creation, This verse is the evidence that one who seeks refuge should seek refuge from the attributes of Allah, And He (Allah) ordered that seek refuge from the attributes of him, His attributes are not creation like Allah orderd to seek refuge from his dhaat and his dhaat is not creation[Asma wal siffat page 183]

Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAJvFgX1sp8VZX9zS2R_K6LrPIhj8WGfCnqlA0pSh6GaAWhA-e5eU5eRlshYni0EjgO5UYTGOT0KQkm2NZ9G5BLYAm1T1UFva9j12i252_aqkZAcLxNfvNczB.jpg

Prophet peace be upon him himself said in a hadith below:
A woman came to the Prophet who ordered her to return to him again. She said, "What if I came and did not find you?" as if she wanted to say, **"If I found you dead?"** The Prophet said, **"If you should not find me, go to Abu Bakr."** [Sahih Bukhari Volume 5, Book 57, Number 11]

Comment: So after death of Prophet peace be upon him, he never said come to my grave and ask me regarding your needs.

Final word even for the sake of an argument, we consider this hadeeth to be authentic than, the intention is to recite that dua in the same original words. Like we recite in the tashahud Assalamu alika Ayyu Han-Nabbiyu (Pece be upon you O Prophet) as it is proven from Omar ra, No where Omar ra meant he is directly talking with Prophet peace be upon him, as it is cleared from himself when he said "O Allaah, we used to beseech You by means of (the du'aa' of) Your Prophet for rain and You would give us rain; now we beseech You by means of (the du'aa' of) the paternal uncle of Your Prophet, so grant us rain."[Bukhari].In fact some sahaba and tabiyeen after the death of Prophet peace be upon him even changed the words "Assalamu Alan-Nabbiyu" (Peace be upon Prophet). without Khitab
See this article in detail, it has criticism on the chain of narrators. http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/tawassul/174-tawassul-refutation-series-hadith-of-blind-man

With regards to the authentication of Soofi Muhammad bin Yousaf Salihi then we say he erred because he was inclined towards Sufism OF 10TH century, even he said

جرت عادة كثير من المحبين إذا سمعوا بذكر وضعه صلى الله عليه وسلم أن يقوموا تعظيما له صلى الله عليه وسلم، وهذا القيام بدعة لا أصل لها

"It has become a habit amongst many of the lovers of the Prophet peace be upon him that whenever they organize a gathering in his (peace be upon him) remembrance they stand up in veneration, whereas this standing is an innovation which has no basis."[Subl al-Hudaa War-Rishaad (1/415 under the heading of Alerts, Alert no: 2)]

Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/RAAAAL6N_EG4TSviVRH2jlCw82tZXhmcJqHXny05R3koJIvUGw3ZcO30XAJzp3CdxBpXpOg9Yu_p5XWLW_yAOjiEIlS1jsKqrY56wndyTCShu3w3AJtU9VDVGkZp35BB8WMzUQBLdP_ynNv2kQ.jpg

BLOCK 18

They said

Hadith # 4

أخبرنا أبو نصر بن قتادة، وأبو بكر الفارسي قالا: حدثنا أبو عمر بن مطر، حدثنا إبراهيم بن علي الذهلي، حدثنا يحيى بن يحيى، حدثنا أبو معاوية، عن الأعمش، عن أبي صالح، عن مالك قال: أصاب الناس قحط في زمن عمر بن الخطاب، فجاء رجل إلى قبر النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم. فقال: يا رسول الله استسق الله لأمتك فإنهم قد هلكوا. فأتاه رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم في المنام فقال: إيت عمر، فأقرئه مني السلام، وأخبرهم أنه مسقون، وقل له عليك بالكيس الكيس. فأتى الرجل فأخبر عمر، فقال: يا رب ما آلوا إلا ما عجزت عنه.
وهذا إسناد صحيح.

Malik ad-Dar i.e. treasurer of Umar (RA) relates: The people were gripped by famine during the tenure of Umar (Ibn-ul-Khattab). Then a man walked up to the grave of Prophet and said: O Messenger of Allah! ask for rain from Allah for your Ummah who is in dire straits. Then he saw the Prophet (SAW) in dream. The Prophet (SAW) said to him, Go over to Umar,

give him my regards and tell him that the rain will come to you. And tell Umar that he should be on his toes, he should be on his toes (he should remain alert). He went over to see Umar and passed on to him the tidings. On hearing this, Umar broke into a spurt of crying. He said, O Allah, I exert myself to the full until I am completely exhausted.

References
►Al-Musannaf Ibn Abi Shaybah Volume 011, Page No. 118, Hadith Number 32538
Click here for Scanned Page (7)

Our Response

Firstly before talking about what scholars said on the chain of narrators i would like to mention that if we assume this hadith to be authentic then it is going against those who ask help from Prophet peace be upon him in thier homes, mosques and on roads etc because this athar says the unknown man came to the grave of Prophet peace be upon him, he did not ask help at his home or in Mosque by saying o Rasool Allah ask Allah for rain.

Second thing is that even at the grave he is not asking directly from the Prophet peace be upon him by saying O Rasool Allah help us (as some grave worshipers do). [This type of call at the grave is not an act of kufr because one is not asking directly hence this is an innovation]

See the fatwa of Ibn Uthaymeen
ra http://www.taimiah.org/index.aspx?function=item&id=3535

see
also: http://www.islamweb.net/emainpage/index.php?page=showfatwa&Option=FatwaId&Id=91189

Third point is that Prophet peace be upon him did not help him, rather he said (in his dream**)"Go to Umar and give him my greeting, then tell him that they will**

be watered." while the narration quoted by Ibn Abdul Barr in "al Isti'ab fi ma'rifat al As-hab" with same chain of narrators and Ahmad Abdullah at Tabari in his book ar Riyadh an Nadhirah fi Manaqib al Ashara says the Prophet appeared to him in a dream and told him: إِيتِ عُمَرَ فَمُرْهُ أَنْ يَسْتَسْقِي لِلنَّاسِ، فَإِنَّهُمْ سَيُسْقَوْنَ، **"Go to 'Umar and tell him to do istisqa' (ask Allah for rain) for the people, and that they will be watered."**

And we know when Allah helped Sahaba, it was not when the unknown person asked Prophet peace be upon him to ask Allah rather it was when Umar bin al-Khattab ask from Abbas ra (who was living) to invoke Allah. This is what the actual narration says

Narrated Anas: Whenever drought threatened them, 'umar bin Al-Khattab, used to ask Al-abbas bin 'Abdul Muttalib to invoke Allah for rain. He used to say, **"O Allah! We used to ask our Prophet to invoke You for rain, and You would bless us with rain, and now we ask his uncle to invoke You for rain. O Allah ! Bless us with rain."** And so it would rain. (BukhariBook #17, Hadith #123)

So this athar itself goes against those who ask help from Auliyah and Prophets. Because Prophet peace be upon him corrected the unknown person that you will be watered after doing Istesqa (i.e praying to Allah)

Fourthly, **Muftis of Islamweb said** "Going to the Prophet's grave to supplicate is something which Allaah and His Prophet, sallallaahu alayhi wa sallam, did not legislate for this nation; the rightly guided caliphs and the first and foremost of the Muhaajiroon (those who migrated from Makkah to Madeenah) and the Ansaar (the citizens of Madeenah who helped and gave aid to the Muhaajireen) and also the companions and those who followed them exactly (in faith) [the Salaf], would certainly have done so, had this act been legislated and permissible. On the contrary, it was reported that they rebuked whoever did so.

Ali Ibn Al-Hussein, may Allaah be pleased with him, when **he saw a man coming to an opening space around the Prophet's, sallallaahu alayhi wa sallam, grave entering to this place and supplicating, he prohibited him from doing so and told him:**"Shall I not narrate to you a narration by my father from my grandfather that the Prophet, sallallaahu alayhi wa sallam, said: **"Do not take my grave as an 'Eed [a festival, a place of worship], and do not take your homes as graves, and exalt my mention, as whoever exalts my mention it arrives to me wherever you are.**", reported by Adh-Dhiyyaa' Al-Maqdissi and Al-Bukhaari, may Allaah have mercy on them, in his book "at-Taareekh al-Kabeer".[Islamweb]

Now why would Ali Ibn Al Hussain (r.a) stop that man from entering the grave t and supplicating ? Ali ibn Al hussayn (r.a) did not inquire what dua'a is he making or what exactly is he doing, but instead Ibn Al hussayn (r.a) directly intervened to stop him and warn him. If truly this practice was legislated then the above narration wouldn't have proven otherwise .

Note: Many times people get carried away by emotional questions such as "are you claiming that the prophet (s.a.w) won't listen to you, or won't hear us or etc"

the answer to this is " The reason why seeking help from those who have left this world is Shirq or to bid'ah (depending on the type) is not because who can hear and who cannot hear, rather the reason this is bid'ah is because this method goes against the teachings of the prophet (s.a.w) and his noble companions (r.a.a). This method goes against the very verse " You alone we worship and you alone we seek help from [Al Faatiha] ". Hence one must not concern himself over who can listen and who cannot, and instead should concern himself with the teachings rasool (s.a.w) taught him "

The topic of who can hear and who cannot is a different topic and it also has varied opinions. We will discuss this as and when required but not here.

BLOCK 19

They said

This Hadith is authenticated as **Sahih** by

►Imam Ibn Kathir in Al Bidayah Wan Nihayah Volume No. 5, Page No. 167

►Imam Qastallani in al-Mawahib-ul-laduniyyah (4:276)

► Ibn-e-Taymiya in Fi-Iqtida-as-Sirat-il-Mustaqim (Vol.1, Page 373)

Our Response:

Even though this athar has nothing to do with brailwi shirk, but I want to clear that Ibn Kathir never authenticated the "HADITH" rather authenticated the chain. If chain is authentic that does not mean it can be apply to the Text.

Proof for this claim is as follows from Ibn Kathir himself

a) Ibn Kathir says:

" الحكم بالصحة أو الحسن على الإسناد لا يلزم منه الحكم بذلك على المتن ، إذ قد يكون شاذاً أو معللاً "

The fact that the chain is deemed to be authentic or hasan does not necessarily mean that the same applies to the text,because it may be shaadhdh (odd) or mu'allal (faulty). **[Ikhtisaar 'Uloom al-Hadeeth (p. 43).]**

Ibn Katheer also authenticated the chain of the athar where Umar ra and Sahaba closed the doors of shirk by levelling the grave of Daniyaal aleh salam, and he also discussed the athar in detail. So according to Ibn Katheer Asking from Prophets is not allowed. see here **http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/aqeedah/195-umar-bin-al-khattab-and-grave-worship**

They also said that Ibn Tamiya authenticated this athar which is an utter lie because Imam Ibn Tamiya was against these innovations done by later people. Below is his detailed fatwa

- **Shaykh ul Islam Ibn Taymiyah replied very beautifully and said:**

Whoever comes to the grave of a Prophet or a righteous man, or what he believes to be the grave of a Prophet or a righteous man although it is not, and asks him for something and seeks his help, one of the three following scenarios applies:

(i) he is asking him for something that he needs, such as to cure his sick animals or to pay off his debt or to take revenge on his enemy or to protect him, his family and his livestock, and other things which no one can do except Allaah. This is obvious shirk and he must be told to repent. If he repents, all well and good, otherwise he must be executed.

If he says, I am asking him because he is closer to Allaah, so that he can intercede for me with regard to these matters, because I am seeking Allaah's help through his virtue, just as people seek the ruler's help through those who are close to him - this is also like the actions of the mushrikeen and Christians, who claim that they take their priests and monks as intercessors and ask them to intercede for them with their requests. Allaah tells us that the mushrikeen say:

" 'We worship them only that they may bring us near to Allaah.'" [al-Zumar 39:3 - interpretation of the meaning].

And Allaah says (interpretation of the meaning):

"Have they taken (others) as intercessors besides Allaah? Say: "Even if they have power over nothing whatever and have no intelligence?" Say: "To Allaah belongs all intercession. His is the Sovereignty of the heavens and the earth. Then to Him you shall be brought back." [al-Zumar 39:43-44]

"Who is he that can intercede with Him except with His Permission?" [al-Baqarah 2:255].

The difference between Him and His creation is clear: people usually ask some of their leading figures who are in positions of honour to intercede for them with their leaders, so that intercessor asks the leader and he meets the person's request because he hopes to gain something thereby, or because he is afraid of him, or because he is too shy to refuse, or because he is being friendly towards him, etc. But no one intercedes with Allaah, may He be glorified, until He gives permission to the intercessor. He only does what He wills, and the intercession of the intercessor is only made by His permission. The entire matter rests with Him… The idea of many misguided people, that this person is closer to Allaah than I am, and I am far away from Allaah and cannot call upon Him except through this mediation etc., all of these ideas are ideas of shirk. Allaah says (interpretation of the meaning):

"And when My slaves ask you (O Muhammad) concerning Me, then (answer

them), I am indeed near (to them by My Knowledge). I respond to the invocations of the supplicant when he calls on Me (without any mediator or intercessor)" [al-Baqarah 2:186]

In al-Saheeh it was reported that when they were on a journey, they were saying Takbeer ("Allaahu akbar") in loud voices, and the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said:
"O people, take it easy! You are not calling upon One Who is deaf or absent; you are calling upon One Who is All-Hearing and Ever Near. The One upon Whom you are calling is closer to any one of you than the neck of his camel."
Allaah has commanded all people to pray to Him and call on Him, and He has commanded them all to say (interpretation of the meaning):

"You (Alone) we worship, and You (Alone) we ask for help (for each and everything)." [al-Faatihah 1:5].

And He has told us that the Mushrikeen say:

" 'We worship them only that they may bring us near to Allaah.'" [al-Zumar 39:3].

Moreover, it may be said to this mushrik: if you call upon this person, that means you think that he knows more about your situation, is more able to grant you what you ask for and is more merciful towards you. This is ignorance, misguidance and kufr. If you know that Allaah has more knowledge and is more able and more merciful, then why do you fail to ask Him, and instead turn to others? Have you not heard what al-Bukhaari and others narrated from Jaabir (may Allaah be pleased with him), who said: the Messenger of Allaah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) used to teach us to pray Istikhaarah (du'aa' seeking guidance from Allaah) in all our affairs, just as he taught us the Surahs of the Qur'aan.
Even if you know that this person is closer to Allaah than you and of a higher status than you, this may be true, but what you are implying is wrong. Even if he is indeed closer to Allaah and of a higher status, that only means that Allaah will reward him and give him more than you. It does not mean that if you call on him (after his death) , Allaah will answer your prayer more than He would do if you called upon Him yourself. If you are deserving of being punished and of having your supplication rejected, for example, because your du'aa' is offered in an improper manner, then no Prophet or righteous person will help you to do something that Allaah dislikes and is angry with. Even if that is not the case, then

you should ask from Allaah because Allaah is more merciful.(Majmoo' al-Fataawaa, 27/72-75)

BLOCK 20

They said

Imam Ibn Hajr al Asqalani in "Fath ul Bari"

وروى ابن أبي شيبة بإسناد صحيح من رواية أبي صالح السمان عن مالك الداري - وكان خازن عمر - قال " أصاب الناس قحط في زمن عمر فجاء رجل إلى قبر النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم صلى الله عليه وسلم فقال: يا رسول الله استسق لأمتك فإنهم قد هلكوا، فأتى الرجل في المنام فقيل له: ائت عمر " الحديث.

وقد روى سيف في الفتوح أن الذي رأى المنام المذكور هو بلال بن الحارث المزني أحد الصحابة، وظهر بهذا كله مناسبة الترجمة لأصل هذه القصة أيضا والله الموفق

Ibn Abu Shaybah transmitted it with a **"SOUND CHAIN OF TRANSMISSION"** the narration from Abi Salih as Samaan from Malik al Dar the treasurer of Umar (ra) that : The people were gripped by famine during the tenure of 'Umar (Ibn al-Khattab). Then a man walked up to the Prophet's grave and said, "O Messenger of Allah, please ask for rain from Allah for your Ummah who is in dire straits." Then he saw the Prophet (SAW) in dream… till the end of hadith. Sayf narrates in his Fatuh, the one seen in dream was Bilal bin Harith al Mazni who was one of the sahaba. [Fath ul Bari : Volume No.2, Page No. 495]

Our Response

He never authenticated the hadeeth even according to him if chain is authentic that does not mean hadeeth is also authentic for example he himself weakened the hadith of Amash where he is narrating from the mode (An).

Ibne Hajar said

لأنه لا يلزم من كون رجاله ثقات أن يكون صحيحا لأن الأعمش مدلس ولم ينكر سماعه من عطاء

Because trustworthiness of the chain does not mean that its sahih (meaning hadeeths is sahih) Amash is mudallis and he did not narrate his sama from Ataa **[Talkhees al hubeer no: 1181]**

Comment: This is a proof that Hafiz Ibne Hajar and Ibne Kathir never authenticated the hadeeth itself, and according to Ibne Hajar Amash is not proof in his tadlees see further quotes.

c) Al-Haafiz ibn al-Salaah (may Allaah have mercy on him) said:

قولهم : (هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد أو حسن الإسناد) دون قولهم : هذا حديث صحيح أو حديث حسن " لأنه قد يقال : هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد ، ولا يصح لكونه شاذا أو معللا "

When they say “This hadeeth has a saheeh isnaad or a hasan isnaad” instead of “this is a saheeh hadeeth or a hasan hadeeth”, that is because it may be said that this hadeeth has a saheeh isnaad but it is not saheeh per se because it is shaadhdh (odd) or mu’allal (faulty). [Muqaddimah fi ‘Uloom al-Hadeeth (p. 23)]

d) Al-‘Iraaqi said in his Alfiyyah:

" والحكم للإسناد بالصحة أو *** بالحسن دون الحكم للمتن رأوا "

The ruling that the isnaad is saheeh or hasan does not necessarily apply to the text. [Al-Tabsirah wa’l-Tadhkirah (1/107)]

BLOCK 21

Note: Nasir ud-din Albani deceivingly tried to prove that "Malik ad-Dar and Abu Salih as-Samaan" present in the chain of this hadith are unknown narrators who do not exist. So let's see the reality in light of Authentic Islamic literature.

A) Imam Ibn Sa'ad said: “Malik ad-Dar was a slave freed by ‘Umar bin al-Khattab. He reported traditions from Abu Bakr as-Siddiq and ‘Umar, and

Abu Salih Samman reported traditions from him. He was **"WELL KNOWN (MAROOF)"**

B)

Reference: Ibn Sa'd, at-Tabaqat-ul-kubra Volume 006, Page No. 12, Narrator Number. 1423

Click here for Scanned Page (39)

B) Ibn Hibban has attested to the trustworthiness and credibility of Malik ad-Dar : Imam Ibn Hibban Said: Malik bin 'Iyad ad-Dar He has taken traditions from Umar Faroq, and Abu Saleh al-Samman, and He was a slave freed by 'Umar bin al-Khattab.

Reference: Kitab uth-Thiqat Volume 005, Page No. 384 **Click here for Scanned Page (40)**

C) Imam Dhahabi said about Malik ad-Dar, He (Malik ad-Dar) was a slave freed by 'Umar bin al-Khattab, He has taken traditions from Abu Bakar as-Siddiq. [Tajrid Asma' al-Sahabah, by Imam Dhahabi, Volume 002, Page No. 44] **Click here for Scanned Page (48)**

Our Response:

Malik Ad Dar is disputed Over (some say Known and Some say Unknown).

He is disputed over according to Ibne Hibban and Ibn e Saad etc **he is known(as far as his name and other things are concerned)**
But on the contrary, according to Imaam Nuruddin Al Haythami and Mundari **he is unknown (regarding his being trustworthy in hadeeth)**

Ibne Hibban said regarding him

مالك بن عياض الدار يروى عن عمر بن الخطاب روى عنه أبو صالح السمان وكان مولى لعمر بن الخطاب

Malik bin 'Iyad ad-Dar He has taken traditions from Umar Faroq, and Abu Saleh al-Samman, and He was a slave freed by 'Umar bin al-Khattab.

Kitab At Thiqqath Vol 5, Page No. 384

Ibn e Saad said

مالك الدار مولى عمر بن الخطاب وقد انتموا إلى جبلان من حمير وروى مالك الدار عن أبي بكر الصديق وعمر رحمهما الله روى عنه أبو صالح السمان وكان معروفا

Malik ad-Dar was a slave freed by 'Umar bin al-Khattab. He reported traditions from Abu Bakr as-Siddiq and 'Umar, and Abu Salih Samman reported traditions from him. He was well known[Tabqaat al Kubra Vol 5 Page 12] but on the Other hand

Noor ud din Haythami said in Majma Az Zawaid regarding his narration

رواه الطبراني في الكبير . ومالك الدار لم أعرفه وبقيه رجاله ثقات

Narrated by At Tabranee in Kabeer and I don't know about **Malik ad Dar** , and other narrators are Trustworthy

Hafidh Mundhari also records the same in his Thargeeb wat Tharheeb

ومالك الدار لا أعرفه

Malik Ad Dar is not Known [Targheeb At Tarheeb 2/29]

Imam Bukhari mentioned him in Tareekh al Kabeer Vol 7 Page 304 and mentioned no Jarh no Tadeel

Imam Ibne Abi Hatim mentioned him in Al Jarh Wa Tadeel and mentioned no Jarh and Tadeel on him

.

Note: Shaykh Irshad ul Haq Athree said If Ibn Abee Haatim remain silent about a narrator in his book al-Jarh WaTa'deel this is evidence that the narrator is unknown according to him, see his book Taudheeh al-Kalaam (2/441-442)

This proves that the so called ahlus-sunna website are ignorant and not even students of knowledge.

BLOCK 22

They said

D) Ibn Hajar ‘Asqalani

مالك بن عياض مولى عمر هو الذي يقال له مالك الدار له إدراك وسمع من أبي بكر الصديق وروى عن الشيخين ومعاذ وأبي عبيدة روى عنه أبو صالح السمان وابناه عون وعبد الله ابنا مالك وأخرج البخاري في التاريخ من طريق أبي صالح ذكوان عن مالك الدار أن عمر قال في قحوط المطر يا رب لا آلو إلا ما عجزت عنه وأخرجه بن أبي خيثمة من هذا الوجه مطولا قال أصاب الناس قحط في زمن عمر فجاء رجل إلى قبر النبي (ص) فقال يا رسول الله استسق الله لأمتك فأتاه النبي (ص) في المنام فقال له ائت عمر فقل له إنكم مستسقون فعليك الكفين قال فبكى عمر وقال يا رب ما آلوا إلا ما عجزت عنه
ذكر بن سعد في الطبقة الأولى من التابعين في أهل المدينة قال روى عن أبي بكر وعمر وكان معروفا وقال أبو عبيدة ولاه عمر كيلة عيال عمر فلما قدم عثمان ولاه القسم فسمى مالك الدار وقال إسماعيل القاضي عن علي بن المديني كان مالك الدار خازنا لعمر

The biographical sketch provided by Ibn Hajar ‘Asqalani: “Malik bin ‘Iyad, a slave freed by ‘Umar, was known as Malik ad-Dar. He had seen the Holy Prophet (Peace Be Uopn Him) and heard traditions from Abu Bakr. He has taken traditions from Abu Bakr as-Siddiq ‘Umar Faruq , Mu‘adh and Abu ‘Ubaydah, and Abu Samman and the two sons of this (Malik ad-Dar) ‘Awn and ‘Abdullah have taken traditions from him. “And Imam Bukhari in at-Tarikh-ul-kabir, (7:304-5), through reference to Abu Salih, has acknowledged a tradition from him that ‘Umar is reported to have said during the period of famine: I do not shirk responsibility but I may be made more humble.

Ibn Abu Khaythamah has reproduced a long tradition along with these words (which we are discussing), ... and I have copied a tradition narrated by ‘Abd-ur-Rahman bin Sa‘id bin Yarbu‘ Makhzumi with reference to Malik ad-Dar, in Fawa’id Dawud bin ‘Umar and ad-Dabi compiled by Baghawi. He said that one day ‘Umar called me. He had a gold wallet in his hand, which had four hundred dinars in it. He commanded me to take it to Abu ‘Ubaydah, and then he narrated the remaining part of the happening. Ibn Sa‘d has placed Malik ad-Dar in the first group of Successors among the natives of Medina and has averred that he has taken traditions from Abu Bakr as-Siddiq and ‘Umar, and he was known. Abu ‘Ubaydah has asserted that ‘Umar had appointed him the guardian of his family. When ‘Uthman was elevated to the office of the caliph,

he appointed him as the minister of finance, and that is how he came to be known as Malik ad-Dar (the master of the house).

[al-Isabah fi tamyiz-is-sahabah - Ibn Hajr, Volume 006, Page No. 164, #8350]

Click here for Scanned Page (46)

Our Response

This is a completely distorded translation as they did by saying "He had seen the Holy Prophet (Peace Be Uopn Him) and heard traditions from Abu Bakr." But the Arabic states " **يقال له مالك الدار له إدراك وسمع من أبي بكر الصديق** " Ibn Hajaq asqalani mentioned this with the seegha tamreedh and even a small student of knowledge knows that whenever a scholar of hadeeth quotes something with the mode of doubt "seegha tamreedh" then according to him the saying is not authentic.

Imam Nawawi said **فصل قال العلماء المحققون من أهل الحديث وغيرهم : إذا كان الحديث ضعيفا لا يقال فيه قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم أو فعل أو أمر أو نهى أو حكم وما أشبه ذلك من صيغ الجزم ، وكذا لا يقال فيه روى أبو هريرة ، أو قال ، أو ذكر ، أو أخبر ، أو حدث ، أو نقل ، أو أفتى ، وما أشبهه ، وكذا لا يقال ذلك في التابعين ومن بعدهم فيما كان ضعيفا ، فلا يقال في شيء من ذلك بصيغة الجزم ، وإنما أو أو يحكى أو حكيعنه أو جاء عنه أو بلغنا عنه ، أو يقال أو يذكر يقال في هذا كله روي عنه أو نقل عنه يروى أو يرفع أو يعزى ، وما أشبه ذلك من صيغ التمريض ، وليست من صيغ الجزم ، قالوا : فصيغ الجزم موضوعة للصحيح أو الحسن ، وصيغ التمريض لما سواهما ، وذلك أن صيغة الجزم تقتضي صحته عن المضاف إليه فلا ينبغي أن يطلق إلا فيما صح ، وإلا فيكون الإنسان في معنى الكاذب عليه .**

Scholars and researchers among people of hadeeth and others said that when the hadeeth is weak, so it will not be said that Prophet peace be upon him said that or he had done or he ordered or he stopped and there are other words like this which are used for the mode of affirmation, these modes can not be used. And it can not be said that Abu Huraira narrated or he said that or mentioned that or he told or explained or transferred or gave fatwa. And it can not be said for tabiyeen and people after them while the (narration attributed to them) is weak.

And we can not use the mode of affirmation in any other thing. **In all these situations these modes are used ruviya anhu or nuqila anhu or huqiya anhu or jaa anhu or balaghnaaa anhu or it is said (Yaqaal) or Yuzkaru or Yuhkay or Yurwa or or yurfaoo or yuazaroo and there are other modes which can be used here (in seegha at-Tameeedh)**. And we can not

use the mode of affirmation (on these kind of narrations) because the mode of affirmation are entitled for authentic and Hasan Narrations, and the mode of tamreedh is used for other narrations (like weak and fabricated etc). Because the mode of affirmation requires authentication of being established and it can not be used for the those which are not authentic. Else under such situations the man would be considered a liar if he say something" http://www.islamweb.net/newlibrary/display_book.php?idfrom=97&idto=97&bk_no=14&ID=83

This proves the deceiving of the so called "ahus sunna" website. Below are the detailed objections on this athar

Objections on this Athar

1. If the chain is Authentic that does not mean it can be apply to the Text.(Asool al Hadeeth)
2. According to Asharis the hadeeth should be Mutwatir for creed so even if it is proven saheeh its not Hujjah for them because it is not Mutwatir.
3. We cannot Base our Creed from Dreams because Islam is Complete.
4. Abu Muawiyah Muhammad bin Hazim is Mudallis
5. Malik Ad Dar is disputed Over (some say Known whereas some say Unknown).
6. Inqita (discontinuity in the chain) between Abu Salih As Samaan and Malik Ad Darr.
7. Amash is Mudallis and narrating from (AN).
8. Scholars on the hadith of Umar ra
9. Not a single scholar mentioned this narration under Istigatha or Tawassul through the Prophet peace be upon him
10. Logical Arguments on the hadeeth by Umm Abdullah (including the person is majhul who came to the grave of Prophet and he never told Omar ra (this whole story)

.

Objection no: 1 (If chain is authentic that does not mean it can be applied to the Text.)

Ibne Katheer and Ibne Hjar never authenticated hadeeth but the chain
Proof for this claim is as follows

Dr Hatem al-Haj said: The hadeeth is controversial. There are many (‘illahs) subtle defects in it. It is noteworthy here to also point out that Ibn Katheer and Ibn Hajar (may Allah bestow mercy on them) authenticated its chain of narrators, not the hadeeth itself, and that is different in the language of the scholars of hadeeth.[Amja Online Fatwa id 87015]

a) Ibn Katheer says:

" الحكم بالصحة أو الحسن على الإسناد لا يلزم منه الحكم بذلك على المتن ، إذ قد يكون شاذاً أو معللاً "

The fact that the chain is deemed to be authentic or hasan does not necessarily mean that the same applies to the text, because it may be shaadhdh (odd) or mu’allal (faulty). **[Ikhtisaar ‘Uloom al-Hadeeth (p. 43)]**

Important Note: Ibne Katheer Authenticated the chain of the hadith of Malik ad Dar but as it is evident according to him if chain is authentic that does not mean hadith is also authentic, **For example he authenticated** the chain of the hadeeth of Mahmood bin Lobaid in prohibition of saying three divorces at a time in (Irshad al Faqeeh Vol 2 page 194) by saying "Narrated by Nisai with good and powerful chain" but he himself said in his (Commentary of Quran Under 2:229) regarding same narration that **"There is Inqitah (Discontinuity) in the chain". (but the hadith is authentic and i have mentioned in the talaq issue)**

Ibn Katheer also authenticated the chain of the athar where Umar ra and Sahaba closed the doors of shirk by levelling the grave of Daniyaal aleh salam, and he also discussed the athar in detail. So according to Ibn Katheer Asking from Prophets is not allowed. see here http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/aqeedah/195-umar-bin-al-khattab-and-grave-worship

b) Hafidh Ibn e hjar asqalani

He never authenticated the hadeeth even according to him if chain is authentic that does not mean hadeeth is also authentic for example he himself weakened the hadith of Amash where he is narrating from the mode (An) Ibne Hajar said

لأنه لا يلزم من كون رجاله ثقات أن يكون صحيحا لأن الأعمش مدلس ولم ينكر سماعه من عطاء

Because trustworthiness of the chain does not mean that its sahih (meaning hadeeths is sahih) Amash is mudallis and he did not narrate his sama from Ataa**[Talkhees al hubeer no: 1181]**

Comment: This is a proof that Hafiz Ibne Hajar and Ibne Kathir never authenticated the hadeeth itself, and according to Ibne Hajar Amash is not proof in his tadlees see further quotes.

c) Al-Haafiz ibn al-Salaah (may Allaah have mercy on him) said:

قولهم : (هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد أو حسن الإسناد) دون قولهم : هذا حديث صحيح أو حديث حسن " لأنه قد يقال : هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد ، ولا يصح لكونه شاذا أو معللا "

When they say “This hadeeth has a saheeh isnaad or a hasan isnaad” instead of “this is a saheeh hadeeth or a hasan hadeeth”, that is because it may be said that this hadeeth has a saheeh isnaad but it is not saheeh per se because it is shaadhdh (odd) or mu’allal (faulty). [Muqaddimah fi ‘Uloom al-Hadeeth (p. 23)]

d) Al-'Iraaqi said in his Alfiyyah:

" والحكم للإسناد بالصحة أو * بالحسن دون الحكم للمتن رأوا "**

The ruling that the isnaad is saheeh or hasan does not necessarily apply to the text. [Al-Tabsirah wa'l-Tadhkirah (1/107)]

e) Hafidh Ibn al Qayyim al Joziyah RA said in his book Al-Sawaiq Al-Mursalah 2/395 [publisher Maktabah Al-Riyadh]:

أنَّ أهل العلم بالحديث لم يزالوا يقولون: صح عن رسول الله -صلى الله عليه وسلّم- وذلك جزم منهم بأنه قاله ولم يكن مرادهم ما قاله بعض المتأخرين إنَّ المراد صحة السند لا صحة المتن ، بل هذا مراد من زعم أنَّ أحاديث رسول الله -صلى الله عليه وسلّم- لا تفيد العلم، وإنما كان مرادهم صحة الإضافة إليه وأنه قاله، كما يجزمون بقولهم قال رسول الله -صلى الله عليه وسلّم-، وأمر ونهى وفعل رسول الله -صلى الله عليه وسلّم-، وحيث كان يقع لهم الوهم في ذلك يقولون يذكر عن رسول الله -صلى الله عليه وسلّم- ويروى عنه ونحو ذلك، ومن له خبرة بالحديث يفرق بين قول أحدهم " هذا حديث صحيح" وبين قولهم "هذا إسناد صحيح"، فالأول جزم بصحة نسبته إلى رسول الله -صلى الله عليه وسلّم- والثاني شهادة بصحة سنده وقد يكون فيه علة أو شذوذ فيكون سنده صحيحا في نفسه

"The scholars of the science of hadith have always said **'It has been authentically reported from the Prophet sallallaho'alaihiwasallam' (Sahha 'Anhu);** and this is doubtless affirmation from them that the Prophet sallallaho'alaihiwasallam said that, contrary to what some latecomers thought that this means authenticating the chain only and not the text. Instead such a saying [that this means authenticating the chain only and not the text] can only come from one who claims that the ahadith of Rasool 'alaihisalam donot result in [the listener having attained] knowledge [but just unsure thoughts that these may have been his words]. Instead they (the scholars of hadith) say **'It has been authentically reported from** him' to mean that the saying is his, sallallaho'alaihiwasallam and that he said that.

And this why they insist that **'He said'**, or **'He ordered'** or '**He forbade'** or **'He did'** etc. But, when they have uncertainity that the Prophet sallallaho'alaihiwasallam said that, they would just say [using passive instead of active voice] 'It is reported from him or he is reported to have said' etc. Whoever has experience in this science, then he differentiates between حديث صحيح ('Authentic hadith') and صحيح الاسناد ('authentic chain'). The first is a doubtless affirmation to the authenticity of these words having been said by

the Prophet sallallaho'alaihiwasallam and the second is only an affirmation that the chain itself is correct and authentic, while it is possible that the text may have defects like oddness (shuzooz: i.e. trustworthy narrators reporting differently from those who are even more trustworthy or against what is narrated by those who are greater in number than him and are as trustworthy as himself) or other defects ['illah: for example the memory of the trustworthy narrator became weak later and it is not possible to say whether he heard the hadith and narrated after or before memory loss etc.:]" **(This Translation is taken from IA forum)**
.

Objection no: 2.(According to Asharis the hadeeth Should be Mutwatir for creed so even if it is proven saheeh its not Hujjah for them because it is not Mutwatir.)

Dr Hatem al-Haj said: Some of those who accepted this hadeeth, are the same who maintain that such matters can be only established through mutawatir reports. The undeniable established default is to only ask Allah. Thus, any variation requires a clear proof.[Amja Online fatwa id 87015]

So, Its a well know fact that those who use this athar as an evidence they don't make creed on khabar al wahid.

GF HAaddad a Soofi says regarding establishing aqeedah and accused Shaykh Al Bani Rah

It is impermissible to say that the `aqida of Muslims today is different from that of the Sahaba but Ahl al-Sunna only admit mutawatir-rank evidence as a basis in defining Islamic `aqida. Only a handful of innovators such as Albani differed.

source: (see question no: 7)http://www.livingislam.org/n/qau_e.html

Now, what is a Mutwatir hadeeth??

Ibn e Hjar mentioned regarding Mutwatir

As such, a **Hadith is classified as Mutawatir only when it fulfils the following conditions:**

1) It is reported by such a large number of narrators that under normal circumstances it would be impossible for them to conspire a lie.

2) Such a number exists throughout the chain of narration, i.e. from the beginning to the end.

3) The reporters must base their report on sense perception, i.e. on something that is heard or seen.

4) That the narration necessitates certain knowledge for the listener. **(Ibn Hajr al-Asqalani, Sharh Nukhba al-Fikr, P.21).**

Objection no: 3 (We can not Base our Creed from Dreams because Islam is Complete.)

Allah says in Chapter 5 verse 3: ... This day have I perfected your religion for you, completed My favour upon you, and have chosen for you Islam as your religion...

The virtue of this verse is so much that even the Jews came and said "If we were you, we would have taken the day when this verse was revealed to be a day of festival" :

Narrated Tariq bin Shibab: Some Jews said, "Had this Verse been revealed to us, we would have taken that day as `Id (festival)." `Umar said, "What Verse?" They said:-- "This day I have Perfected your religion for you, Completed My Favor upon you And have chosen for you Islam as your religion" (5.3) `Umar said, "I know the place where it was revealed; It was revealed while Allah's Apostle was staying at `Arafat." [Sahih Al Bukhaari, Vol. 5, Book 59, Hadith 689 and elsewhere in Muslim book 43, H 7154 and Nasa'ee Vol. 6, Book 1, H 5015)

Dr Hatem al-Haj said: Dreams by someone who is not a prophet or even a known companion, are not a proper means of communicating the revelation and establishing religious rulings in any matter, let alone the matters of 'aqeedah[Amja online fatwa id: 87015]

a) Hafidh Ibne Katheer said

إنه كان من الصالحين أنه رأى النبي صلى الله وقد ذكر الحافظ بن عساكر في ترجمة أحمد بن كثير وقال عليه وسلم وأبا بكر وعمر وهابيل، أنه استحلف هابيل ان هذا دمه فحلف له وذكر أنه سأل الله تعالى أن يجعل هذا المكان يستجاب عنده الدعاء فأجابه إلى ذلك وصدقه في ذلك رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وقال وهذا منام لو صح عن أحمد بن كثير هذا لم إنه وأبا بكر وعمر يزورون هذا المكان في كل يوم خميس يترتب عليه حكم شرعي والله أعلم

Hafidh Ibne Asakir mentioned in the Biography of Ahmad bin Katheer, he said he was (mentioned) among the pious People and he saw Prophet peace be upon him,Abu bakar RadhiAllahanho, Omar RadhiAllahAnho and Habeel (and after quoting whole dream he said) هذا لم يترتب عليه حكم شرعي والله أعلم that is it is not Ruling of Shariy`ah. **Al Bidaya Wal Nihaya vol 1 Page 105 and 106**

b) Imam Nawawi said:

فَرْعٌ} لَوْ كَانَتْ لَيْلَةُ الثَّلَاثِينَ مِنْ شَعْبَانَ وَلَمْ يَرَ النَّاسُ الْهِلَالَ فَرَأَى إنْسَانٌ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فِي { الْمَنَامِ فَقَالَ لَهُ اللَّيْلَةُ أَوَّلُ رَمَضَانَ لَمْ يَصِحَّ الصَّوْمُ بِهَذَا الْمَنَامِ لَا لِصَاحِبِ الْمَنَامِ وَلَا لِغَيْرِهِ ذَكَرَهُ الْقَاضِي حسين فِي الْفَتَاوَى وَآخَرُونَ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا وَنَقَلَ الْقَاضِي عِيَاضٌ الْإِجْمَاعَ عَلَيْهِ وَقَدْ قَرَّرْتُهُ بِدَلَائِلِهِ فِي أَوَّلِ شَرْحِ صَحِيحِ مُسْلِمٍ

''Fara': If the night is thirteenth night of Sha'baan, and people don't find. (the moon never appeared). And if a person saw the Prophet, may the mercy and blessing of Allah be upon him, in dream. And the Prophet inform him (in dream), ''this night is first of Ramadhan.'' Then the fast is not right, neither for the person who saw the dream nor for other. This is mentioned by Qadhi Husain and others. And Qadhi Iyadh has mentioned the Ijma' (consensus) on this. I have collected the proofs for it in First of ''Sharh Sahih Muslim''**['Al-Majmoo' Sharh al-Muhaddhab']**

Source: http://www.islamweb.net/newlibrary/display_book.php?ID=2517&start=0&idfrom=3857&idto=3857&bookid=14&Hashiya=10

c) Ibn Hajar said

فالذي في الخبر رؤيا منام فلا حجة

The dream in this hadith is not evidence **[Fathul Baari :Vol 9 Page 145]**

source: http://islamww.com/bookswww/pg.php?b=1926&pageID=5114
Here he says that Dream is not Evidence

d) Al Aine`ee

فالذي في الخبر رؤيا منام فلا حجة فيه
The dream in this hadith is not evidence **[Umda tul Qari under same Athar of Thobiya]**

e) Kirmani said

الرؤيا ليست بدليل
Dream is not evidence

f) Hafidh Al Iraqi Said

أنه لو أخبر صادق عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في النوم بحكم شرعي مخالف لما تقرر في الشريعة لم نعتمده
If any truthful gives the information of Shariyah that Prophet(pbuh) told him in dream, which is against the Shariyah then we would not rely on that dream. **[طرح التثريب ص 215 / 8].**

Comment: Meaning if some one say Prophet peace be upon him told me this and this in the dream, but in reality the sayings of Prophet peace be upon him in the dream is against actual sayings mentioned in ahadeeth, then we will reject the dream of the person

g) Hafidh Shatib`ee Said

وربما قال بعضهم : رأيت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في النوم ، فقال لي كذا وأمرني بكذا ، فيعمل بها ويترك بها معرضاً عن الحدود الموضوعة في الشريعة ، وهو خطأ ، لأن الرؤيا من غير الأنبياء لا يحكم بها شرعاً على حال إلا أن تعرض على ما في أيدينا من الأحكام الشرعية ، فإن سوغتها عمل بمقتضاها ، وإلا وجب تركها والإعراض عنها
،
And sometimes some people say i have seen prophet(pbuh) in a dream, prophet(pbuh) has said these things to me, he has given me orders of these things, and he starts practicing on it and due to this he leaves the boundaries of Islamic law and this is a mistake because dream of non-prophet's on any

issue cannot be included under part of Islamic law and we cannot reject the Islamic law which is with us. It is obligatory that the the dreams which clashes with the shariyah has to be left and rejected.

Al Aites`aam PAGE 184

If they really want to believe on the dream of this unknown person then what about this?

Imam Muhammad bin Hammad Rahimullah said

" رَأَيْتُ النَّبِيّ صلى الله عليه وسلم فِي المنام، فَقُلْتُ: يَا رَسُولَ اللهِ، مَا تَقُولُ فِي النظر في كلام أبي حنيفة وأصحابه، وأنظر فيها وأعمل عليها؟ قال: لا، لا، لا، ثلاث مرات. قلت: فما تقول في النظر في حديثك وحديث أصحابك، أنظر فيها وأعمل عليها؟ قال: نعم، نعم، نعم ثلاث مرات. ثم قلت: يَا رَسُولَ الله ، عَلِّمْنِي دُعَاءً أَدْعُو بِهِ، فعلمني دعاء وقاله لي ثلاث مرات، فلما استيقظت نسيته."

I saw Prophet peace be upon him in my dream. I asked O Messenger of Allah: What do you say regarding the seeing the kalam of Abu Hanifa and his companions? Can i see and practice that? He (peace be upon him) said three times NO, NO, NO. Then i asked what do you say regarding seeing your hadith and hadith of your companions? Can i see and practice upon that? He (peace be upon him) said three times, YES, YES YES. Then i asked that teach me a prayer so that i can pray that. Then he taught me a dua and repeated three times but when i woke up I forgot the dua.[Tareekh Baghdad 13/403]

I hope the matter is clear for those who are seeking the truth.

Objection no: 4. (Abu Muawiyah Muhammad bin Hazim is Mudallis)

Ibn Saad said: He narrated many ahadeeth, he used to do tadlees, he was a Murji [Tabqaat Ibn Sad 6/392]

al-Alaai mentioned him in his book of Mudalliseen [p 109]

Abu Zur`a Ibn al Iraqi mentioned him in his book of Mudalliseen [page 53]
Students of hadith know that If mudallis narrates from (AN) then He is not Evidence,

Imam Shafiee said in his ar-Risalah:1033
ومن عرفناه دلس مرة فقد أبان لنا عورته فى روايته

If We know some one has done tadlees for once, He has shown us his faults Then he said

لا نقبل من مدلس حديثا حتى يقول فيه حدثني أو سمعت

We do not take hadeeth from a mudallis unless he say Haddathanee (Hadeeth narrated to me) or Samiatu (I heard him)(ar-Risalah:1035 also quoted by Sakhawi in Fth ul Mughees be Sharah al-Faqeehul hadeeth]

Objection no:5 Malik Ad Dar is disputed Over (some says Known and Some says Unknown).

He is disputed over according to Ibne Hibban and Ibn e Saad etc **he is known(as far as his name and other things are concerned)**
and according to Imaam Nuruddin Al Haythami and Mundari **he is unknown (regarding his being trustworthy in hadeeth)**

Ibne Hibban said regarding him
مالك بن عياض الدار يروى عن عمر بن الخطاب روى عنه أبو صالح السمان وكان مولى لعمر بن الخطاب
Malik bin 'Iyad ad-Dar He has taken traditions from Umar Faroq, and Abu Saleh al-Samman, and He was a slave freed by 'Umar bin al-Khattab.
Kitab At Thiqqath Vol 5, Page No. 384

Ibn e Saad said
مالك الدار مولى عمر بن الخطاب وقد انتموا إلى جبلان من حمير وروى مالك الدار عن أبي بكر الصديق وعمر رحمهما الله روى عنه أبو صالح السمان وكان معروفا
Malik ad-Dar was a slave freed by 'Umar bin al-Khattab. He reported traditions from Abu Bakr as-Siddiq and 'Umar, and Abu Salih Samman reported traditions from him. He was well known[Tabqaat al Kubra Vol 5 Page 12]
but on the Other hand
Noor ud din Haythami said in Majma Az Zawaid regarding his narration
رواه الطبراني في الكبير . ومالك الدار لم أعرفه وبقيه رجاله ثقات
Narrated by At Tabranee in Kabeer and I don't know about **Malik ad Dar** , and other narrators are Trustworthy

Hafidh Mundhari also records the same in his Thargeeb wat Tharheeb

ومالك الدار لا أعرفه
Malik Ad Dar is not Known [Targheeb At Tarheeb 2/29]

Imam Bukhari mentioned him in Tareekh al Kabeer Vol 7 Page 304 and mentioned no Jarh no Tadeel

Imam Ibne Abi Hatim mentioned him in Al Jarh Wa Tadeel and mentioned no Jarh and Tadeel on him

.

Note: Shaykh Irshad ul Haq Athree said If Ibn Abee Haatim remain silent about a narrator in his book al-Jarh WaTa'deel this is evidence that the narrator is unknown according to him, see his book Taudheeh al-Kalaam (2/441-442)

Objection no: 6 Inqita (discontinuity in the chain) between Abu Salih Al Samaan and Malik Ad Darr.)

There is Inqita between Abu Salih Samaan and Malik Darr. Its for this reason that Ibn Hajr in Fathul baari gave his verdict as follows :

.

وروى بن أبي شيبة بإسناد صحيح من رواية أبي صالح السمان عن مالك الداري]

Ibn Abu Shaybah narrated it with a Authentic chain the narration from Abi Salih as Samaan from Malik al Dar(end)

This means that the chain is sahih only Up to Abu salih otherwise he would just simply said: It's Isnaad is Sahih!

Secondly Hafidh Khalili in kitaabul Irshad says , after saying he was tabiyee and quoted the same narration after that he said
يقال إن أبا صالح سمع مالك الدار هذا الحديث والباقون ارسلوه

It is said:Abu Salih heard it directly from Malik Darr and others (muhadditheen) say he gave it the way as Mursal

Al-Irshad fi Ma'rifa Ulama al-Hadith of Hafiz al-Khalili (1/314)

Yaqaal is seegha tamreedh (the mode of doubt), so it is doubtful that Abu Saleh heard this hadeeth from Malik ad-Dar and other muhadditheen say he did not hear,**Therefore those who wish to take al-Khalili's verdict on Malik should also take his verdict on the hadeeth, for he himself is alluding to its weakness.**

Objection no: 7 Amash is Mudallis and narrating from (AN).

Amash is Mudallis Hafiz Ibne Hajar mentioned him in Tabqa Thaniyah in [Tabqaat al Mudalliseen (2/55)] but he also mentioned him in 3rd Martaba of Mudalliseen in [Al Nikat al Ibn al Salah (2/640)]

In this chain Amash is Narrating from (An) and Mudallis is not Evidence in his tadlees, But, **Hafiz Dahabee said**

He is mudallis, and sometimes he narrates in this manner from a weak narrator without realising it. When he says **haddathana [he told us],** there is no problem with that, but when he says **'an [i.e narrating from],** there is the possibility of tadlees except in the case of narration from the shuyookh from whom he narrated a great deal, such as Ibraaheem, Abu Waa'il and Abu Saalih al-Sammaan. His narration from these shaykhs is to be understood as meaning that he heard directly from them and there is no interruption in the chain. [Mizaan al-I'tidaal (2/224)]

Shaykh Zubair Ali Zai said.

There could be two meanings of the saying of Dahabee.

1.Normally the narrations from these shuyukh of Amash are presumed to posses sound linkage because in these narrations most of them we find his hearing from his teachers

2. All the narrations from these shuyukh are to be understood as meaning that there is no interruption in the chain

if we take 2nd meaning then it is wrong because of different reasons,

.

Download Al hadith no: 66 from here: http://ircpk.com/mujallat_1.html

Then Shaykh provided different sayings of scholars where Amash is narrating hadith (An) abu saleh (meaning he is doing tadlees) and Muhadditheen said its weak due to tadlees of Amash.

Muhaditheen who declare the ahadith of Amash weak, where he narrates with the mode (an) and where he narrates from Abu Saleh with the mode (an) that if Amash narrate from (An) then he is not Evidence

1. Hafidh An Nawawi

Nawawi said regaring the hadith of Amash where he was narrating from (An)
وَالْأَعْمَش مُدَلِّس وَقَدْ قَدَّمْنَا أَنَّ الْمُدَلِّس لَا يُحْتَجّ

Hafiz Nawawi said regarding Amash (An) Abi Saleh
أَنَّ الْأَعْمَش مُدَلِّسٌ وَالْمُدَلِّس إِذَا قَالَ (عَنْ) لَا يُحْتَجّ بِهِ إِلَّا أَنْ يَثْبُتَ سَمَاعُهُ مِنْ جِهَةٍ أُخْرَى وَقَدْ قَدَّمْنَا فِي الْفُصُول وَفِي شَرْح الْمُقَدِّمَة أَنَّ مَا كَانَ فِي الصَّحِيحَيْنِ عَنْ الْمُدَلِّسِينَ(بِعَنْ) فَمَحْمُول عَلَى ثُبُوت سَمَاعهمْ مِنْ جِهَةٍ أُخْرَى . وَاَللَّه أَعْلَمُ .

Commentary of sahih Muslim vol 1 under the hadeeth 109

Nawawi again said regarding hadith of Amash (AN) abi saleh

عَنْ الْأَعْمَش عَنْ أَبِي صَالِح , وَالْأَعْمَش مُدَلِّسٌ وَالْمُدَلِّسُ إِذَا قَالَ : (عَنْ) لَا يُحْتَجُّ بِهِ

Summary of saying is that

Amash was mudallis and if mudallis narrates from (AN) then He is not Evidence and (MunAN) narrations of Mudalliseen in Sahihyeen(Bukhari and Muslim) are presumed to possess sound linkage.

2. Hafiz ibn e jozi said regarding the hadeeth of Amash from Abi saleh

هاذا حديث لا يصح

This hadith is not authentic. and then he quoted Imam Ahmad by saying There is no Asal of this hadeeth and Imam Ahmad said that Amash didn't hear this from Abu Saleh [**Al alal al mutnahiyah vol 1 page 437 hadith 736]**

3. Hafiz ibn al qattan said regarding the hadith where Amash is narrating from Abu saleh

ومعنعن الاعمش عرضة لتبين الانقطاع فإنه مدلس

Here he said that Amash is mudallis and there is Inqita in chain [**Bayan al wahim wal ihyaam vol 2 hadith 441]**

4. Al Hakim writes in reference to a hadith about Laylat al Qadr with the isnad al A'mash from ('an) Abu Salih.

لم يسمع هذا الحديث الأعمش من أبي صالح

Al Hakim says: "Al A'mash did not hear this hadith from Abu Salih", and offers an alternate isnad by way of al A'mash and Suhayl b. Abi Salih ***Ma'rifat 'Ulum al Hadith*** **(35-)**

5. Sufiyan bin saeed thawri said

: « لم يسمع الأعمش هذا الحديث من أبي صالح الإمام ضامن.

Amash didn't hear this hadith of Imam Zamin from Abi saleh
Sunan al Kubra al behqi 3/127, Tareekh Ibne Maieen Riwayat ad Dorri 3/497

6. Al Bayhaqi points out the defect in the Hadith of Amash from Abi Saleh saying that

And Amash surely didn't hear this hadeeth from Abu Saleh.[Sunan Al Kubra 1/430]

7 Abu al Fadhal Muhammad bin Abi Hussain Al Harwi (317 h)

Mentioned the same defect regarding hadith of Amash from Abi Saleh in (Ilal Al Ahadeeth fe Kitab Al Saheeh Muslim page 138 hadeeth 35)

8. Ibne Hibban said

و أمّا المدلسون الذين هم ثقات و عدول فإنا لا نحتج باخبارهم الا ما بينوا السماع في ما رووا مثل الثوري و الاعمش و أبي اسحاق و أضرابهم

Those mudallisoon who are thiqqah Adil but we take only those narrations in evidence from them in which they do tasreeh of sama like Thawri, Al Amash and Abu Ishaq. [Al Ihsan vol 1 page 161]

9. Imam Ibne Jareer Tabree said

إن الأعمش عندهم مدلس، ولا يجوز عندهم من قبول خبر المدلس إلا ما قال فيه حدثنا أو سمعت وما أشبه ذلك

Al Amash is Mudallis according to me, and It is not allowed according to me to accept the narration of mudallis except when he says i heard this hadeeth or narrated to us (end)**(Tahzeeb al Athar Musnad Ali bin abi Talib page 4 after the hadeeth no: 3)**

10. Abbas Ridvi Brelvi (famous debator in Pakistan) Did Jirha on Amash (An) Abi saleh hadeeth and Said

ایک راوی امام اعمش ہیں جو اگرچہ بہت بڑے امام ہیں لیکن مدلس ہیں اور مدلس راوی جب عن سے روایت کرے تو اس کی روایت بالاتفاق مردود ہو گی

A Narrator is Imam Amash, Who is greatest Imam but he is Mudallis and when Mudallis narrate with (AN) then his Narration is Bil Ittefaaq Rejected [Wallah aap Zindah hain page 251 (Wallah You (peace be upon him) are Alive page 351)]

11. In a narration of Mustadrak Al Hakim from the Route Amash (AN) Abi Wail

Aisha RA did Takzeeb of Amar bin Al Aas ra (Vol 4 Page 13). This is not acceptable because Amash is doing tadlees.

And in Tareekh Yaqoob bin Sufiyan Al Farsi vol 2 page 771

Huzaifa RA pointed out Abu Moosa Al Ashari to be a Munafiq but this hadeeth is weak due to Tadlees of Amash**. Now what will these people say regarding these ahadith?**

12. and Lastly

Abu Dawud in his *Sunan* records the hadith in the way al Bayhaqi mentions, namely with the chain: al A'mash from a man from Abu Salih, with an unnamed intermediary between al A'mash and Abu Salih

حدثنا الحسن بن علي حدثنا ابن نمير عن الأعمش قال نبئت عن أبي صالح قال ولا أراني إلا قد سمعته منه عن أبي هريرة قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم مثله

Amash said :

(From Abu saleh and i think i have heard this from Abu Saleh)

Abu Dawood Kitab as-Salaah hadeeth no: 517 http://www.islamweb.net/newlibrary/display_book.php?idfrom=860&idto=861&bk_no=55&ID=176

Note: he (r.h) himslef is in doubt whether he heard this hadith from Abu Saleh or not

So surely we can Conclude Amash was Mudallis and if he narrates from the mode (AN) then he is not evidence.

Objection no. 8: Muhadditheen on the hadith of Umar ra

Saying of Imam Mahmood Alusi on the athar of Umar ra:

He, said in Tafsir of the Ayat: "Seek Wasilah to Him" (Maidah: 35) **in his 'Ruh Al-Ma'ani"**

"And if we suppose it there is not but Iqsam (swearing) with alive and Tawassul (intermediation) with him, and making his (saw) state of life as his state of death in this topic needs a clear text and probably the text is opposed to that, as there is in "Sahih Al-Bukhari" from Anas that "Umar ibn Al-Khattab when they faced drought sought rain with Abbas and said: "O Allah we used to do Tawassul with Your Prophet (saw) and You gave us rain, and now we do Tawassul to You with the **uncle of our** Prophet, give us rain" and they were given rain. **And if there was Tawassul with him (saw) after his departure**

from this world, why did they turn to other than him? Rather they would have said: "O Allah we do Tawassul with Your Prophet, give us rain."
And they are far away from turning away from the Tawassul of the Prophet (saw) to the Tawassul with his uncle 'Abbas…while they were first forerunners (As-Sabiqun Al-Awalun), and they were more knowledgeable than us about Allah and His Prophet (saw), and the rights of Allah and His Prophet saw, what is legislated in invocation and what is not legislated, and they were in time of huge need, they were seeking relief from difficulties and easiness of difficult, and descent of rain with all ways, this is clear proof that the legislated is what they did without others…

As for the first information, the saying of Umar : "*We used to do Tawassul with Your Prophet (saw)"* and as for second his saying : *"and now we do Tawassul with uncle of Your Prophet (saw)*" because it is said : This Tawassul is not from chapter of Iqsam rather it is from categories of seeking intercession, and this is to seek invocation from an individual and his intercession, and seeking from Allah that he accepts his invocation and intercession. And this is supported by the fact that Abbas was invoking and they were trusting his invocation until rain came."

Imam Alusi said further: "Secondly, people have increased in invoking other than Allah from loved Awliya from dead and other, like saying **"Ya Sayidi Fulan Aghithni" (O so and so saint, save me) and this is not from permitted kinds of Tawassul in anything…**a great number of scholars have considered this to be **polytheism**…and I do not see anybody who says this except that he believes that the invoked alive absent or hidden dead knows the invisible or hears his saying and is capable by himself or with other to bring good and remove problems, and if not he would not call him nor open his mouth, and in this there is a great test from Allah… (end of Al Alousi words)

Saying of Allamah Ropuri On the athar of Umar ra

The action of this unknown man is in fact a proof against people advocating Istishfa on grave. 'Allamah 'Abdullah Ar-Ropuri said in his "Sima' Mawta" p 101-102:

"**It is known that this is not a prove for you but against you, because he was told in the dream to go to 'Umar, and 'Umar was alive at that time, so**

it is known that intercession of people alive should be sought not from dead...what you mentioned to support you is in fact refuting you, and despite this you do not understand, may Allah help you to pay attention: "he who struggles to seek will find and he who knocks with determination at the door will enter. " End of Allamah Ar-Ropuri's words.

And none of the Muhadith like Al-Bukhari, the authors of Sunnan and lowest books has a chapter about seeking intercession from the Prophet (saw) beside his grave.

Hafiz Suyuti on the athar of Umar ra

- **Imaam Suyooti in his work** :السيوطي- الأمر بالاتباع والنهي عن الابتداع Under the Chapter تعظيم الأماكن التي لا تستحق التعظيم (Veneration of those places which are not applicable for veneration) **On page 25 he said**

فإن قصد القبور للدعاء رجاء الإجابة فمنهي عنه، وهو إلى التحريم أقرب. والصحابة رضي الله عنهم - وقد أجدبوا مراتٍ - ودهمتهم نوائب بعد موته (، فهلا جاءوا فاستسقوا واستغاثوا عند قبر النبي (وهو أكرم الخلق على الله عز وجل، بل خرج فيهم سيدنا عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه بالعباس عم النبي (إلى المصلى فاستسقى به، ولم يستسقوا عند قبر النبي .)
فاقتد أيها المسلم إن كنت عبد الله بسلفك الصالح، وتحقق التوحيد الخالص؛ فلا تعبد إلا الله، ولا تشرك بربك أحداً، كما أمر الله تعالى بقوله: (فإياي فاعبدون)، وقال تعالى: (فمن كان يرجو لقاء ربه فليعمل عملاً صالحاً ولا يشرك بعبادة ربه أحداً). فلا تعبد إلا إياه ولا تد ع إلا هو، ولا تستعن إلا به، فإنه لا مانع ولا معطي ولا مضار ولا نافع إلا هو سبحانه وتعالى، لا إله إلا هو عليه توكلت وإليه أنيب

For Verily visiting the graves with the intention that our prayers **will be accepted is not allowed and it is closer to Haram**

Sahaba faced so many difficulties after the death of Prophet (peace be upon him) drought came to them,..... **So Why didn't they came to the grave of Prophet of Allah? Why they didn't requested him (peace be upon him) for rain? Why they didn't call at his grave?** Prophet (SAW) is the highest of the creation in the sight of Allah

In fact at the time of drought OMAR Ra went to Eid GAH with Abbas RA and asked him to pray for rain(prayer of istesqa see Sahih bukhari for detailed athar). **They never prayed near grave of Prophet (peace be upon him)**. O

Muslim If You are follower of Allah like your Salaf as Saleh were so follow them, do Research of Correct Tauheed, Do not Worship other then Allah, Do not Make Partners of Allah. As Allah Commanded (Therefore worship Me.) and Allah says (So whoever hopes for the meeting with his Lord, let him work righteousness and associate none as a partner in the worship of his Lord.'') (end)

Objection no. 9: Not a single scholar mentioned this narration under Istigatha or Tawassul through the Prophet peace be upon him

Dr Hatem al-Haj said: The major scholars of hadeeth who related this narration in their collections titled this report under various headings, such as istisqaa' or the virtues of Omar, and not under the permissibility of making tawassul by the prophet after his death (blessings and peace be upon him)[Amja Online Fatwa id 87015]

Ibn Hajar asqalani was himself against asking help from dead

Hafidh Ibne Hajar asqalani said (لكنه لا يستعاذ الا بالله أو بصفة من صفات ذاته

There is no seeking refuge but only to Allah and from the attributes of his dhaat. Fath ul Bari Kitab al Eman Ch 12

Scan:
http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAAOLgbwnm_2YRDCuteLmQTGvf5L50xpa8nw8HZjUtUJ2KO5PlWqRWlfqpahIzOcKLqMzXz2f8jUN3dYRZokFIpwAm1T1UKgDqEA2JqnJ01MhfS3Rp7n2T1Rm.jpg

Ibne Hajar Asqalani RA said:

قال نعيم بن حماد في الرد على الجهمية : دلت هذه الأحاديث يعني الواردة في الاستعاذة بأسماء الله وكلماته) والسؤال بها مثل أحاديث الباب وحديث عائشة وأبي سعيد بسم الله أرقيك وكلاهما عند مسلم وفي الباب عن عبادة وميمونة وأبي هريرة وغيرهم عند النسائي وغيره بأسانيد جياد على أن القرآن غير مخلوق إذ لو كان مخلوقاً لم يستعذ بها ، إذ لا يستعاذ بمخلوق ، قال الله تعالى (فاستعذ بالله) ، وقال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم : وإذا استعذت فاستعذ بالله)Fathul Bari Kitab at Tawheed ch 13

..."There is no Seeking refuge in creation!" Allah says (ask help from Allah) and Prophet peace be upon him said (If you want to ask, ask from Allah)

Scan:
http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAAoW5KzjflpPgydRzLE12JjFtDqi38gy-5bBFQ0OU77y3BNdgrQNjDx_qWvorpfG2HmDT7pj38B92MY1aAgAC4UAm1T1UMukXxDRBJD-zRM-78n8vYVaoW6-.jpg

Scholars' understanding of this narration (quoted by Um. Abdullah)

1. Hafidh Ibn Hajar al Asqalani -rahimahu Allah- in his books "Fath al Bari" (vol 3 pg. 441):

He sites it in chapter "The people asking the Imam to do istisqa' in times of drought," in the chapter heading section, in which he quotes ahadith that have relevance to the chapter heading, and that connect it with hadiths that come under that chapter.

Amongst those narrations he mentions the narration of Malik al Dar, and he only quotes part of the narration, he stops at **"go to Umar".** He used this as evidence that people ask the imam to do istisqa (ask for rain) for them in times of drought.

He didn't mention the rest of the hadith because it has nothing to do with the chapter heading, he only quoted what he believed fits the chapters title, for he says at the end of the section, after mentioning this narration:

"From all of this appears the relevance of the chapter heading to the origin of this story"

so, al Hafidh Ibn Hajar rahimahu Allah understood from this hadith that the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam was directing the man to go ask the Imam, during that time (Umar radiyallahu anhu), to do istisqa' for them.

2. Hafidh Ibn Kathir -rahimahu Allah-:

He sites it in his book “al Bidayah wan Nihaya ” (vol7 pg.104),in which he mentions some narrations, right before he mentions Malik ad Dar’s narration, which explain the meaning of the narration.

The narrations before it are by Sayf Ibn Umar, and in them is the mentioning of Umar radiyallahu anhu, after hearing about the man’s dream (who is said to be Bilal al Harith), asking the people on the minbar if they have seen anything bad from him, and then he tells them about the dream that Bilal saw, so they told him:

“Bilal has spoken the truth, so make istiqatha (seek or ask for help) to Allah, then the Muslims”. So then Umar radiyallahu anhu does istisqa’ through al Abbas radiyallahu anhu.

In the second narration, they said “he found you slow in doing istisqa’, so do istisqa’ for us “, so he did.

(Note: these 2 narrations could be weak, but the point is that al Hafidh Ibn Kathir rahimahu Allah mentioned them right before the narration of Malik, showing what it is about, which shows what he understood it to mean, same as what Ibn Hajar (r A) understood from it).

3. Ala’ ad Deen Ali al Mutaqi al Hindi al Burhan Furi (d. 975) in his book:

“Kanz al Ummal“:He sites it in chapter of **(salat al Istisqa’ - prayer for rain)**, and what the man did at the grave of the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam was asking for dua, not istisqa' prayer, and salat al Istisqa' was done by Umar radiyallahu anhu, when he made tawassul through Al Abbas radiyallahu anhu, thus both narrations are connected to each other, as shown in the previous points.

Conclusion: That the story of Malik al Dar’s narration is connected to the hadith about Umar’s tawassul through al Abbas, all leading to doing istisqa’ through the living, and not through the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam after his death.[http://www.saheefah.org/2008/04/14/detailed-look-at-the-narration-of-malik-al-dar/]

.Objection no: 10 Logical Arguments by Umm Abdullah (including the person is majhul who came to the grave of Prophet and he never told Omar ra this whole story)

Logical Arguments

1. The ones who use this hadith for this type of tawassul say that Umar radiyallahu anhu did not rebuke the man who did istisqa' at the grave.
   Reply: There is no clear evidence in the hadith indicating that the man told Umar of him going to the grave, but clearly he did tell him of the dream, telling him the message of the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam.so to say that he told him about his istisqa' at the grave is an assumption, and we can't use assumptions as evidence.

2. **It didn't rain until after Umar radiyallahu anhu made istisqa' by al Abbas radiyallahu anhum**.
   If the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam was capable or had permission to do du'aa to Allah after his death, when asked by others, then it would have rained immediately after the man asked the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam at his grave, but it didn't until after Umar's istisqa' through the duaa of Al Abbas radiyallahu anhu.

   This shows that the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam, was guiding the man to ask the umar to do istisqa' and not him, hinting to Umar by saying to him "**be clever!**", and when Umar did istisqa' by al Abbas (radiyallahu anhuma) it immediately rained..

3. If going to the grave of the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam to ask him to make duaa to Allah was permissible, Umar radiyallahu anhu would have done that when wanting to do istisqa' instead of doing it through the uncle of the Messenger sallallahu alayhi wa sallam, who was alive, and Umar's (r.a) saying "**we used to** make tawassul through your Prophet's duaa, and now we do

tawassul through the uncle of your Prophet…", indicates that they don't make tawassul through the Prophet's (sallallahu alayhi wa sallam) duaa after his death, and only when he was alive, or else **why would he say "we used to"**?

4. If what the man did (wether it was Bilal ibn al Harith radiyallahu anhu or someone else) was correct\permissible, then:

- Why didn't any of the scholars I quoted mention the narration in a chapter titled (tawassul by the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam) or some title indicating that the narration is EVIDENCE for permissibility of that type of tawassul? Instead they titled the chapter in which the narration is present (salat al istisqa'- the man didn't do salat al Istisqa' at the grave, only did duaa, while Umar rA did salat al istisqa) , (The people asking the Imam to do istisqa' in times of drought), he didn't say "intercession through the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam",<u>wouldn't it be more important to point out the permissibility of tawassul through the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam after his death</u>, which is stronger than doing tawassul through the righteous and ahl al bayt?

  Instead they ignored that part, **<u>showing</u> <u>no importance</u> to it at all**.

  So if they believed that the narration indicates the permissibility of such a tawassul, why didn't they at least **hint** to it by the chapter title or a comment like they did to show that it meant to do intercession through saliheen and ahl al bayt, and ask the imam to do istisqa?

5.

- What was the point of the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam telling Umar r.A "**be clever**"?
- If the man told Umar that he went to the grave, and then told him about the dream, why would Umar do salat al istisqa' when the man already asked the

Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam to do istisqa' and he told him that they will be watered?

- **Isn't the istisqa' of the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam sufficient?**
- If the action of the man was correct (to ask the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam to do istisqa), and the Prophet S.A.W answered his request, then why didn't it rain immediately after the dream, and instead came down immediately after al Abbas's (radiyallahu anhu) duaa?

Who is higher in status, the Prophet sallallahu alayhi wa sallam or his uncle?

BLOCK 23

They said

Hadith # 5

Abu Nu'aym related to us who said that Sufyan related to us from Abu Ishaq from Abdur Rahman ibn Sa'd, who said Ibn Umar had numbness in his leg, whereupon a man said to him Remember the most beloved of people to you, so he said **Ya Muhammad**

Reference

►Imam Bukhari, Kitab ul Adab ul Mufrad, Page No. 404, Hadith # 964 **Click here for Scanned Page (8)**

Note: There has been an issue, where some of the new version books doesn't contain the word "YA". Here we liked to present the Kalmi Nuskha(refers to original manuscript which was copied by hand writing from classical scholars) of al-Adab al-Mufrad by Imam Bukhari from Jamiyah al-Azhar Misr - Authenticated by Maqtabah Jamiyah al-Riyad **Click here for Scanned Page (84)**

Mullah Ali Qari (rah) say: He said

كانه رضى الله تعالى عنه قصد به اظهار المحبة فى ضمن الاستغاثة

Translation: Ibn Umar (Radhi Allah) expressed his love in the form of "ISTIGHATHA (SEEKING HELP)" [Mullah Ali Qari: Sharh ash-Shifa (2/41)] **Click here for Scanned Page (**155**)**

2) Ibn e Sa'd , Book : Tabqaat Al Kubra Volume : 4 page : 144 Under Biography of Abdullah Bin Umer **Click here for Scanned Page (**150**)**

3) Qadi Ayyad Book : As Shifa Fasl : Feemi Rawa An As Salf Wal Aaemmah Volume : 2 page : 23 **Click here for Scanned Page (**151**)**

4) Imam Ibn e Sunni Book : Amal Al yaum Wa Layilah Chapter : what should be said , if leg goes num, Page : 221-223 Hadith number : 169, 170, 171, 173 **Click here for Scanned Page (**152**)**

5) Imam Mizzi Book : Tahdeeb Al Kamaal Volume : 17 Page : 142 Under Biography of 'Abdur Rahman Bin Sa'd Al Qurashi Al 'Adawi **Click here for Scanned Page (**153**)**

6) Ibn e Ja'd Book : Al Musnad Volume : 2 Page : 917 Hadith number : 2633 **Click here for Scanned Page (**154**)**

Our Response

Objections on this chain and Text

1. **Abu Ishaq is Mudallis and narrating from (An): Meaning he is not quoting his direct hearing of hadith from the narrator he is narrating.**
2. **Idhteraab (Interchanging the narrators in chain)**
3. **Some of the version of Adab Al Mufrad doesn't contains the word YA but only Muhammad(Peace be upon Him)**
4. **The text is against Quran**

5. **The text is against Authentic Hadith**
6. **The text is against own Stance of Ibne Omar RA**

Objection no: 1 Abu Ishaq is Mudallis and narrating from (An)

In the chain Abu Ishaq As Sabeei is Mudallis And he is Narrating from (AN).

Ibne Hibban said

و أمّا المدلسون الذين هم ثقات و عدول فإنا لا نحتج باخبارهم الا ما بينوا السماع في ما رووا مثل الثوري و الاعمش و أبي اسحاق و أضرابهم

It says that

Those mudallisoon who are ThIqqah Adil but we take only those narrations in evidence from them in which they do tasreeh of sama like Thawri, Al Amash and **Abu Ishaq.**

Al Ihsan vol 1 page 161

Haafidh Ibn Hajr said

"Famous for tadlees **(Tabaqaat al-Mudalliseen (3/91)third tabqa of Mudalliseen)**

Ibn Ma'in said:

"A'amsh and Abu Ishaaq as-Sabee'ee rendered the ahadeeth of the people of koofah to be corruptive due to tadlees." **(Tahdheeb ut-Tahdheeb (8/55)**

Objection no: 2 Idhteraab (Interchanging the narrators in chain)

Idhtiraab is when a narrator interchanges the names in a chain he sometimes narrates from person A and then sometimes narrates from Person B (the same incident). This is idhtiraab of the chain,
Haafidh Ibn Hajr said,

"If by changing the name of a narrator a trustworthy narrator is opposed, and none of them can be given precedence over the other, then such a hadeeth is mudhtarib." (Nazhatun-Nazhar (pg.81)

Sometimes Abu ishaq Narrate this from Abdul Rahman bin Saad as mentioned in Adab al Mufrad

Sometimes he narrate from Haytham bin Hansh as mentioned in Amal Al Yaum wa Laylah
Sometimes he narrate from Abu Shaybah as mentioned in same Amal al Yawm wa Laylah

Objection no: 3 Some of the version of Adab Al Mufrad doesn't contains the word YA but only Muhammad(Peace be upon Him)

Even if this Athar is proven then in adab al mufrad of Dar ul Bashair Islamiyah Beruit with the Tahqeeq of Muhammad Fawad Abdul Baq`eethe word (ya) is not mentioned

- حدثنا أبو نعيم قال حدثنا سفيان عن أبي إسحاق عن عبد الرحمن بن سعد قال خدرت رجل بن عمر فقال له رجل اذكر أحب الناس إليك فقال محمد

'Abu Na'im narrated to us, he said: Sufyaan narrated to us from 'Abi 'Ishaaq from 'Abd ar-Rahman bin Sa'd, he said: a foot of 'Ibn 'Umar fell asleep, so a man said to him: Mention the most loved person to you. So he said: **Muhammad.**

Adab al Mufrad hadith no: 964
Dow nload from here
http://www.almeshkat.net/books/open.php?book=277&cat=8

Objection no: 4 The text is against Quran

It's against Quran

[6:17] If God touch thee with affliction, none can remove it but He; if He touch thee with happiness, He hath power over all things.

And Allah Says

[27:62] Is He [not best] who responds to the desperate one when he calls upon Him and removes evil and makes you inheritors of the earth? Is there a deity with Allah ? Little do you remember.

And Allah says

[35:2] Whatever mercy, Allah may grant to mankind, none can withhold it, and whatever He may withhold, none can grant it thereafter
And Allah Says

[17:67] And when harm touches you upon the sea, those that you call upon vanish from you except Him

And Allah Says

[16:53] Then, when harm touches you, unto Him you cry aloud for help

Ibn e Kathir Commented

أي: لعلمكم أنه لا يقدر على إزالته إلا هو، فإنكم عند الضرورات تلجؤون إليه وتسألونه، وتلحون في الرغبة إليه مستغيثين به

Meaning because you know that none has the power to remove that harm except for Him, so when you are harmed, you turn to ask Him for help and beg Him for aid

Source: http://altafsir.com/Tafasir.asp?tMadhNo=1&tTafsirNo=7&tSoraNo=16&tAyahNo=53&tDisplay=yes&UserProfile=0&LanguageId=1

Commentary of Jalalayn says

{ وَمَا بِكُم مّن نّعْمَةٍ فَمِنَ ٱللَّهِ } لا يأتي بها غيره و «ما» شرطية أو موصولة { ثُمَّ إِذَا مَسَّكُمُ } أصابكم { ٱلضُّرُّ } الفقر والمرض { فَإِلَيْهِ تَجْئَرُونَ } ترفعون أصواتكم بالاستغاثة والدعاء ولا تدعون غيره.

Whatever grace you have, it is from God, none but He brings it (mā, ‘whatever’, is either a conditional or relative [particle]). Then when misfortune, poverty or illness, befalls you, to Him you cry for help, [to Him] you raise your voices with pleas for help and supplications, and you do not call upon any other than Him.

Source: http://altafsir.com/Tafasir.asp?tMadhNo=0&tTafsirNo=74&tSoraNo=16&tAyahNo=53&tDisplay=yes&UserProfile=0&LanguageId=2

Commentary of Ibne Jozi Says

قال الزجاج: «تجأرون»: ترفعون أصواتكم إِليه بالاستغاثة

Zajjaj said: «تجأرون»: [to Him] you raise your voices with pleas for help
Source: http://altafsir.com/Tafasir.asp?tMadhNo=0&tTafsirNo=15&tSoraNo=16&tAyahNo=53&tDisplay=yes&UserProfile=0&LanguageId=1

Objection no: 5 The text is against Authentic Hadith

It is against hadith

Hadith no: 1

(. It is recorded in the Sahih that the Messenger of Allah used to supplicate,

«اللَّهُمَّ لَا مَانِعَ لِمَا أَعْطَيْتَ وَلَا مُعْطِيَ لِمَا مَنَعْتَ، وَلَا يَنْفَعُ ذَا الْجَدِّ مِنْكَ الْجَد»

(O Allah, there is none Who can avert what You grant or give what You deprive, and no fortune ever helps the fortunate against You.)
(Commentary of Ibne Kathir under the ayah 17 of Surah Al An`aam)
Prophet Peace be upon him himself is asking from Allah and Supplicating

Hadith no: 2

Abu al-'Abbas 'Abdullah bin 'Abbas, *radiyallahu anhuma*, reported: One day I was behind the Prophet, *sallallahu 'alayhi wasallam*, and he said to me: "O young man, I shall teach you some words [of advice] : Be mindful of Allah, and Allah will protect you. Be mindful of Allah, and you will find Him in front of you. **If you (have need to) ask, ask of Allah; and if you seek help, seek help from Allah.** Know that even if the Nation (or the whole community) were to gather together to benefit you with something, they would not benefit you with anything except that which Allah has already recorded for you, and that if they gather together to harm you with something, they would not be able to harm you with anything except that which Allah has already recorded against you. The pens have been lifted and the pages have dried."**[Sahih al-Tirmidhi 2043 and said Hasan Sahih, Al bani Authenticated in Saheeh Tirmidhee, SHAYKH SHUAIB AL ARANAUT in his Tahqeeq of Musnad Ahmad vol no:4 page 410 hadith no: 2669 said that Chain is Qawi]**

Hadith no: 3

Imam Ahmad reported that a man of Balhajim said: "O Messenger of Allah, what are you calling for'' He said:

«أَدْعُو إِلَى اللهِ وَحْدَهُ الَّذِي إِنْ مَسَّكَ ضُرٌّ فَدَعَوْتَهُ كَشَفَ عَنْكَ، وَالَّذِي إِنْ أَضْلَلْتَ بِأَرْضِ قَفْرٍ فَدَعَوْتَهُ رَدَّ عَلَيْكَ، وَالَّذِي إِنْ أَصَابَتْكَ سَنَةٌ فَدَعَوْتَهُ أَنْبَتَ لَكَ»

(I am calling people to Allah Alone, the One Who, if you call on Him when harm befalls you, will relieve you; and when you are lost in the wilderness, you call on Him and He brings you back: and when drought (famine) strikes, you call on Him and He makes your crops grow.)

Commentary of Ibne Kathir Under 27:62

Objection no: 6 The text is against own Stance of Ibne Omar RA

It is against own stance of Abdullah Bin Omar RA

Mawtta Malik *Book 3, Number 3.14.57:*

Yahya related to me from Malik from Nafi that Abdullah ibn Umar used to say the tashahhud saying, "In the name of Allah. Greetings belong to Allah. Prayers belong to Allah. Pure actions belong to Allah. Peace be on the Prophet and the mercy of Allah and His blessings. Peace be on us and on the slaves of Allah who are salihun. I testify that there is no god except Allah. I testify that Muhammad is the Messenger of Allah."

"Bismillah, at-tahiyatu lillah, as-salawatu lillah, az-zakiyatu lillah. As-salamu ala'n-nabiyyi wa rahmatullahi wa barakatuhu. As-salamu alayna wa ala ibadi'llahi's-salihin. Shahidtu an la ilaha illallah. Shahidtu anna Muhammadu'r-rasulu'llah."

He used to say this after the first two rakas and he would make supplication with whatever seemed fit to him when the tashahhud was completed. When he sat at the end of the prayer, he did the tashahhud in a similar manner, except that after the tashahhud he made supplication with whatever seemed fit to him. When he had completed the tashahhud and intended to say the taslim, he said, **"Peace be on the Prophet and His mercy and blessings**. Peace be upon us and on the slaves of Allah who are salihun."
"As-salamu ala'n-nabiyyi wa rahmatu'llahi wa barakatuhu. As-salamu alayna wa ala ibadi'llahi'ssalihin ."

He then said, "Peace be upon you" to his right, and would return the greeting to the imam, and if anyone said "Peace be upon you" from his left he would return the greeting to him.(end)

Note: Both are Correct (As-salaamu ‘alayka ayyhu’l-nabiyyu) And (As-salaamu`Alan-Nabiyyu) because both are proven from Sahaba.

Islam qa says

It was not permissible to address the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) by saying “Ya Muhammad” during his lifetime, because Allaah says (interpretation of the meaning):

“Make not the calling of the Messenger (Muhammad صلى الله عليه وسلم) among you as your calling one of another” [al-Noor 24:63].

Al-Dahhaak said, narrating from Ibn ‘Abbaas: **They used to say Ya Muhammad**, Ya Aba’l-Qaasim, **but Allaah told them not to do that, out of respect to His Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him)**. So they said Ya Rasool Allaah (O Messenger of Allaah), Ya Nabi Allaah (O Prophet of Allaah). Mujaahid and Sa’eed ibn Jubayr said something similar.
Qataadah said: Allaah enjoined that His Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) **should be treated with respect and venerated and honoured as a leader.** Muqaatil ibn Hayyaan said: **Do not address him by name when you call him and say Ya Muhammad, and do not say Ya Ibn ‘Abd-Allaah.** Rather address him with honour and say Ya Nabi Allaah or Ya Rasool Allaah.

Maalik said, narrating from Zayd ibn Aslam: Allaah enjoined them to address him with honour. So the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) should not be addressed by name only, rather it should be said: Ya Rasool Allaah, Ya Nabi Allaah.

Secondly:
It is **not permissible to call** on the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) in du’aa’ after his death, because du’aa’ is an act of worship that can only be directed to Allaah. Allaah says (interpretation of the meaning):
“And the mosques are for Allaah (Alone), so invoke not anyone along with Allaah”[al-Jinn 72:13]

“And who is more astray than one who calls on (invokes) besides Allaah, such as will not answer him till the Day of Resurrection, and who are (even) unaware of their calls (invocations) to them?” [al-Ahqaaf 46:5]

And the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said to Ibn ‘Abbaas (may Allaah be pleased with him): **“If you ask, then ask of Allaah, and if you seek help then seek help from Allaah.”**Narrated by al-Tirmidhi (2516) and classed as saheeh by al-Albaani in Saheeh Sunan al-Tirmidhi.

Du’aa’ is asking for benefit and asking for harm to be warded off, and it is not only done by saying Yaa (O…), rather it has become customary among people to use this call in du’aa’, especially when hardship comes and calamity strikes, so they say Ya Allaah, meaning O Allaah, save us, give us help, support us. (end)

Source: http://www.islam-qa.com/en/ref/111019

So from Above we can conclude that its is not Allowed to say YA Muhammad (Peace be upon him) how can we assume that Ibne Umar RA went against Quran and Sunnah?

Their Objections

1st Objection Abu Ishaq is Narrator of Bukhari

One of the Soofi quoted some Ahadeeth from Bukhari and Muslim and said see here Abu Ishaq is narrating from (AN) so do you say that Bukhari has weak ahadith? First of all i want to tell that Rule of Bukhari and Muslim is different from others

Nawawi said

ما كان في الصحيحين وغيرهما من الكتب الصحيحة عن المدلسين بعن ، محمول ثبوت سماعه من جهة أخرى

Irshad Al Talib Al Haqaiq page 93

Hafiz Nawawi said

أَنَّ الْأَعْمَش مُدَلِّسٌ وَالْمُدَلِّس إِذَا قَالَ (عَنْ) لَا يُحْتَجّ بِهِ إِلَّا أَنْ يَثْبُتَ سَمَاعُهُ مِنْ جِهَةٍ أُخْرَى وَقَدْ قَدَّمْنَا فِي الْفُصُول وَفِي شَرْح الْمُقَدِّمَة أَنَّ مَا كَانَ فِي الصَّحِيحَيْنِ عَنْ الْمُدَلِّسِينَ(بِعَنْ) فَمَحْمُول عَلَى ثُبُوت سَمَاعهمْ مِنْ جِهَةٍ أُخْرَى . وَاَللَّه أَعْلَمُ .

source:
http://hadith.al-islam.com/Display/Display.asp?Doc=10&ID=24835&SearchText=%E6%C7%E1%C7%DA%E3%D4%20%E3%CF%E1%D3&SearchType=root&Scope=all&Offset=0&SearchLevel=QBE

Summary of saying is that

(MunAN) narrations of Mudalliseen in Sahihyeen(Bukhari and Muslim) are presumed to possess sound linkage.

Abu Muhammad Abdul kareem al halbi said

Scholars said (mun un) narrations of Shahayn are equal to Sama (meaning they quoted sama)

al Tabrah wal Tabsarah tul Iraqi volume 1 page 186

These are the ahdeeth which he quoted from Sahih Bukhari of Abu Ishaq and all are from (AN) lets see one by one and reply

No: 1.

الجزء الأول >> 3 - العلم كتاب. >> 48 -
باب: بعض ترك من منه أشد في فيقعوا عنه، الناس بعض فهم يقصر أن مخافة الاختيار،.
126 - حدثنا عبد الله بن مسلمة عن مالك عن ابن شهاب عن سالم بن عبد الله أن عبد الله بن محمد بن أبي بكر أخبر عبد الله بن عمر عن عائشة رضي الله عنهم زوج النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال لها ألم تري أن قومك لما بنوا الكعبة اقتصروا عن قواعد إبراهيم فقلت يا رسول الله ألا تردها على قواعد إبراهيم قال لولا حدثان قومك بالكفر لفعلت

الزبير ابن لي قال: قال الأسود عن ، إسحاق أبي عن ، إسرائيل عن موسى، بن الله عبيد حدثنا:
وسلم عليه الله صلى النبي قال :لي قالت :قلت الكعبة؟ في حدثتك فما كثيرا، إليك تسر عائشة كانت:
(يا عائشة لولا قومك حديث عهدهم - الزبير ابن قال -
الزبير ابن ففعله .(يخرجون وباب الناس يدخل باب :بابين لها فجعلت الكعبة، لنقضت بكفر،

Reply
Imam Bukhari quoted this hadith in 7 different places and different chains to make it authentic

Here is the 1st chain.
حدثنا عبد الله بن مسلمة عن مالك عن ابن شهاب عن سالم بن عبد الله أن عبد الله بن محمد بن أبي بكر أخبر عبد الله بن عمر عن عائشة رضي الله عنهم زوج النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال لها ألم تري أن قومك لما بنوا الكعبة اقتصروا عن قواعد إبراهيم فقلت يا رسول الله ألا تردها على قواعد إبراهيم قال لولا حدثان قومك بالكفر لفعلت

http://hadith.al-islam.com/Display/Display.asp?Doc=0&Rec=2511

2nd chain.

حدثنا مسدد حدثنا أبو الأحوص حدثنا أشعث عن الأسود بن يزيد عن عائشة رضي الله عنها قالت سألت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم عن الجدر أمن البيت هو قال نعم قلت فما لهم لم يدخلوه في البيت قال إن قومك قصرت بهم النفقة قلت فما شأن بابه مرتفعا قال فعل ذلك قومك ليدخلوا من شاءوا ويمنعوا من شاءوا ولولا أن قومك حديث عهدهم بالجاهلية فأخاف أن تنكر قلوبهم أن أدخل الجدر في البيت وأن ألصق بابه بالأرض

3rd chain

حدثنا عبيد بن إسماعيل حدثنا أبو أسامة عن هشام عن أبيه عن عائشة رضي الله عنها قالت قال لي رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم لولا حداثة قومك بالكفر لنقضت البيت ثم لبنيته على أساس إبراهيم عليه السلام فإن قريشا استقصرت بناءه وجعلت له خلفا

قال أبو معاوية حدثنا هشام خلفا يعني بابا

http://hadith.al-islam.com/Display/Display.asp?Doc=0&Rec=2513

There is no Abu ishaq is in any of these 3 chains apart from this Bukhari quoted this hadith in other places hadith no: 3368,4483,7243

Hadith no: 2

(3741) -

حدثنا عبد الله بن رجاء :حدثنا إسرائيل ، *عن إسحاق أبي* عن البراء :قال محمد أصحاب كنا عليه الله صلى وسلم :نتحدث

بضعة مؤمن، إلا معه يجاوز ولم النهر، معه جاوزوا الذين طالوت أصحاب عدة على بدر أصحاب عدة أن وثلاثمائة عشر

Reply

In very previous hadith one can see Samat of Abu Ishaq from Al Baraa

حدثنا زهير حدثنا عمرو بن خالد حدثنا سمعت البراء قال إسحاق أبو يقول عنه الله رضي

حدثني أصحاب محمد صلى الله عليه وسلم ممن شهد بدرا أنهم كانوا عدة أصحاب طالوت الذين جازوا معه النهر بضعة عشر وثلاث مائة قال البراء لا والله ما جاوز معه النهر إلا مؤمن

http://hadith.al-islam.com/Display/Display.asp?Doc=0&Rec=5902'

Hadith no: 3

(3352) - حدثنا عبد الله بن رجاء :حدثنا إسرائيل ، *عن إسحاق أبي* عن وهب أبي جحيفة :قال السوائي

العنفقة السفلى، شفته تحت من بياضا ورأيت وسلم، عليه الله صلى النبي رأيت

Reply

Imam Bukhari quoted very next hadith with different chain.

حدثنا عصام بن خالد حدثنا حريز بن عثمان أنه سأل عبد الله بن بسر صاحب النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال

أرأيت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم كان شيخا قال كان في عنفقته شعرات بيض

http://hadith.al-islam.com/Display/Display.asp?Doc=0&Rec=5429

Hadith no: 4

الإيمان من الصلاة :باب - 29 << .الإيمان كتاب - 2 << الأول الجزء ،

40 -

وسلم عليه الله صلى النبي أن البراء، عن إسحاق، أبو حدثنا :قال زهير حدثنا :قال خالد بن عمرو حدثنا:
عشر ستة المقدس بيت قبل صلى وأنه الأنصار، من أخواله قال أو أجداده، على نزل المدينة قدم ما أول كان
صلاها صلاة أول صلى وأنه البيت، قبل تكونقبلته أن يعجبه وكان شهرا، سبعة أو شهرا،

Reply

Abu ishaq Quoted his Sama`at in other hadith

رضي الله عنه أبو إسحاق قال سمعت البراء حدثنا محمد بن المثنى حدثنا يحيى عن سفيان حدثني قال

صلينا مع النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم نحو بيت المقدس ستة عشر أو سبعة عشر شهرا ثم صرفه نحو القبلة

http://hadith.al-islam.com/Display/Display.asp?Doc=0&Rec=6473

Hadith no: 5

وسلم عليه الله صلى النبي وقول الوصايا، :باب - 1 << .الوصايا كتاب - 59 << الثاني الجزء:
(عنده مكتوبة الرجل وصية)

2588 -

عن إسحاق، أبو حدثنا :الجعفي معاوية بن زهير حدثنا :بكير أبي بن يحيى حدثنا :الحارث بن إبراهيم حدثنا
الحارث، بن عمرو

وسلم عليه الله صلى الله رسول ترك ما :قال الحارث، بنت جويرية أخي وسلم، عليه الله صلى الله رسول ختن
صدقة جعلها وأرضا وسلاحه، البيضاء، بغلته إلا شيئا، أمة،ولا ولا عبدا، ولا دينارا، ولا درهما، موته عند

Reply

Bukhari quoted this hadith in other place where abu ishaq mentioned his Sama

أبو إسحاق قال سمعت عمرو بن الحارث حدثنا عمرو بن علي حدثنا يحيى حدثنا سفيان قال حدثني قال

ما ترك النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم إلا بغلته البيضاء وسلاحه وأرضا تركها صدقة

http://hadith.al-islam.com/Display/Display.asp?Doc=0&Rec=4533

Hadith no: 6

القتال عند الصبر :باب - 32 << والسير الجهاد كتاب - 60 << الثاني الجزء.

2678 -

أبي سالم عن عقبة، بن موسى عن إسحاق، أبو حدثنا :عمرو بن معاوية حدثنا :محمد بن الله عبد حدثنا
كتب،فقرأته أوفى أبي بن الله عبد أن :النضر:
فاصبروا لقيتموهم إذا) :قال وسلم عليه الله صلى الله رسول إن

Reply

This is Jahalah of that person who said he is Abu Ishaq As sabiee because he is not **Abu ishaq as sabiee** but he is **Abu Ishaq Fadhari Ibraheem bin Muhammad bin Harith.**

here is the evidence from same Sahih Bukhari, Bukhari quoted same hadith

موسى بن _أبو إسحاق الفزاري عن حدثنا يوسف بن موسى حدثنا عاصم بن يوسف اليربوعي حدثنا
عقبة قال حدثني سالم أبو النضر مولى عمر بن عبيد الله كنت كاتبا له قال كتب إليه عبد الله بن أبي أوفى
حين خرج إلى الحرورية فقرأته فإذا فيه إن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم في بعض أيامه التي لقي
فيها العدو انتظر حتى مالت الشمس ثم قام في الناس فقال أيها الناس لا تمنوا لقاء العدو وسلوا الله العافية
فإذا لقيتموهم فاصبروا واعلموا أن الجنة تحت ظلال السيوف ثم قال اللهم منزل الكتاب ومجري السحاب
وهازم الأحزاب اهزمهم وانصرنا عليهم

http://hadith.al-islam.com/Display/Display.asp?Doc=0&Rec=4767

Hadith no: 7

الموت عند السلاح كسر ير لم من :باب - 85 << والسير الجهاد كتاب - 60 << الثاني الجزء.

2755 -

قال الحارث بن عمرو عن إسحاق، أبي عن سفيان، عن الرحمن، عبد حدثنا :عباس بن عمرو حدثنا:
صدقة جعلها وأرضا بيضاء، وبغلة سلاحه، إلا وسلم عليه الله صلى النبي ترك ما.

Reply

In this hadith abu ishaq and sufiyan are narrating from (AN)but Bukhari quoted this hadith in Other place and he mentioned the Sama of Sufiyan and Abu ishaq

عمرو بن الحارث قال سفيان قال حدثني أبو إسحاق قال سمعت حدثنا مسدد حدثنا يحيى عن
ما ترك النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم إلا سلاحه وبغلته البيضاء وأرضا تركها صدقة

http://hadith.al-islam.com/Display/Display.asp?Doc=0&Rec=4881

Hadith no: 9

البخاري صحيح

الجاهلية أيام :باب - 56 << الصحابة فضائل كتاب - 66 << الثاني الجزء.

3626 -

قال ميمون بن عمرو عن إسحاق، أبي عن سفيان، حدثنا :الرحمن عبد حدثنا :عباس بن عمرو حدثني:
فخالفهم ثبير، على الشمس تشرق حتى جمع من يفيضون لا كانوا المشركين إن :عنه الله رضي عمر قال
تطلعالشمس أن قبل فأفاض وسلم عليه الله صلى النبي

Reply

Abu Ishaq quoted his sama in kitab al hajj of Sahih Bukhari Chapter 100

يقول شهدت عمر رضي الله عنه أبي إسحاق سمعت عمرو بن ميمون حدثنا حجاج بن منهال حدثنا شعبة عن صلى بجمع الصبح ثم وقف فقال إن المشركين كانوا لا يفيضون حتى تطلع الشمس ويقولون أشرق ثبير وأن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم خالفهم ثم أفاض قبل أن تطلع الشمس

http://hadith.al-islam.com/Display/Display.asp?Doc=0&Rec=2662

Ahadith of Sahih Muslim where Abu Ishaq is Narrating from (An) provided by Soofi

Hadith no: 1

الثاني الجزء >> 12 - الزكاة كتاب. >>
النار من حجاب وأنها طيبة، كلمة أو تمرة بشق ولو الصدقة على الحث باب (20)

66- (1016) حدثنا سلام بن عون الكوفي. حدثنا زهير معاوية الجعفي عن إسحاق، أبي عن
سمعت :قال ؛ حاتم بن عدي عن معقل، بن عبدالله النبيصلى الله عليه وسلم يقول:

فليفعل تمرة، بشق ولو النار من يستتر أن منكم استطاع من".
وجانبها نصفها الشين، بكسر الشق (بشق) ش]

Reply

IMAM Muslim mentined same hadith with different chain.

و حدثنا محمد بن المثنى وابن بشار قالا حدثنا محمد بن جعفر حدثنا شعبة عن عمرو بن مرة عن خيثمة عن عدي بن حاتم
عن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم أنه ذكر النار فتعوذ منها وأشاح بوجهه ثلاث مرار ثم قال اتقوا النار ولو بشق تمرة فإن لم تجدوا فبكلمة طيبة

http://hadith.al-islam.com/display/Display.asp?Doc=1&Rec=2215

Hadith no: 2

144 -

أرقم، بن زيد عن إسحاق، أبي عن زهير حدثنا .آدم بن يحيى حدثنا .شيبة أبي بن بكر أبو وحدثنا (1254)
منه؛ سمعه

حجة .غيرها يحج لم حجة هاجر ما بعد وحج .غزوة عشرة تسع غزا وسلم عليه الله صلى الله رسول أن
الوداع

Reply

Imam Muslim quoted same hadith with different chain

حدثنا زهير بن حرب حدثنا روح بن عبادة حدثنا زكرياء أخبرنا أبو الزبير أنه سمع جابر بن عبد الله يقولا

غزوت مع رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم تسع عشرة غزوة قال جابر لم أشهد بدرا ولا أحدا منعني أبي فلما قتل عبد الله يوم أحد لم أتخلف عن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم في غزوة قط

http://hadith.al-islam.com/display/Display.asp?Doc=1&Rec=4357

Hadith no: 3

1 - << عنهم تعالى الله رضي الصحابة فضائل كتاب - 44 >> .الرابع الجزء .مسلم صحيح

عنه الله رضي الصديق، بكر أبي فضائل من باب

5 -

(2383) أبي عن إسحاق، أبي عن سفيان حدثني .عبدالرحمن حدثنا :قالا بشار وابن المثنى بن محمد حدثنا مليكة، أبي ابن عن عميس أبو أخبرنا .عون بن جعفر أخبرنا .بنحميد عبد وحدثنا ح .عبدالله عن الأحوص، .قال .عبدالله عن:

".خليلا قحافة أبي ابن لاتخذت خليلا متخذا كنت لو" وسلم عليه الله صلى الله رسول قال

Reply

See very next ahadith Muslim quoted 2 different chains

حدثنا محمد بن المثنى وابن بشار قالا حدثنا عبد الرحمن حدثني سفيان عن أبي إسحق عن أبي حدثنا عبد بن حميد أخبرنا جعفر بن عون أخبرنا أبو عميس عن ابن و الأحوص عن عبد الله ح أبي مليكة عن عبد الله قال

قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم لو كنت متخذا خليلا لاتخذت ابن أبي قحافة خليلا

http://hadith.al-islam.com/display/Display.asp?Doc=1&Rec=5649

and here is 3rd chain

حدثنا عثمان بن أبي شيبة وزهير بن حرب وإسحق بن إبراهيم قال إسحق أخبرنا و قال الآخران حدثنا جرير عن مغيرة عن واصل بن حيان عن عبد الله بن أبي الهذيل عن أبي الأحوص عن عبد الله

عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال لو كنت متخذا من أهل الأرض خليلا لاتخذت ابن أبي قحافة خليلا ولكن صاحبكم خليل الله

http://hadith.al-islam.com/display/Display.asp?Doc=1&Rec=5650

Hadith no: 4 (his last quote)

18 - << والاستغفار والتوبة والدعاء الذكر كتاب - 48 >> .الرابع الجزء

يعمل لم ما شر ومن عمل، ما شر من التعوذ باب

72-م -
(2721) الإسناد، بهذا إسحاق، أبي عن سفيان، عن عبدالرحمن حدثنا :قالا .بشار وابن المثنى ابن وحدثنا
".والعفة"روايته في قال المثنى ابن أن غير .مثله

Here Imam Muslim is saying that This hadith has been narrated on the authority of Abu Ishaq with the same chain of transmitters but with a slight variation of wording. i don't know why he quoted this

As for the saying of Mulla Ali qari then it has nothing to do with istegatha of brailwism because Ibn Umar ra did not say (if it is authentic) that O Prophet peace be upon him heal me.

Mullah Ali Qari said under the hadtih,

"And when you ask then ask Allah and when you seek aid then seek aid from Allah"

ويعتمد فى جمهور الامور عليه اى ولا يسأل غيره لان غيره غير قادر
على العطأ والمنع ودفع الضرر وجلب
النفع فانهم لا يملكون موتا ولا حياتا ولا نشور

"And one should, in all of one's issues rely on Him i.e. not ask anyone apart from Him because those apart from Him are not able to give or prevent, remove harm, attract benefit, for indeed they do not possess the ability to give death or life and nor resurrection."[Mirqat, 2:159]

BLOCK 24

They said

Hadith # 6

It is attributed to Dawud bin Abu Salih. He says: one day Marwan came and he saw that a man was lying down with his mouth turned close to the Prophet's

grave. Then he (Marwan) said to him, “Do you know what are you doing?” When he moved towards him, he saw that it was Abu Ayyub al-Ansari. (In reply) he said, “Yes (I know) I have come to the Messenger of Allah (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) and not to a stone. I have heard it from the Messenger of God (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) not to cry over religion when its guardian is competent. Yes, shed tears over religion when its guardian is incompetent.

References

►Imam Hakim declared it **"Sahih"** while Imam Dhahabi **"AGREED"** with him [Al-Mustadrak 4:520, Hadith # 8571]

►Ahmad bin Hambal with a sound chain of transmission in his Musnad Volume 005: Hadith Number 422; Hakim, al-Mustadrak Volume 004: Hadith Number 515 **Click here for Scanned Page (6)**

Above hadith with another chain by Imam Tabrani

► Tabrani, Book : Ma'jam Al Ausath, Volume : 1, Page : 94, Hadith number : 284

Click here for Scanned Page (109)

►Taqi Ud Din Subki, Book : Shifa As Siqam, Chapter : Fasl Ath Thani ; Fi Tatabba Kalimaatihi, Volume : 1, Page : 342-343

Click here for Scanned Page (110)

Some people, says in the above Chain Dawud Bin Abu Salih is unknown. Let us see what Sheikul Islam Imam Hajar Asqalani r.a has said

1) Imam Ibn Hajar Asqalani R.A

من الثالثة تمييز داود ابن أبي صالح حجازي **مقبول**

Translation: Differentiate: Dawud bin Ab salih Al Hijazi is **MAQBOOL (ACCEPTED)**

Reference

►Ibn Hajar Asqalani, Taqrib ut Tahdhib volume 1, Page 306, Narrator no: 1802 [Online version: 1792]

Click here for Scanned Page (111**)**

2) Imam Mizzi said

[Differentiate]: Dawud Bin Abu Salih Al Hijazi

He Narrated from : Abu Ayyub Ansari R.A

Person who narrated from Dawud bin Abu Salih : waleed bin kather

Reference

► Imam Mizzi, Book : Tahdheeb wal Kamaal Volume : 8 Page : 405 Biography number : 1766

Click here for Scanned Page (112**)**

Our Response:

Hakim did not say this Hadeeth is Saheeh!. but he said Isnaad is saheeh and there is a big difference in these two, proof for this is

Ibn Katheer says:

" الحكم بالصحة أو الحسن على الإسناد لا يلزم منه الحكم بذلك على المتن ، إذ قد يكون شاذاً أو معللاً "

The fact that the isnaad is deemed to be saheeh or hasan does not necessarily mean that the same applies to the text, because it may be shaadhdh (odd) or mu'allal (faulty). end quote.

Ikhtisaar 'Uloom al-Hadeeth (p. 43).

There are 4 faults in the chain and Text

1. Katheer bin Zaid is Disputed over
2. Dawud bin abi Saleh is Majhul
3. Oddness in Text
4. Against Authentic Ahadith

Proof for above Arguments

1. Katheer bin Zaid is Disputed Over

a) Haafidh Haithamee said after quoting this athar

رواه أحمد والطبراني في الكبير والأوسط وفيه كثير بن زيد وثقه أحمد وغيره وضعفه النسائي وغيره
"It is narrated by Ahmad and Tabrani in Al Kabeer and in Al Awsat and in it Katheer bin Zaid, Ahmad and others declared him reliable whereas Imaam Nasaa'ee and others have declared him to be weak**."** (Majma'a az-Zawaa'id (5/243).

b) Imaam Ibn Abee Haatim mentioned regarding Katheer bin Zaid,

سمعت أبى يقول ذلك نا عبد الرحمن انا أبو بكر بن أبى خيثمة فيما كتب الى قال سئل يحيى بن معين عن كثير بن زيد فقال ليس بذاك القوى نا عبد الرحمن قال سئل أبي عن كثير بن زيد فقال صالح ليس بالقوي يكتب حديثه نا عبد الرحمن قال سئل أبو زرعة عن كثير بن زيد فقال هو صدوق فيه لين

"..The manuscript that Abu Bakr ibn Khaithmah wrote with us, in it Yahyaa ibn Ma'een was asked concerning Katheer ibn Zaid to which he replied, **"He is not strong."** . "My father was asked concerning Katheer ibn Zaid, he replied,**"Righteous, but he is not strong, his hadeeth is written"**.. Abu Zur'ah was asked about him and he said, **"Truthful but he has weakness." (al-Jarh Wa-Ta'deel (7/150).**

c) Imaam Nasaa'ee said, "Katheer ibn Zaid is weak" **(Kitaab adh-Dhu'afaa Wal-Matrookeen no: 505)**

d) Ibne Jozi Mentioned Katheer bin Zaid In his **Kitab Adh Dhuafa wal Matrukeen vol 3 page 22 no: 2786**

e) Ibne Hibban mentioned him in Thiqqat 7/354
Moreover there are some who authenticated him including Imam Ahmad and Ibne Adi

f) Ibn e Hajar Asqalani Said
صدوق يخطىء
suquq, make Mistakes [At taqreeb page 459]

2. Dawud bin abi Saleh is Majhul

The chain contains Dawood bin abi Saaleh,

a) Hafiz ad-Dahabee said regarding him

داود بن ابى صالح حجازى لا يعرف له عن ابى ايوب الانصارى روى عنه الوليد بن كثير فقط
Dawood bin abi saleh hijazi is Not Known. he narrates from Abu Ayyub al ansari and from him only waleed bin katheer narrates" [Mizaan al-Aitedaal vol page 9 no: 2618]

b) Imam Manawi Quoted this hadeeth in Faydh Al Qadeer and said

قال الهيثمي عقب عزوه لأحمد والطبراني : فيه كثير بن زيد وثقه أحمد وغيره وضعفه النسائي وغيره رواه سفيان بن حمزة عن كثير بن زيد عن المطلب بن عبد الله بن حنطب بدل داود اه ، وكثير بن زيد أورده الذهبي في الضعفاء وقال : ضعفه النسائي وقبله غيره وداود بن أبي صالح قال ابن حبان : يروي الموضوعات

Al-Haythami stated, after noting that this narration had been documented by Ahmad and al-Tabarani: 'In the chain of narrators there is Katheer bin Zayd who was credited by Ahmad and others whereas al-Nasaie and others discredited him. This narration was reported by Sufyan bin Hamazah from Katheer bin Zayd from al-Muttalib bin Abdillah bin Hantab instead of Dawud.' Al-Dhahabi listed Katheer bin Zayd amongst the weak narrators and said: 'He was acknowledged as weak by al-Nasaie and Dawud bin abi Salih, Ibn Hibban said: 'He narrated fabricated narrations.'[**Faydh Al Qadeer 6/387]**

c) Shaykh Shoaib Al Aranoot said

Chain is weak Due to Jahalah of Dawud bin abi Saleh and Katheer bin Zayd who is disputed over [Tehqiq Shoaib aranoot Musnad Ahmad vol 38 page 558 no: 23585]

3. Oddness in Text

And regarding text of this athar
Abu Ayyub Al Ansari ra Died in 50, 51, 52 or 55 h in the era of Muawiyah ra and the narration clearly indicates that the grave of Prophet peace be upon him was is in public and seen by whoever pass by while, but we all know that the grave of the Prophet peace be upon him is actually located in the Hujrah of Aisha Ra so clearly it has some obvious oddness

4. Against Authentic Ahadith

Lastly it is against authentic Sayings of Prophet peace be upon him which are as follows: It is Narrated by Anas (May Allah be Pleased with him) that the Prophet Peace be upon him said

لا يصلح لبشر أن يسجد لبشر

"It is not appropriate for a human being to bow to another." Narrated by Ahmad, 3/158; classed as saheeh by al-Albaani in Saheeh al-Targheeb, 1936, 1937; Irwa' al-Ghaleel, 3/158.

حدثنا أحمد بن صالح قرأت على عبد الله بن نافع أخبرني ابن أبي ذئب عن سعيد المقبري عن أبي هريرة قال
قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم لا تجعلوا بيوتكم قبورا ولا تجعلوا قبري عيدا وصلوا علي فإن صلاتكم تبلغني حيث كنتم

Narrated AbuHurayrah: The Prophet (peace_be_upon_him) said: Do not make your houses **grave**s, and do not make my **grave** a place of festivity. But invoke blessings on me, for your blessings reach me wherever you may be. (Abu Dawood Book #10, Hadith #2037 and Albani Authenticated it)

Commentries of Muhadditheen on this hadeeth

a) Imam Al Madeenah Al Munawwarah Shaykh Salah al Budayr said

Indeed, having intention of worshipping Allaah at the grave of a Prophet or a saint is a means leading to Shirk. That is why making supplications at the graves – including that of the Prophet saws – is forbidden. Aboo Ya'laa and Ad-

Diya Al-Maqdisee reported that ‘Alee Ibn Husayn saw a man who used to enter an opening that is at the Prophet’s grave and make supplications there. He forbade him from doing that and told him.” Let me narrate to you a hadeeth I heard from my father on the authority of my grandfather that the Messenger of Allaah saws said,

> “Do not turn my grave into a place of festival, nor turn your houses to graves [whereby you do not pray in them]. Invoke blessings on me, for your invocation of peace and blessings on me reaches from wherever you may be.”

source: http://www.islaam.net/main/display.php?id=390&category=23

b) Imam Malik said

Its in -Jami’ li’l-Bayan by Ibn Rushd
" سئل مالك رحمه الله تعالى عن الغريب يأتي قبر النبي كل يوم ، فقال : ما هذا من الأمر ، وذكر حديث : (اللهم لا تجعل قبري وثنًا يُعبد)

Imam Malik (may Allah have mercy on him) was asked about a stranger who comes to the grave of the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) each day. He said, **‘That is not right,’** and quoted the hadith, **‘O Allah, do not make my grave an idol that is worshipped.’**”[*al-Jami’ li’l-Bayan* by Ibn Rushd Classed as sahih by al-Albani in *Tahdhir al-Sajid min Ittikhadh al-Qubur Masajid*, p. 24-26.]

So these are explicit statements from Prophet peace be upon him and this weak athar of Abu Ayyub ra is against them

The Claim that Dahabee Authenticated this weak Athar

Some says Dahabee Authenticated this athar, this is false claim as Dahabee himself said Dawub bin abi Saleh is Not Known that is he is Majhool.
And Fatwa of Dahabee is also against This athar that is he said

ألا ترى الصحابة من فرط حبهم للنبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قالوا : ألا نسجد لك ؟ فقال : لا .
فلو أذن لهم لسجدوا له سجود إجلال وتوقير لا سجود عبادة كما قد سجد إخوة يوسف -عليه السلام- ليوسف .

وكذلك القول في سجود المسلم لقبر النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم على سبيل التعظيم والتبجيل لا يكفر به أصلا بل يكون عاصيا ، فليعرّف أن هذا منهي عنه ، وكذلك الصلاة إلى القبر

Don't you see that the Companions, in the excess of their love for the Prophet, asked him: "Should we not prostrate to you?" and he replied no, and if he had allowed them, they would have prostrated to him as a mark of utter veneration and respect, not as a mark of worship,just as the The prostration done to Yusuf (a.s) by his brothers was not prostration of worship. The prostration of the Muslim to the grave of the Prophet is for the intention of respect and reverence. One is Not doing Kufr because of it whatsoever **but he is being disobedient** . Let him therefore be informed **that this is forbidden**. Similarly in the case of one who offers Prayer towards the grave."**[Imam Dhahabi in Mu`jam al-Shuyukh, Volume No.1, Page No. 55]**

Note: Here Dahabee did not say it is shirk because the person was not seeking help from the grave or the person in Grave, Dahabee ra himself said
ولجهلة المصريين فيها اعتقاد يتجاوز الوصف، ولايجوز مما فيه من الشرك، ويسجدون لها، ويلتمسون منها المغفرة

Due to ignorance of Egyptians the Creeds found in them is not correct to talk about it, When shirk found in them, **they prostate to others**(except Allah), **and they seek forgiveness from them**[Seyar Ailam Nubala 10/106]
Shaykh Abdul Qadir Jeelani RA said
"When you visit the graves **then do not put your hands on them or kiss them as this is the habit of the jews**, nor sit on the graves or rest against them.." **(al-Ghuniyyah (1/91).**

Scan: http://lh4.ggpht.com/_Y3h6JhqU8O4/TFbFeeG0GvI/AAAAAAAAAMo/-HZvP4VmhIE/s400/untitled.JPG

From Now onwards Hanafi fatawa taken from hanafi website: http://www.tauheed-sunnat.com/sunnat/content/tawaaf-circumbulate-sujood-prostrating-etc-graves

Mullah Ali Qari commentating on the hadith Allah's curse be on the Yahood and Nasara writes that the Yahood and Nasara fell prey to Allah's curse either because,

A) Due to their love and respect to the Ambiya, they, in expressing this love and respect, made sajdah to the graves of the Ambiya alayhimus salam **and this is shirk.**

B) Or they used to read Salaah and make sajdah to Allah but in the grave yards they prostrated to their prophets. In the condition of Salaah they used to face the graves and make sajdah to these graves. **They thought they were doing two good deeds.**

Hadhrat Shah Wali ullah writes in "Fauzul Kabir". If you wish to see a perfect example of the practices of the Mushrikeen then look at the general masses and the ignorant of our times. They visit tombs, graves, etc and indulge in many types of shirk. Every wicked and misfortunate act and belief of the previous people is exercised by different groups of our times. May Allah Ta'ala protect us from such beliefs and practices.

Burhan Tarjumani says: "We do not regard placing of the hands on the graves as sunnah nor as a good act. However if someone does so, there is no sin. Ainul Aimmah Karabisi says: This was the ruling of the Salaf (Pious predecessor) without reproach. And **Shamshul Aimma Makki** says: **This is an innovation. Do not rub or place your hands on graves nor kiss it, because these are christian customs**. **(Fatwa Alamgiri pg357 Vol 5)**

The gist of the above fatwa (decree) is that there is no evil in placing your hands sometimes on the graves as long as it is not regarded as sunnah or an act of virtue. **To place hands on the graves regarding it virtuous and a means of gaining "barakah" and kissing the grave or the hand are all innovations.** It was not the practice of the Salaf but a christian custom.(end quote)

BLOCK 25

They quoted

Adam's intermediation through the holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم)

Hadith # 7

حدّثنا أبو سعيد عمرو بن محمد بن منصور العدل ، ثنا أبو الحسن محمد بن إسحاق بن إبراهيم الحنظلي ، ثنا أبو الحارث عبد الله بن مسلم الفهري ، ثنا إسماعيل بن مسلمة ، أنبأ عبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم ، عن أبيه، عن جدّه، عن عمر بن الخطاب رضي الله عنه قال: قال رسول الله : «لَمّا اقْتَرَفَ آدَمُ الْخَطِيئَةَ قالَ يا رَبِّ أَسْأَلُكَ بِحَقّ مُحَمَّدٍ لما غَفَرْتَ لِي، فَقالَ الله: يا آدَمُ وَكَيْفَ عَرَفْتَ مُحَمّداً وَلَمْ أَخْلُقْهُ؟ قالَ: يا رَبِّ لأَنَّكَ لَمّا خَلَقْتَنِي بِيَدِكَ وَنَفَخْتَ فِيَّ مِنْ روحِكَ رَفَعْتُ رَأْسِي فَرَأَيْتُ على قوائِمِ الْعَرْشِ مَكْتوباً لا إِلهَ إِلا الله مُحَمَّدٌ رَسولُ الله، فَعَلِمْتُ أَنَّكَ لَمْ تُضِفْ إِلى اسْمِكَ إِلا أَحَبَّ الْخَلْقِ إِلَيْكَ، فقالَ الله: صَدَقْتَ يا آدَمُ إِنَّهُ لأَحَبُّ الْخَلْقِ إِلَيَّ ادْعُني بِحَقِّهِ فَقَدْ غَفَرْتُلَكَ وَلَوْلا مُحَمَّدٌ ما خَلَقْتُكَ . هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد وهو أول حديث ذكرته لعبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم في هذا الكتاب

Translation: Narrated `Umar: The Prophet said: "When Adam committed his mistake he said: **O my Lord, I am asking you to forgive me for the sake of Muhammad.** Allah said: O Adam, and how do you know about Muhammad whom I have not yet created? Adam replied, O my Lord, after You created me with your hand and breathed into me of Your Spirit, I raised my head and saw written on the heights of the Throne: "LA ILAHA ILLALLAH MUHAMMADUR RASULULLAH" I understood that You would not place next to Your Name but the Most Beloved One of Your creation. Allah said: O Adam, **I have forgiven you, and were it not for Muhammad I would not have created you."**

► Al-Hakim narrated it in al-Mustadrak al Sahihayn (Volume No. 2, Page No. 651, Hadith No. 4228)

It was transmitted through many chains and was cited by Bayhaqi (in *Dala'il al-nubuwwa*), Abu Nu`aym (in*Dala'il al-nubuwwa*), al-Hakim in *al-Mustadrak* (2:615), al-Tabarani in his *Saghir* (2:82, 207) with another chain containing sub-narrators unknown to Haythami as he stated in *Majma` al-zawa'id* (8:253), and Ibn `Asakir on the authority of `Umar ibn al-Khattab, and most of these narrations were copied in Qastallani's *al-Mawahib al-laduniyya* (and al-Zarqani's Commentary 2:62).

1. This hadith is declared sound (sahih) by al-Hakim in al-Mustadrak (2:651, Hadith No. 4228), although he acknowledges Abd al-Rahman ibn Zayd ibn Aslam, one of its sub-narrators, as weak. However, when he mentions this hadith he says: "Its chain is sound, and it is the first hadith of Abd al-Rahman ibn Zayd ibn Aslam which I mention in this book"; al-Hakim also declares sound another version through Ibn `Abbas.

Imam Hakim (rah) also narrates:

حدّثنا علي بن حمشاذ العدل إملاء ، ثنا هارون بن العباس الهاشمي ، ثنا جندل بن والق ، ثنا عمرو بن أوس الأنصاري ثنا سعيد بن أبي عروبة ، عن قتادة ، عن سعيد بن المسيب ، عن ابن عباس رضي الله عنهما قال: أوحى الله إلى عيسى عليه السلام: يا عيسى آمن بمحمد وأمر من أدركه من أمتك أن يؤمنوا به، فلولا محمد ما خلقت آدم ولولا محمد ما خلقت الجنة ولا النار، ولقد خلقت العرش على الماء فاضطرب فكتبت عليه لا إله إلا الله محمد رسول الله فسكن.

هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد ولم يخرجاه

Translation: Ibn Abbas (ra) narrates that Allah inspired Isa (a.s) saying O Isa, believe in Muhammad (salallaho alaihi wasalam), and whosoever form your Ummah finds him should believe in him, If I had not created Muhammad (salallaho alaihi wasalam) then I would not have created Adam, If not for him I would not have created the paradise and hell, When I made the throne on Water, it started to shake, I wrote La Ilaha Il Allah Muhammad ur Rasul Ullah, due to which it became still [Imam Hakim in Mustadrak ala Sahihayn, Volume No. 2, Page No. 609, Hadith No. 4227]– Imam Hakim after narrating it said: This Hadith has Sahih chain.

2. Imam Tabaran in his Mu'jam Al-Ausat

Narrated by Umar bin al-Khattab Allah's Messenger (Peace Be Upon Him) said: When Adam committed the error, he submitted (to Allah): O Lord, I beg You to forgive me through the mediation of Muhammad. Then Allah said: O Adam! How did you recognize Muhammad as I have not created him yet? He replied: O Lord, when You created me with Your divine hand and breathed Your soul into me, I raised my head and saw 'la ilaha illallahu Muhammad-ur-rasulullah ("There is no god but Allah, Muhammad is Allah's Messenger")' inscribed on each pillar of the Throne. I discovered that with Your name, the name of only such a person can be associated who is Your most beloved of all the creatures. At this Allah said: O Adam, you have said it correctly. Of all the creatures I love him the most. Now when you offered your prayer through his mediation, I forgave you. And if Muhammad were not there, I would not have created even you.

Reference

►Tabarani Mu'jam Al-Ausat Volume 006, Page No. 313-314, Hadith Number 6502

Our Response

Now here Brelvis say the words were Adam peace be upon him sought tawassul through Prophet peace be upon him and they quote the fabricated hadith. On the other hand when i was discussiong the same verse with shia clan, They tried to prove their fabricated stance from this verse that is Adam a.s sought tawassul through Prophet peace be upon him, Ali ra, Fatima ra, Hasan ra and Hussain ra and they use this fabricated hadith below.
.

Jalal ud din as-Suyuti said

وأخرج ابن النجار عن ابن عباس قال " سألت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم عن الكلمات التي تلقاها آدم من ربه فتاب عليه قال: سأل بحق محمد، وعلي، وفاطمة، والحسن، والحسين، إلا تبت علي فتاب عليه

"Ibn al Najjar narrates that Ibn Abbas asked Prophet peace be upon him in connection with the above matter, and Prophet peace be upon him stated, Adam asked Allah "Through Muhammad, 'Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Husayn, please accept my repentance. Allah (swt) then accepted his repentance".[Tafseer Durre Manthur under the verse 2:37 and Shias say as-Suyuti remained silent which is the indication that he accepted this hadith]
.
Source of
Tafsir: http://www.altafsir.com/Tafasir.asp?tMadhNo=0&tTafsirNo=26&tSoraNo=2&tAyahNo=37&tDisplay=yes&Page=5&Size=1&LanguageId=1
.
Comment: leave a side chain of the narration it is fabricated like the hadith of Adam peace be upon him doing tawassul of Prophet peace be upon him. Plus the text is forged because the status of Adam peace be upon him is better than Companions of Prophet peace be upon him. How can he make tawassul with their name? secondly, they were not even existing at that time.

The hadith itself says "O Adam, and how do you know about Muhammad whom I have not yet created?" But the brailwi clan also quotes the fabricated

hadith that The first thing which Allah created was Noor of Prophet peace be upon him. If they accept the hadith of Adam making tawassul than their whole aqeedah of Literal Noor of Prophet is false, if they accept the hadith of Noor then the hadith of Adam aleh salam is false. Brailwis have their choice, but the authentic stance is with Quran and Sunnah mentioned above and both of the ahadith are not the words of Rasool Allah peace be upon him. Now what is the authentic stance on this issue? It is mentioned in Qur'an itself plus this is the opinion of Tabiyeen let me quote

.

Ibn Kathir stated

It was reported that the above Ayah is explained by Allah's statement(They said"Our Lord! We have wronged ourselves. If You forgive us not, and bestow not upon us Your mercy, we shall certainly be of the losers.(7:23)as Mujahid, Sa'id bin Jubayr, Abu Al-'Aliyah, Ar-Rabi' bin Anas, Al-Hasan,Qatada,Muhammad bin Ka'b Al-Qurazi, Khaلid bin Ma'dan,'Ata' Al-Khurasani and 'Abdur-Rahman bin Zayd bin Aslam stated

.

Abu Hiyan Andalusi quoted many opinion but majority says:

، قال ابن عباس والحسن وابن جبير ومجاهد وابن كعب وعطاء الخراساني والضحاك وعبيد بن عمير وابن زيد: هي
{ ربنا ظلمنا أنفسنا وإن لم تغفر لنا }
[الأعراف: 23]، الآية.

Ibn Abbas, Al-Hasan, Ibn Jubair, Mujahid, Ibn Ka`ab, Ata al-Khurasani, Zahhaq, Obaid bin Omair, Ibn Zaid said these are the words ""Our Lord! We have wronged ourselves. If You forgive us not, and bestow not upon us Your mercy, we shall certainly be of the losers.(7:23)(end quote)

.

He also said It is said by (a Group) that Adam (a.s) saw written on the Shin of Throne: Muhammad is the Mesenger of Allah and he Adam (a.s) "SOUGHT INTERCESSION THROUGH IT" and "THESE ARE THE words" [in his tafsir 2:37]

.

Comment: Same is said by Qurtubee in his tafsir under same verse with the mode of Doubt (seegha at-tamreedh) which is used for weak and fabricated narrations no one said that the Companions had this opinion that Adam peace be upon him sought tawassul through Prophet peace be upon him. The

opinion of the Companions and Tabiyeen is what i mentioned above. I believe this short reply is enough to refute their claim because when Qur'an and Tabiyeen say something else then how can we believe with fabricated narrations of shias and brelvi clan? Still i am going to refute them because of some requests otherwise they are not worth for reply.

.

BLOCK 26

They said

3. Imam al-Bulqini declares this hadith of Adam (a.s)'s Tawassul to be sound in his *Fatawa*.

4. **al-Subki confirms al-Hakim's authentication** (in *Shifa' al-siqam fi ziyarat khayr al-anam* p. 134-135) although Ibn Taymiyya's rejection and criticism of this hadith was known to him and he rejects it, as well as saying that Ibn Taymiyya's extreme weakening of Ibn Zayd is exaggerated.

Response

Imam Al-Haakim himself said in same Al-Mustadrak regarding same chain i.e

الخطاب عمر بن ، عن أبيه ، عن جده ، عن عبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم

he said

بعبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم والشيخان رضي الله عنهما لم يحتجا

Shaykhaan (Bukhari and Muslim) RadhiAllahanhuma did not take evidence from Abdul Rahman bin Zaid bin Aslam.**[Al Mustadrak, Kitan Muarifat Sahaba, hadith no: 5479]**

Source: http://main.islamweb.net/newlibrary/display_book.php?idfrom=5306&idto=5307&bk_no=74&ID=2335

Imam al-Hakim also said

عبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم روى عن أبيه أحاديث موضوعة

Abdul Rahman Bin Zain Bin Aslam narrated fabricated Ahadeeth from his Father [Al Mudakhal Vol 1 page 154] And note that this hadeeth is also from his father. So According to Hakim this hadeeth is not authentic.

Lastly Imam Al-Hakim himself authenticated another words which are from Ibn Abbas ra and they are contradicting fabricated hadith of Tawassul

Ibn Abbas ra said
Then Adam received from his Lord Words.Adam said, 'O Lord! Did You not created me with Your Own Hands' He said, 'Yes.' He (Adam) said, 'And blow life into me' He(Allah)said, 'Yes.' He (Adam) said, 'And when I sneezed, You said, 'May Allah grant you His mercy.' Does not Your mercy precede Your anger' He was told, 'Yes.' Adam said, 'And You destined me to commit this evil act' He was told, 'Yes.' He said, 'If I repent, will You send me back to Paradise' Allah said, 'Yes.
[Authenticated by al-Hakim in al-Mustadrak (3/545) and ad-Dahabee agreed with him. Ibn Jareer Tabri and Ibn Katheer in their commentary of al-Qur`an 2:37, Ibn Katheer said "Similar is reported from Al-'Awfi, Sa'id bin Jubayr, Sa'id bin Ma'bad, and Ibn 'Abbas. Al-Hakim recorded this Hadith in his Mustadrak from Ibn Jubayr, who narrated it from Ibn 'Abbas. Al-Hakim said, "Its chain is Sahih and they (Al-Bukhari and Muslim) did not record it."]

Comment: Alhumdulillah it is cleared that even Hakim never said 2:37 means Adam peace be upon him sought tawassul, in fact he agreed with what Ibn Abbas ra said, Dahabee also agreed with him plus Ibn Katheer also accepted this narration and endorsed the words of Al-Hakim..

Al-Dhahabi said, in Talkhees al Mustadrak criticizing the words of al-Haakim.
ذا من أدري لا الفهري أسلم بن الله وعبد واهٍ، الرحمن وعبد موضوع، بل
"Rather it is fabricated and 'Abdur-Rahmaan is severely weak, and as for 'Abdullaah ibn Aslam al-Fihree, then I do not know who he is."

Note: Some of the extreme sufis in thier ignorance said Hafiz Dahabee accepted this hadith, and they quote this az-Zarqani said

قال فيه الحافظ الذ هبي: عليك به فإنه كله هدى ونور
In this regard (i.e. Regarding Dalail an Nabuwah of Imam al-Bayhaqi) **Hafidh al-Dhahabi (rah) said: Whatever is in it is "TOTAL GUIDANCE AND**

light" [Sharh ala Muwahib (1/120)]

Comment: This is like jews, taking one verdicts and leaving other verdicts, Its like i say the people of Pakistan are nice, but i take a specific person i.e Amir that he is a liar. Now these are not contradicting statements, same is the case with dahabi, he himself is praising dalail al nabuwwah as a whole but he is criticising specific narration.

c) Al-Bayhaqi said after mentioning this hadeeth in Dalail al Nabuwwah:

- تفرد به عبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم، من هذا الوجه عنه، وهو ضعيف

'Abd al-Rahmaan ibn Zayd ibn Aslam is the only one who narrated it with this isnaad ,and he is weak

Note: Some of the sufis say Bayhaqi accepted this narration to be authentic because he said

وعادتي في كتبي المصنفة في الأصول والفروع الاقتصار من الأخبار على ما يصح منها دون ما لا يصح أو التمييز بين ما يصح منها ومالا يصح ليكون الناظر فيها من أهل السنة على بصيرة مما يقع الاعتماد عليه لا يجد من زاغ قلبه من أهل البدع عن قبول الأخبار مغمزاً فيما اعتمد عليه أهل السنة من الآثار

My procedure is that I rely only on "SAHIH REPORTS" from all the books on Usool and Faroh and I have "REJECTED THOSE WHICH ARE NOT SAHIH" and my way is to "Distinguish sahih from non-Sahih" so anyone from Ahlus Sunnah who has sight over reports can "TRUST THEM" and one from Ahlul Bidah who has disease in his heart will consider such reports as "LOW GRADED" which have been accepted by Ahlus Sunnah. [Dalail al Nabuwah (1/47)]

Comment: Beyhaqi himself said and I have "REJECTED THOSE WHICH ARE NOT SAHIH" and my way is to "Distinguish sahih from non-Sahih" and we know that Bayhaqi himself rejected the narration of Adam peace be upon him by saying "'Abd al-Rahmaan ibn Zayd ibn Aslam is the only one who narrated it with this isnaad, and he is weak" Even if Bayhaqi rah did not show his Jarha on the narration, Student of knowledge must always see the chain of narrators.

Ibn Kathir endorsed verdicts of Al Byhaqi in al-Bidaayah wa'l-Nihayyah, 2/323 and he did not quote authentication of Hakim because he knew Hakim himself said Abdul Rahman narrated fabrications from his father. Here is full quote of Ibn Kathir

عبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم عن أبيه عن جده عن وروى الحاكم أيضا والبيهقي وابن عساكر من طريق عمر بن الخطاب قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه و سلم: لما اقترف آدم الخطيئة قال: يا رب أسألك بحق مُحمد أن غفرت لي فقال الله: فكيف عرفت محمدا ولم أخلقه بعد؟ فقال: يا رب لأنك لما خلقتني بيدك ونفخت في من روحك رفعت رأسي فرأيت على قوائم العرش مكتوبا لا إله إلا الله محمد رسول الله فعلمت أنك لم تضف إلى اسمك إلا أحب الخلق إليك فقال الله: صدقت يا آدم إنه لأحب الخلق إلي وإذ سألتني بحقه فقد غفرت لك ولولا محمد ما خلقتك، قال البيهقي : تفرد به عبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم من هذا الوجه وهو ضعيف

Source: www.al-eman.com/Islamlib/viewchp.asp?BID=251&CID=6&SW=قوائم#SR1

Comment: Hafiz Ibn Katheer supported the stance of Ahlus Sunnah in his Tafsir of Qur`an as quoted above, he clearly quoted tabiyeen who said these were the words Adam a.s spoke ""Our Lord! We have wronged ourselves. If You forgive us not, and bestow not upon us Your mercy, we shall certainly be of the losers"

Hafiz Noor ud din Haythamee said

رواه الطبراني في " الأوسط " و" الصغير " وفيه من لم أعرفهم .

"It was narrated by al-Tabarani in al-Awsat and it contains one whom I do not know."[Majma az-Zawaid 8/253]

Source: www.al-eman.com/Islamlib/viewchp.asp?BID=272&CID=124&SW=13917#SR1

Shaykh al-Islam Ibn Taymiyah said in al-Qaa'idah al-Jaleelah fi'l-Tawassul wa'l-Waseelah (p. 69):

ورواية الحاكم لهذا الحديث مما أنكر عليه ، فإنه نفسه قد قال في كتاب "المدخل إلى معرفة الصحيح من السقيم" : عبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم روى عن أبيه أحاديث موضوعة لا يخفى على من تأملها من أهل الصنعة أن الحمل فيها عليه ، قلت : وعبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم ضعيف باتفاقهم يغلط كثيراً

Al-Haakim's narration of this hadeeth is something for which he was denounced, and he himself said in his book al-Madkhil ila Ma'rifat al-Saheeh 'an al-Saqeem:

'Abd al-Rahmaan ibn Zayd ibn Aslam narrated fabricated ahaadeeth from his father, and it is obvious to any competent hadeeth scholar that he is the one to blame for fabricating ahaadeeth. I say: 'Abd al-Rahmaan ibn Zayd ibn Aslam is da'eef (weak) because he made a lot of mistakes.(end)

Hafiz Jalal ud din as-Suyuti said:
الحديث البيهقى والطبرانى من حديث عمر بسند ضعيف

This hadith is in Behaqi, At-Tabrani the hadith of Umar with weak chain[Manahil us-Safa fe Takhreej ahadith as-Shifa page no: 94 no: 381 Dar al Janan]

Scan: https://lh3.googleusercontent.com/-6w4sILDT8ks/TeXxw2LO8SI/AAAAAAAAAZI/aYyLgNV0nD4/s400/untitled.JPG

Comment: Some of the sufis say Jalal ud din Suyuti declared this hadith to be authentic which is blatant lie because In Tafsir Jalalayn they supported stance of Ahlus sunnah

Tafsir Jalalyan under 2:37

Thereafter Adam received certain words from his Lord, with which He inspired him (a variant reading [of Ādamu] has accusative Ādama and nominative kalimātu), **meaning they [the words] came to him, and these were [those of] the verse Lord, we have wronged ourselves** [Q. 7:23], with which he supplicated, and He relented to him, that is, He accepted his repentance; truly He is the Relenting, to His servants, the Merciful, to them.(end quote)

Hafidh Ibn Hajar Asqalani said:
عبد الله بن مسلم أبو الحارث الفهري روى عن اسماعيل بن مسلمة بن قعنب عن عبد الرحمن بن زيد بن سلم
خبرا باطلا فيه يا آدم لولا محمد ما خلقتك رواه البيهقي في دلائل النبوة
(قلت لا أستبعد أن يكون هو الذي قبله فإنه من طبقته

Abdullah bin Muslim abu-Al Harith al-Faheree narrated from Ismaeel bin Muslama bin Qa`nib from Abdul Rahman bin Zaid bin Aslam **A baseless and futile narration**.in which (Allah says) "O Adam and were it not for

Muhammad I would not have created you" Narrated by al-Behaqi in Dalail an-Nabuwwah

I say:"And I do not think it to be unlikely that he is one and the same person as the one just quoted since he is of the same le vel and time."(end quote Lisan al-Meezan Vol 5 page 12 no: 4462]

Comment: Muhadditheen always make their rulings by watching all the routes of hadith, If it was not fabricated Ibn Hajar would never say the hadith is Baseless.

Al-Albaani added after quoting Ibn Hajar Asqalani

والذي قبله هو عبد الله بن مسلم بن رُشيد، قال الحافظ: ذكره ابن حبان، متهم بوضع الحديث، يضع على ليث ومالك وابن لهيعة، لا يحل كتب حديثه، وهو الذي روى عن ابن هدية نسخة كأنها معمولة

The narrator whom he spoke of before him was 'Abdullaah ibn Muslim ibn Rushayd, about whom al-Haafidh said: "Ibn Hibbaan mentions him, he is accused of fabricating ahaadeeth. He fabricates narrations which he attributes to Layth, Maalik and Ibn Lahee'ah. It is not permissible to write down his ahaadeeth. He is the one who narrated a manuscript of hadeeth from Ibn Lahee'ah, and it seems to be something deliberately invented."[**al-Silsilah al-Da'eefah, no: 25 where he declared it to be fabricated**]

Ali Bin Muhammad bin Iraq al-Kinani (907 h-963 h) said

(105) عبد الله بن مسلم الفهرى عن إسماعيل بن مسلم بن قعنب عن عبد الرحمن بن زيد بن أسلم بخبر باطل

Abdullah bin Muslim abu-Al Harith al-Faheree narrated from Ismaeel bin Muslama bin Qa'nib from Abdul Rahman bin Zaid bin Aslam **A baseless and futile narration**[Tanzih us Shari'ah al-Marfooa an ahadeeth Shia al Modhuaa" vol 1 page 76]

Above were the clear verdicts of scholars who fabricated and weakened the hadith and there are others who said it is weak.

BLOCK 27

They said

Imam Qadhi Iyaad (rah) considered it Sahih and famous because he narrated it under the Chapter No. 3 of his Ash-Shifa in which he said: **This Chapter is**

about "SAHIH AND FAMOUS" narrations (مشهورها و الأخبار منصحيح ورد فيما الثالث الباب), and he says that Abu Muhammad al-Makki and Abu al-Layth al-Samarqandi mention it; Qadi `Iyad says: "It is said that this hadith explains the verse: 'And Adam received words from his Lord and He relented towards him' (2:37)"; he continues to cite another very similar version through al-Ajurri (d. 360), about whom al-Qari said: "al-Halabi said: This seems to be the imam and guide Abu Bakr Muhammad ibn al-Husayn ibn `Abd Allah al-Baghdadi, the compiler of the books *al-Shari`a* devoted to the Sunna, *al-Arba`un*, and others.'" This is confirmed by Ibn Taymiyya in his *Qa`ida fi al-tawassul*: "It is related by Shaykh Abu Bakr al-Ajurri, in his book *al-Shari`a.*"

Our Response

Qadhi Ayadh never said i will narrate all the sahih ahadith rather he said "Sahih and famous narrations" Famous can be weak, can be fabricated.That is why as-Suyuti said the chain is weak in the Takhreej of the book by Qadhi Iyadh as-Shifa page no: 94 Dar al Janan For example same chapter Fasal no: one of as-Shifa says

"Jafar bin Muhammad narrated from his father that on the day of judgment it will be said stand up if there is someone with the name of Muhammad and enter in the Jannah with the Barakah of the name"

.

'Prophet peace be upon him said If there are 1 or 2 or 3 persons with the name of Muhammad in the house they have no fear"[As-Shifa chapter 3 Fasal one page 156-157 of urdu translation]

.

Comment Now i ask them to accept this hadeeth to be authentic, if this is authentic then i tell you, there are so many people with the name of Muhammad but they are corrupt, surely above hadith is fabrication but it was famous and Qadhi ayadh mentioned in it. That is why Imam Dahabee said regarding Qadi Iyad in Siyar A'lâm al-Nubalâ'. In his biographical entry on al-Qâdî 'Iyâd Vol 20 Page 216, he writes:

.

"His writings are valuable and one of his best works would have been his book al-Shifâ' had it not been filled with fabricated ahadîth."

.

Comment: No where Qadhi Ayadh is saying This hadith is authentic i

challenge if all the ahdith in this chapter are authentic then prove all the ahadith in this chapter to be authentic and show me where Qadhi said hadith is authentic?see the article **""Shifa" of Qadi 'Iyad refuting the Bralwi creed"** http://www.umm-ul-qura.org/info/user_pages/page.asp?art_id=124

BLOCK 28

They said :

Ibn al-Jawzi also considers it sound (*sahih*) as he cites it in the first chapter of *al-Wafa bi ahwal al-mustafa*, in the introduction of which he says: "(In this book) I do not mix the sound hadith with the false,"although he knew of `Abd al-Rahman ibn Zayd's weakness as a narrator; he also mentions the version of Maysarat al-Fajr whereby the Prophet says: "When satan deceived Adam and Eve, they repented and sought intercession to Allah with my name"; Ibn al-Jawzi also says in the chapter concerning the Prophet's superiority over the other Prophets in the same book: "Part of the exposition of his superiority to other Prophets is the fact that Adam asked his Lord through the sanctity *(hurmat)* of Muhammad that He relent towards him, as we have already mentioned."

Our Response

Ibn al-Jawzi never said i will not include weak hadith, He himself mentioned Abdul Rahman in his weak and rejected Narrators Plus he wrote whole Tafsir of Qur`an let us see what he says in that, In the tafsir of the verse ""Then Adam received from his Lord Words. And his Lord pardoned him (accepted his repentance). Verily, He is the One Who forgives (accepts repentance), the Most Merciful"[al-Baqarah 2:37]

He quoted few sayings first one is

أحدها: أنها قوله تعالى:
{ ربنا ظلمنا أنفسنا، وإن لم تغفر لنا وترحمنا لنكونن من الخاسرين }
[الأعراف:23]. قاله ابن عباس، والحسن، وسعيد بن جبير، ومجاهد، وعطاء الخراساني، وعبيد بن عمير، وأبيّ بن كعب، وابن زيد.

First is the saying of Allah "Our Lord! We have wronged ourselves. If You forgive us not, and bestow not upon us Your mercy, we shall certainly be of the losers."(7:23) this is said by Ibn Abbas, Al-Hasan,Saeed bin Jubair,

Mujahid, Ata Khurasani, Obaid bin Umair, Ubi bin Ka`ab and Ibn Zayd.(end quote)

Source of his Tafsir: http://altafsir.com/Tafasir.asp?tMadhNo=0&tTafsirNo=15&tSoraNo=2&tAyahNo=37&tDisplay=yes&UserProfile=0&LanguageId=1

Comment: Then he quoted two other sayings, he did not even quoted the hadith of Adam peace be upon him. If he considered the hadith to be authentic he must have included in his tafsir of this verse. Because according to sufis this hadith in discussion is tafsir of this verse. Plus Ibn al-Jawzi was staunch against asking help from dead

Ibn e jawzi said regarding deviants in Talbees al-Ibnlees
One of there habbit is that on the 15th night of shaban they visit the graves... and they take the mud from the grave of saint (end quote)
Then he quoted ibn Aqil that

قال ابن عقيل: لما التكاليف على الجهال والضغام عدلوا عن أوضاع الشرع إلى تعظيم أوضاع وضعوها لأنفسهم فسهلت عليهم إذ لم يدخلوا بها تحت أمر غيرهم قال وهم كفار عندي بهذه الأوضاع مثل تعظيم القبوروإكرامها بما نهى الشرع عنه من إيقاد النيران وتقبيلها وتخليفها وخطاب الموتى بالألواح وكتب الرقاع فيها يا مولاي افعل بي كذا وكذا وأخذ التراب تبركا وإفاضة الطيب على القبور وشد الرحال إليها وإلقاء الخرقعلى الشجر اقتداء بمن عبد اللات والعزى

"Ibn Aqil said: "When these obligations were hard on the ignorant and rabble ones, they diverted themselves from the positions of Shari'a to revere positions which they laid down for themselves, so it felt easy to them as they will not be regulated by the order of anyone except themselves." He added: "To me, they are kafir (infidels) due to these positions; like revering the graves and paying respect to them with things which are forbidden by Shari'a like burning fire, kissing the graves, roaming around them, addressing the dead with sheets (of requests) and notes on patches which say like this: "O My Master do such and such for me", and taking the soil for getting blessing, pouring perfume on the graves, undertaking journey to visit them, hanging shreds with trees, as imitation to those who worship Lat and Uzza.
Talbees Iblees of ibn e jozi chapter تلبيس إبليس/الباب الثاني عشر تلبيس إبليس على جمهور العوام

Urdu Translation Scan page: http://ia600609.us.archive.org/BookReader/BookReaderImages.php?zi

p=/17/items/Talbees-e-Iblees/Talbees-e-Iblees_jp2.zip&;file=Talbees-e-Iblees_jp2/Talbees-e-Iblees_0570.jp2&scale=4&rotate=0

Arabic
Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAABwI6gjMVRBQa7kJkTCDLVmKF2WTStqm1hFr3hgpwwYtc73OV-5mQNhSYCAIjfiCrareWTryF7Fm0W-X4Od9YOMAm1T1UHYma1Rht9qBUJU0zDcY5T1K48RS.jpg

Then Ibn Aqil said
والويل عندهم لمن لم يقبل مشهد الكهف ولم يتمسح بآجره مسجد المأمونية يوم الأربعاء ولم يقل الحمالون على جنازته أبو بكر الصديق أو محمد وعلي ولم يكن معها نياحة ولم يعقد على أبيه أزجا بالجص والآجر ولم يشق ثوبه إلى ذيله ولم يرق ماء الورد على القبر ويدفن معه ثيابه

According to them, woe is to one who did not kiss the Mashhad al-Kahaf and did not touch the wall of the Al-Mamuniyah mosque on Wednesday, The funeral of Abu Bakar Siddique or Muhammad (peace be upon him) or Ali was not carried by porters there was no Noha on them, their graves were not erect with brick and plaster"[Ibid]

Scan: http://ia600609.us.archive.org/BookReader/BookReaderImages.php?zip=/17/items/Talbees-e-Iblees/Talbees-e-Iblees_jp2.zip&;file=Talbees-e-Iblees_jp2/Talbees-e-Iblees_0571.jp2&scale=4&rotate=0

b) Ibn e Aqil said
لا يخلق القبور بالخلوق , والتزويق والتقبيل لها والطواف بها , والتوسل بهم إلى الله
Graves are not made for kissing and decorating and roaming around and begging them for ALLAH [Ibn e Muflih quoted al furoo 2/316]

Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAJFXFISiMceFb7HLgvtzXhUexKq4I6mwFNJ-3EmUCaZ7FLbYz1eRomDckgUh31611VKBqyfzVNiB7F7HjnEtDvMAm1T1UO3FA6Tsd1cn1c_C4hDDudMskEl5.jpg

c) Ibn e Jawzi Criticised al-Ghazali Badly when he said Sufis can see souls of Prophets and hear them. He said

Then there came Abu Haamid Al-Ghazaalee who wrote the book ' Ihyaa

'Uloom-ud-Deen' for them, according to the methodology of the (Sufi) people, which he filled with baseless ahaadeeth even though he knew well they were baseless. He spoke about knowledge of the Mukaashafah (unveiling of unseen by Allaah to Sufis) and withdrew from the principles of Fiqh. And he stated such things as: 'Indeed the stars, the sun and the moon, which Ibraaheem saw, were in fact lights that screened Allaah!' Such things are not mentioned in any of the sources of knowledge. Rather, this is from the types of speech of the Baatiniyyah.

He (Al-Ghazaalee) also said in the book ' Al-Mufsih bil-Ahwaal': "While in their state of wakefulness, the Sufis are able to witness the angels and souls of the prophets, hear their voices and take hold of benefit from them. Then this condition escalates from the witnessing (of their) images to levels in which they are contained within these domains."

The factors that caused these individuals to write these books was their little knowledge of the Sunnah, Islaam and the narrations, as well as their dedication for what they approved of from the way of the people (Sufis). They only approved this way because of adoration for abstinence (zuhd) that was established in their souls. They did not see any condition better than the condition of these people (Sufis) in regards to appearance, nor any speech more pleasant than their speech, whereas in the biographies of the Salaf, they found a form of harshness. So the people inclined very strongly towards these individuals (Sufis).

This was due to what we stated previously, that it was a way, which was characterized outwardly by cleanliness and worship, whereas on the inside, it was about indulging in leisure and hearing music, which the bodily dispositions incline to. The original Sufis would flee from the leaders and authorities. However (in later times) they became friends.

The majority of these books that were compiled for them have things in them that cannot be traced back to any (authentic) source. Rather, they are only based on mystical occurrences that befell some of them, which they managed to take hold of and record. They called this hidden knowledge (al-'ilm-ul-baatin). Abu Ya'qoob Ishaaq bin Hayya said: "I heard Ahmad bin Hanbal once when asked about the occurrence of delusions and notions, so he replied: 'The Sahaabah and the Taabi'een never spoke about such things.'"[Ibn e Jozi in Talbees Iblees pg. 163 and Page 261 of Urdu Tranlsation]

Note: Abu Hamid Ghazali repented from all these Khurafaat like Sufis can see souls,Angels and they can hear them etc. This is called Speech of Baataniyah as said by Ibn e Jozi. See here repentence of

Ghazali http://www.islamqa.com/en/ref/13473
See this whole article http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/aqeedah/319-ibn-jawzi-versus-the-creed-of-asking-help-from-dead

They said

7. Suyuti cites it in his Qur'anic commentary *al-Durr al-manthur* (2:37) and in *al-Khasa'is al-kubra* (1:12) and in *al-Riyad al-aniqa fi sharh asma' khayr al-khaliqa* (p. 49), where he says that Bayhaqi considers it sound; this is due to the fact that Bayhaqi said in the introduction to the *Dala'il* that he only included sound narrations in his book, although he also knew and explicitly mentions `Abd al-Rahman ibn Zayd's weakness;

Response

Again this is false accusation on Jalal ud din asSuyuti because no where Suyuti said Bayhaqi considered it sound rather he did jarha of bayhaqi and then tasheeh of alHakim, which we have already cleared before, **Hafiz Jalal ud din as-Suyuti said:**

الحديث البيهقى والطبرانى من حديث عمر بسند ضعيف

This hadith is in Behaqi, At-Tabrani the hadith of Umar with weak chain[Manahil us-Safa fe Takhreej ahadith as-Shifa page no: 94 no: 381 Dar al Janan]
Scan: https://lh3.googleusercontent.com/-6w4sILDT8ks/TeXxw2LO8SI/AAAAAAAAAZI/aYyLgNV0nD4/s400/untitled.JPG

BLOCK 29

They said

8. Ibn Kathir mentions it after Bayhaqi in *al-Bidayat wa al-Nihaya* (1:75, 1:180) where he points towards weakness of Abdur Rahman bin Zayd bin Aslam.

9. al-Haythami in *Majma` al-zawa'id* (8:253 #28870), al-Bayhaqi himself, and al-Qari in *Sharh al- shifa'* show that its chains have weakness in them. However, the weakness of Abd al-Rahman ibn Zayd was known by Ibn al-Jawzi, Subki, Bayhaqi, Hakim, and Abu Nu`aym, yet all these scholars retained this hadith for consideration in their books.

Our Response

Alhumdulillah they agreed that scholars agreed on the weakness of this narration, the stance of Ibn Jawzi, alHakim and asSuyuti and alBayhaqi is already cleared before.

BLOCK 30

They said:
Three scholars reject it outright **a)** Ibn Taymiyya (*Qa`ida jalila fi al-tawassul* p. 89, 168-170) and his two students **b)** Ibn `Abd al-Hadi (*al-Sarim al-munki* p. 61-63) and **c)** al-Dhahabi (*Mizan al-i`tidal* 2:504 and*Talkhis al-mustadrak*), while `Asqalani reports Ibn Hibban's saying that `Abd al-Rahman ibn Zayd was a forger (*Lisan al-mizan* 3:360, 3:442).

Our Response

Ibn Tamiyah, Ibn Abdul Hadi, alDhahabi and Ibn Hajar asqalani are not three rather four. Secondly not only four we have quoted alHakim himself, alBayhaqi, Ibn Tamiya, adDhahabi, Ibn hajar asqalani, Ibn Hajar haythamee, Ibn Katheer, asSuyuti, Ibn alIraq Kinani, Ibn Abdul Hadi. These are ten Muhadditheen while thre are others like Shihab Khifaji and Mulla Ali qari etc.

BLOCK 31

They said

11. At the same time, Ibn Taymiyya elsewhere quotes it and the version through Maysara and says: "These two are like the elucidation (*tafsir*) of the authentic ahadith (فهذا الحديث يؤيد الذي قبله و هما كالتفسير للأحاديث الصحيحة.) (*Fatawa* 2:150). The contemporary Meccan hadith scholar Ibn `Alawi al-Maliki

said: "This indicates that Ibn Taymiyya found the hadith sound enough to be considered a witness for other narrations *(salih li al-istishhad wa al-i`tibar)*, because the forged *(al-mawdu`)* and the false *(al-batil)* are not taken as witness by the people of hadith"; al-Maliki also quotes (without reference) Dhahabi's unrestrained endorsement of the ahadith in Bayhaqi's *Dala'il al-nubuwwa* with his words: "You must take what is in it (the *Dala'il*), for it consists entirely of guidance and light." (*Mafahim yajib an tusahhah* p. 47).

Our Response

Our Shaykh wrote "Hazihi Mafahimuna" by Shaykh Salih Al Shaykh **صالح بن عبد العزيز بن محمد آل الشيخ** in Refutation of the book of Muhammad ibn 'Alawi Al-Maliki "**مفاهيم يجب أن تصحح**" **and he** exposed the lies of Ibn Alwi.

BLOCK 32

They said

The Hadith of Maysara (ra) is the following:
Hadith # 8

وقد رواه أبو الحسن بن بشران من طريق الشيخ أبي الفرج بن الجوزي في (الوفا، بفضائل المصطفى) صلى الله عليه وسلّم: حدّثنا أبو جعفر محمد بن عمرو، حدّثنا أحمد بن إسحاق بن صالح، حدّثنا محمد ابن صالح، حدّثنا محمد بن سنان العوفي، حدّثنا إبراهيم بن طهمان عن يزيد بن ميسرة، عن عبد الله بن سفيان، عن ميسرة قال قلت: يا رسول الله، متى كنت نبياً؟ قال: «لَمَّا خَلَقَ اللَّهُ الأَرْضَ وَاسْتَوَى إِلَى السَّمَاءِ فَسَوَّاهنَّ سَبْعَ سَمَواتٍ وَخَلَقَ العَرْشَ كَتَبَ عَلَى سَاقِ العَرْشِ مُحَمَّدٌ رَسُولُ اا خَاتَمُ الأَنْبِيَاءِ وَخَلَقَ اللَّهُ الجَنَّةَ الَّتِي أَسْكَنَهَا آدَمَ وَحَوَّاءَ فَكَتَبَ اسْمِي عَلَى الأَبْوَابِ وَالأَوْرَاقِ وَالقِبَابِ وَالخِيَامِ وَآدَمُ بَيْنَ الرُّوحِ والجَسَدِ، فَلَمَّا أَحْيَاهُ الله تَعَالَى نَظَرَ إِلَى العَرْشِ فَرَأَى اسمِي فأَخْبَرَهُ اا أَنَّهُ سَيِّدُ وَلَدِكَ، فَلَمَّا غَرَّهُمَا الشَّيْطَانُ تَابَا وَاسْتَشْفَعَا بِاسْمِي إِلَيْهِ

Translation: Narrated by Maysara (ra), I asked: "O Messenger of Allah, when were you [first] a Prophet?" He replied: "When Allah created the earth 'Then turned He to the heaven, and fashioned it as seven heavens' (2:29), and created the Throne, He wrote on the leg of the Throne: "Muhammad the Messenger of Allah is the Seal of Prophets" (Muhammadun Rasûlullâhi Khâtamu al-Anbiyâ'). Then Allah created the Garden in which He made Adam and Hawwa' dwell, and He wrote my name on the gates, its tree-leaves, its domes and tents, at a time when Adam was still between the spirit and the body. When Allah Most High instilled life into him he looked at the Throne and

saw my name, whereupon Allah informed him that 'He [Muhammad SAWS] is the liege-lord of all your descendants.' When Satan deceived them both, they repented and sought intercession to Allah with my name."[Ibn Jawzi in Al Wafa bi Ahwaal lil Mustafa, Page No. 26, Published by Dar ul Kutab al Ilmiyyah]

Imam Muhammad bin Yusuf al-Salihi (student of Imam al-Hafidh As-Suyuti) said:

بسند جيد لا بأس به وروى ابن الجوزي

Translation: This hadith is narrated by Ibn Jawzi (rah) and the chain of it is "STRONG" and there is nothing wrong in it [Subul al-Hadi wal Rashhad, Volume No.1, Page No. 86 – Dar ul Kutb al iLmiyyah]

Ibn Taymiyyah said:

للأحاديث الصحيحة كالتفسير فهذا الحديث يؤيد الذي قبله و هما

Translation: This hadith corresponds to the hadith mentioned before (i.e. hadith of Umar ibn ul Khattab)These two are like the explanations (tafsir) of the authentic (Sahih) ahadith [Majmua al Fatawa, 2/150] Imam al Alawai al Makki said: This indicates that Ibn Taymiyya found the hadith sound enough to be considered a witness for other narrations (salih li al-istishhad wa al-i`tibar), because the forged (al-mawdu`) and the false (al-batil) are not taken as witness by the people of hadith

Our Response

This hadeeth with these words are not in any other book, neither in sunan, nor in sahihyen except in Al wafa of Ibn Jawzi. Note that this is asool al hadith if chain is authentic that does not mean hadith is also authentic,

Al-Haafiz ibn al-Salaah (may Allaah have mercy on him) said:

قولهم : (هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد أو حسن الإسناد) دون قولهم : هذا حديث صحيح أو حديث حسن لأنه " قد يقال : هذا حديث صحيح الإسناد ، ولا يصح لكونه شاذا أو معللا "

When they say "This hadeeth has a saheeh isnaad or a hasan isnaad" instead of "this is a saheeh hadith or a hasan hadiththh", that is because it may be said that this hadeeth has a saheeh isnaad **but it is not saheeh per say because it is shaadhdh (odd) or mu'allal (faulty).** [Muqaddimah fi 'Uloom al-Hadeeth (p. 23)]

Above hadith is clearly odd (shaz) because see the red bold arabic in the hadeeth the narrator is Muhammad bin Sanan, Only Muhammad bin Saleh Narrated these odd words from him. Where as these are the authentic words from Maysara "(Maysara al Fajr asked asked from Prophet *"when were you a Prophet?" to which he replied, "while Adam was between the spirit and the body*"see Syar Ailam al Nubala Vol 7 page 384) and there are no words of tawassul in all other narrations. These are the narrators who narrated from Muhammad bin Sanan these later words and they opposed Muhammad bin Salih in the words of twassul. **Imam Bukhari, Ahmad bin Ishaq, Ahmad bin Dawood al-Makki, Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Salma al-Anzi, Hafs bin Umar al-Raqi, Muhammad bin Ayyub bin Yahya, Muhammad bin Ghalib bin Tamtaam, Muhammad bin Yunas bin al-Mubarak al hol. All of these narrated from same Muhammad bin Sanan. Plus this hadeeth is oppoing Qur`an as i will prove further**

see details from
here: http://www.ahlalhdeeth.com/vb/showthread.php?t=24050
So these eight narrators oppose one single narrator plus there are other routs other than Maysara ra of this hadith and they also oppose the hadith of Muhammad bin Salih

Authentic hadith in Tirmidhi from Abu huraira Ra clears this issue.
قالوا يا رسول الله متى وجبت لك النبوة قال وآدم بين الروح والجسد

Prophet (SAW) was asked, **"when was the Prophethood made obligatory for you"** to which he replied, "while Adam was between the spirit and the

body" [At-Tirmidhee chpt. 'The virtues of the Prophet (SAW)' (vol. 10 of the commentary of al-Mubaarakfooree.)]

Words from Musnad Ahmad and others

Prophet peace be upon him said

"I was written as a Prophet in the presence of Allaah while Adam was intertwined in his clay."[Musnad Ahmad 4/127,128, Sharah As Sunnah 13/207 and in the Saheehs of al-Haakim and ibn Hibbaan]
Let us Understand it with Imam al Behaqi

He said

قوله صلى الله عليه وسلم: "إني عند الله في أمّ الكتاب لخاتم النبيين وان ءادم لمنجدل في طينته" يريد انه كان كذلك في قضاء الله وتقديره قبل أن يكون أبو البشر وأوّل الأنبياء صلوات الله عليهم"

And what is meant by Prophet Muhammad Peace and blessings be upon Him "I was written [in Umm Al-Kitab] in Allah's presence as the Seal of the Prophets, while Adam was still kneaded in his clay" **is that he was destined and decreed by Allah even before the father of Man and the first of Messenger's Salawat Allah 'alaihim**.[Dalael Al-Nubuwah 1/81]

Now, coming back to the criticism

Shaykh Abdulrahman Al-Faqeeh says regarding this hadith:

وأما قوله إسناده جيد فليس بصحيح كما سبق بل هو شاذ منكر بهذا اللفظ من حديث ميسرة
"... as for him (Al-Ghumari) saying it is *Jayid* (good): that is not correct, rather it is ***Shaaz Munkar*** (Rejected and Strange) with these wordings from the hadith of Maysarah".

and he also said

فالحاصل أن هذا الحديث بهذا اللفظ المذكور عند ابن الجوزي من حديث ميسرة لايصح ، فمتنه شاذ مخالف لكل من روى الحديث عن ميسرة ، والاحتمال الذي ذكره الشيخ أبو تيمية حفظه الله من احتمال خطأ الناسخ وكونه انتقل بصره للذي بعده احتمال كبير جدا وقد يكون من ابن الجوزي أيضا

لأن ابن الجوزي رحمه الله ذكر كما في المطبوع من الوفا ص25

(عن ميسرة الفجر قال قلت يارسول الله متى كنت نبيا ؟ قال (وآدم بين الروح والجسد)

(عن ميسرة قال قلت يارسول الله متى كنت نبيا ؟ قال (فذكر اللفظ الطويل السابق

. فابن الجوزي ذكر حديث ميسرة كما هو لفظه المعروف ثم قال عن ميسرة وذكر اللفظ الثاني المنكر

So the point is, Indeed This hadith with these words mentioned from the hadith of Maysara are not authentic in Ibn Jozi, and the text is Odd and is against all the ahadith narrated from Maysara.The possibility is mentioned by Shaykh Abu Tamiyah May Allah Protect him...

Ibn Jozi Rahimullah mentioned in printed version of Al-Wafa page 25 (Maysara al Fajr asked asked from Prophet *"when were you a Prophet?" to which he replied, "while Adam was between the spirit and the body*"?

(Maysara asked from Prophet when were you a Prophet? He replied (and mentioned the previous long hadith i.e He replied: "When Allah created the earth "

So, Ibne Jozi (firstly) mentioned the hadith of Maysara with the famous words (i.e where Prophet peace be upon him replied when adam was between spirit and body) and then he quoted from Maysara other words which are rejected. source:http://www.ahlalhdeeth.com/vb/showthread.php?t=24050

b) Shaykh Al Bani said

منكر(Rejected)

نقلته من مجموع فتاوى ابن تيمية وهو في رسالة له في بيان حقيقة مذهب الاتحادية وبطلانه محفوظة في الكواكب الدراري (39 / 103 / 1) لابن عروة الحنبلي ومنه صححت بعض الاخطاء في المجموع ومن كتب الرجال .

I quoted from Majmoo' Fatwa Ibn Taymiyyah what he wrote in the form of a letter to expose the reality of Itihadyya ideology and prove its invalidity. This letter is preserved in al-Kawakib al-Darari (1/103/39) written by Ibn U'rwah al-Hanbali. I relied on this book [i.e. al-Kawakib al-Darari] and used it to correct some mistakes I found in al-Majmo' and books of Tarajum.

وهذا الاسناد رجاله كلهم معروفون ثقات غير محمد بن صالح فلم أعرفه ومن فوقه من رجال التهذيب .

The chain of narrators of this chain are all known and trustworthy except Muhammad bin Salih who I could not recognize while the narrators above him are all listed in the Tahdheeb book.

فالظاهر أن الآفة من محمد بن صالح الذي لم اعرفه ولم يذكره الخطيب في شيوخ الوزان ولذلك قلت : إن الحديث منكر فلو فرض أنه ثقة فهو شاذ لأنه قد خالفه

جمع من الثقات فرووه مختصراً جداً:

It seems that the defect [of this narration] is because of Muhammad bin Salih who I did not recognize and who al-Khateeb did not even mention as one of the Shuyookh of al-Wazzan. Therefore, I said: 'This hadeeth is Munkar and even if we assume this narrator to be trustworthy, the narration will still be an odd narration since he is opposed by many other trustworthy narrators who narrated a shorter version of this narration.

وإن مما يستغرب حقا : أن شيخ الإسلام ابن تيمية رحمه الله تعالي بعد أن ذكر الحديث بلفظه المختصر الصحيح المذكور أنفا أتبعه بهذا اللفظ الطويل المنكر ،

What is the most surprising is that Shaykh al-Islam, May Allah bestow His mercy upon him, mentioned the summarized authentic version of this hadeeth, and then he mentioned the lengthy, odd version afterwards.

Munkar (then he said)

نقلته من مجموع فتاوى ابن تيمية وهو في رسالة له في بيان حقيقة مذهب الاتحادية وبطلانه محفوظة في الكواكب الدراري (39 / 103 / 1) لابن عروة الحنبلي ومنه صححت بعض الاخطاء في المجموع ومن كتب الرجال .

I quoted from Majmoo' Fatwa Ibn Taymiyyah what he wrote in the form of a letter to expose the reality of Itihadyya ideology and prove its invalidity. This letter is preserved in al-Kawakib al-Darari (1/103/39) written by Ibn U'rwah al-Hanbali. I relied on this book [i.e. al-Kawakib al-Darari] and used it to correct some mistakes I found in al-Majmo' and books of Tarajum.

وهذا الاسناد رجاله كلهم معروفون ثقات غير محمد بن صالح فلم أعرفه ومن فوقه من رجال التهذيب .

The chain of narrators of this chain are all known and trustworthy except Muhammad bin Salih who I could not recognize while the narrators above him are all listed in the Tahdheeb book. (then he said)

فالظاهر أن الآفة من محمد بن صالح الذي لم اعرفه ولم يذكره الخطيب في شيوخ الوزان ولذلك قلت : إن الحديث منكر فلو فرض أنه ثقة فهو شاذ لأنه قد خالفهجمع من الثقات فرووه مختصراً جداً:

It seems that the defect [of this narration] is because of Muhammad bin Salih who I did not recognize and **who al-Khateeb did not even mention as one of the Shuyookh of al-Wazzan.** Therefore, I said: 'This hadeeth is Munkar and **even if we assume this narrator to be trustworthy, the narration will still be an odd narration since he is opposed by many other trustworthy narrators who narrated a shorter version of this narration.**

وإن مما يستغرب حقا : أن شيخ الإسلام ابن تيمية رحمه الله تعالي بعد أن ذكر الحديث بلفظه المختصر الصحيح المذكور أنفا أتبعه بهذا اللفظ الطويل المنكر ،

What is the most surprising is that Shaykh al-Islam, May Allah bestow His mercy upon him, mentioned the summarized authentic version of this hadeeth, and then he mentioned the lengthy, odd version afterwards.**[Silsilah Daeefa Vol 14 page 468-470**]

c)And this Munkir odd narration is Against Quran

What makes it most likely that the text is false is the fact that the du'aa' by which Allaah accepted Adam's repentance is what is mentioned in Soorat al-A'raaf, where Allaah says

قَالاَ رَبَّنَا ظَلَمْنَآ أَنفُسَنَا وَإِن لَّمْ تَغْفِرْ لَنَا وَتَرْحَمْنَا لَنَكُونَنَّ مِنَ الْخَـسِرِينَ

"They said: 'Our Lord! We have wronged ourselves. If You forgive us not, and bestow not upon us Your Mercy, we shall certainly be of the losers'"**[al-A'raaf 7:23]**

Ibn e Kathir Commented

وقال الضحاك بن مزاحم في قوله: { رَبَّنَا ظَلَمْنَآ أَنفُسَنَا وَإِن لَّمْ تَغْفِرْ لَنَا وَتَرْحَمْنَا لَنَكُونَنَّ مِنَ ٱلْخَـسِرِينَ } هي الكلمات التي تلقاها آدم من ربه.

Zahhaq bin Mazahum said This saying ("Our Lord! We have wronged ourselves. If You forgive us not, and bestow not upon us Your mercy, we shall

certainly be of the losers.'') "These are the words that Adam received from his Lord.''(end quote).

.d) **Islam QA says in fatwa 60041**

This is the supplication of Adam and Hawwa', in which they called upon Allaah alone, and sought to draw close to Him (tawassul) by His names and attributes, and by mentioning their situation. These are words which Adam received from his Lord, then he said them and Allaah accepted his repentance, as Allaah says (interpretation of the meaning):

"Then Adam received from his Lord Words. And his Lord pardoned him (accepted his repentance). Verily, He is the One Who forgives (accepts repentance), the Most Merciful"**[al-Baqarah 2:37](end quote)**
Note: These sufis say the hadith of Adam peace be upon him is the commentary of the verse "Then Adam received from his Lord Words. And his Lord pardoned him (accepted his repentance). Verily, He is the One Who forgives (accepts repentance), the Most Merciful"**[al-Baqarah 2:37](end quote)**

Response is that, This is nothing but an utter lie because when the hadith is fabricated how can it be a Tafsir of the verse? let us see the commentaries of 2:37

a) Ibn Kathir stated
It was reported that the above Ayah is explained by Allah's statement, (They said: "Our Lord! We have wronged ourselves. If You forgive us not, and bestow not upon us Your mercy, we shall certainly be of the losers.'') (7:23) **as Mujahid, Sa'id bin Jubayr, Abu Al-'Aliyah, Ar-Rabi' bin Anas, Al-Hasan, Qatadah, Muhammad bin Ka'b Al-Qurazi, Khaلlid bin Ma'dan, 'Ata' Al-Khurasani and 'Abdur-Rahman bin Zayd bin Aslam have stated.**

b) Tafsir Jalalyan

Thereafter Adam received certain words from his Lord, with which He inspired him (a variant reading [of Ādamu] has accusative Ādama and nominative kalimātu), meaning they [the words] came to him, and these were [those of] the verse Lord, we have wronged ourselves [Q. 7:23], with which he supplicated, and He relented to him, that is, He accepted his repentance; truly He is the Relenting, to His servants, the Merciful, to them.

Comment: So this is clearly against Qur`an and sayings of the salaf of this Ummah, No one ever believed from the first three centuries that Adam peace be upon him sought intercession to Allah with the name of Prophet's peace be upon him name."And we challenge those who said hadith is authentic. Show us from single salaf who believed this that Adam A.S made the tawassul through Prophet, Plus show us the direct Hukam of accepted muhaddith who said "This hadith is Authentic" against that we have shown 10 muhadditheen and their direct hukam plus 11th is Hakim himself who never authenticated the hadith as he himself said Abdul Rahman narrated fabricated ahadith from his father

BLOCK 33

They said

12. It is furthermore evident that Ibn Taymiyya considers the meaning of the creation of everything for the sake of the Prophet as true and correct, as he declares in his Majmu`at al-fatawa in the volume on tasawwuf (11:95-97):

محمد سيد ولد آدم. وأفضل الخلق؛ وأكرمهم عليه، ومن هنا قال من قال: إن الله خلق من أجله العالم، أو أنه لولا هو لما خلق عرشاً، ولا كرسياً، ولا سماء ولا أرضاً ولا شمساً ولا قمراً. لكن ليس هذا حديثاً عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلّم لا صحيحاً ولا ضعيفاً، ولم ينقله أحد من أهل العلم بالحديث، عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلّم، بل ولا يعرف عن الصحابة، بل هو كلام لا يدرى قائله. ويمكن أن يفسر بوجه صحيح كقوله: {وَسَخَّرَ لَكُمْ مَّا فِي السَّمَـوَتِ وَمَا فِى الأَرْضِ } [الجاثية: 13] وقوله: { وَسَخَّرَ لَكُمُ الْفُلْكَ لِتَجْرِىَ فِى الْبَحْرِ بِأَمْرِهِ وَسَخَّرَ لَكُمُ الأَنْهَـرَ وَسَخَّرَ لَكُمُ الشَّمْسَ وَالْقَمَرَ دَآئِبَيْنِ وَسَخَّرَ لَكُمُ الَّيْلَ وَالنَّهَارَ وَآتَاكُم مِّن كُلِّ مَا سَأَلْتُمُوهُ وَإِن تَعُدُّواْ نِعْمَةَ اللَّهِ لاَ تُحْصُوهَا } [إبراهيم: 32 - 34] وأمثال ذلك من الآيات التي يبين فيها أنه خلق المخلوقات لبني آدم، ومعلوم أن لله فيها حكماً عظيمة غير ذلك، وأعظم من ذلك، ولكن يبين لبني آدم ما فيها من المنفعة، وما أسبغ عليهم من النعمة.فإذا قيل: فعل كذا لكذا لم يقتض أن لا يكون فيه حكمة أخرى. وكذلك قول القائل: لولا كذا ما خلق كذا، لا يقتضي أن لا يكون فيه حكم أخرى عظيمة، بل يقتضي إذا كان أفضل صالحي بني آدم محمد، وكانت خلقته غاية مطلوبة، وحكمة بالغة مقصودة [أعظم] من غيره، صار تمام الخلق، ونهاية الكمال، حصل بمحمد صلى الله عليه وسلّم.والله خلق السموات والأرض وما بينهما في ستة أيام، وكان آخر الخلق يوم الجمعة، وفيه خلق آدم وهو آخر ما خلق، خلق يوم الجمعة بعد العصر في آخر يوم الجمعة، وسيد ولد آدم محمد ـ صلى الله عليه وسلّم ـ آدم فمن دونه تحت لوائه ـ قال صلى الله عليه وسلّم «إني عند الله لمكتوب خاتم النبيين وإن آدم لمنجدل في طينته»، أي: كتبت نبوتي وأظهرت لما خلق آدم قبل نفخ الروح فيه كما يكتب الله رزق العبد وأجله وعمله وشقي أو سعيد إذا خلق الجنين قبل نفخ الروح فيه. فإذا كان الإنسان هو خاتم المخلوقات وآخرها وهو الجامع لما فيها، وفاضله هو فاضل المخلوقات مطلقاً، ومحمد إنسان هذا العين؛ وقطب هذه الرحى، واقسام هذا الجمع كان كأنها غاية الغايات في المخلوقات، فما ينكر أن يقال: إنه لأجله خلقت جميعها، وأنه لولاه لما خلقت، فإذا فسر هذا الكلام ونحوه بما يدل عليه الكتاب والسنة

Translation: Muhammad is the Chief of the Children of Adam, the Best of Creation, the noblest of them in the sight of Allah. This is why some have said that "**Allah created the Universe due to him," or that "Were it not for him, He would have neither created a Throne, nor a Footstool, nor a heaven, earth, sun or moon."** However, this is not a hadith on the authority of the Prophet, neither is it sahih nor is it weak and it has not been narrated by any person of knowledge in hadith either from Prophet or Sahaba ***but it may be explained from a correct aspect...***

Since the best of the righteous of the children of Adam is Muhammad, creating him was a desirable end of deep-seated purposeful wisdom, more than for anyone else, and hence the completion of creation and the fulfillment of perfection was attained with Muhammad, may Allah Exalted bless him and grant him peace... The Chief of the Children of Adam is Muhammad, may Allah Exalted bless him and grant him peace, Adam and his children being under his banner. He, may Allah Exalted bless him and grant him peace, said: "Truly, I was written as the Seal of the Prophets with Allah, when Adam was going to-and-fro in his clay," i.e. that my prophethood was decreed and manifested when Adam was created but before the breathing of the Spirit into him, just as Allah decrees the livelihood, lifespan, deeds and misery or happiness of the slave when He creates the embryo but before the breathing of the Spirit into it.

Since man is the seal and last of all creation, and its microcosm, and since the best of man is thus the best of all creation absolutely, then Muhammad, being the Pupil of the Eye, the Axis of the Mill, and the Distributor to the Collective, is as it were the Ultimate Purpose from amongst all the purposes of creation. **Thus it cannot be denied to say that "Due to him all of this was created", or that "Were it not for him, all this would not have been created," so if statements like this are thus explained according to what the Book and the Sunna indicate, it is acceptable.** [Majmua al Fatawa, Volume No. 11, Page Nos. 95-97]

Tabarānī, Bayhaqī, Ibn-ul-Mundhir and Suyūtī narrated this tradition through ‘Umar bin al-Khattāb and ‘Alī that the Holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) said, “Adam was just about to repent for his act of disobedience that he suddenly recalled in his state of anxiety that he had seen lā ilāha illallāhu Muhammad-

ur-rasūlullāh (there is no god but Allah, Muhammad is Allah's Messenger) inscribed on the Throne at the time of his birth." It obviously meant that the distinction the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) possesses is denied to others. That is the reason his name was inscribed along with Allah's Own name. At this, he added these words of intermediation to his prayer for divine forgiveness:

(O Allah,) I beg Your forgiveness through the mediation of Muhammad (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم).

The tradition related by Ibn-ul-Mundhir has the following words:

O Allah, I beg Your forgiveness through Your beloved and most honoured servant Muhammad and through his distinction You have blessed him with.

►[Suyuti cites in ad-Durr-ul-manthur Volume 001: Page No. 60]

Our Response

Shaykh al-Islam Ibn Taymiyah (may Allaah have mercy on him) was asked:

Is the hadeeth which some people quote – "Were it not for you, Allaah would not have created the Throne or the Kursiy or the earth or the heavens or the sun or the moon or anything else" saheeh or nor?

He replied:
Muhammad (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) is the leader of the sons of Adam, and the best and noblest of creation, hence some people say that Allaah created the universe because of him, or that were it not for him, Allaah would not have created the Throne or the Kursiy or the earth or the heavens or the sun or the moon.

But this hadeeth that is narrated from the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) is neither saheeh (sound) nor da'eef (weak), and it was not narrated by any scholar in a hadeeth from the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him). Neither was it known from the Sahaabah. Rather it is the words of one who is unknown but it may be explained from a correct aspect... [Majmoo' al-Fataawa, 11/86-96.]

Then he went on and quotes the correct meaning of this quote (as also quoted by ahlus sunna website) which is against the meaning of meaning taken by extreme soofiyah.

It is mentioned in Fatawa Tatarkhaniya (Hanafi Fatawa book)

وفي جواهر الفتاوى: هل يجوز أن يقال لولا نبينا محمد صلى الله تعالى عليه وآله وسلم لما خلق الله تعالى آدم ؟
قال : هذا شيء يذكره الوعاظ على رءوس المنابر يريدون به تعظيم محمد عليه الصلاة والسلام والأولى أن يحترزوا عن أمثال هذا فإن النبي عليه الصلاة والسلام وإن كان عظيم المنزلة والمرتبة عند الله تعالى فان لكل نبي من الأنبياء منزلة ومرتبة وخاصيته ليست لغيره فيكون كل نبي أصلا بنفسه

It is mentioned in Jawahir al-Fatawa: Is it allowed to say "If Allah had not created Muhammad (salallaho alaihi wasalam) then Allah would not have created Adam"?

The answer: This is the thing mentioned by orators on Minbar. There meaning is veneration of Prophet Peace be upon him. It is better to keep away from the (speech) like this because the status and rank of Prophet Peace be upon him in the court of Allah is very high but every Prophet has high status and rank (in the court of Allah). And (each Prophet) had some speciality which the other had not, so each Prophet has a place [**Fatawa Tatarkhaniya**5/485, Ibn Nujaym in 131/5 البحر الرائق]

So Hanafi fatawa says something else and what Ibn Tamiya says is totally different, there is no need of taking that part to quote for innovative tawassul.

BLOCK 34

They said

Mother of All Believers Hazarth Ayesha Siddiquea(R.A)

Hadith # 9

حدثنا أبو النعمان حدثنا سعيد بن زيد حدثنا عمرو بن مالك النكري حدثنا أبو الجوزاء أوس بن عبد الله قال قحط أهل المدينة قحطا شديدا فشكوا إلى عائشة فقالت انظروا قبر النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فاجعلوا منه كوى إلى السماء حتى لا يكون بينه وبين السماء سقف قال ففعلوا فمطرنا مطرا حتى نبت

العشب وسمنت الإبل حتى تفتقت من الشحم فسمي عام الفتق

Imam Dārimī Relates from Abu al-Jawza' Aws bin 'Abdullah: The people of Medina were in the grip of a severe famine. They complained to 'A'ishah (about their terrible condition). She told them to go towards the Prophet's grave and open a window in the direction of the sky so that there is no curtain between the sky and the grave. The narrator says they did so. Then it started raining heavily; even the lush green grass sprang up (everywhere) and the camels had grown so fat (it seemed) they would burst out due to the over piling of blubber. So the year was named as the year of greenery and plenty.

References

►Sunan Darimi Volume 001, Page 227, Hadith Number 093 **Click here for Scanned Page (11)**

►Ibn Jawzi (rah) in his al-Wafa bi Ahwal lil Mustafa made a chapter before this hadith

الباب التاسع والثلاثون في الاستسقاء بقبره صلى الله عليه وسلّم

Translation: Chapter #39 in regards to "Seeking rain through the grave of Prophet (Peace be upon him)" And then he brought the Hadith of Sayyidah Aisha (ra) under it. [Al Wafa bi Ahwal lil Mustafa, Page #817-818] **Click here for Scanned Page (156)**

►Muhammad bin 'Alawi al-Maliki says, "This tradition has a good chain of transmission; rather, in my opinion, it is sound. The scholars have also acknowledged its soundness and have established its genuineness on the basis of almost equally credible evidence. [Shifa'-ul-fu'ad bi-ziyarat khayr--il-'ibad Page No.153]

►Subkī in Shifā'-us-siqām fī ziyārat khayr-il-anām (p.128)

►Qastallānī in al-Mawāhib-ul-laduniyyah (4:276); and Zurqānī in his Commentary(11:150)

Chain :""Abū an-Nu'mān heard it from Sa'īd bin Zayd, he from 'Amr bin Mālik

an-Nukrī and he from Abū al-Jawzā' Aws bin 'Abdullāh who has reported it."

Our Response

Hafiz Ibn Jozi mentioned under the chapter "في الاستسقاء بقبره صلى الله عليه وسلم "Istesqa with the grave of Prophet peace be upon him"[Al Wafa be Tareef Fadhaail e Mustafa]

Note: Chapter does not mean this is the aqeedah of Ibn Jozi neither the chapter says Asking help from Prophet peace be upon him is allowed, It simply means he will narrate ahadith related to this chapter

see alsi Ibn Jozi VS The aqeedah of brelviyah on asking help from the dead. http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/aqeedah/319-ibn-jawzi-versus-the-creed-of-asking-help-from-dead

Coming back to the hadith, One of the narrator is Saeed bin Zaid, Who is trustworthy but he is not evidence in his lone narrations and This is Jarah Mufassir

Ibne Hibban said

وكان صدوقا حافظا ممن كان يخطىء في الأخبار ويهم في الآثار حتى لا يحتج به إذا انفرد

He is truthful Hafiz who makes mistakes in narrations and Waham in Athaar even he is not evidence in his lone narrations [Kitab al Majroheen by Ibne Hibban under the biography of Saeed bin Zaid]

a) Ibne Hibban said

وكان صدوقا حافظا ممن كان يخطىء في الأخبار ويهم في الآثار حتى لا يحتج به إذا انفرد
He is truthful Hafiz who makes mistakes in narrations and Waham in Athaar he is not evidence in his lone narrations **[Kitab al Majroheen by Ibne Hibban under the biography of Saeed bin Zaid]**

Note: This narration is also in his (saeed bin zaid) lone narrations, so this is weak, And the people who are using this hadeeth as evidence they claim that we need mutwatir ahadeeth for creed, How strange! they are going against their own rule (i.e) using weak ahdeeth of lone narrators for their false creed?

Below is The reply taken from ISLAM QA and i believe it is sufficient for this Narration, let us see from text of this athar, It is no where proving Tawassul and Istegatha.

b) Islam QA says

This hadeeth is not a proof for what the extreme Sufis believe about it being permissible to seek rain by the help of the Prophet Muhammad (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him). **You cannot find in the hadeeth anything which indicates that, by any stretch of the imagination. The most that can be said is that it shows how Allaah honoured his Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) after he died**, as al-Daarimi described in his Musnad in the chapter heading under which he included this hadeeth. This is the blessing of his pure body and his honour before Allaah. **But that does not mean that it is permissible for the Muslims to go to him and seek his help whilst he is in his grave**. The Sahaabah (may Allaah be pleased with them) did not do that, rather they opened a hole in the roof of his room so that it might be directly open to the sky, **but none of them asked the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) for rain, and they did not speak to him concerning that.**

Shaykh al-Islam Ibn Taymiyah (may Allaah have mercy on him) said in Iqtida' al-Siraat al-Mustaqeem (p. 338)

Going to graves to offer supplication beside them, and seeking a response to du'aa' offered there more than du'aa's offered elsewhere, is something that was not prescribed by Allaah or His Messenger, and was not done by any of the Sahaabah, Taabi'een or imams of the Muslims. It was not mentioned by any of the earlier scholars or righteous men. Rather most of what has been narrated concerning that comes from some of the later figures, after the second century (AH).

The companions of the Messenger of Allaah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) were faced with drought several times, and other calamities befell them, but did they come and seek rain and seek help at the grave of the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him)?

Rather ‘Umar went out with al-‘Abbaas and sought rain through him, i.e. through his du’aa’; he did not pray for rain by the grave of the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him).

Indeed it was narrated from ‘Aa’ishah (may Allaah be pleased with her) that she uncovered he grave of the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) so that rain might fall on it, because it (rain) is a mercy, **but she did not pray for rain there, or seek divine help there.** End quote.

Thus it is clear that there is no evidence in this report for the Sufis that it is permissible to seek help from the Messenger (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) or to seek to draw closer to Allaah by means of him or his status. And Allaah knows best.
Source: http://www.islam-qa.com/en/ref/103585

Moreover Prophet Peace be Upon him himself said

Imam Ahmad reported that a man of Balhajim said: "O Messenger of Allah, what are you calling for'' He said:

«أَدْعُو إِلَى اللهِ وَحْدَهُ الَّذِي إِنْ مَسَّكَ ضُرٌّ فَدَعَوْتَهُ كَشَفَ عَنْكَ، وَالَّذِي إِنْ أَضْلَلْتَ بِأَرْضٍ قَفْرٍ فَدَعَوْتَهُ رَدَّ عَلَيْكَ، وَالَّذِي إِنْ أَصَابَتْكَ سَنَةٌ فَدَعَوْتَهُ أَنْبَتَ لَكَ»

(I am calling people to Allah Alone, the One Who, if you call on Him when harm befalls you, will relieve you; and when you are lost in the wilderness, you call on Him and He brings you back: **and when drought (famine) strikes, you call on Him and He makes your crops grow.**)
Musnad Ahmad hadith no: 19718 quoted by Ibne Kathir In his Commentary of Quran under 27:62

Source of Musnad Ahmad: http://ar.wikisource.org/wiki/24/مسند_أحمد_بن_حنبل/مسند_البصريين
Prophet peace be upon him Never said when Drought Strikes, You Call on Me and I can Help youProphet peace be upon him told us everything, we challenge these sufis show us single hadith where Prophet peace be upon him said visit my grave and ask me i will help you.

For detailed Critic on the chain

http://www.ahlalhdeeth.com/vbe/showpost.php?p=8698&postcount=13

Imam Dahabee said
ولجهلة المصريين فيها اعتقاد يتجاوز الوصف، ولايجوز مما فيه من الشرك، ويسجدون لها، ويلتمسون منها المغفرة

Due to ignorance of Egyptians the Creeds found in them is not correct to talk about it, **When shirk** found in them, they prostate to others (except Allah), **and they seek forgiveness from them** [Seyar Ailam Nubala 10/106]
Now i want to quote Imam ad-Dahabee which will clear all the things regarding this narrations Insha'Allah

Dahabee Rahimullah said
يريد إجابة دعاء المضطر عنده لأن البقاع المباركة يستجاب عندها الدعاء كما أن الدعاء في السحر مرجو ودبر المكتوبات وفي المساجد بل دعاء المضطر مجاب في أي مكان اتفق اللهم إني مضطر إلى العفو فاعف عني))

shortly It says that Prayer is answered since the graves of pious is blessed and the dua is answered like the dua is answered while traveling , dua is answered after obligatory prayers dua is answered in masjid in fact, Dua is accepted in any place and this is agreed upon [Seray Ailam an-Nubala 9/324,344]

Comment: So according to muhadditheen Prayer is answered everywhere not only on the grave of Prophet peace be upon him or any pious person, and according to muhadditheen grave of pious is blessed as said by ad-Dahabee, Darami and Islam QA above, according to Muhadditheen asking the needs from the person in grave is shirk as Dahabee clearly said.

Conclusion:

1. This athar is weak
2. This athar is not mutwatir and asharies need mutwatir hadeeth for creed.
3. This athar is not proving any kind of asking dead or tawassul from the essance of Prophet peace be upon him. In fact it is against these people No where sahaba asked help from Prophet peace be upon him.

Companions rejected this act

http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/aqeedah/195-umar-bin-al-khattab-and-grave-worship

Also see detailed analysis on this hadeeth:

http://www.docstoc.com/docs/92384079/Was-a-window-opened-above-the-Prophet's-grave-for-rain

Then they again quoted The **Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) as a source of intermediation for Jews which is** already responded above in this article, see this also http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/tawassul/182-bidaee-tawassul-refutation-series-tawassul-of-jews-through-prophet

BLOCK NO. 35

Hadith # 9

Narrated Abdullah Ibn Umar:

Allah's Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم) said: **who ever visits my grave after my death it is same he has visited me in my life.**

Reference

►Tabrani Volume 012: Hadith Number 406

►Bayhaqi Shu'ab ul Iman Volume 003: Hadith Number 489

Imam Ibn Quduma (rah) said:

ويستحب زيارة قبر النبي لما روى الدارقطني بإسناده عن ابن عمر قال: قال رسول الله : «من حج فزار قبري بعد وفاتي فكأنما زارني في حياتي» وفي رواية، «من زار قبري وجبت له شفاعتي

It is recommended to do Ziyarah of Prophet's grave as it is narrated by Daraqutni with his Isnaad from Ibn Umar (ra) that the Prophet (Peace be upon him) said: Whosoever performs the Hajj after my death then he should visit my grave because It is as If he has visited me during my life. And he also narrated (another hadith) that Whosoever visits my grave then my intercession becomes Wajib for him [Imam Ibn Quduma in al-Mughni, Volume No. 5, Page No. 381]

►Imam al Bahuti al-Hanbli (rah) has also said this in his Al-Kashaf al-Qanna [Volume No. 2, Page No. 290]

Qadhi Iyaad (rah) said in his magnificent Ash-Shifa

في حكم زيارة قبره صلى الله عليه وسلم، وفضيلة من زاره وسلم عليه
و زيارة قبره صلى الله عليه وسلم سنة من سنن المسلمين مجمع عليها، وفضيلة مرغب فيها: روى عن ابن عمر

Chapter: The order of visiting the grave of Prophet (Peace be upon him) and the Virtue of the one visiting it and sending Salam.

It should be known that visiting the grave of Prophet (Peace be upon him) is "Masnoon" [Well known] for all Muslims and they have "IJMA" over it, It has such a virtue that It has been prescribed to us as it comes in the hadith of Ibn Umar (ra) [i.e. whosoever visits my grave then my intercession becomes Wajib for him][Qadhi Iyaad in Ash-Shifa, Volume No.2, Page No. 53]

Our Response

This has nothing to do with the innovative tawassul. All this has been dealt here http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/refutation/199-ahadith-on-visiting-the-grave-of-prophet-peace-be-upon-him

BLOCK 36

They said

Intermediation through the Prophet's request for forgiveness after his death

Hadith # 10

عبد الله بن مسعود عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال:

"إن لله ملائكة سياحين يبلغون عن أمتي السلام". قال: وقال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم:

"حياتي خير لكم تحدثون ويُحدث لكم، ووفاتي خير لكم تعرض علي أعمالكم، فما رأيت من خير حمدت الله عليه وما رأيت من شر استغفرت الله لكم".

It is attributed to ‘Abdullāh bin Mas‘ūd that the Holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) is reported to have said:

My life is blissful for you because you hear traditions from people and relate them to others and my death is also blissful for you because your deeds will be presented to me. If I see the virtues prevail, I will be grateful to Allah, and if I see the vices prevail, I will pray for your forgiveness from Allah.

References

►Haythamī transmitted it in Majma‘-uz-zawā’id (9:24) and said that that tradition had been reported by Bazzār (in his Musnad) and its sub-narrators are all of sahīh (sound) hadith.

►‘Irāqī has confirmed the soundness of its transmission in his book Tarh-ut-tathrīb fī sharh-it-taqrīb (3:297)

►Ibn Sa‘d has recorded it in at-Tabaqāt-ul-kubrā (2:194)

►Qādī ‘Iyād has inscribed this tradition in ash-Shifā (1:19)

►Suyūtī, recording it in al-Khasā’is-ul-kubrā (2:281) and Manāhil-us-sifā fī takhrīj ahādīth ash-Shifā (p.3), has commented that Ibn Abū Usāmah in his Musnad has reproduced it through Bakr bin ‘Abdullāh Muzanī and Bazzār in his Musnad who have relied on its narration by ‘Abdullāh bin Mas‘ūd with a sound chain of transmission. It has been endorsed by Khafājī and Mullā ‘Alī Qārī in their commentaries on ash-Shifā, i.e. Nasīm-ur-riyād (1:102) and Sharh ash-Shifā (1:36) respectively.

►Hadith-scholar Ibn-ul-Jawzī has reproduced it in al-Wafā bi-ahwāl-il-mustafā (2:809-10) from Bakr bin ‘Abdullāh and Anas bin Mālik. Subkī has copied this tradition in Shifā’-us-siqām fī ziyārat khayr-il-anām (p.34) from Bakr bin ‘Abdullāh Muzanī, and Ibn ‘Abd-ul-Hādī in as-Sārim-ul-munkī (p.266-

7) has authenticated its veracity.

►Bazzār's tradition has also been recorded by Ibn Kathīr in al-Bidāyah wan-nihāyah (4:257).

►Ibn Hajar 'Asqalānī narrated it through Bakr bin 'Abdullāh Muzanī in al-Matālib-ul-'āliyah (4:22-3#3853).

►'Alā'-ud-Dīn 'Alī copied Ibn Sa'd's tradition in Kanz-ul-'ummāl (11:407#31903) and from Hārith (#31904).

►Nabhānī related it in Hujjatullāh 'alal-'ālamīn fī mu'jazāt sayyid-il-mursalīn (p.713).

Our Response

Critique on Chain

a) Hafiz al-Bazzar himself said after quoting the hadeeth

وهذا الحديث آخره لا نعلمه يروى عن عبد الله إلا من هذا الوجه بهذا الإسناد.

"We don't know the end of this Hadeeth to have been narrated from 'Abdullah except from this angle through this specific chain of narration". Source of Musnad al
Bazzar: http://www.islamweb.net/newlibrary/display_book.php?bk_no=72&ID=647&idfrom=1750&idto=1752&bookid=72&startno=2

b) Hafiz Ibne Kathir endorsed the wordings of Hafiz al-Bazzar in Al Bidaya wal Nihaya 5/275
Note: These people need mutwatir hadeeth to prove their false creed, above hadith is weak leave a side mutwatir.

c) Hafiz al 'Iraqee, shaykh of Haythamee said:

ابن ووثَّقه مسلمٌ، له أخرج وإن رواد، أبي بن عبدالعزيز بن عبدالمجيد إلا الصحيح رجال ورجاله كثيرون، ضعَّفه فقد والنسائي؛ معين"

Men are men of Saheeh, except that Abdel Majeed ibn Abi Ruwad although Muslim narrated

from him, and Ibn ma'een and Nassai declared him thiqqah, And Majority declared him weak" Takhreej Al Ihya (4/128)

d) Shaykh Zubair Ali Zai said:

This chain is weak because of three reasons

1- Sufiyan at-Thawri is Mudallis and this narration is from (AN)
2- Abdel Majeed ibn Abi Ruwad is Mudallis and this narration is from (AN) see al Fath-ul Mubeen fe tahqeeq Tabqaat ul Mudalliseen 3/82
3- Abdel Majeed is Weak according to Majority see al Fath ul Mubeen fe tahqeeq Tabqaat ul Mudalliseen page 55 and Tohfa tul Aqwiya fe tahqeeq Duafa al Bukhari page 242[In the tahqeeq of Fadal Salat an Nabi by Imam Ismaieel bin Ishaq al Qadhi page 69]

2.. Critique on the text

a) Shaykh Al-Albani said:
The first part : " Allah has (appointed) angels wandering on earth, they bring me the salam of my Ummah" has been transmitted by Nassai (1/189) from many asaneed from Sufyan Thawree from Abdallah ibn Saib, and from Al A'mash in Mu'jam Kabeer of Tabaranee (3/81/2) , Akhbar Asbahan of Abu Nu'aym (2/205) and Ibn Asakir (9/189/2)

Shaykh Albani said : " The agreement of a Jama'at of thiqah on this narration from Sufyan without mention of end of hadeeth " My life...", and A'mash following him in that shows for me the Shuzooz of this addition (meaning the addition is shaadh), because Abdel Majeed ibn Abdel Azeez is alone in reporting it, and how not when he his mutakalam fihi (talked about) because of his memory, despite his being from narrators of Muslim, a Jama'at has declared him thiqqah, and other have declared him weak, and some mention reason (of weakening).

Khalili said : " He is Thiqqah, but he makes mistakes in Ahadeeth"
Nassai said : " He is not Qawee, his hadeeth are written"

Ibn Abdil Barr said : "He narrated from Malik Ahadeeth in which he made mistakes"

Ibn Hibban said in " Al Majroohin" (2/152) : " Munkarul Hadeeth Jidan, he mixes akhbar, he narrates manakeer from famous (people), and he deserves to be abandoned" I say : this is why Hafiz said in Taqreeb : " Sadooq he makes mistakes"(end quote)

See detailed translation of reply by Shaykh Nasir ud din Al-AlBani here: http://jawziya.wordpress.com/category/creed-of-ahlul-hadith/

There is another Mursal narration on this issue, Mursal is the type of weak hadith [source of the mursal narration:http://www.islamweb.net/hadith/display_hbook.php?bk_no=970&hid=6273&pid=402748] Mursal narration is not evidence (from Sahaba to majority of the Muhadditheen) see

here: http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/general/263-mursal-hadith-is-not-evidence

3.This is not Mutwatir hadith

Brelvis need mutwatir hadith for their creed but here they are accepting this weak narration for their one of the main creed.

4. If cahin is authentic that does not necessarily mean text is authentic

Haythamee said regarding the hadeeth of Ibne Masood: "tradition had been reported by al- Bazzār and its sub-narrators are all of sahīh" [Majma'-uz-zawā'id (9:24)]

Response is that

Hafiz Noor ud din al-Haythamee himself endorsed the verdicts of Hafiz Al-Bazzar in Kashf al-Astar (Source:http://www.islamweb.net/hadith/display_hbook.php?bk_no=4205&hid=793&pid=560858)

Secondly Hafiz Ibn Katheer says:
" الحكم بالصحة أو الحسن على الإسناد لا يلزم منه الحكم بذلك على المتن ، إذ قد يكون شاذاً أو معللاً "

The fact that the isnaad is deemed to be saheeh or hasan does not necessarily mean that the same applies to the text, because it may be shaadhdh (odd) or mu'allal (faulty). Ikhtisaar 'Uloom al-Hadeeth (p. 43).

See details on this topic: http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/general/173-difference-between-saheeh-hadeeth-and-its-isnaad-is-saheeh

Comment: It is already proven above that the text is odd

5. The hadith is not proving any kind of istegatha

One of the sisters from Multaqa forum replied "Lets say for the sake of argument that the hadith is sound, it is still not evidence for istighathat because it says that our deeds are PRESENTED to them, and according to the type of deed, they make duaa for us, it says nothing about us making duaa to them, asking them for forgiveness or help ....etc. There is no mention of istighatha in those narrations at all."(end quote from multaqa)

So In short

1. Sufiyan is mudallis narrating from (an)
2. Abdul Majeed is mudallis and had very weak memory. Imam Muslim brought him only in mutab'iat not for Ihtijaj.
3. Text of the hadith is very odd(Shadh) and against authentic ahadith.
4. If the chain is authentic that does not mean hadith is authentic plus this hadith is not mutwatir.
5. Hadith has nothing to do with Istegatha

Also see partial English translation of reply by Shaykh Damashqiya here http://ahlalhdeeth.cc/vbe/showthread.php?t=5758
See original post by Shaykh Damashqiya here: http://www.ahlalhdeeth.com/vb/showthread.php?t=147740

BLOCK NO. 37

They quoted

Hadith # 11

As it is reported by ‘Amr bin Shu‘ayb that his grandfather says: we were present in the company of the holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) when messengers from Hawāzin tribe came and said: O Muhammad! We belong to the same origin and tribe, and the trouble we are facing is not hidden from you, therefore, have mercy on us. The holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) replied: opt one of the two choices; either take away your property and wealth or have your women freed. They opted for their women and children. Then the Messenger of Allah (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) added: as far as my share and the share of ‘Abd-ul-Muttalib and his children (in the spoils) is concerned, I have already given it to you. But when I have performed the noon prayer, you should all stand up and say:

"Through the means of the Messenger of Allah (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) we seek help for our women and children from believers (or Muslims)"

The narrator says that when people had finished their prayer, they repeated the same words as the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) had advised them.

Reference

►Nasā’ī, Sunan, book of hibah (gifts) 6:262-3

Our Response

This is the Arabic

وإذا ما أنا صليت الظهر بالناس, فقوموا فقولوا: إنا نستشفع برسول الله إلى المسلمين وبالمسلمين إلى رسول الله في أبنائنا ونسائنا, فسأعطيكم عند ذلك وأسال لكم"

But when I have performed the noon prayer, you should all stand up and say:

"We seek Shafah of Messenger of Allah (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) to Muslims and Muslims seek shafah to Prophet peace be upon him for our children and women. Then I would give you and would intercede.”

This is a proof that asking from living person for Intercession is allowed. Howw are they quoting this as a proof of innovative tawassul as this is our evience against them.

BLOCK NO. 38

They said

The Prophet's supplication through the mediation of his own and other Prophets

Hadith # 12

عن أنس بن مالك قال: لما ماتت فاطمة بنت أسد بن هاشم أم علي رضي الله عنهما

دخل عليها رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فجلس عند رأسها فقال: "رحمك الله يا أمي، كنت أمي بعد أمي، تجوعين وتشبعيني، وتعرين وتكسيني، وتمنعين نفسك طيباً وتطعميني، تريدين بذلك وجه الله والدار الآخرة". ثم أمر أن تغسل ثلاثاً فلما بلغ الماء الذي فيه الكافور سكبه رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم بيده، ثم خلع رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قميصه فألبسها إياه، وكفنها ببرد فوقه، ثم دعا رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم أسامة بن زيد وأبا أيوب الأنصاري وعمر بن الخطاب وغلاماً أسود يحفرون، فحفروا قبرها، فلما بلغوا اللحد حفره رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم بيده وأخرج ترابه بيده، فلما فرغ دخل رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فاضطجع فيه فقال: "الله الذي يحيي ويميت، وهو حي لا يموت، اغفر لأمي فاطمة بنت أسد، ولقنها حجتها، ووسِّع عليها مدخلها بحق نبيك والأنبياء الذين من قبلي فإنك أرحم الراحمين". وكبر عليها أربعاً، وأدخلوها اللحد هو والعباس وأبو بكر الصديق رضي الله عنهم.

رواه الطبراني في الكبير والأوسط، وفيه روح بن صلاح، وثقه ابن حبان والحاكم وفيه ضعف، وبقية رجاله رجال الصحيح

It is narrated by Anas bin Malik. He said: When the mother of 'Ali bin Abu Talib — Fatimah bint Asad bin Hashim — died, Allah's Messenger (Peace Be Upon Him) called on her and sat down by the head of the bed and said, "O dear mother, may Allah have mercy on you. After my mother, you were the one I regarded as my mother. When I was hungry you fed me to the point of saturation while you yourself remained hungry. Then you helped me put on clothes and instead of eating yourself, you gave me nice things to eat. You did all this for Allah's pleasure and for a good reward in the Hereafter." Then he (the Prophet) commanded to bathe her three times. When camphor water was brought, Allah's Messenger (Peace Be Upon Him) poured some water into his

hands. Then Allah's Messenger (Peace Be Upon Him) took off his shirt and clothed her with it and used his own sheet of cloth as her coffin.Then Allah's Messenger (Peace Be Upon Him) sent for Usamah bin Zayd, Abu Ayyub al-Ansari and 'Umar bin al-Khattab and the negro slave to dig up the grave. So they dug her grave. When they reached near the lahd, Allah's Messenger (Peace Be Upon Him) dug it up and drew the soil out with his own hands. When he finished, Allah's Messenger (Peace Be Upon Him) entered and lay down in (the grave), and said, "It is Allah Who controls life and death, and He is Ever living and will never die. **(O Allah,) forgive my mother—Fatimah bint Asad— and help her answer properly at the time of questioning and through the mediation of Your Prophet (Muhammad) and the former prophets, make her grave capacious.** Surely You are infinitely Merciful." Then he repeated, "God is Great" four times (i.e. led the funeral prayer). Then he, 'Abbas and Abu Bakr as-Siddiq lowered her into the grave.

References

►Tabarani Mu'jam Al-Ausat Volume 001, Page Number 67-68, Hadith Number 189 **Click here for Scanned Page(**13**)**

►Ibn Hibbān and Hākim declared him thiqah (trustworthy). Haythamī also cites it in Majma'-uz-zawā'id (9:256-7)

►Ibn-ul-Jawzī in al-'Ilal-ul-mutanāhiyyah (1:268-9#433)

►Abū Nu'aym in Hilyat-ul-awliyā' wa tabaqāt-ul-asfiyā' (3:121)

► Mahmūd Sa'īd Mamdūh graded it hasan (fair) in his Raf'-ul-minārah (pp.147-8).

Our Response:

Defects in Chain

1. This Narration is Munqati (discontinue)
2. Rawh ibin Sallah is alone in Narrating it
3. Rawh ibin Sallah is Weak
4. This hadeeth is weak as Scholars of hadeeth say, it is not authentic even according to Ibne Hibban and Hakim

.

1. This Narration is Munqati (discontinue)

Hafiz Mubashar Hussain Lahori said

Sufiyan Thawri Died in 161 h and Rawh bin Sallah died is 233 h and there is gap of 74 years in between them.... That's why this is powerful point that Rawh bin Sallah never heard from Sufiyan Thawri... Ibn Hibban said regarding the narrator (Rawh bin Sallah) Rawh bin Sallah al-Misree narrates from the people of Egypt, Kitab al Thiqqat vol 8 page 244 and Sufiyan Thawri is Kufi, so it is not proven that Rawh bin Sallah wen to egypt, and Imam Al Mizzi did not mentioned him (Rawh bin Sallah) in students of Sufiyan Thawri
Tawassul wa Ist'ianah Part 2 reply to hadith no 6

Defect no: 2 Rawh bin Sallah is alone in narrating this hadith

a) Tabrani said after quoting this hadith
روح بن صلاح به لم يرو هذا الحديث عن عاصم الأحول إلا سفيان الثوري تفرد

No one narrate this hadeeth from Asim Al ahol except Sufiyan Thawri and Rawh bin Sallah is alone in Narrating this
Al Awsat vol 1 page 68 number 189 (same refrence which they quoted)

b) Abu nuyeem said after quoting this hadeeth
غريب من حديث عاصم والثوري لم نكتبه إلا من حديث روح بن صلاح تفرد به

Hilya tul Auliuyah vol 3 page 121
Both says that Rawh bin sallah is alone in narrating this. So according to those who are making this evidence, They say for creed their should be Mutwatir hadith but not Khabar al wahid so even according to them this is not hujjah.

Defect no: 3 Rawh bin sallah is weak

a) Haythami said
وثقه ابن حبان والحاكم وفيه ضعف وبقية رجاله رجال الصحيح روح بن صلاح وفيه
"chain contains Rawh ibn Sallàh whom Ibn Hibbàn and al-Hàkim declared trustworthy although there is weakness in him, and the rest of its sub-narrators are the men of sound hadïth."[*Majma Az Zawaid Vol 9 page 257]*

b) Ibn e Adi said

There are rejected Narrations in his some ahadeeth[Al kamil ibn e Adyy vol 6 page 146]

c) Darqutni said
He was weak in hadith[**leesan al meezan vol 2 page 465 and al-Mu'talif wal-Mukhtalif (3:1377)]**

d) Ibn al-Jawzï said
تفرد به روح بن صلاح وهو فى عدد المجهولين وقد ضعفه ابن عدى

Rawh bin Sallah is Alone in Narrating this ..Ibne Adi weakened him.[al-'Ilal al-Mutanàhiya page 269 under the Chapter Hadeeth fe Fadhal Fatimah bint Asad]

e) Hafiz Dahabee said regarding this same hadeeth in Talkhees of the book of Ibn e Jozi Al Ilal al Mutanahiya

حديث فى وفاة فاطمة بنت أسد والدة على
فيه: روح بن صلاح واهٍ عن الثورى عن عاصم عن انس

The hadith of death of Fatimah bin Asad the Mother of Ali
In it Rawh bin Sallah is severely weak (who narrates) From Thawri From Asim From Anas ra[**Talkhees al Ilal page 91 no: 218]**

and Hafiz Dahabee said
There are his Munkar Narrations[**Tareekh al Islam 17/160]**

f) Ibn Makula said
They (muhadditheen) weakened him in hadeeth [**al-Ikmàl (5:15)]**

g) Ibn e Yoonas said
قال ابن يونس : رويت عنه مناكير
Rejected narrations are narrated from him[**Quoted by Shaykh Al Bani in Silsilah al daeefah no:23 and Ibne Hajar asqalani in Leesan al Meezan 3/110]**

h) Abu Bakkar Hafiz Al Baghdadi (d 296 h) said

It is our ittefaaq that we will not write ahadeeth of three people, a) Ali bin hasan al Sami, **b) Rawh bin Sallah** and c) Abdul Mun`im bin basheer from the people of egypt [**Sawalaat al Burqani as Sagheer no: 20]**

i) Hafidh Shawkani said
حديث فاطمة بنت أسد ضعيف فيه روح بن صلاح المصري وهو ضعيف

Hadeeth of Fatimah bint Asad is weak In it Rawh bin Sallah Al misree is weak[**Al Durr Al Nazeed fe Ikhilaas Kalima tul Tawheed page 64]**

j) Shaykh Nasir ul din Al bani weakened this hadeeth in Daeefa no: 23
k) Shaykh Zubair Ali Zai weakened in Majallah al hadith no: 76 page 11 and 122

l) Shaykh Abdul Rahman Dosaree also said this hadeeth is weak by saying

يدل على عدم ثبوته هذا الحديث لا يصح دراية ، إذ صيغة متنه وركاكة ألفاظه وما فيه من المبالغة مما زيادة على غرابته ، وما في سنده من الضعف (end)

5. Claim that according to Ibne Hibban and Imam Hakim this hadeeth is Authentic

Soofis rely on Ibne Hibban and Hakim that according to Ibn e Hibban and Hakim Roh bin Sallah is trustworthy

Note that Ibne Hibban and Hakim are Mutasahil as said by Muhadditheen 2ndly even if these people are so rigid then see the Hukam of Ibne Hibban on Sufiyan Thawri and Rawh bin Sallah (Narrators of this hadeeth)

Ibn Hibban said regarding Rawh bin Sallah
روح بن صلاح من اهل مصر روى عن يحي بن ايوب واهل بلده

Rawh bin Sallah who is from the people of Egypt, Narrated from Yahya bin Ayoob and from the people of his city (egypt)**[Kitab al Thiqqat vol 8 page 244]**

Ibne Hibban said "he narrates from the people of his city and Yahya bin Ayoob" but here we can see he is narrating from Sufiyan Thawri who was Kufi not Egyptian, so even according to Ibne Hibban hadeeth is weak.

Ibn e Hibban said regarding Sufiyan Thawri (2nd narrator)

و أمّا المدلسون الذين هم ثقات و عدول فإنا لا نحتج باخبارهم الا ما بينوا السماع في ما رووا مثل الثوري و الاعمش و أبي اسحاق و أضرابهم
الاحسان المجلد 1 الصفحة 161)

Those Mudallis narrators who are reliable Adil but we take only those narrations from them in which they do tasreeh of sama like **Sufiyyan thawri**, Amash and Abu ishaq.(end)

So even according to Ibne Hibban hadeeth is not Authentic because here Sufiyan thawri is narrating from (An) and Mudallis is not Hujjah in his tadlees
And now **Hakim Neshapoori** said regarding Sufiyan Thawri
He(Sufiyan) did tadlees from majhooleen.**(Muarifat Al Uloom Al Hadith page 105)**

It is mentioned in Irshad al-Sari that Suffiyan is mudallis and (un anah) of mudallis is not acceptable.(Irshad Al Sari 1/286)

BLOCK NO. 39

They said

Hadith # 13

am Ibn Hajr al Haythami (rah) wrote a "WHOLE BOOK" on virtues of visiting the grave of Prophet (Peace be upon him) in it he writes:

Amongst the evil deeds of Ibn Taymiyyah, something which nobody before him in this world proclaimed is his rejection of Istighatha (Beseeching for help) and Tawassul through Prophet (salalallaho alaihi wasalam). This Tawassul through Prophet (salallaho alaihi wassalam) is Hassan (fair) in all conditions whether before his creation (i.e. him being sent to the world), after it (i.e. his death), also in this world and on Day of Judgment.

Reference

►Jawhar al Munazzam fi Ziyaratil Qabr il Mukkaram: Page No. 171 **Click here for Scanned Page (9)**

Our Response:

Ibn Hajar Haytamee was a Sufi and staunchly against Ibn Tamiya, **Allama Alousi said regarding Ibn Hajar Haytamee**

Because the books of ibn e hajar are filled with lies and ifteraa.... opinions which have no evidance and dawah of ghair ALLAH, BID`Ah DALAH
[انوار رحمانی ترجمة غاية الامانى 433/2.]

- **Mullah Ali Qari Defending Shaykh Ibn e Tamiyah**

When Ibn Hajar al-Haytami criticized the two Shaykhs of Islam, Ibn Taymiyah and his student Ibn al-Qayyim, a great deal and accused them of describing Allaah in physical terms, likening Him to His creation, and other abhorrent beliefs. But he was refuted by many, who explained the falseness of what he said and demonstrated that the two imams were innocent of any belief that goes against the Qur'aan and Sunnah. One of these scholars was:

Mulla 'Ali Qaari (may Allaah have mercy on him), who said, after quoting Ibn Hajar's accusations against them and his criticism of their 'aqeedah:

أقول صانهما الله – أي : ابن القيم وشيخه ابن تيمية - عن هذه السمة الشنيعة ، والنسبة الفظيعة ، ومن طالع " شرح منازل السائرين " لنديم الباري الشيخ عبد الله الأنصاري قدس الله سره الجلي ، وهو شيخ الإسلام عند الصوفية : تبيَّن له أنهما كانا من أهل السنة والجماعة ، بل ومن أولياء هذه الأمة ، ومما ذكر في الشرح المذكور ما نصه على وفق المسطور
وهذا الكلام من شيخ الإسلام يبين مرتبته من السنَّة ، ومقداره في العلم ، وأنه بريء مما رماه أعداؤه " الجهمية من التشبيه والتمثيل ، على عادتهم في رمي أهل الحديث والسنَّة بذلك ، كرمي الرافضة لهم بأنهم نواصب ، والناصبة بأنهم روافض ، والمعتزلة بأنهم نوابت حشوية ، وذلك ميراث من أعداء رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم في رميه ، ورمي أصحابه بأنهم صبأة ، قد ابتدعوا ديناً محدثاً ، وهذا ميراث لأهل الحديث والسنة من نبيهم بتلقيب أهل الباطل لهم بالألقاب المذمومة

وقدس الله روح الشافعي حيث يقول وقد نسب إلى الرفض

إن كان رفضا حب آل محمد *** فليشهد الثقلان أني رافضي

ورضي الله عن شيخنا أبي العباس بن تيمية حيث يقول

إن كان نصباً حب آل محمد *** فليشهد الثقلان أني ناصبي

وعفا الله عن الثالث – وهو ابن القيم - حيث يقول :

فإن كان تجسيماً ثبوت صفاته *** وتنزيهها عن كل تأويل مفتر

فإني بحمد الله ربي مجسم *** هلموا شهوداً واملئوا كل محضرِ

I say: Allaah protected them – i.e., Ibn al-Qayyim and his Shaykh Ibn Taymiyah – from this abhorrent accusation. The one who studies Sharh Manaazil al-Saa'ireen by Nadeem al-Baari al-Shaykh 'Abd-Allaah al-Ansaari, who is the Shaykh of Islam according to the Sufis, will clearly see that they were among Ahl al-Sunnah wa'l-Jamaa'ah and are indeed among the awliya' (close friends of Allaah) of this ummah. Among what he said in the book mentioned was the following:

"These words of Shaykh al-Islam highlight his position as a prominent scholar of Ahl al-Sunnah, and his status among scholars, and it demonstrates that he is innocent of what his Jahami enemies accused him of, that he likened Allaah to His creation, as they usually accused the scholars of hadeeth and Sunnah, just as the Raafidis accuse them of being Naasibis, and the Naasibis accuse them of being Raafidis,, and the Mu'tazilah accuse them of being **anthropomorphists.** That is a legacy of the enemies of the Messenger of Allaah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) who accused him and his companions of having invented a new religion. And this is a legacy of the scholars of hadeeth and Sunnah from their Prophet, that the people of falsehood give them offensive labels.

May Allaah sanctify the soul of al-Shaafa'i, who said when he was accused of being a Raafidi:

If being a Raafidi means loving the family of Muhammad, then let the two races (of mankind and jinn) bear witness that I am a Raafidi.
May Allaah be pleased with our Shaykh Abu'l-'Abbaas ibn Taymiyah when he said:

If being a Naasibi means loving the family of Muhammad, then let the two races (of mankind and jinn) bear witness that I am a Naasibi.

May Allaah forgive the third – Ibn al-Qayyim – when he said:

If being an anthropomorphist means affirming the divine attributes and regarding them as being above the interpretation of a liar,
Then praise be to Allaah, I am an anthropomorphist; bring your witnesses." **[Mirqaah al-Mafaateeh by al-Mulla 'Ali Qaari (8/146, 147). (from islam qa)]**

Even Ibn Hajar Haytami went against stances of these brailwis and followers of keller, **He said**

ونظير ذلك فعل كثير عند ذكر مولده (صلى الله عليه وسلم) ووضع أمه له من القيام وهو أيضاً بدعة لم يرد فيه شيء على أن الناس إنما يفعلون ذلك تعظيماً له (صلى الله عليه وسلم) فالعوام معذورون لذلك بخلاف الخواص

And example of this is the practice of Many people stand at the time of dhikr and mawlid of Rasool Allah peace be upon him. This is an innovation because there is no hadith mentioned regarding this issue. Even if people do it in veneration of him (peace be upon him) But the lay people can be excused because they don't know. But specials (scholars) can not be excused/ [Fatawa Hadithiya page no: 60 under the heading مطلب في أن القيام في أثناء مولده الشريف بدعة لا ينبغي فعلها]

http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/milaad/2000020-mawlid-quotes-of-scholars-quoted-by-brailwis

BLOCK NO. 40

They quoted

Imam Ibn Hajr Asqalani

Imam Ibn Hajr Asqalani proving Yahyah Bin Yahya research said this proves Imam Ibn Hajr and Imam Hakim (rah) Belief (aqida) that going to tombs of Awliyas and asking through their Intercession is allowed. Ibn Hajr (rah) Writes: Imam Hakim (rah) said that he heard Abu Ali Nishapori that he said that I was in extreme depression that I saw Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) in

my dream he said that go to grave of Yahya bin Yahya (rah) and do Istaghfar and ask for help through his Intercession your problem will be solved. Abu Ali Nishapori said I did like that and my problem was solved in the morning. [Ibn Hajr, Tahdhib ut-Tahdhib Volume 004, Page 398]

Our Response:

- This is just and Hikayah we need chain of this saying, if we take it literally then that means the grave of Yahya bin yahya ra was better then the grave of Rasool Allah peace be upon him (naudhubillah) which we can not agree.
  Hafidh Ibne Hajar asqalani said (لكنه لا يستعاذ الا بالله أو بصفة من صفات ذاته)
  There is no seeking refuge but only to Allah and from the attributes of his dhaat. Fath ul Bari Kitab al Eman Ch 12
  Scan:http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAAOLgbwnm_2YRDCuteLmQTGvf5L50xpa8nw8HZjUtUJ2KO5PlWqRWlfqpahIzOcKLqMzXz2f8jUN3dYRZokFIpwAm1T1UKgDqEA2JqnJ01MhfS3Rp7n2T1Rm.jpg

- Ibne Hajar Asqalani RA said:

  قال نعيم بن حماد في الرد على الجهمية : دلت هذه الأحاديث يعني الواردة في الاستعاذة بأسماء الله وكلماته) والسؤال بها مثل أحاديث الباب وحديث عائشة وأبي سعيد بسم الله أرقيك وكلاهما عند مسلم وفي الباب عن عبادة وميمونة وأبي هريرة وغيرهم عند النسائي وغيره بأسانيد جياد على أن القرآن غير مخلوق إذ لو كان مخلوقاً لم يستعذ بها ، إذ لا يستعاذ بمخلوق ، قال الله تعالى (فاستعذ بالله) ، وقال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم : وإذا استعذت فاستعذ بالله)Fathul Bari Kitab at Tawheed ch 13
  ..."There is no Seeking refuge in creation !" Allah says (ask help from Allah) and Prophet peace be upon him said (If you want to ask, ask from Allah)
  Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAAoW5KzjflpPgydRzLE12JjFtDqi38gy-5bBFQ0OU77y3BNdgrQNjDx_qWvorpfG2HmDT7pj38B92MY1aAgAC4UAm1T1UMukXxDRBJD-zRM-78n8vYVaoW6-.jpg

- Ibn Rajab says:

  وكذلك التبرك بالآثار، فإنما كان يفعله الصحابة مع النبي-صلى الله عليه وسلم- ولم يكونوا يفعلونه مع " بعضهم.. ولا يفعله التابعون مع الصحابة، مع علو قدرهم فدل على أن هذا لا يُفعل إلا مع النبي -صلى الله عليه وسلم- مثل التبرك بوضوئه، وفضلاته، وشعره، وشرب فضل شرابه وطعامه.

وفي الجملة فهذه الأشياء فتنة للمعظّم وللمعظّم لما يخشى عليه من الغلو المدخل في البدعة ، وربما يترقى إلى نوع من الشرك . كل هذا إنما جاء من التشبه بأهل الكتاب والمشركين الذي نهيت عنه هذه الأمة .
وفي الحديث الذي في السنن : " ان من إجلال الله إكرام ذي الشيبة المسلم ، والسلطان المقسط ، وحامل القرآن غير الغالي فيه والجافي عنه " . فالغلو من صفات النصارى ، والجفاء من صفات اليهود ، والقصد هو المأمور به .

وقد كان السلف الصالح ينهون عن تعظيمهم غاية النهي كأنس الثوري وأحمد . وكان أحمد يقول : من أنا حتى تجيئون إلى ؟ اذهبوا اكتبوا الحديث ، وكان إذا سئل عن شيء ، يقول : سلوا العلماء . وإذا سئل عن شيء من الورع يقول : أنا لا يحل لي أن أتكلم في الورع ، لو كان بشر حياً تكلم في هذا .

وسئل مرة عن الإخلاص فقال : اذهب إلى الزهاد ، إي شيء نحن تجيء إلينا ؟ وجاء إليه رجل فمسح يده ثيابه ومسح بهما وجهه ، فغضب الإمام أحمد وأنكر ذلك أشد الإنكار وقال : عمن أخذتم هذا الأمر ؟

"Although the Companions sought tabarruk with the Prophet, peace be upon him, they never did so with each other. Nor did the Tabi'un do so with the Companions, despite their tremendous rank..... This shows that it is not to be done; it could also evolve into shirk. All of this constitutes imitation of the People of the Book and the Mushriks which this ummah has been forbidden from ...A man came to him(Imam Ahmad) and he wiped his hands on his clothes, And wiped his face, Imam Ahmad became angry and denied that of the most denial and said: from whom you have learnt this?[الحكم الجديرة بالإذاعة. Page 46 and 47] Scan Proof

Plus there is a dream in the narration which are not evidence.

Dreams are not evidence in religion

a) Hafidh Ibne Katheer said

إنه كان من الصالحين أنه رأى النبي صلى الله وقد ذكر الحافظ بن عساكر في ترجمة أحمد بن كثير وقال عليه وسلم وأبا بكر وعمر وهابيل، أنه استحلف هابيل ان هذا دمه فحلف له وذكر أنه سأل الله تعالى أن يجعل هذا المكان يستجاب عنده الدعاء فأجابه إلى ذلك وصدقه في ذلك رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم وقال وهذا منام لو صح عن أحمد بن كثير هذا لم إنه وأبا بكر وعمر يزورون هذا المكان في كل يوم خميس يترتب عليه حكم شرعي والله أعلم

Hafidh Ibne Asakir mentioned in the Biography of Ahmad bin Katheer, he said he was in Pious People and he saw Prophet peace be upon him,Abu bakar RadhiAllahanho, Omar RadhiAllahAnho and Habeel (and after quoting whole dream he said) هذا لم يترتب عليه حكم شرعي والله أعلم that is it is not Ruling of Shariy`ah. **Al Bidaya Wal Nihaya vol 1 Page 105 and 106**

b) Imam Nawawi said:

فَرْعٌ} لَوْ كَانَتْ لَيْلَةُ الثَّلَاثِينَ مِنْ شَعْبَانَ وَلَمْ يَرَ النَّاسُ الْهِلَالَ فَرَأَى إنْسَانٌ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فِي { الْمَنَامِ فَقَالَ لَهُ اللَّيْلَةُ أَوَّلُ رَمَضَانَ لَمْ يَصِحَّ الصَّوْمُ بِهَذَا الْمَنَامِ لَا لِصَاحِبِ الْمَنَامِ وَلَا لِغَيْرِهِ ذَكَرَهُ الْقَاضِي حسين فِي الْفَتَاوَى وَآخَرُونَ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا وَنَقَلَ الْقَاضِي عِيَاضٌ الْإِجْمَاعَ عَلَيْهِ وَقَدْ قَرَّرْتُهُ بِدَلَائِلِهِ فِي أَوَّلِ شَرْحِ صَحِيحِ مُسْلِمٍ

''Fara': If the night is thirteenth night of Sha'baan, and people don't find. (the moon never appeared). And if a person saw the Prophet, may the mercy and blessing of Allah be upon him, in dream. And the Prophet inform him (in dream), ''this night is first of Ramadhan.'' Then the fast is not right, neither for the person who saw the dream nor for other. This is mentioned by Qadhi Husain and others. And Qadhi Iyadh has mentioned the Ijma' (consensus) on this. I have collected the proofs for it in First of ''Sharh Sahih Muslim''**['Al-Majmoo' Sharh al-Muhaddhab']**

Source: http://www.islamweb.net/newlibrary/display_book.php?ID=2517&start=0&idfrom=3857&idto=3857&bookid=14&Hashiya=10

c) Ibn Hajar said

فالذي في الخبر رؤيا منام فلا حجة

The dream in this hadith is not evidence **[Fathul Baari :Vol 9 Page 145]**

source: http://islamww.com/bookswww/pg.php?b=1926&pageID=5114

d) Al Aine`ee

فالذي في الخبر رؤيا منام فلا حجة فيه

The dream in this hadith is not evidence **[Umda tul Qari under same Athar of Thobiya]**

e) Kirmani said

الرؤيا ليست بدليل

Dream is not evidence

f) Hafidh Al Iraqi Said

أنه لو أخبر صادق عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في النوم بحكم شرعي مخالف لما تقرر في الشريعة لم نعتمده

If any truthful gives the information of Shariyah that Prophet(pbuh) told him in dream, which is against the Shariyah then we would not rely on that dream. **[طرح التثريب ص 215 / 8].**

Comment: Meaning if some one say Prophet peace be upon him told me this and this in the dream, but in reality the sayings of Prophet peace be upon him in the dream is against actual sayings mentioned in ahadeeth, then we will reject the dream of the person

g) Hafidh Shatib`ee Said

وربما قال بعضهم : رأيت النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في النوم ، فقال لي كذا وأمرني بكذا ، فيعمل بها ويترك بها معرضاً عن الحدود الموضوعة في الشريعة ، وهو خطأ ، لأن الرؤيا من غير الأنبياء لا يحكم بها شرعاً على حال إلا أن تعرض على ما في أيدينا من الأحكام الشرعية ، فإن سوغتها عمل بمقتضاها ، وإلا وجب تركها والإعراض عنها ،

And sometimes some people say i have seen prophet(pbuh) in a dream, prophet(pbuh) has said these things to me, he has given me orders of these things, and he starts practicing on it and due to this he leaves the boundaries of Islamic law and this is a mistake because dream of non-prophet's on any issue cannot be included under part of Islamic law and we cannot reject the Islamic law which is with us. It is obligatory that the the dreams which clashes with the shariyah has to be left and rejected.
Al Aites`aam PAGE 184

If they really want to believe on the dream of this unknown person then what about this?

6. If the dreams are evidence then what about these dreams?

Dream 1) Ibne Kathir mentioned

وقال ابن عساكر: حدثنا أبو الفضل محمد بن محمد بن الفضل بن المظفر العبدي قاضي البحرين من لفظه وكتبه لي بخطه - قال: رأيت يزيد بن معاوية في النوم فقلت له: أنت قتلت الحسين؟
فقال: لا!
فقلت له: هل غفر الله لك؟
قال: نعم، وأدخلني الجنة.

Ibne Athakir said: Abul Fadhal Muhammad bin Fadhal bin al-Muzaffar al-Abdi who is judge in Behrain told me in the letter. He saw Yazeed bin Muawiyah in the dream. I asked him: Did you kill hussain? Yazeed said No. I asked Allah saved you? He said "Yes" Allah sent me in the paradise. [Al Bidaya wal Nihaya

vol 16 page no: 299 under the Tarjuma of Yazeed bin Muawiyah]
Comment: I have seen people quoting their dreams and the dreams of sufis and they act upon them. Above dream is also the dream of a pious person. What will they do regarding this? Specially brelvis of Pakistan who are staunch against Yazeed bin Muawiyah.

Dream 2) Imam Abu Jafar Ahmad bin Ishaq said "I was on the madhab of people of Iraq. I saw Prophet peace be upon him in dream, he was praying and doing Rafayadain in first takbeer, in rukoo and after rukoo.[Sunan Darqutni hadeeth no: 1112]

Comment: Now what will they do specially Sufis of Pakistan (brelvis), They take evidences from too many dreams. Will they practice of rafayadain in Salah?

Dream 3) Ibne Kathir mentioned another dream regarding Yazeed

فرأت أمه في المنام أنه خرج منها قمر من قُبلها، فقصّت رؤياها على أمها فقالت: إن صدقت رؤياك لتلدن من يبايع له بالخلافة.

His mother saw in dream that she delivered the moon. She narrated her dream to her mother, Her mother said: If your dream is true then surely you will deliver the one who will be the khalifah [Al Bidaya wal Nihaya Vol 16 page 288 biography of Yazeed bin Muawiyah]

Dream 4) Imam Muhammad bin Hammad Rahimullah said

" رَأَيْتُ النَّبِيّ صلى الله عليه وسلم فِي المنام، فَقُلْتُ: يَا رَسُولَ اللهِ، مَا تَقُولُ فِي النظر في كلام أبي حنيفة وأصحابه، وأنظر فيها وأعمل عليها؟ قال: لا، لا، لا، ثلاث مرات. قلت: فما تقول في النظر في حديثك وحديث أصحابك، أنظر فيها وأعمل عليها؟ قال: نعم، نعم، نعم ثلاث مرات. ثم قلت: يَا رَسُولَ الله ، عَلِّمْنِي دُعَاءً أَدْعُو بِهِ، فعلمني دعاء وقاله لي ثلاث مرات، فلما استيقظت نسيته."

I saw Prophet peace be upon him in my dream. I asked O Messenger of Allah: What do you say regarding the seeing the kalam of Abu Hanifa and his companions? Can i see and practice that? He (peace be upon him) said three times NO, NO, NO. Then i asked what do you say regarding seeing your hadith and hadith of your companions? Can i see and practice upon that? He (peace be upon him) said three times, YES, YES YES. Then i asked that teach me a prayer so that i can pray that. Then he taught me a dua and repeated three times but when i woke up I forgot the dua.[Tareekh Baghdad 13/403]

I hope the matter is clear for those who are seeking the truth.

See this article which is a sowrd against these brailwiya and keller clan
http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/aqeedah/192-creed-of-ibn-e-hajar-asqalani-versus-ghali-soofiyah

BLOCK NO. 41

They said

Imam Nawawi says in "Majmu" (8/274):

قال الإمام النووي في المجموع (ج274/8) كتاب صفة الحج، باب زيارة قبر الرسول صلى الله عليه وسلم: "ثم يرجع إلى موقفه الأول قُبالة وجه رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلّم (((ويتوسل به))) في حق نفسه ويستشفع به إلى ربه".

Imam al Nawawi (rah) said in his Majmu (8/274) the book of description of Hajj, chapter of "Visiting the grave of Prophet (Peace be upon him): The one visiting should stand by facing towards the face of Prophet (Peace be upon him) **and make him a means (tawassul) and seek his wasilah as intercession (shafa'at) towards the Lord.**

Our Response:

- Imam Nawawi is not spreading the message like brailwis do, let me provide another great Imam to clear the stance of Imam Nawawi and meaning of tawassul through Prophet. **Ibn Qudama says the following:**

اللهم إنك قلت وقولك الحق : { ولو أنهم إذ ظلموا أنفسهم جاءوك فاستغفروا الله واستغفر لهم الرسول لوجدوا الله توابا رحيما } . وقد أتيتك مستغفرا من ذنوبي ، مستشفعا بك إلى ربي ، أن توجب فأسألك يا رب لي المغفرة ، كما أوجبتها لمن أتاه في حياته ، اللهم اجعله أول الشافعين

O ALLAH You spoke and your word is true"And if they had come to you, when they had wronged their souls, and asked forgiveness of Allah, and the Messenger also had asked forgiveness for them, they (on the basis of this means and intercession) would have found Allah the Granter of repentance, extremely Merciful"(Surah an-Nisa verse 64) I came to you after I have had asked for forgiveness of my sins and seeking your intercession with your Lord. So I ask you, O Allah! To grant me your forgiveness, just as you granted it for those who came to him when he was alive. O Allah! Make him the first of all intercessors..."[alMughni Vol 3 Kitab al-Hajj]

It is clear that Ibn Qudama is making du'a to Allah directly, and there is absolutely nothing wrong with this, let alone it be bid'a or Shirk. For more information see this:http://www.ahlalhdeeth.com/vbe/showthread.php?t=14758

Allah I ask you through your Prophet peace be upon him means Tawassul with Iman in him (peace be upon him), obedience to him(peace be upon him), love for him (peace be upon him), salam on him(peace be upon him), or with his du'a and his shafa'ah, which is from his actions or actions of worship ordered for his right, this is legislated by consensus', and this is from Wasilah ordered " And Seek Wasilah to Him" This is also said by Ibn Tamiya and agreed by Imam Mardawi in his alInsaaf

Shaykh Abdul Qadir Jelani was about to die and he adviced his son by saying.
ولا تخف أحدًا ولا ترجه، وكِل الحوائج كلها إلى الله عز وجل، واطلبها منه، ولا تثق بأخد سوى الله عزوجل ولا تعتمد إلا عليه سبحانه التوحيد التوحيد التوحيد وجماع الكل التوحيد
Don't fear anyone and don't hope anyone, and address all your needs to Allah alone, seek your need from him.. and do not depend on anyone other than Allah atTawheed, atTawheed, atTawheed.[Fath al-Rabbani page 373]

BLOCK NO. 42

They Quoted

Imam Bayhaqi

[Hadith Number 3879] Abu Ishaq al-Qarshi (ra) narrates that there was a man with us in Madina. Whenever he used to see any bad deed which he was not capable of stop with his hand, he used to go to the grave of Prophet (Peace be upon him) and say: O the inhabitants of Qabr i.e. Prophet and Sahaba (Abu Bakr and Umar) and our helpers please look towards our state. --- [Hadith Number 3880] Abu Harb Hilali (ra) narrates that one Arabi performed Hajj and then came to the door of Prophet's Mosque. He tied his camel there and enter the mosque till he reached the grave of Prophet (Peace be upon him). He stood at the feet of Prophet (Peace be upon him) and said: Peace be upon you

O Prophet, then he offered greetings to Abu Bakr and Umar (Ridhwan Allaho Ajmain), he then turned towards the Prophet again and said: O Messenger of Allah, May my parents be taken ransom for you, I have come in your court because I am filled with sins and mistakes, so that I can make you a waseela infront of Allah so that you can intercede for me, because Allah has said in his Book: And We have not sent any Messenger but that he must be obeyed by the Command of Allah. And, (O Beloved,) if they, having wronged their souls, had come to you imploring the forgiveness of Allah and the Messenger (blessings and peace be upon him) had also asked forgiveness for them, then (owing to this mediation and intercession) they would certainly have found Allah Most Relenting, Ever-Merciful. (Quran 4/64)" Then he turned towards a big group of Sahaba while saying: O best of those who are buried in deep""And from whose fragrance the depth and the height have become sweet" "May I be the ransom for a grave which thou inhabit" "And in which are found purity, bounty and munificence!"
[Shuab ul Iman Volume 006, Page No. 60 Hadith Number 3879-80]

Our Response

This is a narration quoted by Imam alBayhaqi not his own sayings Al Hafidh Ibn e Hajar asqalani RA said

بل أكثر المحدثين في الأعصار الماضية من سنة مائتين وهلم جراً إذا ساقوا الحديث بإسناده اعتقدوا أنهم برئوا من عهدته

In fact most of the muhadditheen after the era of 200 h mentioned hadith with chains, according to them they were acquitted of the charge [Lisan al Meezan under the Tarjumah of Suleman bin Ahmad bin Ayyub Tabrani 3/75]

- And regarding these fabrications Imam al Muhaddith Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Abdul-Haadee (705h to 744 h) said.

بعضهم ذكرها التي الحكاية هذه" :
1- إسناد بلا العتبي عن يرويها .
2- الهلالي حرب بن محمد عن يرويها وبعضهم.
3- الأعرابي عن الزعفراني الحسن أبي عن حرب بن محمد عن يرويها وبعضهم.
4-
أبو حدثني البصري، يزيد بن روح بن محمد عن مظلم بإسناد الإيمان شعب كتاب في البيهقي ذكرها وقد

ثم فعقلها راحلته أناخ وسلم عليه الله صلى الله رسول بابمسجد إلى جاء فلما أعرابي حج :قال الهلالي حرب .تقدم ما نحو ذكر ثم ، القبر أتى حتى دخل

"This incident as some people have mentioned and have narrated it from Utba without a chain, some narrate it from Muhammad bin Harb al-Hilaalee and some from Muhammad bin Harb from Abul-Hasan Za'afaraanee and he from the bedouin arab. Biahaqee has transmitted in Shu'bal Eemaan with a defective chain from Muhammad bin Rooh bin Yazeed Basree who said mentioned to me Abu Harb al-Hilaahee and then he mentioned the narration as above.(as-Saarim al Munkee pg.246)

- Hafidh Al Bayhaqi said that Allah says: (وَقُلْ رَّبِّ أَعُوذُ بِكَ مِنْ هَمَزَاتِ الشَّيـطِينِ - وَأَعُوذُ بِكَ رَبِّ أَن يَحْضُرُونِ) وقال عزوجل (فَاسْتَعِذْ بِاللَّهِ مِنَ الشَّيْطَـنِ الرَّجِيمِ)

ولا يصح أن يستعيذبمخلوق من مخلوق ، فدل أنه استعاذ بصفة من صفات ذاته ، وأمر أن يستعاذ بصفة من صفات ذاته ، وهي غير مخلوقة كما أمره الله تعالى أن يستعيذ بذاته ، وذاته غير مخلوق

[23:97] And say, "My Lord, I seek refuge in You from the incitements of the devils,[23:98] And I seek refuge in You, my Lord , lest they be present with me." and Allah says [16:98]seek refuge with Allah from Shaytan, the outcast. And it is not correct that the creation would seek refuge from other creation, This verse is the evidence that one who seeks refuge should seek refuge from the attributes of Allah, And He (Allah) ordered that seek refuge from the attributes of him, His attributes are not creation like Allah orderd to seek refuge from his dhaat and his dhaat is not creation[Asma wal siffat page 183]
Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAJvFgX1sp8VZX9zS2R_K6LrPIhj8WGfCnqlA0pSh6GaAWhA-e5eU5eRlshYni0EjgO5UYTGOT0KQkm2NZ9G5BLYAm1T1UFva9j12i252_aqkZAcLxNfvNczB.jpg

- al-Imaam Birqivi al-Hanafi says in Ziayarah al qaboor

فزيارة القبور لأجل الصلاة عندها والطواف بها وتقبيلها واستلامها وتعفير الخدود عليها وأخذ ترابها ودعاء أ صحابها والاستعانة بهم، وسؤالهم النصر والرزق والعافية والولد وقضاء الديون وتفريج الكربات وإغاثةاللهف ات وغير ذلك من الحاجات، التي كان عباد الأوثان يسألونها من أوثانهم، فليس شيء من ذلك مشروعًا باتفاق أئمة المسلمين إذ لم يفعله رسول الله ولا أحد من الصحابة والتابعين وسائر أئمة الدين، بل أصلهذه الزيارة البد عية الشركية مأخوذة من عباد الأصنام

"Visiting graves to offer prayers by them, circumambulate them, kiss them, carry out their istilam, to rub cheeks on them, take their dust, to supplicate to the occupants [of the grave], seek their aid [isti'ana], ask from them help, sustenance, well being, children, fulfillment of debts, removal of difficulties, help with sorrows and other needs which the worshippers of idols used to ask their idols. None of this is sanctioned in Shari'ah, according to the consensus of the Imams of the Muslims, as the Messenger of Allah and none of the Companions and Followers and the imams of the faith did this. Rather, the basis of this polytheistic, bid'ati visit has been derived from the worshippers of statutes!"

Source: http://islamport.com/w/aqd/Web/4782/21.htm
Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAFf9T70v0MFH0oatDDyPG90nl0pcUw2gyVvsuKnLNT7XJJ7nXcYj47NkQzCR0vZ2uVO-0psSjJYJjbx0hrxkYhYAm1T1UKdGr3u5Z9_GMoxw4fiD4IvEOQJf.jpg

BLOCK NO. 42

They said

Al-Hafidh Ibn Hibban

مات على بن موسى الرضا بطوس من شربة سقاه إياها المأمون فمات من ساعته وذلك في يوم السبت) "... آخر يوم سنة ثلاث ومائتين وقبره بسناباذ خارج النوقان مشهور يزار بجنب قبر الرشيد، قد زرته مرارا كثيرة وما حلت بي شدة في وقت مقامي بطوس فزرت قبر على بن موسى الرضا صلوات الله على جده وعليه ودعوت الله إزالتها عنى إلا أستجيب لي وزالت عنى تلك الشدة وهذا شيء جربته مرارا فوجدته كذلك (أماتنا الله على محبة المصطفى وأهل بيته صلى الله عليه وعليهم أجمعين

Ibn Hibban (rah) relates his own account of going to Al-Ridha's (rah) grave, performing Tawassul through him and states that whenever "I was afflicted with a problem during my stay in Tus, I would visit the grave of Ali bin Musa (Allah (SWT)'s blessings be upon his grandfather and him) and ask Allah (SWT) to relieve me of that problem and it (my dua) would be answered and the problem alleviated. And this is something I did, and found to work, many times

[Ibn Hibban, Kitab uth-Thiqat Volume 008, Page No. 456-7 #14411]

Our Response:

- Al-Hafidh Ibn Hibban said

مات على بن موسى الرضا بطوس من شربة سقاه إياها المأمون فمات من ساعته وذلك في يوم السبت) "...
آخر يوم سنة ثلاث ومائتين وقبره بسناباذ خارج النوقان مشهور يزار بجنب قبر الرشيد، قد زرته مرارا
كثيرة وما حلت بي شدة في وقت مقامي بطوس فزرت قبر على بن موسى الرضا صلوات الله على جده
وعليه ودعوت الله إزالتها عنى إلا أستجيب لي وزالت عنى تلك الشدة وهذا شيء جربته مرارا فوجدته كذلك
(أماتنا الله على محبة المصطفى وأهل بيته صلى الله عليه وعليهم أجمعين

"I was afflicted with a problem during my stay in Tus, I would visit the grave of Ali bin Musa (Allah (SWT)'s blessings be upon his grandfather and him) and ask Allah (SWT) to relieve me of that problem and it (my dua) would be answered and the problem alleviated. And this is something I did, and found to work, many times[Ibn Hibban, Kitab uth-Thiqat Volume 008, Page No. 456-7 #14411]

Comment: May Allah bless Imam Ibn Hibban he only asked Allah he never said O Ali bin Musa Aid me or help me, he said “he asked help from Allah.” And he was already in the city of Tus so there was no special travelling to the grave.

Note: Ibn Hibban mentioned Imam Abu Hanifa ra is Kitab al Majroheen, even though we do not agree Ibn Hibban there but we want the opinion of this so called ahlus-sunna who use Imam Ibn Hibban for wrong purposes and accuse him when he criticized their Imam.

- Fakhrudin Ar-Razi in the Tafsir of verse 18 of surah yunus mentioned different sayings of scholars about how the Mushriks took idols as intermediary towards Allah, and he mentioned in fourth explanation:

أنهم وضعوا هذه الأصنام والأوثان على صور أنبيائهم وأكابرهم، وزعموا أنهم متى اشتغلوا بعبادة هذه التماثيل، فإن أولئك الأكابر تكون شفعاء لهم عند الله تعالى، ونظيره في هذا الزمان اشتغال كثير من الخلق بتعظيم قبور الأكابر، على اعتقاد أنهم إذا عظموا قبورهم فإنهم يكونون شفعاء لهم عند الله.

"They built these statues and idols upon the forms of their Prophets and leaders (Akabir), and they believed that when they would worship these idols, then these leaders (Akabir) would become intercessors for them in front of Allah. And what is similar to this in our times is the veneration (ta'zeem) of a lot of people among the creation of the graves of their leaders (Akabir), with the belief that if they venerate their graves, then they (leaders) will be intercessors for them in front of Allah."

Scan:http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAEhQIQ2Ii37z5kS3mwpgnEbAR392RBP7LycI-

Cyx_2Qb1NX6_9JuPpafG4kovMb7JVH9xQ4Z7UKpr8rOEJjXfJEAm1T1UFVtMnKxQVLj6egMolGIoM88zljD.jpg

BLOCK NO.43

They said

Intermediation through Allah's favourites in the jungle

Hadith # 14

'Abdullāh bin Mas'ūd has narrated that the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) said:

When you lose your means of transport in a jungle, you should call: O creatures of Allah! Help me, recover my transport! O creatures of Allah! Help me, recover my transport! There are many of Allah's creatures on this earth. They will help you recover it.

References

►Tabarānī narrated it in al-Mu'jam-ul-kabīr (10:217#10518)

► Abū Ya'lā, Musnad (9:177)

► Ibn-us-Sunnī, 'Amal-ul-yawm wal-laylah (p.162#502)

► Haythamī, Majma'-uz-zawā'id (10:132)

►Ibn Hajar 'Asqalānī in al-Matālib-ul-'āliyah (3:239#3375).

Our Response

Even though **Imaam Haythami in Majmau Zawaid said:**

رواه أبو يعلى والطبراني وزاد : " سيحبسه عليكم " . وفيه معروف بن حسان وهو ضعيف

Narrated by Abu Yala and Tabrani with more wordings "They will help you recover it." and in it M`aroof bin Hisaan who is Weak

But even if we consider it authentic then it is not about dead. Let us see what Ibn Abbas ra has to say about this, **Words from Shoaib ul Emaan (Moquf Rout)**

أخبرنا علي بن أحمد بن عبدان ثنا أحمد بن عبيد الصفار ثنا عبيد بن شريك ثنا بن أبي مريم ثنا عبد الله بن فروخ أخبرني أسامة بن زيد حدثني أبان بن صالح عن مجاهد عن بن عباس قال إن لله عز وجل ملائكة سوى الحفظة يكتبون ما سقط من ورق الشجر فإذا أصاب أحدكم عرجة بأرض فلاة فليناد أعينوا عباد الله يرحمكم الله تعالى

Translation: Ibne Abbas said: 'Indeed Allah possesses **Angels besides the Hafazah** (the Angels of Protection) who write (of even) the leaf which falls from a tree so when one of you suffers a limp in a deserted land he should call "Assist (me) O slaves of Allah

.

So Angels are meant from this hadith, Imam Abdullah bin Mubarak rejected this hadith because he did not have authentic chain, but Imam Ahmad acted upon this.

Above athar truely goes with the Quran as Allah says (13:10. It is the same (to Him) whether any of you conceals his speech or declares it openly, whether he be hid by night or goes forth freely by day.) (11. For him (each person), **there are angels in succession, before and behind him. They guard him by the command of Allah**. Verily, Allah will not change the (good) condition of a people as long as they do not change their state (of goodness) themselves. But when Allah wills a people's punishment, there can be no turning it back, and they will find besides Him no protector.)

Shaykh Muhammad Saalih al-Munajjid said

The commentator on the Qur'aan who had the best understanding of it, Ibn 'Abbaas, explained that the mu'aqqibaat [translated here as "angels in succession"] **refers to the angels whom Allaah has appointed to guard man from in front and from behind.** When the decree of Allaah comes – when He decrees that some accident or calamity etc. should befall him – the angels withdraw from him.

Mujaahid said: There is no person who does not have **an angel appointed to protect him** when he is asleep and when he is awake, from the jinn, men and wild beasts. There is nothing that comes to him but the angels tell it to clear off, except for that which Allaah grants permission for it to befall him.[Islamqa fatwa no: 6523]

Hammad bin nasr al Muammar said (he is also one of the students of Shaykh Muhammad bin Abdul Wahhaab), in Durr- ar-Saniyyah one of the articles

أن يقال: إن صح الحديث فلا دليل فيه على دعاء الميت والغائب؛ فإن الحديث ورد في أذكار السفر; ومعناه: أن الإنسان إذا انفلتت دابته وعجز عنها، فقد جعل الله عبادا من عباده الصالحين، أي صالحي الجن أو الملائكة،

If its said :that this hadeeth is saleel there is no daleel in to make Dua to dead or to one who is absent, as this hadeeth is reocred in the supplications related to travel , meaning that when a person looses his vehicle, **as Allah has make slaves among his pious slaves that is pious Jinn and Angels to retrieve it .....**

A little later he says.

فإن هؤلاء عباد لله أحياء، قد
جعل الله لهم قدرة على ذلك، كما جعل الله للإنس. فهو ينادي من يسمع ويعين بنفسه ويرى بعينه، كما ينادي أصحابه الذين معه من الإنس. فأين هذا من الاستغاثة بأهل القبور؟! بل هذا من جنس ما يجوز طلبه من الأحياء

As these are among the salves who are alive , Allah has made them capable for that for Allah has made them for men , who when they hear the sound would help him and see him , just like a companion with him among the men who hears him , Where is the seeking help of the Ahlul Quboorees in this ?Rather this is a form in which its peremitted to seeking help from the alive.

BLOCK NO. 44

They said

Hadith #15

وعن أبي هريرة قال: سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلّم يقول: والّذي نَفْسُ أبي القاسِمِ بِيَدِهِ لَيَنْزِلَنَّ عيسى ابنُ مَريمَ إمَاماً مُقْسِطاً، وَحَكَماً عَدْلاً، فَلَيَكْسِرَنَّ الصَّلِيْبَ، وَيَقْتُلَنَّ الخِنْزِيرَ، وَلَيُصْلِحَنَّ ذَاتَ البَيْنِ، وَلَيُذْهِبَنَّ الشَّحْنَاءَ، وَلَيَعْرُضَنَّ المَالَ فَلا يَقْبَلهُ أَحَدٌ، ثُمَّ لَئِنْ قَامَ على قَبْرِي فَقَالَ: يَا مُحَمَّدُ لأجِيْبَنَّهُ

قلت: هو في الصحيح باختصار .
رواه أبو يعلى ورجاله رجال الصحيح

Translation: Narrated Abu Hurayra I heard the Prophet say: "By the one in Whose hand is Abu al-Qasim's soul,"ISA IBN MARYAM SHALL DESCEND" as a just and wise ruler. He shall destroy the cross, slay the swine, eradicate discord and grudges, and money shall be offered to him but he will not accept it. **Then he shall stand at my grave side and say: Ya Muhammad! and I will answer him.** (Abu Ya`la relates it with a**sound (sahih) chain** in his Musnad Volume No. 11, Page No. 462, (Dar al-Ma'mun ed. 1407/1987)]; al-Haythami says in Majma` al-zawa'id (8:5), Chapter entitled: "`Isa ibn Maryam's Descent": "Its sub-narrators are the men of sound (sahih) hadith")

Imam Nur ud-din al-Haythami (rah) said of that hadith:

رواه أبو يعلى ورجاله رجال الصحيح

Translation: It is Narrated by Abu Ya'la and **"ALL ITS RIJAAL ARE THOSE OF SAHIH"** [Majma az Zawaid Volume 8, Page No. 387, Hadith No. 13813]

Our Response:

This hadith is not authentic because of Abdullah Ibn Wahab who is Mudallis and narrating from (an). And if we consider it authentic then what this hadith (if authentic) have to do with innovative Tawassul? Isa aleh salam is not asking from prophet for help neither he is making him waseela. Leave a side Isa aleh salam who was a Prophet of Allah Messenger of Allaah (peace be upon him) said:

مَا مِنْ أَحَدٍ يُسَلِّمُ عَلَيَّ ، إِلَّا رَدَّ اللَّهُ عَلَيَّ رُوحِي حَتَّى أَرُدَّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامَ

"No one gives greetings of salaam, except that Allah will restore my soul to me, so that I may reply to him with the greeting of salaam."
[Sunan Abu Dawood: 2043]

This was also the practice of Ibn Umar ra, this is why, whenever Sayyidunah Abdullah bin Umar (radiallah anhu) would return from a journey, he would come near the grave of the Prophet (peace be upon him) and say: **"Peace be upon you O Messenger of Allaah, peace be upon you O Abu Bakr, Peace be upon you O My Father (Umar)"**[Fadhal as-Salaat ala an-Nabi by Qaadhi Ismaa'eel bin Ishaaq (Pg 81-82), Al-Sunan al-Kubra by Bayhaqi (5/245), Chain Saheeh]

Imam Alousi said regarding this matter
And it did not come from any of the Sahabah - and they are among the most desiring people from creation to seek any good- that they asked the dead anything, rather it is authentically reported from Ibn Umar that he used to say when he entered prophetic chamber when making Ziyarah (visit of the grave): "As-Salam Aleyka Ya Rasula Allah, As-Salam Aleyka Ya Aba Bakrin, As Salam Aleyka Ya Abati" (Peace be upon you O messenger of Allah, peace be upon you O Abu Bakr, peace be upon you O my father), then he left and he did not add to that and he did not seek anything from the leader of the universe (saw) or from his two nobles companions lying next, and they are the most virtuous from what surface can ever gather and have the highest value from what all containing places can ever contain. [Imam Mahmud Al-Alusi in his "Ruh ul-Ma'ani" in Tafsir of the verse "**Seek Wasilah to Him**" (Maidah: 35)]

Shaikh ul-Islaam Ibn Taymiyyah writes **"This is the hadeeth upon which the Scholars like Ahmed and Abu Dawood trusted on the issue of saying salaam from near the Prophet's grave."** [Ar-Radd Ala al-Bakri: 1/107]

The most explicit of all proofs is that Imaam Abu Dawood (rahimahullah) has brought this hadeeth under the chapter heading **"Visit of the Grave".**

So this has nothing to do with innovative tawassul or asking help from Prophet peace be upon him.

BLOCK NO. 45

They said

Abdur Rahim al-Mubarakpori (Among the Authentic Scholar for Salafi School of Thought)

Imam Qadhi Shawkani's (rah) writes: Regarding what those who forbid tawassul to Allah through the Prophets (Peace Be Upon Him) and the Saint's cite to support their position, such as Allah's sayings: "We only worship them in order that they may bring us nearer" (39:3) and "Do not call on any other god with Allah, or you will be among those who will be punished" (26:213) and "Say: Call on those besides Him whom ye fancy; they have no power to remove your trouble from you or to change them. Those unto whom they cry seek for themselves the means of approach to their Lord, which of them shall be the nearest; they hope for His mercy and fear His wrath: for the wrath of thy Lord is something to take heed of" (17:57) These verses are irrelevant. Rather: they support exactly the reverse of what the objectors to tawassul claim, since the verses are related to another issue.

To wit: the verse "We only worship them in order that they may bring us nearer" explicitly states that they worship them for that purpose, "whereas the one who makes Tawassul through a scholar, for example, never worships him, but knows that he has a special distinction (maziyya) before Allah for being a carrier of knowledge; and that is why he uses him as a means". Similarly irrelevant to the issue is Allah's saying: "Do not call on any other god with Allah." This verse forbids that one should call upon another together with Allah, as if saying: ""O Allah and O So-and-so." However, the one who makes tawassul through a scholar, for example, never calls upon other than Allah. He only seeks a means to Him through the excellent works that one of His servants achieved, just as the three men in the cave who were blocked by the rock used their good works as a means to have their petition answered".

Similarly irrelevant to the issue is Allah's saying: "Those unto whom they cry..." for it refers to people who call upon those who cannot fulfill their request, at the same time not calling upon Allah Who can; whereas one who makes tawassul through a scholar, for example, never called except upon Allah, and none other besides Him. The above shows the reader that these objectors to tawassul are bringing forth evidence that is irrelevant to the issue at hand. Even more irrelevant is their citing of the verse: "The Day when no soul shall have power to do anything for another: for the Command, that Day, will be all with Allah." (82:19) For that noble verse contains nothing more

than the fact that Allah alone decides everything on the Day of Judgment, and that none other will have any say at that time. However, the maker of tawassul through one of the Prophets (Peace Be Upon Him) or one of the scholars, never believes that the one through whom he makes tawassul is in partnership with Allah on the Day of Judgment!

Whoever believes such a thing in relation to a Prophet or non-Prophet is in manifest error. Equally irrelevant is their objection to tawassul by citing the verses: "Not for you is the decision in the least" (3:128) "Say: I have no power over over good or harm to myself except as Allah wills" (7:188) for these two verses are explicit in that the Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) has no say in Allah's decision and that he has no power to benefit or harm himself in the least, let alone someone else: but there is nothing in those two verses to prevent Tawassul through him or any other of the Prophets or Friends of Allah or scholars.

Allah has given His Prophet (Peace Be Upon Him) the Exalted Station (al-maqam al-mahmud) -- the station of the Great Intercession (al-shafa`a al-`uzma), and He has instructed creation to ask for that station for him and to request his intercession, and He said to him: "Ask and you shall be granted what you asked! Intercede and you shall be granted what you interceded for!" And in His Book He has made this dependence on the fact that there is no intercession except by His leave, and that none shall possess it except those whom He pleases...

Reference: Abdur Rahim al-Mubarakpori, Tuhfatul Ahwazi ba-Sharah Tirmidhi Volume 10, Page 36

Click here for Scanned Page (53)

OUR Response:

Its not Abdul Rahim rather Abdur Rehman Mubarakpori, secondly He is quoting ashShawkani not his own sayings. He also quoted Imam al-Izz bin Abdus Salam who said about the Hadith of Blind man about Tawasul:

الحديث صح إن بالنبي إلا تعالى الله إلى التوسل يجوز لا إنه السلام عبد بن الدين عز الشيخ قال فقد

"If the hadith of blind man is authentic then it is specific for the Prophet saw only "

٢٥ الصفحة – ١٠ ج – المباركفوري – الأحوذي تحفة

And Izz bin Abdus Salam said in his fatawa
"If the hadith of blind man is authentic then it is specific for the Prophet saw only and QIYAS CANNOT be done for others" Fatawa Sultan al-Ulama p82

After that Mubarakfoori said

الحق عندي: أن التوسل بالنبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في حياته بمعنى التوسل بدعائه وشفاعته جائز، وكذا التوسل بغيره من أهل الخير والصلاح في حياتهم بمعنى التوسل بدعائهم وشفاعتهم ـ أيضا ـ جائز.

وأما التوسل به بعد مماته وكذا التوسل بغيره من أهل الخير والصلاح بعد مماتهم: فلا يجوز،

So Imam Izz bin Abdus salam said "IF" the hadith is authentic then it is specific for the Prophet peace be upon him and no qiyas can be done that it is also for auliyah, then Imam Mubarakpori quoted his own opinion that tawassul through dead is not permissible. As for Imam ashShawkani is concerned then see this

- Qadhi shawkani said in (شرح الصدور بتحريم رفع القبور)Page no: 10

‘
صار تحت أطباق الثرى، لا يقدر على أن يجلب لنفسه نفعا ولا يدفع عنها ضرا، كما قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فيما أمره الله أن يقول:
(لا أملك لنفسي نفعا ولا ضرا). فانظر كيف قال سيد البشر وصفوةالله من خلقه بأمر ربه أنه لا يملك لنفسه ضرا ولا نفعا ، وكذلك قال فيما صح عنه " يا فاطمة بنت محمد لا أغني عنك من الله شيئا. "
They are under mud, They have no authority of good and Bad for their own self, nor they have power to prevent the pain of any other, like ALLAH told Prophet Peace be upon him to tell the people (al araf 188). Say : "I possess no power over benefit or harm to myself.
Same like He said to his beloved Daughter "O Faatimah bint Muhammad, I cannot help you before Allah in any way"?.(end)

Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAKv0cMQcnpU_AqNPT9Kr5rYMPLdTAnjtNrzYGoJoZiy86hcYZVoZ5VIJZuVhvFFTlIfnU-GXxjnfs2lndtD34BcAm1T1UJpXgR-9ty-XU-YtmM796t5CAnPh.jpg

- 12) Qadhi Shawkani went on and said
فيا عجبًا! كيف يطمع من له أدنى نصيب من علم، أو أقل حفظ من عرفان أن ينفعه أو يضره فرد من أفراد أمة هذا النبي الذي يقول عن نفسه هذه المقالة ؟ والحال أنه فرد من التابعين له المقتدين بشرعه.
فهل سمعت أذنَاكَ- أرشدك الله- بضلال عقل أكبر من هذا الضلال الذي وقع فيه عباد أهل القبور؟!
(إنا لله وإنا إليه راجعون).
وقد أوضحنا هذا أبلغ إيضاح في رسالتنا التي سميناها " الدر النضيد في إخلاص كلمة التوحيد
How strange! people have creed for the person who have normal knowledge and small muarifat that he has authority over good and preventing the pains of people, he is in the Ummah of That Prophet who said (I possess no power over benefit or harm to myself)
And this man is in followers of Prophet, have you ever heard about more big deviant talk?? Like what these worshipers of grave say? Inna Lillah wa inna iliyhe Rajioon
We have mentioned in detail on this issue in our Risalah Ad dur al nzeed fe ikhilaas kalmia tul tawheed (end)
Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAOzYErmlQ4tlhZW7Z4B0xcPHIOL9vQXKrHCLsTFstyTh-Zv4RUtSeZVNpd3iTZD7iv4aDcYwKMMW2ZSb1z6N3ycAm1T1UMywD1M7EHwbbtu81tPjdmoO5kgP.jpg
- This is the hadith Qadhi Shawkani is Talking About
It was narrated that Abu Hurayrah (may Allaah be pleased with him) said: When the words "And warn your tribe (O Muhammad) of near kindred" [al-Shu'ara' 26:214] were revealed to him, the Messenger of Allaah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: "O people of Quraysh (or words to that effect)! Ransom yourselves, I cannot avail you anything before Allaah. O Banu 'Abd Manaaf, I cannot avail you anything before Allaah. O 'Abbaas ibn 'Abd al-Muttalib, I cannot avail you anything before Allaah. O Safiyah, (paternal) aunt of the Messenger of Allaah, I cannot avail you anything before Allaah. O Faatimah, daughter of the Messenger of Allaah, ask me for whatever you want of my wealth, I cannot avail you anything before Allaah." Narrated by al-Bukhaari (2602) and Muslim (206).
And then Qadhi Shawkani went on and mentioned the bad things of domes on graves

BLOCK NO. 46

They said

Hujjat ul Islam Imam Al-Ghazzali (Rahimuhullah)

وقد ذكره الغزالي ولذا قيل - وليس بحديث كما توهم - إذا تحيرتم في الأمور فاستعينوا من أصحاب القبور أي أصحاب النفوس الفاضلة المتوفين ولا شك في أنه يحصل لزائرهم مدد روحاني ببركتهم وكثيراً ما تنحل عقد الأمور بأنامل التوسل إلى الله تعالى بحرمتهم،

Translation: Imam Ghazzali (rah) said that whenever anyone is in some difficulty then **he should ask the people of tombs for help,** who are of (sacred) souls but have passed away (i.e. transferred into another dimension). There is no doubt in it that any person visiting (their tombs) gets spiritual help plus benefit from them and many times **when their Waseela is presented in the court of Allah, the difficulties are removed** [Tafsir Ruh ul Ma'ani, Volume 30, Page No. 24]

Our Response:

alGhazalli ra is quoting a hadith which is fabricated secondly Ibn e Jawzi Criticised al-Ghazali Badly when he said Sufis can see souls of Prophets and hear them. He said

Then there came Abu Haamid Al-Ghazaalee who wrote the book ' Ihyaa 'Uloom-ud-Deen' for them, according to the methodology of the (Sufi) people, which he filled with baseless ahaadeeth even though he knew well they were baseless. He spoke about knowledge of theMukaashafah (unveiling of unseen by Allaah to Sufis) and withdrew from the principles of Fiqh. And he stated such things as: 'Indeed the stars, the sun and the moon, which Ibraaheem saw, were in fact lights that screened Allaah!' Such things are not mentioned in any of the sources of knowledge. Rather, this is from the types of speech of the Baatiniyyah.

He (Al-Ghazaalee) also said in the book ' Al-Mufsih bil-Ahwaal': "While in their state of wakefulness, the Sufis are able to witness the angels and souls of the prophets, hear their voices and take hold of benefit from them. Then this condition escalates from the witnessing (of their) images to levels in which they are contained within these domains."
The factors that caused these individuals to write these books was their little knowledge of the Sunnah, Islaam and the narrations, as well as their dedication for what they approved of from the way of the people (Sufis). They only approved this way because of adoration for abstinence (zuhd) that was established in their souls. They did not see any condition better than the condition of these people (Sufis) in regards to appearance, nor any speech more pleasant than their speech, whereas in the biographies of the Salaf, they found a form of harshness. So the people inclined very strongly towards these individuals (Sufis).

This was due to what we stated previously, that it was a way, which was characterized outwardly by cleanliness and worship, whereas on the inside, it was about indulging in leisure and hearing music, which the bodily dispositions incline to. The original Sufis would flee from the leaders and authorities. However (in later times) they became friends.
The majority of these books that were compiled for them have things in them that cannot be traced back to any (authentic) source. Rather, they are only based on mystical occurrences that befell some of them, which they managed to take hold of and record. They called this hidden knowledge (al-'ilm-ul-baatin). Abu Ya'qoob Ishaaq bin Hayya said: "I heard Ahmad bin Hanbal once when asked about the occurrence of delusions and notions, so he replied: 'The Sahaabah and the Taabi'een never spoke about such things.'"[Ibn e Jozi in Talbees Iblees pg. 163 and Page 261 of Urdu Tranlsation]
Note: Abu Hamid Ghazali repented from all these Khurafaat like Sufis can see souls,Angels and they can hear them etc. This is called Speech of Baataniyah as said by Ibn e Jozi. See here repentence of
Ghazali http://www.islamqa.com/en/ref/13473

BLOCK NO. 47

They said

Imam Ahmed bin Hanbal(RehmatuAllah Alihe) intercession from pious

muslims

عبد الله بن أحمد بن حنبل قال سمعت أبي يقول حججت خمس حجج اثنتين راكب وثلاث ماشي أو ثلاث راكب واثنتين ماشي فضللت الطريق في حجة وكنت ماشيا فجعلت أقول يا عباد الله دلوني على الطريق قال فلم أزل أقول ذلك حتى وقفت على الطريق أو كما قال أبي

Translation: Abdullah bin Ahmed bin Hanbal (rah) said that he heard his father (Imam Ahmed - Rahimuhullah) saying: I performed Hajj 5 times, thrice on foot and twice on ride or he said thrice on ride and twice on foot,**once when I was on foot I lost my way hence I started to exclaim this: O Allah's servants show me the way (يا عباد الله دلوني على الطريق), I kept on repeating this until I came back on track.** [Imam Baihaqi in Shu'ayb ul Iman, Volume 6, Page No 128, Hadith No. 7697]

Our Response:

This issue has been cleared already above that **Shoaib ul Emaan of Bayhaqi states**

أخبرنا علي بن أحمد بن عبدان ثنا أحمد بن عبيد الصفار ثنا عبيد بن شريك ثنا بن أبي مريم ثنا عبد الله بن فروخ أخبرني أسامة بن زيد حدثني أبان بن صالح عن مجاهد عن بن عباس قال إن لله عز وجل ملائكة سوى الحفظة يكتبون ما سقط من ورق الشجر فإذا أصاب أحدكم عرجة بأرض فلاة فليناد أعينوا عباد الله يرحمكم الله تعالى

Translation: Ibne Abbas said: 'Indeed Allah possesses **Angels besides the Hafazah** (the Angels of Protection) who write (of even) the leaf which falls from a tree so when one of you suffers a limp in a deserted land he should call "Assist (me) O slaves of Allah

.

So Angels are meant from this hadith, Imam Abdullah bin Mubarak rejected this hadith because he did not have authentic chain, but Imam Ahmad acted upon this.

Above athar truely goes with the Quran as Allah says (13:10. It is the same (to Him) whether any of you conceals his speech or declares it openly, whether he

be hid by night or goes forth freely by day.) (11. For him (each person), **there are angels in succession, before and behind him. They guard him by the command of Allah**. Verily, Allah will not change the (good) condition of a people as long as they do not change their state (of goodness) themselves. But when Allah wills a people's punishment, there can be no turning it back, and they will find besides Him no protector.)

Shaykh Muhammad Saalih al-Munajjid said

The commentator on the Qur'aan who had the best understanding of it, Ibn 'Abbaas, explained that the mu'aqqibaat [translated here as "angels in succession"] **refers to the angels whom Allaah has appointed to guard man from in front and from behind.** When the decree of Allaah comes – when He decrees that some accident or calamity etc. should befall him – the angels withdraw from him.

Mujaahid said: There is no person who does not have **an angel appointed to protect him** when he is asleep and when he is awake, from the jinn, men and wild beasts. There is nothing that comes to him but the angels tell it to clear off, except for that which Allaah grants permission for it to befall him.[Islamqa fatwa no: 6523]

Hammad bin nasr al Muammar said (he is also one of the students of Shaykh Muhammad bin Abdul Wahhaab), in Durr- ar-Saniyyah one of the articles

أن يقال: إن صح الحديث فلا دليل فيه على دعاء الميت والغائب؛ فإن الحديث ورد في أذكار السفر; ومعناه: أن الإنسان إذا انفلتت دابته وعجز عنها، فقد جعل الله عبادا من عباده الصالحين، أي صالحي الجن أو الملائكة،

If its said :that this hadeeth is saleel there is no daleel in to make Dua to dead or to one who is absent, as this hadeeth is reocred in the supplications related to travel , meaning that when a person looses his vehicle, **as Allah has make slaves among his pious slaves that is pious Jinn and Angels to retrieve it .....**

A little later he says.

فإن هؤلاء عباد الله أحياء، قد

جعل الله لهم قدرة على ذلك، كما جعل الله للإنس. فهو ينادي من يسمع ويعين بنفسه ويرى بعينه، كما ينادي أصحابه الذين معه من الإنس. فأين هذا من الاستغاثة بأهل القبور؟! بل هذا من جنس ما يجوز طلبه من الأحياء

As these are among the salves who are alive , Allah has made them capable for that for Allah has made them for men , who when they hear the sound would help him and see him , just like a companion with him among the men who hears him , Where is the seeking help of the Ahlul Quboorees in this ?Rather this is a form in which its peremitted to seeking help from the alive.

BLOCK NO. 48

They said

Hadrat Umar (RadhiAllah anho) helping Sahabis (R.A) from 1000 miles away

When Umar ibn Khattab sent out an army, he appointed a man named Sariyah as their leader. Then while Umar was delivering the Khutbah he started shouting, 'O Sariyah, the mountain! O Sariyah, the mountain, the mountain!' Then a messenger from the army came and he questioned him [concerning the army], he said, 'O Leader of the Believers! We met with the enemy and they had [almost] defeated us, then a voice proclaimed, 'O Sariyah, the mountain!' So we put our backs against the mountain and Allah vanquished them.'

Reference

► Ibn Taymiyyah, The Decisive Criterion between the Friends of Allah and the Friends of Shaitain,(page 316)

Our Response:

This narration is disputed because the narrator Muhammad bin Ajlaan is mudallis and narrating from (an) but if we consider it authentic then this was a speciality of Umar Narrated Abu **huraira**: The Prophet said, "Amongst the people preceding you there used to be 'Muhaddithun' (i.e. persons who can

guess things that come true later on, as if those persons have been inspired by a divine power), and if there are any such persons amongst my followers, it is '**umar** bin Al-Khattab." (Bukhari Book #56, Hadith #675)

So Prophet peace be upon him himself said this regarding Umar bin alKhattab ra, know that Umar ra himself said that

"People were (sometimes) judged by the revealing of a Divine Inspiration during the lifetime of Allah's Apostle but now there is no longer any more (new **Revelation**). Now we judge you by the deeds you practice publicly, so we will trust and favor the one who does good deeds in front of us, and we will not call him to account about what he is really doing in secret, for Allah will judge him for that; but we will not trust or believe the one who presents to us with an evil deed even if he claims that his intentions were good." (Bukhari Book #48, Hadith #809)

This athar shows that Umar bin alKhattab ra did not know the knowledge of unseen neither he was shown something.

☛Shaykh al-Albaani (may Allaah have mercy on him) said:

There can be no doubt that the call mentioned was inspiration from Allaah to 'Umar. That is nothing strange, because he was "muhaddath" (inspired) as was narrated from the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him), but that does not mean that 'Umar was shown the situation of the army or that he saw them with his own eyes. The use of this as evidence by some of the Sufis for the claims that they make about the awliya' ("saints") having kashf and that they can see what is in people's hearts is utter falsehood. How can it be otherwise, when that is one of the unique attributes of the Lord of the Worlds Who alone has knowledge of the unseen and sees what is in people's hearts?
I wonder, how can they make such a false claim when Allaah says in His Book "(He Alone is) the All-Knower of the Ghayb (Unseen), and He reveals to none His Ghayb (Unseen). Except to a Messenger (from mankind) whom He has chosen"[al-Jinn 72:26-27]?

Do they believe that those awliya' are Messengers of Allaah so that it may be said of them that they can know the unseen as much as Allaah tells them?! Glory be to You (O Allaah)! This is a great lie (al-Noor 24:16).

This story is saheeh and is proven. It was a miracle (karaamah) with which Allaah honoured 'Umar, by means of which the Muslim army was saved from capture or destruction. But it does not mean that he had knowledge of the unseen, as the Sufis claim. Rather it was a kind of inspiration, in the sense defined in sharee'ah, or a kind of telepathy, which is not infallible. It may be correct, as in this incident, or it turn out to be wrong, as usually happens to people. Hence every close friend of Allaah (wali) must adhere to sharee'ah in everything that he does or says, lest he do something that goes against sharee'ah and thus lose the status of being a friend of Allaah, which Allaah has described in comprehensive terms when He said
"No doubt! Verily, the Awliyaa' of Allaah, no fear shall come upon them nor shall they grieve.
Those who believed, and used to fear Allaah much (by abstaining from evil deeds and sins and by doing righteous deeds)"[Yoonus 10:63]
And the poet said:
"If you see a man flying through the air or walking on the water, but he does not adhere to the limits of sharee'ah,then you should realize that this is a temptation which is leading him astray, and he is a man of bid'ah."[Al-Silsilah al-Saheehah, 3/102-104]

.

☛Al-Shanqeeti said:
Al-Qurtubi (may Allaah have mercy on him) said:
Our Shaykh, Abu'l-'Abbaas, said: some heretics who followed batiniyyah (esoteric teachings) wanted to follow a path that did not enjoin these shar'i rulings. They said: these general shar'i rulings are obligatory upon the Prophets and the masses only. As for the awliyaa' and the elite, they do not need those texts. Rather what is required of them is what they receive in their hearts through intuition and the thoughts that dominate their minds. They said: this is because their hearts are free of anything that may cause distraction and of thoughts of anything other than Allaah. In this manner divine knowledge becomes manifest to them, and they discover the secrets of creation and learn the rulings concerning minor issues, thus they are no longer subjected to the holistic shar'i rulings. This is what happened in the case of al-Khidr who, by means of the knowledge that was made manifest to him was rendered independent of the knowledge that Moosa had. One of the

things that they narrated was the words: "Consult your heart, no matter how many people give you fatwas and advice."
Our shaykh (may Allaah be pleased with him) said: These are the words of heresy and kufr; the one who says them should be executed without being asked to repent, because he has denied that which is known from the sharee'ah. For Allaah has set up the system by His wisdom in such a way that His rulings can only be known through His Messengers who are ambassadors between Him and His creation. They are the only ones who convey His Message and His words from Him, explaining His laws and rulings, and He has chosen them for that purpose.

Allaah says
"Allaah chooses Messengers from angels and from men. Verily, Allaah is All-Hearer, All-Seer"[al-Hajj 22:75]

"Allaah knows best with whom to place His Message"[al-An'aam 6:124]
"Mankind were one community and Allaah sent Prophets with glad tidings and warnings"[al-Baqarah 2:213]

and there are other similar aayahs.
In conclusion, we know definitely and for certain, and the consensus of the earlier and later generations states likewise, that there is no way to learn the rulings of Allaah, which have to do with His commands and prohibitions, except through His Messengers. Whoever says that there is another way through which His commands and prohibitions may be known, independently of the Messengers, is a kaafir who should be executed without asking him to repent; there is no need to question him. For this is stating belief in Prophets after our Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him), whom Allaah has made the Seal of the Prophets and Messengers, after whom there is no Prophet or Messenger.

What that means is that whoever says that he has taken the ruling of Allaah from his heart or from what he received in his heart through intuition, and that he acts upon that and thus has no need of the Qur'aan or Sunnah, has claimed for himself the unique qualities of Prophethood, because this is like what the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: "The Holy Spirit [i.e., Jibreel] told me in my heart..."(From Tafseer al-Qurtubi).
What he quoted from his shaykh, that the heretic should not be asked to repent, is the view of Maalik and those who agreed with him. We have

explained the views of the scholars and their evidence, and what is most correct according to the evidence, in our book Daf' Ayhaam al-Idtiraab 'an Ayaat al-Kitaab, in the chapter on Soorat Aal 'Imraan.[Adwaa' al-Bayaan, 4/174, 175.] (source: http://islamqa.info/en/ref/22245/)

BLOCK NO. 49

They said

Ibn Hajar `Asqalânî(RehmatuAllah Alihe) writes about this Tawasul of Ibn e Abbas (R.A)

**"The episode involving `Abbâs makes it clear that to seek intercession from the virtuous, the pious and members of the Prophet's family is a desirable act.** In addition, this event proves the high status of `Abbâs as well as reveals `Umar's respect for him and the acknowledgement of his status."

References

►Ibn Hajar `Asqalânî, Fath-ul-bârî, 2:497

►Zurqânî, Sharh-ul-Mawâhib, 11:152

Our Response:

There is nothing wrong in this saying because asking for dua from pious and ahlul bait is permissible, there is nothing in it which states that asking Allah through dead is allowed.

BLOCK NO. 50

They said

Imam Ahmad(RehmatuAllah Alihe) and Tawassul

المرداوي في الإنصاف (2:456)
"...يجوز التوسل بالرجل الصالح على الصحيح من المذهب، وقيل:
يُستحب. قال الإمام أحمد للمروذي : يتوسل بالنبي صلى اله عليه وسلم في دعائه
وجزم به في المستوعب وغيره.."

Al-Mardawi said: "The correct position of the [Hanbali] madhhab is that it is permissible in one's dua to use as one's means of a pious person (saalih), and it is said that it is desirable (mustahabb). Imam Ahmad said to Abu Bakr al-Marwazi: **'Let him use the Prophet as a means in his supplication to Allah (SWT).'"** (Al-Insaf 2:456) This is also cited by Ibn Taymiyyah in Majmu' Al-Fatawa (1:140).

Our Response:

This is a misquote below is the full saying

- al-Mardawi said

ومنها : يجوز التوسل بالرجل الصالح ، على الصحيح من المذهب ، وقيل : يستحب . قال الإمام أحمد : المروذي يتوسل بالنبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في دعائه وجزم به في المستوعب وغيره ، وجعله الشيخ تقي الدين كمسألة اليمين به قال : والتوسل بالإيمان به وطاعته ومحبته والصلاة والسلام عليه ، وبدعائه وشفاعته ، ونحوه مما هو من فعله أو أفعال العباد المأمور بها في حقه : مشروع إجماعا ، وهو من الوسيلة المأمور بها في قوله تعالى { اتقوا الله وابتغوا إليه الوسيلة } وقال الإمام أحمد وغيره من العلماء : في قوله عليه أفضل الصلاة والسلام { أعوذ بكلمات الله التامات من شر ما خلق } الاستعاذة لا تكون بمخلوق .

"The correct position of the [Hanbali] madhhab is that it is permissible in one's dua to use as one's means of a pious person (saalih), and it is said that it is desirable (mustahabb). Imam Ahmad said to Abu Bakr al-Marwazi: 'Let him use the Prophet as a means in his supplication to Allah (SWT). (Mardawi cleared the statement of Imam Ahmad by quoting Shaykh Taqi ud din) "Shaykh Taqiyudin considered it as the case of the Yameen and he said : " Tawassul with Iman in him (peace be upon him), obedience to him(peace be upon him), love for him (peace be upon him), salam on him(peace be upon him), or with his du'a and his shafa'ah, which is from his actions or actions of

worship ordered for his right, this is legislated by consensus', and this is from Wasilah ordered " And Seek Wasilah to Him"

Imam Ahmad and other scholars said regarding the saying of Prophet peace be upon him {"I seek refuge in the perfect Words of Allaah" } "There is no Seeking refuge in creation

Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAL4NRNDm-RQedRR5UBpYiEXkZq3oXIaLyDrHr0ePmqGj8aPN9gl1oNmsvbnOjGE7Jml0NRya4-uPzOTFvkLVPxMAm1T1UEwDRaVdeRxru6btul-Y_N497Qbv.jpg

Ibn e Aqil Hanbalee said
لا يخلق القبور بالخلوق , والتزويق والتقبيل لها والطواف بها , والتوسل بهم إلى الله
Graves are not made for kissing and decorating and roaming around and making them tawassul for ALLAH [Ibn e Muflih quoted al furoo 2/316]
Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAJFXFISiMceFb7HLgvtzXhUexKq4I6mwFNJ-3EmUCaZ7FLbYz1eRomDckgUh31611VKBqyfzVNiB7F7HjnEtDvMAm1T1UO3FA6Tsd1cn1c_C4hDDudMskEl5.jpg

The saying of Imam Ahmad (if proven) has nothing to do with innovative tawassul of brailwiyah and the keller clan.

BLOCK NO. 51

They quoted

Imam Dhahabi (RehmatuAllah Alihe) narrates:

قال قحط المطر عندنا بسمرقند في بعض الأعوام فاستسقى الناس مرارا فلم يسقوا فأتى رجل صالح معروف بالصلاح إلى قاضي سمرقند فقال له إني رأيت رأيا أعرضه عليك قال وما هو قال أرى أن تخرج ويخرج الناس معك إلى قبر الإمام محمد بن إسماعيل البخاري وقبره بخرتنك ونستسقي عنده فعسى الله أن يسقينا قال فقال القاضي نعم ما رأيت فخرج القاضي والناس معه واستسقى القاضي بالناس وبكى الناس عند القبر وتشفعوا بصاحبه فأرسل الله تعالى السماء بماء عظيم غزير أقام الناس من أجله بخرتنك سبعة أيام أو نحوها لا يستطيع أحد الوصول إلى سمرقند من كثرة المطر وغزارته وبين خرتنك وسمرقند نحو ثلاثة أميال

Translation: Once there was a drought in Samarqand, People tried their best, some said Salat al Istisqa but still it did not rain, A renowned righteous man

known as Salih came to the Qadhi and said: **In my opinion you along with your public should visit the grave of Imam Bukhari (Rahimuhullah), His grave is located in Khartank, We should (go near the Qabr) and ask for rain, Allah might give us rain** then, The Qadhi said Yes to his opinion and then he along with the people went towards (the Qabr) and then He made a dua along with the people and **people started to cry near the grave and started to make him a Waseela (i.e. Imam Bukhari). Allah Ta'ala (immediately) sent rainclouds.** All people stayed in Khartank for about 7 days, none of them wanted to go back to Samarqand although the distance between Samarqand and Khartank was only 3 miles [As Siyar al Alam An Nabula Volume 12, Page No 469]

Our Response:

There is no value of Hikayah in ISLAM specially in creed. It could be weak, fabricated or Authentic, Creed are based on Quran and Authentic Sunnah (those who use this athar according to them hadith should be mutwatir for creed) but here they are using Hikayah of Mutakhiroun and not even from Tabiyeen and Itteba Tabiyeen.

Abdullah bin Mubarak Rahimullah rightly said

Chains are in deen, if chain is not there then anyone can say anything.
Muqaddimah Sahih muslim tarqeem dar us salam no: 32

Dahabee is quoting from Abu Ali Ghisani, Dahabee died in 748 h, and there is no chain from Ad Dahabee to Abu Ali Ghisani,how can we rely on this story?

Critique on chain

a) Shaykh Zubair Ali Zai said:
Who is Abu Ali al Hafidh? Nothing is mentioned regarding him. Remember that here Abu Ali Al Hafidh Nesaboori is not meant, who was teacher of Hakim Etc. He died Before Abu Al Fath Nasr bin Al Hasan As Samarqandi
Summary is that This story of Praying for Rain near Grave of Imam Bukhari is not Proven[**Al Hadith no:38 page 10,11]**
b)Shaykh Saheem Replied(Considering Abu Ali Ghisani, Al Hussain Bin Muhammad Bin Ahmad Al Ghisani Al Andulasi The Imam)

القصة أوردها الذهبي في " سير أعلام النبلاء " .
وكذلك السبكي في " الطبقات " قال : وقال أبو علي الغساني . ثم ذكرها .

. والذهبي متوفّى سنة 748 هـ
. والسبكي مُتوفّى سنة 771 هـ
وأبو عليّ الغساني ، هو الحسين بن محمد بن أحمد الغساني الأندلسي الجياني ، المتوفَّى سنة 498هـ

فكم بين الذهبى والسبكى وبين أبى علىّ الغسانى ؟!

. وهي قصة مُنقطعة فهي تُروى عن أبي عليّ الغساني ،

Dahabee mentioned this story in Seyar Ailam Al Nubala and Subki Mebtioned in Tabqaat and Said, Abu Ali Ghisani said (and then the whole story)
Dahabee Died in 748 H
Subki Died in 771 H
And Abu Ali Ghisani, and He is Al Hussain bin Muhammad bin Muhammad bin Ahmad Al Ghisani Al Andulasi Al Jiyani died in 498h
Then He said this Story is Munqatah.**(end)**
See his Detailed Reply here Source: http://www.dd-sunnah.net/forum/showthread.php?t=87281&page=3

Imam Dahabee himself said

ولجهلة المصريين فيها اعتقاد يتجاوز الوصف، ولايجوز مما فيه من الشرك، ويسجدون لها، ويلتمسون منها المغفرة

Due to ignorance of Egyptians the Creeds found in them is not correct to talk about it, When shirk found in them, they prostate to others (except Allah), and they seek forgiveness from them[Seyar Ailam Nubala 10/106]

This Athar is Against the Practice of Sahaba

It is against Quran and Sunnah and Sahaba, Islam is not derived from Stories

a) Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him)said , "Do not take my grave as a place of festivity (which you visit repeatedly)." Ibn Hajar al-Haythami said in Sharh al-Mishkaat:

العيد اسم من الأعياد ، يقال : عاده واعتاده وتعوّده صار له عادة ، والمعنى : لا تجعلوا قبري محلاً لاعتياد المجيء إليه متكررًا تكرارًا كثيرًا ، فلهذا قال : (وصلوا عليَّ فإن صلاتكم تبلغني حيث كنتم) فإن فيها كفاية عن ذلك

"Eid is the name of one of the **festivals**, and it was said that it means **returning and repeating,** until it becomes a habit ['aadah]. What is meant is: do not make my grave a place to **which you have the habit of coming back repeatedly and often.** Hence he said, 'Send blessings upon me for your greeting will reach me no matter where you are,' because that is sufficient and **there is no need to visit his grave frequently."**

b) Athar of Omar RadhiAllahAnho

It was narrated that al-Ma'roor ibn Suwayd (may Allaah have mercy on him) said:

خرجنا مع عمر بن الخطاب فعرض لنا في بعض الطريق مسجد فابتدره الناس يصلون فيه فقال عمر : ما شأنهم ؟ فقالوا : هذا مسجد صلى فيه رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فقال عمر : أيها الناس إنما هلك من كان قبلكم باتباعهم مثل هذا حتى أحدثوها بيعا فمن عرضت له فيه صلاة فليصل ومن لم تعرض له فيه صلاة فليمض

"We went out with 'Umar ibn al-Khattaab and **we came across a mosque on our route.** The people rushed to pray in that mosque, and 'Umar said, **'What is the matter with them?'** They said, **'This is a mosque in which the Messenger of Allaah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) prayed.'** 'Umar said: **'O people, those who came before you were destroyed because they followed such (practices) until they made them places of worship**. Whoever happens to be there at the time of prayer, let him pray there, and whoever is not there at the time of prayer, let him continue his journey.'" **(Narrated by Ibn Waddah in his book al-Bida' wa'l-Nahiy 'anhaa; classed as saheeh by Ibn Taymiyah in al-Majmoo', 1/281).**

c) Athar of Ali bin Hussain Bin Ali Ra

علي بن عمر عن أبيه عن علي بن حسين أنه رأى رجلا يجيء إلى فُرْجَة كانت عند قبر النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فيدخل فيها فيدعو ، فَدَعَاه ، فقال : ألا أُحَدِّثُك بحديث سمعته من أبي عن جدي عن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم ؟ قال : لا تتخذوا قبري عيدا ، ولا بيوتكم قبورا ، وصَلُّوا عَلَيّ فإن صلاتكم تبلغني حيث ما كنتم

'Ali ibn al-Husayn (may Allaah be pleased with him) **saw a man entering through a gap at the grave of the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him), and making du'aa'.** He told him not to do that and said, "Shall I not tell you a hadeeth that I heard from my father from my grandfather from the Messenger of Allaah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him)? **'Do not take my grave as a place of festivity (which you visit repeatedly) and do not take your houses as graves. Send blessings upon me for your greeting will reach me no matter where you are**.'"[Narrated by Abu Dawood, 2042; classed as saheeh by al-Albaani in Saheeh Abi Dawood, 1796., Abu Ya'la and al-Haafiz al-Diya' in al-Mukhtaarah, Mentioned by Shaikh al-Islam Ibn Taymiyyah in Kitaab al-Waseelah (p.136) and al-Iqtidaa p.155-156, Shaikh al-Albanee in Ahkam al-Janaaiz, p.280]

Fatwas of Scholars

a) Ibn Waddaah al-Qurtubi (200 h to 287 h) May Allaah have mercy on him said:

وكان مالك ابن أنس وغيره من علماء المدينة يكرهون إتيان المساجد وتلك الآثار للنبي صلى الله عليه وسلم ما عدا قباء وأحدا

"Maalik ibn Anas and other scholars of Madeenah regarded **it as makrooh to go to those mosques and historical sites connected to the Prophet** (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him), apart from Quba' and Uhud." (al-Bida' wa'l-Nahiy 'anhaa, p. 43).

BLOCK NO. 52

They quoted

Imam Shafi (rahmatuallah alihe) on intercession of Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) after his life

"The family of the Prophet, they are my means/intermediaries (wasîlatî) in this life and the afterlife,through them, I hope to be given my records in my right hand on the Day of Judgement."

Reference
►Imâm Shâfi`î, Dîwân (Lebanon, Beirut: Dârul-Fikr, 2005), 162, #34

Our Response:

If this book is really proven from him the again this has nothing to do with innovative tawassul rather it is regarding virtues of ahlul bayt

Al-Bukhaari also narrated in his Saheeh (3509) that Abu Bakr (may Allaah be pleased with him) said: "Pay attention to the rights of the household of Muhammad (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him)."

Al-Haafiz Ibn Hajar (may Allaah have mercy on him) said:

The words "Pay attention to the rights of the household of Muhammad (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him)" are addressed to the people, enjoining them to fulfil the rights of Ahl al-Bayt. [Fath al-Baari (7/79).]

The Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said:] “So the Prophets, the angels and the believers will intercede, and the Compeller (Allaah) will say, ‘There remains My intercession.’ Then He will take a handful from the Fire and bring forth some people whose bodies have been burnt and throw them into a river at the entrance to Paradise that is called the Water of Life.

They will grow on its banks, as a seed carried by a flood grows. You have seen how it grows beside a rock or beside a tree, and how the side facing the sun is usually green while the side facing the shade is white. They will come out like pearls, and necklaces will be placed around their necks. Then they will enter Paradise, and the people of Paradise will say, ‘These are the people emancipated by the Most Merciful. He has admitted them into Paradise without them having done any good deeds and without them having sent forth any good (for themselves).’ Then it will be said to them, ‘You will have what you have seen and the equivalent thereof.’”

(Narrated by al-Bukhaari, 7440)

So in the hereafter pious people will intercede for the laypeople InshaAllah.

BLOCK NO. 53

They quoted

Imam Ibn Jawzi (rah) says in his magnificent Seerah work called “Al Wafa bi Ahwaal lil Mustafa”

Abu Bakr al-Minqari said: **I was with (al-hafiz) al-Tabarani and Abu al-Shaykh in the Prophet's Mosque, in some difficulty. We became very hungry. That day and the next we didn't eat. When it was time for `isha,I CAME TO THE PROPHET’S GRAVE AND I SAID: "O Messenger of Allah, we are hungry, we are hungry" (ya rasullallah al-ju` al-ju`)!** Then I left. Abu al-Shaykh said to me: Sit. Either there will be food for us, or death. I slept and Abu al-Shaykh slept. al-Tabarani stayed awake, researching something. Then an `Alawi (a descendant of `Ali) came knocking at the door with two boys, each one carrying a palm-leaf basket filled with food. We sat up and ate. We thought that the children would take back the remainder but they left everything behind. When we finished, the `Alawi said: **O people, did you**

complain to the Prophet? I saw him in my sleep and he ordered me to bring something to you. [Al-Hafiz Ibn Jawzi, Kitab al Wafa, Page 818]

Our Response

This narration is weak as Imam adDhahabi mentioned it with seegha tamreedh **(روي)**

وروي عن أبي بكر بن أبي علي، قال: كان ابن المقرئ يقول: كنت أنا والطبراني وأبو الشيخ بالمدينة فضاق بنا الوقت، فواصلنا ذلك اليوم فلما كان وقت العشاء حضرت القبر، وقلت: يا رسول الله الجوع، فقال لي الطبراني: أجلس فإما أن يكون الرزق أو الموت، فقمت أنا وأبو الشيخ فحضر الباب علوي ففتحنا له، فإذا معه غلامان بقفتين فيهما شئ كثير، وقال: شكوتموني إلى النبي صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم، رأيته في النوم فأمرني بحمل شئ إليكم»

Tadhkira tul Huffaz vol 3 under the tarjuma of Ibn alMuqri.

It has already been mentioned that whenever muhadditheen quote the narration with seegha tamreedh then according to them that is not authentic. Secondly we need chain from Ibn Jawzi upto Ibn alMuqri. The aqeedah of Ibn alJawzi is also cleared before in this very same book.

BLOCK NO. 54

They quoted

Ibn Taymiyyah has related a story in the perspective of this tradition that Ibn Abū Dunyā has narrated a tradition in his book Mujābī ad-du‘ā’ that a person came over to see ‘Abd-ul-Malik bin Sa‘īd bin Abjar. ‘Abd-ul-Malik pressed his belly and told him that he was suffering from an incurable discase. The man asked him: what is it? ‘Abd-ul-Malik replied that it was a kind of ulcer that grows inside the belly and ultimately kills the man. It is said that the patient turned round and then he said:

Allah! Allah! Allah is my Lord. I regard no one as His rival or partner. O Allah! I beseech You and submit myself to You through the mediation of Your Prophet Muhammad (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم), the merciful Prophet. O Muhammad! Through your means I submit myself to your and my Lord that He should take

mercy on me in my state of illness.

It is said that ‘Abd-ul-Malik pressed his belly again and said: you are cured, you are no longer suffering from any disease. Ibn Taymiyyah after recording the whole incident in his book, comments:

I say that this and other forms of supplication have been taken over from our predecessors

Reference

►Qaida al Jaleela, Fit Tawassul wal-Wasila, Page No. 91

Our Response:

Ibn Tamiya said

“التَّالِثَةُ أَنْ يُقَالَ: أَسْأَلُك بِفُلَانٍ أَوْ بِجَاهِ فُلَانٍ عِنْدَك وَنَحْوِ ذَلِكَ الَّذِي تَقَدَّمَ عَنْ أَبِي حَنِيفَةَ وَأَبِي يُوسُفَ وَغَيْرِهِمَا أَنَّهُ مَنْهِيٌّ عَنْهُ.”

“The third is to say: “I ask you by this and that person” or “by his hagh rank with You” or similar things which previosly was mentioned from Abu Hanifa and Abu Yusuf that it’s forbidden.”

“Majmu al-Fatawa”, 1/350-356

- Ibn Taymiyya says in reference to the verse "They worship besides Allah that which neither harms them nor benefits them, saying: These are our intercessors with Allah. Say: Do you inform Allah of something He does not know in the heavens or on the earth? Exalted is He and high above what they associate with Him!" (Yunus 18)
'He - Subhaanahu - informed about the pagans - as has preceded - that they took intermediaries between themselves and Allah, calling upon them and taking them as intercessors without Allah's permission. Allah Ta'ala said:

"They worship besides Allah that which neither harms them nor benefits them, saying: These are our intercessors with Allah. Say: Do you inform Allah of something He does not know in the heavens or on the earth? Exalted is He and high above what they associate with Him!" Hence, Allah informed that those who took them as intercessors areMushrikun.' Majmu' al-Fatawa 3/105

- Shaykh al-Islam Ibn Taymiyah said:
Whoever regards the angels and Prophets as intermediaries whom he calls upon, puts his trust in and asks them to bring that which will benefit him and ward off harmful things, such as asking them to forgive sins, guide them, relieve them of distress and meet their needs, is a kaafir, according to the consensus of the Muslims.Majmoo' al-Fataawa, 1/124.

BLOCK NO. 55

They said

He was one of the great Companions. He took part in the battle of Constantinople. Near the enemy border he fell ill. As the illness grew worse, he dictated his will as follows:

When I die, take my dead body with you, when you line up against the enemy, bury me in your feet

►Ibn ‘Abd-ul-Barr, al-Istiab fī ma‘rifat-il-ashāb (1:404-5)

So, acting on his will, the Islamic soldiers buried him at the foot of the fort and warned the enemies that in case they tried to desecrate his grave, no church in the Islamic country would remain safe. Thus, even the enemies were forced to revere his grave, and people soon came to know the blessings emanating from the grave. Whatever they prayed for at the grave was immediately granted.

And Abū Ayyūb’s grave lies near the ramparts of the fort and everybody knows it... When people pray for rain there, it starts raining.

►Ibn ‘Abd-ul-Barr, al-Istiab fī ma‘rifat-il-ashāb (1:405)

Mujahid says:

Whenever there is famine, people expose the grave, so it starts raining

Our Response:

- Again acceptance of prayer does not mean that they asked help from Abu Ayyub Ansaree, Imaam Suyooti in his work :الأمر بالاتباع والنهي عن الابتداع -السيوطي
Under the Chapter تعظيم الأماكن التي لا تستحق التعظيم (Veneration of those places which are not applicable for veneration)
First he replied those who say that our prayers are accepted at these places or graves or shrines etc He replied by saying
وقد كان الكفار يدعون، فيستجاب لهم فيسقون وينصرون يعافون مع دعائهم عند أوثام وتوسلهم ا. وقد قال تعالى: (كُلاً نمد هؤلاء وهؤلاء من عطاء ربك وما كان عطاء ربك محظوراً
Kuffar pray in front of Idols and with the Wasilah of Idols and their prayers are Accepted ,then Rain comes to them, Help comes to them , Afiyah comes to them as Allah says (in Bani Israeel:20) On each these as well as those We bestow from the bounties of your Lord. And the bounties of your Lord can never be forbidden [Page 124 with the tehqeeq of Shaykh Mashoor bin Hasan aal Salmaan publihed by دار ابن القيم للنشر والتوزيع ، الدمام ، ط 1 ، 1410 هـ / 1990 م]

Scan:http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/OwAAAM1L00qhpCh6h28aeikiwqa3McivDCTOox_SRTLLkuxKT1ozKlpNDh9NEsAz5i3BC1VG6alMINuVjrV4DOv3h8MAm1T1UB5xVJbKBdQwx18XNsO68b2f2GQH.jpg

They quoted Ibn Abdul Barr but let us see what Ibn Abdul Barr said regarding the grave of Prophet peace be upon him.

- Ibne Abdul Barr said
الوثن : الصنم ، وهو الصورة من ذهب كان أو من فضة ، أو غير ذلك من التمثال ، وكل ما يعبد من دون الله فهو وثن ، صنما كان أو غير صنم ؛ وكانت العرب تصلي إلى الأصنام وتعبدها ، فخشي رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم على أمته أن تصنع كما صنع بعض من مضى من الأمم : كانوا إذا مات لهم نبي عكفوا حول قبره كما يصنع بالصنم ، فقال صلى الله عليه وسلم : اللهم لا تجعل قبري وثنا يصلى إليه ، ويسجد نحوه ويعبد فقد اشتد غضب الله على من فعل ذلك ، وكان رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يحذر أصحابه وسائر أمته من سوء صنيع الأمم قبله ، الذين صلوا إلى قبور أنبيائهم، واتخذوها قبلة ومسجدا ، كما صنعت الوثنية بالأوثان التي كانوا يسجدون إليها ويعظمونها ، وذلك الشرك الأكبر ، فكان النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم يخبرهم بما في ذلك من سخط الله وغضبه ، وأنه مما لا يرضاه خشية عليهم من امتثال طرقهم
The idol (Wathan) is the Statue (Sanam) and it is the Surah from gold or from silver or anything else from tamtheel (forms) and all that is worshiped besides Allah is an idol (wathan), whether it is a Sanam (statue) or other, and

arabs did pray in front of statues and worshiped them and the Prophet peace be upon him feared for his Ummah that they do what some people of previous generations did, when a Prophet died they stayed ('akafoo) next to his grave as done for an idol, then the Prophet peace be upon him said O Allah, do not turn my grave into an idol. So that people pray in front of it and prostrate it and worship it. The people who did this the warth of Allah was on them. Prophet peace be upon him used to order his companions and others to keep away from the bad deeds of these people, Who prayed by facing the graves of their Prophets, and made them mosque like the idol worshipers did with their idols. They prostrated in front of them and they venerated them. This is Shirk al-Akbar [Tamheed v 5 p 45]
Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAFoKFZOIVa_gimGhPJJ21brgP--WrvKDYRljaEwY8IBkEv4JbGLYOQH1V8v-C0CHqQCsjXokduJxdXWsm2WhREYAm1T1UFkI9Z-gQp_Bp7VL1cBkYK0vr1w_.jpg

- 32) Ibne Abdul barr said
وليس فيه حكم أكثر من التحذير أن يُصلَّى إلى قبره ، وأن يتخذ مسجدا ، وفي ذلك أمر بأن لا يعبد إلا الله وحده ، وإذا صنع من ذلك في قبره ، فسائر آثاره أحرى بذلك ، وقد كره مالك وغيره من أهل العلم طلب موضع الشجرة التي بويع تحتها بيعة الرضوان ، وذلك والله أعلم مخالفة لما سلكه اليهود والنصارى في مثل ذلك

And in this (hadith) there is a warning about praying to his(peace be upon him) grave and making it a place of worship. And this is an order not to worship anyone except Allah Alone. And when this is the instruction about doing anything like that about his grave same applies to all the things associated with him. And verily Malik and others from amongst the learned disliked to seek to know the location of the tree under which "Bayt al-Ridwan" was made. And Allah knows this is going against what Jews and Christians did concerning this issue [i.e. graves and remnants related to the Prophets].[Al-Istedhkaar 2/360]

Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAALHJxLre2AW1PkFBZzY71lR6px555hu7CQE5hLC2MczJ9oxVA6zWmINd_YcdOuFdHo0Q-DXsk8dsQ-s9a7VAUYgAm1T1UBl3nrZhfiVuMIevGCy7UlZL9KxH.jpg

http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAALN4rQREjH57aa1-DcQF6ljRFHXlw0enDm5OVlhqsXFsVUKCeicFz5jUIU39AgIGT1nBA5iiX6-amI4X1JJ1lr4Am1T1UAhd-T4X4vOjJXw8UkORXwHKv3Fw.jpg

BLOCK NO. 56

They quoted

1. **Imam Shafi**

   He describes his own experience **about the blessings of the tomb of Imam Abū Hanīfah: I derive blessing from the person of Imam Abū Hanīfah and I visit his grave everyday. When I face a problem, I offer two optional cycles of prayer and visit his grave and (while standing) I pray to Allah to solve my problem. And I have not even left the place that my problem is solved.**

   Reference

   ►Khatīb Baghdādī has related the incident with a sound chain of transmission in his Tārīkh Baghdād (1:123)

   ►Ibn Hajar Haythamī, al-Khayrāt-ul-hisān fī manāqib-il-imām al-a'zam Abū Hanīfah (p.94)

   ► Muhammad Zāhid Kawtharī, Maqālāt (p.381)

   ►Ibn 'Ābidīn Shāmī in Radd-ul-muhtār 'alā Durr-il-mukhtār (1:41).

Our Response:

a) Shaykh Muhiydeen Muhammad ibn Ali al-Birqivi al-Hanafi (929 h) said in his book "Ziyaratul quboor" On page 58,

قال سلمة بن وردان : رأيت أنس بن مالك يسلم على النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم ثم يسند ظهره إلى جدار القبر ثم يدعو ، وهذا مما لا نزاع فيه بين العلماء وإنما نزاعهم في وقت السلام عليه قال أبو حنيفة رحمه

الله : يستقبل القبلة عند السلام أيضاً ولا يستقبل القبر وقال غيره : يستقبل القبر عند السلام خاصة ولم يقل أحد من الأئمة الأربعة أنه يستقبل القبر عند الدعاء ، إلا حكاية مكذوبة عن مالك ؛ ومذهبه بخلافها ، وكذلك الحكاية المنقولة عن الشافعي رحمه الله كان يقصد الدعاء عند قبر أبي حنيفة رحمه الله ـ فإنها من الكذب الظاهر بل قالوا : إنه يستقبل القبلة وقت الدعاء ولا يستقبل القبر حتى يكون الدعاء عند القبر ، فإن الدعاء عبادة كما ثبت في الترمذي مرفوعاً " الدعاء هو العبادة " فالسلف من الصحابة والتابعين جردوا العبادة لله تعالى ، ولم يفعلوا عند القبر منها شيئاً إلا ما أذن فيه النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم من السلام على أصحابها والاستغفار لهم والترحم عليهم .

"Salamah ibn Waradan said : I saw Anas ibn Malik doing salam on the Prophet saw then he put his back towards wall of grave and did du'a, and this is from which there is no dispute between scholars, and the dispute is only in time of salam. **Abu Hanifah says one should also face qiblah during salam and he should not face the grave, and other than him said one should face grave during salam only, and none of the 4 Imams said to face the grave during du'a, except a lied story from Malik, and his madhab is opposed to that, and the same for the story reported from Shafi'I that he made purpose of du'a at Abu Hanifa's grave, this is from clear (blatant,Obvious) Lie.**rather they said to face Qiblah during du'a and not to face grave so that du'a is done on graves, because du'a is worship as it is established from Tirmidhi in marfu' form (words of Prophets) : " Du'a is worship" and salaf from Sahabah and Tabi'I made singled ibadah for Allah, and they did not do anything on the grave except what the Prophet peace be upon him permitted from salam to his companions and istighfar for them and mercy for them.(end)

b) Shaykh ul Islam Ibne Tmiyah Rejected this Narration in Iqteza Sirat Al Mustaqeem page 343 and 344

c) Ibnul-Qayyim said in "Ighathatul Lahfan fi Masayid Al Shaytan" (1/246): "Story related from al-Shafi' that he made supplications at Abu Hanifa's grave is apparently lie."

d) Shaykh Zubair Ali Zai mentioned that it is fabricated and accused those who use this athar, and he said Omar bin Ishaq is Majhool.**[Majallah Al hadith no:26 page 49 and 50]**

Imam Ash Shafa`iee Rahimullah Himself did Jirha on Imam Abu Haneefa Rahimullah

and Lastly it is in same Tareekh Baghdad Vol 15 page 527 and other Nuskha vol 13 page 394-395 from Imam Abu Bakr Abdullah ibn Sulayman ibnul Ash'at, son of the famous Imam Abu Dawud, addressing a group:
"What do you say about a topic on which agree Malik and his companions, **Ash-Shafi'i** and his companions, Al-Awza'i and his companions, Al-Hasan ibn Salih and his companions, Sufyan Ath-Thawri and his companions, Ahmad ibn Hambal and his companions?" They replied: "It is among most authentic topic". He said: "All of these agreed on the misguidance of Abu Hanifah"

Scan: http://lh3.ggpht.com/_Y3h6JhqU8O4/TEzem-7v8mI/AAAAAAAAAMY/GMKcVXp0Piw/s400/sweetu.jpeg
I ask from the people of fabrications, will you believe on this athar against fabricated athar you are providing?? surely they will come up with excuses but they never hesitate in quoting fabricated athar. **Note that I do respect Imam Abu Hanifa but the athar i mentioned is an extra reply to refute their claim. Imam Abu Dawood said**
رحم الله مالكا كان اماما رحم الله الشافعى كان اماما رحم الله اباحنيفة كان اماما

May Allah bless Malik he was an Imam, May Allah bless Shafi'ee he was an Imam **May Allah bless Abu hanifa he was an Imam**[Al Inteqa Ibn e Abdul Barr page 32 authenticated by Shaykh Zubair Ali Zai in Majallah al-Hadith]

Hafidh As Shatibi Clearly Refutes the Tabarruk.

الصحابة -رضي الله عنهم- بعد موته - عليه الصلاة والسلام- لم يقع من أحدٍ منهم شيء من ذلك بالنسبة إلى من خلفه، إذ لم يترك النبي -صلى الله عليه وسلم - بعده في الأمة أفضل من أبي بكر الصديق -رضي الله عنه- ، فهو كان خليفته، ولم يُفعل به شيءٌ من ذلك، ولا عمر - رضي الله عنه-، وهو كان أفضل الأمة ثم لم يثبت لواحد منهم بعده، ثم كذلك عثمان، ثم علي، ثم سائر الصحابة الذين لا أحد أفضل منهم في الأمة، على أحد تلك الوجوه أو نحوها، بل اقتصروا فيهم على من طريق صحيح معروف أن متبركاً تبرك به فهو إذاً إجماع منهم على -الاقتداء بالأفعال والأقوال والسير التي اتبعوا فيها النبي -صلى الله عليه وسلم ترك تلك الأشياء.

"The Prophet (sallallaahu alayhi wasallam) never left anyone after himself anyone more superior than Abu Bakr as-Siddiq (ra), since he was his Khalifah and **no one did this through him**... **and nor through 'Umar (ra) and he was the best of the Ummah after him.** Then **likewise,** 'Uthman (ra) and then all of the Companions, with respect to whom there is no one who is more

superior. **There is not established from a single one of them any authentic report that states that someone would make tabarruk from them in any of these ways or what is similar to them** . Rather they restricted themselves to following and imitating the actions and statements in which they (the Companions) followed the Prophet (sallallaahu alayhi wasallam) . This, **therefore is a unanimous agreement from them for the abandonment of these things."**

Al Aitesa`am Vol 2 page 8 and 9

Quotes below are taken from the book "Mawsu'ah Ahlus Sunnah" of Shaykh AbdurRahman Ad-Dimashqi written in refutation of the Ahbash.

The Ahbash have claimed that Tabarruk with the graves is correct and they justified this by what Khateeb Al-Baghdadi narrated that Ash-Shafi'i said: "I do Tabarruk with Abu Hanifah and I go to his grave every day -meaning for visit- and when I have a need I pray two Rak'ah and I go to his grave and ask my need to Allah (Ta'ala) and I do not leave it until it is fulfilled" (Tarikh Baghdad v 1 p 123)

This Sanad to Ash-Shafi'i contains Majhul (unknown) narrators as said by **'Allamah Al-Mu'allimi. Shaykh Albani said** in his "Silsilah Ad-Da'ifah" (1/31): "This narration is weak, rather Batil (pure falsehood), because 'Umar ibn Ishaq ibn Ibrahim is not known and there is no mention of him in books of narrators. And it is possible that he is 'Amr ibn Ishaq ibn Ibrahim ibn Humayd ibn us-Sakan Abu Muhammad At-Tunsi, and Al-Khateeb mentioned him (12/226) and mentioned that he was from Bukhara and he went for Hajj in 341H and he did not mention any Jarh nor Ta'dil (criticism or praise) so he is Mahlul ul Hal, and it is unlikely that he (the narrator Umar ibn Ishaq) is him ('Amr ibn Ishaq) because the death of his Shaykh Ali Maymun is in latest case in 247H, so there is between their death approximately 100 years, so it is unlikely that he reached him (meaning 'Amr ibn Ishaq did Hajj in 341 and it is difficult for him to narrate from Ali Maymun who died in 247, so the narrator of this narration is unlikely to be 'Amr ibn Ishaq)"

Ash-Shafi'i said in his "Al-Umm" v 1 p 278: **"I consider it Makruh that creation should be venerated (Ta'zim) until his grave is transformed into a place of worship (mosque) fearing the Fitnah for him and for those after him"**

An-Nawawi in his Sharh Muslim quoted the words of Ash-Shafi'i v 7 p 24, Janaiz Bab 32 and "Majmu'" v 5 p 298: **"I have seen among the rulers some who destroyed what was built upon graves and I have not seen the Fuqaha blaming this"**

Al-Baydhawi said in his "Hashiyah Sunnan An-Nasai" v 2 p 42 that the Jews and the Christians used to come to the graves of their saints for prayer and invocation"

Comment: When Ash-Shafi'i mentioned he saw rulers destroying constructions over graves, so if the people of this time and he himself were doing Tabarruk on graves, why did he failed to mention this?

And if Ash-Shafi'i was doing such actions, why didn't he do this on graves of Sahabah?

Why would he fail to mention in his books such actions if they were to be beneficial?

Can anyone having little reason believe that Ash-Shafi'i do such actions and believe them to be beneficial then fail to mention this in his books and recommend to do such actions on graves of Sahabah?**(end quote from the link)**

see also http://www.umm-ul-qura.org/info/user_pages/page.asp?art_id=116

and http://gift2shias.com/2011/06/12/imam-shafi-and-grave-of-abu-hanifah/
There is another refrence in above link Quoted from book by Muhammad al-Humays.

Imam of hanafis of his time, al-Alusi said regarding this report: "This is a lie and it is obvious that it is a lie to anyone who has knowledge of transmission, because when ash-Shafi came to Baghdad there was no grave present in Baghdad at that time that was turned for dua whatsoever. Rather, Abu Hanifah wasn't well known during his time and ash-Shafi had visited Hijaz, Yemen, Sham, al-Iraq, Egypt which were all places wherein the graves of the Prophets, the Sahabah and the Tabiin were to be found and all of these were better than Abu Hanifah and other scholars of his level. So why dua only

be to made to ABu Hanifah? Furthermore, the companions of Abu Hanifah who met him such as Abu Yusuf, Muhammad, Zufar, al-Hasan ibn Ziyad and others their like were all not known to go to the grave of Abu Hanifah and dua there. Ash-Shafi made expressly clear in some of his books that it's disliked to exalt and glorify graves out of fear of the fitnah that it would lead to. The one who popularised the likes of these stories are those who have scant knowledge and Deen and these stories are only transmitted from those who are unknown". See "**Fath al-Mannan" pp 372-373.**

BLOCK NO. 57

They quoted

2. Imam Malik

Imam Mālik's prominence as one of the four jurists of Islam is well-established. Once caliph Abū Ja'far Mansūr visited Medina and he asked Imam Mālik: "While supplicating, **should I turn my face to the prayer niche [and turn my back to the Holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم)] or should I turn my face to the Holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) (and turn my back to the prayer niche)?"** On this interrogation, Imam Mālik replied: **"(O caliph!) Why do you turn your face from the Holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم), as he is the source of mediation for you and for your ancestor Adam (عليه السلام) on the Day of Judgement? Rather you should (pray and supplicate by) turning towards the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) and seek his intercession so that he intercedes for you before Allah on the Day of Judgement.** Allah has declared:

"We sent not an apostle, but to be obeyed, in accordance with the will of Allah. If they had only, when they were unjust to themselves, come unto thee and asked Allah.s forgiveness, and the Messenger had asked forgiveness for them, they would have found Allah indeed Oft-returning, Most Merciful"(4:64)

This incident has been narrated by Qādī 'Iyād in his ash-Shifā (2:596) with a sound chain of transmission. Besides, it has been related by a number of other traditionists of impeccable credibility. Subkī in Shifā'-us-siqām fī ziyārat khayr-il-anām, Samhūdī in Khulāsat-ul-wafā, Qastallānī in al-Mawāhib-ul-laduniyyah, Ibn Jamā'ah in Hidāyat-us-sālik and Ibn Hajar Haythamī in al-

Jawhar-ul-munazzam.

Our Response:

This Story is Fabricated

Shaykh Muhiydeen Muhammad ibn Ali al-Birqivi al-Hanafi (929 h) said in his book "Ziyaratul quboor" On page 58,

قال أبو حنيفة رحمه الله : يستقبل القبلة عند السلام أيضاً ولا يستقبل القبر وقال غيره : يستقبل القبر عند السلام خاصة ولم يقل أحد من الأئمة الأربعة أنه يستقبل القبر عند الدعاء ، إلا حكاية مكذوبة عن مالك ؛ ومذهبه بخلافها

Abu Hanifah Rahimullah says one should also face qiblah during salam and he should not face the grave, and other than him said one should face grave during salam only,**and none of the 4 Imams said to face the grave during du'a, except a lied story from Malik,** and his madhab is opposed to that..(end)

Story is Against Authentic Ahadith and Madhab of Imam Malik

Abu dawud

حدثنا أحمد بن صالح قرأت على عبد الله بن نافع أخبرني ابن أبي ذئب عن سعيد المقبري عن أبي هريرة قال

قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم لا تجعلوا بيوتكم قبورا ولا تجعلوا قبري عيدا وصلوا علي فإن صلاتكم تبلغني حيث كنتم

Narrated AbuHurayrah: The Prophet (peace_be_upon_him) said: Do not make your houses **grave**s, and do not make my **grave** a place of festivity. But invoke blessings on me, for your blessings reach me **wherever you may be.** (Abu Dawood Book #10, Hadith #2037 and Albani Authenticated it)

and Muwatta Book 9, Number 9.24.88:

Yahya related to me from Malik from Zayd ibn Aslam from Ata ibn Yasar that the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, said, "O Allah! Do not make my grave an idol that is worshipped. The anger on those who took the graves of their Prophets as places of prostration was terrible."

Al Haythamee Quoted this Hadeeth under the Chapter of **باب قوله: لا تجعلن قبري وثناً** **"Chapter Saying Do not turn my grave into an idol" in his Majma Az Zawaid.**

Ibne Abdul Hadee Authenticated By saying

وَالْحَدِيث حَسَن جَيِّد الْإِسْنَاد وَلَهُ شَوَاهِد كَثِيرَة يَرْتَقِي بِهَا إِلَى دَرَجَة الصِّحَّة . قَالَهُ الشَّيْخ الْعَلَّامَة مُحَمَّد بْن عَبْد الْهَادِي رَحِمَهُ اللَّه .

Awn al Mabood Sharah Sunan Abi Dawood under the commentary of this hadeeth
source: http://hadith.al-islam.com/Display/Display.asp?Doc=4&Rec=2429

Imam Malik Said

سئل مالك رحمه الله تعالى عن الغريب يأتي قبر النبي كل يوم ، فقال : ما هذا من الأمر ، وذكر حديث : (" اللهم لا تجعل قبري وثنًا يُعبد)

Imam Malik (may Allah have mercy on him) was asked about a stranger who comes to the grave of the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) each day. He said, '**That is not right,' and quoted the hadith, 'O Allah, do not make my grave an idol that is worshipped.'"**[al-Jami' li'l-Bayan by Ibn Rushd Classed as sahih by al-Albani in Tahdhir al-Sajid min Ittikhadh al-Qubur Masajid, p. 24-26.]

Al-Qaadi 'Iyaad al-Maliki

وسئل القاضي عياض عن أناس من أهل المدينة يقفون على القبر في اليوم مرة أو أكثر ، ويسلمون ويدعون ساعة ، فقال : " لم يبلغني هذا عن أحد من أهل الفقه ، ولا يُصلح آخر هذه الأمة إلا ما أصلح أولَها ، ولم يبلغني عن أول هذه الأمة وصدرها أنهم كانوا يفعلون ذلك " الشفا بتعريف حقوق المصطفى 676/2)) .

Al-Qaadi 'Iyaad was asked about people of Madeenah who stand by the grave one or more times a day, and they send salaams and make du'aa' for a while. He said, "I have not heard of this from any of the fuqaha', and nothing is good for the latter generations of this ummah except that which was good for its first generations**. I have not heard that any of the first generations of the ummah used to do that."[Al-Shifa bi Ta'reef Huqooq al-Mustafa, 2/676.]**

al-Qadi 'Iyaad al-Maliki on how the Prophet's intercession is sought:

قال القاضي عياض : وقد عرف بالنقل المستفيض سؤال السلف الصالح - رضي الله عنهم - شفاعة نبينا - صلى الله عليه وسلم - ورغبتهم فيها ، وعلى هذا لا يلتفت إلى قول من قال إنه يكره أن يسأل الإنسان الله تعالى أن يرزقه شفاعة محمد - صلى الله عليه وسلم - ، لكونها لا تكون إلا للمذنبين فإنها قد تكون كما قدمنا لتخفيف الحساب ، وزيادة الدرجات ثم كل عاقل معترف بالتقصير ، محتاج إلى العفو ، غير معتد بعمله ، مشفق من أن يكون من الهالكين ، ويلزم هذا القائل ألا يدعو بالمغفرة والرحمة ; لأنها لأصحاب الذنوب ، وهذا كله خلاف ما عرف من دعاء السلف والخلف . هذا آخر كلام القاضي - رحمه الله - والله أعلم .

I.e. many of the Salaf would seek the Prophet's intercession and hence, the way to do it is to ask Allah to bless him with the Prophet's intercession[Sharah Sahih Muslim hadith no: 183]

Reply by Ibne Abdul Hadi to As Subki

Taken From: http://www.umm-ul-qura.org/info/user_pages/page.asp?art_id=111

As-Subki also quoted the narration of Qadhi 'Iyad in his "Shifa" that Ja'far Mansur, the second 'Abbasid caliph, when visiting the Prophetic mosque asked Imam Malik: "Shall I turn my face towards the Ka'ba or face the grave of the Messenger of Allah (saw) for invocation?" To which Imam Malik replied: "How can you turn your face away from the Messenger of Allah? He is your Wasilah and the Wasilah of your father Adam, peace be upon him! Rather turn your face towards him and seek intercession though him!..."

The Isnad is **Qadhi 'Iyadh: Qadhi Abu 'Abdillah Muhammad ibn 'AbdirRahman Al-Ash'ari and Abu Al-Qasim Ahmad ibn Baqi Al-Hakim and others who gave me the authority to narrate this, they said: Abu Al-'Abbas Ahmad ibn 'Umar ibn Dalhath narrated to us, Abul Hasan 'Ali ibn Fihr narrated to us, Abu Bakr Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Al-Faraj narrated to us, Abul Hasan 'Abdullah ibn Al-Muntab narrated to us, Ya'qub ibn Ishaq ibn Abi Israil narrated to us, ibn Humayd narrated to us: he said Abu Ja'far Emir Al-Muminin called Malik** in the mosque of the Messenger of Allah (saw)...

Ibn 'Abdil Hadi said after quoting the story attributed to Imam Malik: **"I say: What is known from Malik is not facing the grave for invocation, and this story quoted by Qadi 'Iyad with his Isnad to Malik is not true from him,** and the objector (As-Subki) said in a place of his book its Isnad is a good (Jayd) Isnad, **and he is mistaken in this saying with a clear mistake, rather the Isnad is not good,** it is an unjust **Munqati' (disconnected) Isnad**, **and it comprehends someone accused of lying,**and on some whose condition is not known, and ibn Humayd is **Muhammad ibn Humyd Ar-Razi, he is weak with a lot of Manakir, not based upon in narrations, and he did not hear anything from Malik nor met him, rather this narration from him is Munqati' not continuous.**

And the objector thought that he (Muhammad ibn Humayd) is Abu Sufyan Muhammad ibn Humayd Al-Mu'amari, one of the trustworthy narrators

present in "Sahih Muslim", he said: "Al-Khatib mentioned him among those who narrated from Malik" and he made a clear mistake in his thinking **and an ugly error,** because Muhammad ibn Humayd Al-Mu'amari came before, Ya'qub ibn Ishaq ibn Abi Israil the narrator from ibn Humayd in the story did not reach him, **rather there is a great gap between them. Al-Mu'amari narrated from Hisham ibn Hasaan, Mu'amar and Ath-Thawri,** and he did in **182H before the birth of Ya'qub ibn Ishaq ibn Abi Israil.** As for Muhammad ibn Humayd Ar-Razi then he is among the narrators from Al-Mu'amari like Abu Khaythamah, ibn Numayr, 'Amr An-Naqid and others, and his death was in **248,** and it is possible for Ya'qub ibn Ishaq to narrate from him contrary to narrating from Al-Mu'amari, because it is impossible.

Muhammad ibn Humayd Ar-Razi, and he is the one from whom the narration is narrated, has been criticised by many Imams and some attributed lie to him.

Ya'qub ibn Shaybah As-Sudusi said: "Muhammad ibn Humayd Ar-Razi mentions many **Manakir"** (note from Muhaqiq of "Sarim Al-Munki: see "Tahzib" 9/129)

Al-Bukhari said: "Hadithuhu fihi Nadhar (his Hadith has observations)" (At-Tarikh Al-Kabir 1/69 and "Ad-Du'afa As-Saghir" n°315)

An-Nassa'i said "He is not Thiqah" ("Ad-Du'afa wal Matrukin" p 32)

Ibrahim ibn Ya'qub Al-Juzjani said: "He had a bad Madhab, he is not trustworthy" ("Ahwal Ar-Rijal" n°382)

Fadlak Ar-Razi said: "I have fifty thousands Ahadith from ibn Humayd, **and I do not narrate a word from him."** ("Tahzib" 9/129)

Abul 'Abbas Ahmad ibn Muhammad Al-Azhari said: "I heard Ishaq ibn Mansur saying: "I witness in front of Allah that Muhammad ibn Humayd and 'Ubayd ibn Ishaq Al-'Atar**are both liars."** ("Tahzib" 9/129)

Salih ibn Muhammad Al-Hafiz: "Every Hadith from Sufyan that reached him he would turn it to Mihran, and every Hadith from Mansur that reached him he would turn it 'Amr ibn (Abi) Qays, and every Hadith of Al-A'mash that reached him he would turn it to similar to these and to 'Anbasah" then he

said: **"Everything he was narrating, we would accuse him (of lying in it)."**

And he said in another place: **"His Ahadith would add (in words) and I have not seen someone daring (more lies) on Allah than him, he would take the Ahadith of people and would inverse them"** and he said in another place: "I have not seen anyone more keen to lie than two men: Sulayman Ash-Shazkuni and **Muhammad ibn Hameed Ar-Razi,** he would learn a Hadith one day, and would add, and every day he would add (words). **Abul Qasim said:** 'Abdullah ibn Muhammad ibn 'Abdil Karim Ar-Razi, the nephew of Abu Zur'ah: I asked Abu Zur'ah about Muhammad ibn Humayd and he made a sign putting his finger on his mouth" **I asked him: "Would he lie?" and he answered with his head saying yes...**

Abu Nu'aym 'Abdul Malik ibn Muhammad ibn 'Adi: I heard Abu Hatim Muhammad ibn Idris Ar-Razi in his house, and 'AbdurRahman ibn Yusuf ibn Kharash was present with him and also a group of scholars of (region of) Ray and their Hufaz of Hadith, and they mentioned ibn Humayd and **they agreed on the fact that he was very weak in Hadith and he narrates what he did not hear, and he would take the Ahadith of the people of Basrah and Kufah and narrate them from the two Razi. Abul 'Abbas ibn Sa'id said:**I heard Dawud ibn Yahya saying: Abu Hatim heard from him before, meaning from Muhammad ibn Humayd then he left him at the end, **he said: I heard 'AbdurRahman ibn Yusuf Kharash saying that ibn Humayd narrated to him and by Allah he was a liar.** (Al-Kamil 6/2277)

Abu Hatim ibn Hibban Al-Busti said in his "Kitab Ad-Du'afa": Muhammad ibn Humayd Ar-Razi, his Kubiyah is Abu 'Abdillah, he narrates from ibn Al-Mubarak and Jarir, our Shuyukh narrated from him and he died in 248H, and he was among those who were alone in inversing narrations of Thiqat, and specially when he narrated from the Shuyukh of his country..."

Al-'Uqayli said in his "Kitab Ad-Du'afa": "Ibrahim ibn Yusuf narrated to us, he said: Abu Zur'ah, Muhammad ibn Muslim narrated a lot from Muhammad ibn Humayd then they stopped narrating from him. And Al-Hakim Abu Ahmad said in his "Kitab Al-Kuna": Abu 'Abdillah Muhammad ibn Humayd Ar-Razi is not strong for them and Abu 'Abdillah ibn Yahya Az-Zuhli and Abu Bakr Muhammad ibn Ishaq ibn Khuzaymah abandoned him." End of ibn 'Abdil Hadi's words

Also after the weakness of ibn Humayd, there is also disconnection as ibn Humayd did not meet Malik as explained by Ibn Taymiyah in his "Al-Qa'idah Al-Jalilah fi Tawassul Wal Wasilah" and this chain contains other unknown narrators.

BLOCK NO. 58

They said

3. Ibn-ul-Jawzī

In the biography of saints Sifat-us-safwah (Volume 1: Page 441-442), he writes about Ibrāhīm bin Ishāq Harabī:

"And his grave is open to everyone. People receive blessing from it." **Click here for Scanned Page (165)**

He has also described Adam's intermediation through the holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) in the first chapter of his book al-Wafā bi-ahwāl-il-Mustafā (1:33) see page 149.

Our Response:

Now here these people claim that he was on the opinion that the auliyah can help after their death, First thing to note is that he is not talking about his own stance. He is talking about the stance of some people. And the practice of some people is not evidence in Islam, let me provide some ahadeeth on visiting the graves and then example

Ahadith:

The Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: "Visit the graves, for they remind you of the Hereafter." (Narrated by Muslim, 976).
It was reported that 'Aa'ishah said that when it was her night for the Messenger of Allaah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) to stay with her, he would go out during the latter part of the night to (the cemetery of) al-Baqee' and say, "Peace be upon you, dwellings of the believing people. There

has come to you that which you were promised, ..., and if Allaah wills we will follow you soon. O Allaah, forgive the people of Baqee' al-Gharqad." (Narrated by Muslim, 974).

Example:

Ibn Katheer mentioned almost same thing (Like Ibn Jawzi said regarding the grave of Maroof) regarding Shaykh ul Islam Ibn Tamiyah, he said (quoting the words of Bazzarli on the death of Sh Ibn Tamiyah)

وجلس جماعة عنده قبل الغسل ، وقرءوا القرآن ، وتبركوا برؤيته وتقبيله ، ثم انصرفوا ، وحضر جماعة من النساء ففعلوا مثل ذلك ثم انصرفوا ،

A group of people came near his (Dead body) before doing the Ghusl, They read the Qur'an and sought blessings by watching and kissing him, Then they went back and a group of women came who did same things and went back. [Al Bidaya wal Niyaha Vol 14 page 158]
Source: http://www.islamweb.net/newlibrary/display_book.php?idfrom=2443&;idto=2443&bk_no=59&ID=3086

Comment: We all know the stance of Shykh ul Islam on asking help from dead and tabarruk from graves, but still people did some acts of ignorance with his dead body. If some scholar Mention some incidence that does not mean this is the aqeedah of the particular scholar. Ibn Katheer is just quoting from Bazzarli that what the people did with the dead body of Ibn Tamiya Rahimullah, Own stance of Ibn Katheer was different.

Ibn e Katheer said in al-Bidaya wal Nihaya under the Tarjuma of al-Khidr bin Nasr

وترجمه ابن خلكان في الوفيات ، وقال قبره يزار، وقد زرته غير مرة، ورأيت الناس ينتابون قبره ويتبركون به، وهذا الذي قاله ابن خلكان مما ينكره أهل العلم عليه وعلى أمثاله ممن يعظم القبور

Ibn Khilkaan mentioned his (Khidr`s) biography in al-Wafayāt and said: People visit his grave and i have visited his grave and i have seen people visiting his grave and seeking blessings from it. This is what Ibn Khilkaan said. **People of knowledge rejected the veneration on his grave and a like**[al-Bidaya wal-Nihaya 12/371]

Comment: So own sayings of Ibne Kathir is different, Quoting something in book never means the author agree with it

See also Aqeedah of Ibn Katheer and grave worship here: http://www.systemoflife.com/articles/aqeedah/195-umar-bin-al-khattab-and-grave-worship

.

Now what about the statement quoted by Ibn Jawzi?

وكان إبراهيم الحربي يقول قبر معروف الترياقي
المجرب.
Ibraheem al-Harbee said The grave of Maroof is proven medicine(end quote)

Response:

Khateeb Baghdadi quoted this with his chain in Tareekh Baghdad 1/134-135
ومقبرة باب الدير وهي التي فيها قبر معروف الكرخي أخبرنا إسماعيل بن أحمد الحيري قال أنبأنا محمد بن الحسين السلمي قال سمعت أبا الحسن بن مقسم يقول سمعت أبا علي الصفار يقول سمعت إبراهيم الحربي يقول : قبر معروف الترياق المجرب .

The narrator in the chain is Muhammad bin al Husayn Abu Abdul Rahman as-sulamee

a) Ibn Jawzi himself said regarding him
Then there came Abu 'Abdir-Rahmaan As-Sulamee who wrote a book for them called 'as-Sunan.' He also compiled a book for them called 'Haqaa'iq-ut-Tafseer', in which he mentioned amazing things about them (i.e. Sufis) concerning their interpretation of the Qur'aan, based on the (mystical things) that occurred to them, without tracing that back to any of the sources where knowledge is derived from. And indeed, what brought them to take such things and place them as their views was their state of daze, due to their strict abstinence of food and their love for talking at great lengths of the Qur'aan.[Talbees Iblees: pg. 162]

b)
Ibn Jawzi said in Duafa wal Matrookeen (weak and rejected narrators) Vol 3 page 52 no: 2952
محمد بن الحسين أبو عبد الرحمن السلمي الصوفي حدث عن الأصم وغيره قال أبو بكر الخطيب قال لي محمد بن يوسف القطان كان السلمي غير ثقة وكان يضع للصوفية الأحاديث

Muhammad bin Al-Hussain Abu Abdul Rahman as-sulamee al-Sufi
He Narrated from al-Aasam and others

Abu Bakar Khateeb said: Muhammad bin Yusaf al-Qattan said to me "Abu 'Abdir-Rahmaan As-Sulamee is not reliable. And he would fabricate ahaadeeth for the Sufis."(end quote)

b) Imam ad-Dahabee said

محمد بن الحسين أبو عبد الرحمن السلمي الصوفي صاحب المصنفات تكلم فيه وما هو بالحجة وقال الخطيب قال لي محمد بن يوسف القطان كان يضع الأحاديث للصوفية، قلت: وله في حقائق التفسير تحريف كثير [ص 184/2 no: 5434].

c) Ibn Al Ajmi (752 - 841) said

محمد بن الحسين أبو عبد الرحمن السلمي النيسابوري شيخ الصوفية وصاحب تاريخهم وطبقاتهم وتفسيرهم قال الذهبي: تكلموا فيه وليس بعمدة، قال الخطيب: قال لي محمد بن يوسف القطان كان يضع الأحاديث للصوفية وله أربعون حديثا في التصوف رويناها عالية وفيها موضوعات والله أعلم
الكشف الحثيث فيمن رمي بوضع الحديث page no: 255

d) Shaykh ul Islam Ibn Tamiyah refuted this saying of Ibraheem al-Harbee in ي (الاقتضاء 203/2)

These sufis quote the chapter made by Hafiz Ibn Jawzi with the name of " في الاستسقاء بقبره صلى الله عليه وسلم "Istesqa with the grave of Prophet peace be upon him" in Al Wafa be Tareef Fadhaail e Mustafa
And then these poeple say, see Hafiz Ibn Jawzi made whole chapter for us

Response:

Chapter does not mean this is the aqeedah of Ibn Jawzi neither the chapter says Asking help from Prophet peace be upon him is allowed, It simply means he will narrate ahadith related to this chapter
Shaykh ul Islam Ibne Tamiyah said
Muhadditheen like him (abu Nuyeem) narrated ahadeeth on some specific topic (no mattaer authentic or weak) so that people may know (about the ahadeeth), we can not take evidence from some of them. [Minhaj us Sunnah vol 4 page 15]

Clear statements of Ibn Jawzi against asking help from the dead.

a) Ibn e jawzi said regarding deviants in Talbees al-Ibnlees
One of there habbit is that on the 15th night of shaban they visit the graves... and they take the mud from the grave of saint (end quote)
Then he quoted ibn Aqil that
قال ابن عقيل: لما التكاليف على الجهال والضغام عدلوا عن أوضاع الشرع إلى تعظيم أوضاع وضعوها لأنفسهم فسهلت عليهم إذ لم يدخلوا بها تحت أمر غيرهم قال وهم كفار عندي بهذه الأوضاع مثل تعظيم القبوروإكرامها بما نهى الشرع عنه من إيقاد النيران وتقبيلها وتخليفها وخطاب الموتى بالألواح وكتب الرقاع فيها يا مولاي افعل بي كذا وكذا وأخذ التراب تبركا وإفاضة الطيب على القبور وشد الرحال إليها وإلقاء الخرقعلى الشجر اقتداء بمن عبد اللات والعزى
"Ibn Aqil said: "When these obligations were hard on the ignorant and rabble ones, they diverted themselves from the positions of Shari'a to revere positions which they laid down for themselves, so it felt easy to them as they will not be regulated by the order of anyone except themselves." He added: "To me, they are kafir (infidels) due to these positions; like revering the graves and paying respect to them with things which are forbidden by Shari'a like burning fire, kissing the graves, roaming around them, addressing the dead with sheets (of requests) and notes on patches which say like this: "O My Master do such and such for me", and taking the soil for getting blessing, pouring perfume on the graves, undertaking journey to visit them, hanging shreds with trees, as imitation to those who worship Lat and Uzza.
Talbees Iblees of ibn e jozi chapter تلبيس إبليس/الباب الثاني عشر تلبيس إبليس على جمهور العوام
Urdu Translation Scan
page: http://ia600609.us.archive.org/BookReader/BookReaderImages.php?zip=/17/items/Talbees-e-Iblees/Talbees-e-Iblees_jp2.zip&;file=Talbees-e-Iblees_jp2/Talbees-e-Iblees_0570.jp2&scale=4&rotate=0
Arabic
Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAABwI6gjMVRBQa7kJkTCDLVmKF2WTStqm1hFr3hgpwwYtc73OV-5mQNhSYCAIjfiCrareWTryF7Fm0W-X4Od9YOMAm1T1UHYma1Rht9qBUJU0zDcY5T1K48RS.jpg
Then Ibn Aqil said
والويل عندهم لمن لم يقبل مشهد الكهف ولم يتمسح بآجره مسجد المأمونية يوم الأربعاء ولم يقل الحمالون على جنازته أبو بكر الصديق أو محمد وعلي ولم يكن معها نياحة ولم يعقد على أبيه أزجا بالجص والآجر ولم يشق ثوبه إلى ذيله ولم يرق ماء الورد على القبر ويدفن معه ثيابه
According to them, woe is to one who did not kiss the Mashhad al-Kahaf and did not touch the wall of the Al-Mamuniyah mosque on Wednesday, The

funeral of Abu Bakar Siddique or Muhammad (peace be upon him) or Ali was not carried by porters there was no Noha on them, their graves were not erect with brick and plaster"[Ibid]
Scan: http://ia600609.us.archive.org/BookReader/BookReaderImages.php?zip=/17/items/Talbees-e-Iblees/Talbees-e-Iblees_jp2.zip&;file=Talbees-e-Iblees_jp2/Talbees-e-Iblees_0571.jp2&scale=4&rotate=0
b) Ibn e Aqil said
لا يخلق القبور بالخلوق , والتزويق والتقبيل لها والطواف بها , والتوسل بهم إلى الله
Graves are not made for kissing and decorating and roaming around and begging them for ALLAH [Ibn e Muflih quoted al furoo 2/316]
Scan: http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAAJFXFISiMceFb7HLgvtzXhUexKq4I6mwFNJ-3EmUCaZ7FLbYz1eRomDckgUh31611VKBqyfzVNiB7F7HjnEtDvMAm1T1UO3FA6Tsd1cn1c_C4hDDudMskEl5.jpg

c) Ibn e Jawzi Criticised al-Ghazali Badly when he said Sufis can see souls of Prophets and hear them. He said
Then there came Abu Haamid Al-Ghazaalee who wrote the book ' Ihyaa 'Uloom-ud-Deen' for them, according to the methodology of the (Sufi) people, which he filled with baseless ahaadeeth even though he knew well they were baseless. He spoke about knowledge of theMukaashafah (unveiling of unseen by Allaah to Sufis) and withdrew from the principles of Fiqh. And he stated such things as: 'Indeed the stars, the sun and the moon, which Ibraaheem saw, were in fact lights that screened Allaah!' Such things are not mentioned in any of the sources of knowledge. Rather, this is from the types of speech of the Baatiniyyah.

He (Al-Ghazaalee) also said in the book ' Al-Mufsih bil-Ahwaal': "While in their state of wakefulness, the Sufis are able to witness the angels and souls of the prophets, hear their voices and take hold of benefit from them. Then this condition escalates from the witnessing (of their) images to levels in which they are contained within these domains."

The factors that caused these individuals to write these books was their little knowledge of the Sunnah, Islaam and the narrations, as well as their dedication for what they approved of from the way of the people (Sufis). They only approved this way because of adoration for abstinence (zuhd) that was established in their souls. They did not see any condition better than the

condition of these people (Sufis) in regards to appearance, nor any speech more pleasant than their speech, whereas in the biographies of the Salaf, they found a form of harshness. So the people inclined very strongly towards these individuals (Sufis).

This was due to what we stated previously, that it was a way, which was characterized outwardly by cleanliness and worship, whereas on the inside, it was about indulging in leisure and hearing music, which the bodily dispositions incline to. The original Sufis would flee from the leaders and authorities. However (in later times) they became friends.

The majority of these books that were compiled for them have things in them that cannot be traced back to any (authentic) source. Rather, they are only based on mystical occurrences that befell some of them, which they managed to take hold of and record. They called this hidden knowledge (al-'ilm-ul-baatin). Abu Ya'qoob Ishaaq bin Hayya said: "I heard Ahmad bin Hanbal once when asked about the occurrence of delusions and notions, so he replied: 'The Sahaabah and the Taabi'een never spoke about such things.'"[Ibn e Jozi in Talbees Iblees pg. 163 and Page 261 of Urdu Tranlsation]
Note: Abu Hamid Ghazali repented from all these Khurafaat like Sufis can see souls,Angels and they can hear them etc. This is called Speech of Baataniyah as said by Ibn e Jozi. See here repentence of
Ghazali http://www.islamqa.com/en/ref/13473

BLOCK NO. 59

They said

4. Ibn Hajar ʻAsqalānī

He has in his books al-Isābah fī tamyīz-is-sahābah (3:484) and Fath-ul-bārī (2:495-6) narrated the incident of the man who visited the Prophet's grave for rain through his mediation.(Page 230)

Our Response:

This has been dealt under the hadith of Malik adDar.

BLOCK NO. 60

They said

5. Jalauddin Suyūtī

He has related the tradition of Adam's intermediation in ad-Durr-ul-manthūr (1:58) and al-Khasā'is-ul-kubrā (1:6) in addition to narrating it in ar-Riyād-ul-anīqah fī sharh asmā' khayr-il-khalīqah where he spells out its soundness by endorsing the view expressed by Bayhaqī.(Page 151)

Our Response

The stance of Jalal ud din sudyuti is also dealt many times in this article.

BLOCK NO. 61

They quoted

6. Qastallānī

The qualities and accomplishments of a special group of saints are recorded in the traditions. The blessing of their supplication causes rain and brings victory and triumph to the Muslims. Qastallānī's views about them are given below:

"When ordinary people fall into trouble, first of all, the Heralds supplicate for them, then turn by turn the Nobility, Substitutes, the righteous and the ministers (supplicate for them). If their supplication is granted, well and good, otherwise, the saint of the highest rank, ghawth (who is all the time engrossed in Allah's worship,) supplicates for them, and before he winds it up, his prayer is granted. (This is Allah's special blessing on them.)"

►Qastallānī, al-Māwāhib-ul-laduniyyah (2:726); Zurqānī, Commentary (7:487)

►Qastallānī has also mentioned intermediation in the beginning of al-Mawāhib-ul-laduniyyah (Page 149)

Our Response:

This is totally allowed as it has been cleared before.

BLOCK NO. 62

They quoted
7. Ibn Hajar Haythamī

Ahmad Shihāb-ud-Dīn Ibn Hajar Haythamī Makkī, who possesses an eminent position among experts on Islamic jurisprudence and tradition, has proved on the basis of the experience and observation narrated by Abū 'Abdullāh Qurayshī that Allah's favourites help people after death as they help them during life and the value of their benefit is not in the least reduced. Produced below is an incident attributed to Abū 'Abdullāh Qurayshī:

A severe drought had enveloped Egypt in its grip and the people's distress caused by hunger and thirst remained unrelieved inspite of their prayers and supplications:

So I journeyed towards Syria, when I reached near Allah's friend (Ibrāhīm's) tomb, he met me on the way. I said to him: 'O Messenger of Allah! I have come as a guest. You should show your hospitality in the form of a supplication for the natives of Egypt.' He prayed for them, so Allah drove their famine away from them.

►Ibn Hajar Haythamī, al-Fatāwā al-hadīthiyyah (pp.255-6)

In this extraordinary reference, the description of the face-to-face meeting with Ibrāhīm (عليه السلام) has been commented upon by Imam Yāfi'ī in these words:

The statement made by Abū 'Abdullāh Qurayshī that he had a face-to-face meeting with the Friend is based on truth. Only an ignorant person can deny it who is unaware of the mode of living and status of the saints because these people observe the earth and the heavens and see the prophets in their living condition.

►Ibn Hajar Haythamī, al-Fatāwā al-hadīthiyyah (p.256)

In addition, Ibn Hajar Haythamī has penned down a special treatise al-Jawhar-ul-munazzam on the theme of intermediation. On its page 61, he has spelled out intermediation through the holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) as a fair (hasan) act.

Our Response

Even though Ibn Hajar haytami is from soofi scholars and we have already mentioned the criticism of Alousi and Mulla Ali Qari on him. He has quoted false thing of meeting Ibraheem aleh salam in his book,

Al-Haafiz ibn Hajar (may Allaah have mercy on him) said (quoting the opinion of Qadhi Abu Bakar Ibn al-Arabi)

وشذ بعض الصالحين فزعم أنها تقع بعيني الرأس حقيقة

Some of the righteous erred and claimed that it is possible to see him with one's own eyes.[Fath al-Baari, 12/384.]

Qurtubi said, refuting those who said that the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) could be seen when one is awake:

وهذا يدرك فساده بأوائل العقول ، ويلزم عليه أن لا يراه أحد إلا على صورته التي مات عليها ، وأن يراه رائيان في آن واحد في مكانين ، وأن يحيا الآن ويخرج من قبره ويمشي في الأسواق ويخاطب الناس ويخاطبوه ، ويلزم من ذلك أن يخلو قبره من جسده ولا يبقى في قبره منه شيء ، فيزار مجرد القبر ويسلم على غائب ؛ لأنه جائز أن يرى في الليل والنهار مع اتصال الأوقات على حقيقته في غير قبره

This idea (that the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) may be seen when one is awake) may easily be refuted by common sense, because it implies that no one can see him except in the form in which he died, and that two people may see him at the same time in two different places, and that he may come to life sometimes and emerge from his grave and walk about in the marketplaces and converse with the people. That implies that his body is not in his grave and there is nothing left in his grave, so the grave is visited and salaam is said to one who is not there, because he may be seen by night and by day in his real form outside his grave.
Quoted by al-Haafiz ibn Hajar in Fath al-Baari, 12/384
Moreover, if it were true that someone could see the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) when he is awake, then he would be one of his companions and there would be Sahabaah until the Day of Resurrection.
Al-Haafiz ibn Hajar al-'Asqallaani stated that Ibn Abi Jamrah narrated from some of the Sufis that they saw the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) in a dream, then they saw him after that when they were awake, and they asked him about some things which they were worried about, and he told them how to deal with them, and they followed his advice and achieved the desired results. Then al-Haafiz commented on that by saying:

قلت: وهذا مشكل جدا ولو حمل على ظاهره لكان هؤلاء صحابة ولأمكن بقاء الصحبة إلى يوم القيامة، ويعكر عليه أن جمعا جما رأوه في المنام ثم لم يذكر واحد منهم أنه رآه في اليقظة وخبر الصادق لا يتخلف

This is very odd. If we interpret it as it appears to be, then these people would be Sahaabah, and there could be Sahaabah until the Day of Resurrection. But this may be refuted by the fact that many people see him when they are asleep but no one says that that they saw him when they were awake, so there is an inconsistency.
Fath al-Baari, 12/385
Sakhawi said

قال السخاوي في رؤية النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم في اليقظة بعد موته : لم يصل إلينا ذلك - أي ادعاء وقوعها - عن أحد من الصحابة و لا عمن بعدهم و قد اشتد حزن فاطمة عليه صلى الله عليه وسلم حتى ماتت كمداً بعده بستة أشهر على الصحيح و بيتها مجاور لضريحه الشريف و لم تنقل عنها رؤيته في المدة التي تأخرتها عنه .

(rough)It says that it is not correct that someone could see messenger (sallalahu alaihi wa ala alihi wa sallam) after his death while he is awake. And he says such things doesn't reach him not from any companion or those who came after him. As an example he gives Fatima (r.a) which died due to feeling

lonely after her fathers death, and yet she didn't see him aftre his death while she was awake.[Qustulani quoted in Mawahib li-duniya 5/295]
Abdul Hai Laknavi Hanafi said
و منها - أي من القصص المختلقة الموضوعة - ما يذكرونه من أن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم يحضر بنفسه في مجالس وعظ مولده عند ذكر مولده وبنوا عليه القيام عند ذكر المولد تعظيماً وإكراماً
It says that the stories of Prophet peace be upon him himself coming in the Majalis of Mawlid are fabricated [Athaar al-Marfooa fe akhbaar al-Modhua page 46
Allah says
23:15 Then indeed, after that you are to die.23:16 Then indeed you, on the Day of Resurrection, will be resurrected.
Ibn Hazam said in maratib al-Ijma
واتفقوا أن محمداً عليه السلام وجميع أصحابه لا يرجعون إلى الدنيا إلا حين يبعثون مع جميع الناس
It is agreed upon that Muhammad peace be upon him and all his companions will not return to this world except when all the people will be raised.
Abu Saeed Khadmi al-Hanafi said in البريقة شرح الطريقة المحمدية
رؤية شخصه صلى الله عليه وسلم يقظة بعين الرأس بعد موته، ورؤيته تعالى في الدنيا بعين الرأس غير ممكن، والأول عقلي إذ الموتى ما داموا كذلك لا يتصور منهم ذلك.
It says that it is not prossible to see Prophet peace be upon him after his death and (it is not possible) to see Allah in this world..
Allamah Rasheed Ridha Ra said
صرح بعض العلماء المحققين بأن دعوى رؤية النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم بعد موته في اليقظة والأخذ عنه دعوى باطلة
It says that Some scholars and Muhaqqiqeen cleared that The Claim to see Prophet peace be upon him after his death (while awake) is False Claim[فتاويه6/2385]

BLOCK NO. 63

They said

8. Imam Nawawī

Imam Nawawī in the sixth chapter of his book al-Īdāh has mentioned the issue of intermediation. Besides, he has recorded in al-Adhkār a number of supplications which prove the reality of intermediation(Page 212)

9. Imam Hākim

In his book al-Mustadrak (2:615) he has mentioned the tradition relating to Adam's intermediation through the holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) and has pronounced it as sound.(Page 147)

10. Imam Bayhaqī

He has related in his book Dalā'il-un-nubuwwah (5:489) the tradition in which Adam (عليه السلام) relied on the mediation of the Holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم). He has painstakingly avoided reference to any disconfirmed (mawdū') tradition in his book.(Page 148)

Imam Bayhaqī in his book Dalā'il-un-nubuwwah (6:166-7), has also recorded a tradition attributed to 'Uthmān bin Hunayf.(Page 180) In addition, in the same book (p.147) and in as-Sunan-ul-kubrā (3:352) he has also narrated the incident of 'Umar bin al-Khattāb seeking 'Abbās's mediation for rain.(Page 325)

11. Qādī 'Iyād

He has, in his book, ash-Shifā (1:227-8) narrated Adam's intermediation through the Holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) with the help of sound and famous traditions.(Page 150-151) In addition, in the chapters on 'visiting the Prophet's grave,' 'virtues and merits of the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم)' and in many other chapters in his book he has referred to the qualities and attributes of the Holy Prophet (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم).

Our Response:

These things are already cleared in this article.

Ala ud din Kasani (587 h) Mentioned in Bada`i al Sanai`e 5/126

(

ويكره للرجل أن يقول في دعائه أسألك بحق أنبيائك ورسلك وبحق فلان لأنه لا حق لأحد على الله سبحانه وتعالى جل شأنه

It is disliked if a person say in Dua and ask Allah with the Haq of messengers and Prophets with the haq of so and so because there is no haq on anyone other than Allah subhanawa Tala Jalla Shanahu

Scan http://images.orkut.com/orkut/photos/PQAAACRpt3yoRmXTOVQT15zm5pSB6V6cpVmNhOWIn__nXgOpPmmkcQo9iUJ2n98Bte-QQQ4BvTfHrs6v9vY9vYRpwPcAm1T1UJVgwReakud1RHtlpyCG116HVa1p.jpg